TOWARDS A PROTECTION OF THE SYRIAN CULTURAL HERITAGE:

A SUMMARY OF THE NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL RESPONSES

VOLUME IV

(OCTOBER 2015 - DECEMBER 2016)

BY

LEONARDO LECKIE, EMMA CUNLIFFE & BASTIEN VAROUTSIKOS

◆ MARCH 2017 ◆

Leonardo Leckie, Emma Cunliffe, and Bastien Varoutsikos
in association with
Heritage *for* Peace

Contact
Emma Cunliffe: emma.l.cunliffe:@dur.ac.uk
Heritage for Peace: contact@heritageforpeace.org

Table of Contents

Introduction[1]

"The archaeological sites and the historic buildings are an important part of my identity, they represent my history. They are part of me."

Interview with Syrian heritage worker, conducted by Heritage for Peace 2015/2016

„ ‘

Heritage for Peace are pleased to introduce the (belated) report on actions taken to protect Syria's heritage, volume IV. This report covers the period October 2015 to December 2016, and it is truly impressive how much the report continues to grow each year. In the past year, the destruction of cultural heritage across the world has continued, but the seriousness of the issue has also continued to rise in global prominence. There is a continual concern that as the media, and the world, become saturated with the conflict, attention – and action – will fade.

Some have suggested that to demonstrate such concern for heritage, given the catastrophic costs of the war on Syria's people, is callous. However, the scale of the work conducted by those in Syria, and those no longer in the country - supported by the international community - demonstrates a level of dedication to heritage protection that surpasses mere stones. The people of Syria are a part of their heritage. Each year, we learn of more people who have died trying to protect it. Many are nameless to us, known by false names to protect their identities and their families, or known only by their actions. Others are almost household names, such as Khaled al-Assad, the former Director of Palmyra beheaded by Da'esh. These people are defenders not only of cultural heritage, but of cultural rights, rights which are guaranteed in the Bill of Human Rights, and are recognised as such by the United Nations Office of Human Rights Special Rapporteur.

This report stands as testimony to those who work continuously to protect Syria's heritage, demonstrating that as time passes, more people have become determined to help, not less.

Structure of the Report
As before, a broad classification has been undertaken between "national/local" and "international" actions, but – given the commendable level of international work done by the Syrian community - it must be acknowledged that this separation is not reflective of the reality of the situation. Those actions listed in National/Local Actions are those which are mostly, or entirely, Syrian led, whereas those with a larger international component are listed under international actions. The distinction is arbitrary, and largely based on whose the website the action is published on. It is also intended to aid understanding of which groups have contributed to assisting Syria.

Within these two sections, we have attempted to collate projects into rough categories, so that any person wishing to see the work being done in a given area (looting, for example), can see at a glance which projects are working in that area. These categorisations are intended for the readers' ease, and should not be considered definitive. Many of the organisations listed are working together on collaborative projects, creating overlaps between the projects listed here.

We apologise if the categorisation of projects is incorrect. In addition, we have attempted to cross reference projects between the different categories, but given the amount of overlap, we apologise for mistakes that may have occurred. All errors are the fault of the authors.

The report contains all actions and projects listed in the 2015 report, with updates, and any new projects for the period of this report, focussing on projects that are still ongoing. It does not contain a complete overview of actions from 2011-2015 – earlier training courses, for example, are covered in previous reports. We acknowlege there is a heavy – but unfortunately unavoidable – bias towards reports available in English. We regret a proactive search capacity for Arabic updates has not been possible, but we welcome updates from Arabic speakers: these can be translated.

Changes to the Report
This year we have included intangible heritage for the first time. It is unlikely we have successfully found all information on previous projects, however, we have attempted to be as comprehensive as possible. We chose not to cover artists and art, due to the scale of the work required (although the organisation Ettijahat – cited later in the report for other work – have many excellent examples of support for Syrian art and artists, for those who may be interested).

We have not reproduced the appendices list of actors involved in the protection of heritage. In previous years, we felt it was helpful to list contact details and status of the groups, to establish how many involved Syrians, how many were new, and so on. Whilst the figures were cited several times, we feel the field has moved on from the need for this. Group contact details can be obtained using the many URLs throughout the report.

As always, we welcome feedback on the structure and content of the report.

Activities to protect Syria's Archaeological Heritage

1.   National Actions and Local Initiatives

The following contains only an overview of the DGAM's most recent activities. Those wishing to know more regarding their tireless and comprehensive work since 2011 are directed to their most recent publication.[2]

a) Projects

i.   *Status of Staff*

In previous years, we have provided updates where possible on the status of the staff of the DGAM. As mentioned in the introduction, we now know that many others have been lost protecting their heritage, whose names we do not know. Rather than name only those we can, we ask you to consider pausing for a moment in memory of all those who have died protecting Syria's heritage.

ii.   *Status of the Site and Museum Records*

DGAM Documentation continues for Syrian collections (March 2016)
2014: with EU funding, the UN cultural agency UNESCO began training Syrian staff in storing artefacts and helped establish a nationwide system to document their inventory. *December 2014:* the DGAM have worked to digitise the records and plans of 1500 castles, museums, archaeological sites and mosques in province of Aleppo.[3] They have also created a database of icons from Syrian Churches to help preserve and reduce trafficking of stolen icons/archaeological finds from churches.[4]

March 2015: more than 1000 files for built cultural heritage have been digitised, to preserve the original archive at risk of damage due to the crisis. Files include historic documents, maps and building blueprints.[5]

Overall, the DGAM "centralized database of archaeological archives" combines the databases of the Syrian museums and of archaeological sites, which are listed in GIS-based maps. So far, around 134,000 objects from the museums of Damascus, Palmyra, Aleppo and Hama are integrated in the database. Work on the data of the Damascus old city, Damascus Citadel and Bosra was completed by July 2015. A 'unified cataloguing system of museums objects in Syria' was made available in 2012 in English and Arabic. A looted objects database is currently being developed. Data is open to researchers and editors. The output of GIS documentation will be produced as site maps, risk and damage map. All information is electronically published.[6]

---

[2] DGAM. 2016. *Syrian Archaeological Heritage. Five years of Crisis 2011-2015*. Ministry of Culture, Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums. Available at: http://dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/File/downloads/Book_en_2016.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[3] *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=239&id=1143 [Accessed 07/02/14]
[4] *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1545 [Accessed 21/08/15]
[5] *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1607 [Accessed 21/08/15]
[6] Almidani, A., and Gerrouge, T. 2015. *DGAM* Digital Information Systems for built and movable heritage. Presentation given at the Syrian Cultural Heritage Initiatives Meeting in Berlin, 31 July 2015.

March 2016: in Damascus, a team of archaeologists and archivists was still processing the collection brought from the Daraa Museum in southern Syria.[7]

Bosra al-Sham Museum and Site
Aided by the ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiative, and the Humanitarian Research Services (HRS), and supported by the U.S. Department of State and a private funder, Bosra al Sham Antiquities Department performed emergency collections assessments and site assessments and began rehousing the remaining museum and archaeological storehouse collections. Employees catalogued and safely stored the Bosra museum's remaining collections — severely damaged and looted during clashes — and completed more thorough site condition assessments.[8] (See Section 2a xiii - Damage Assessment: Reports and Databases, 2a xv - Reconstruction Projects and Conservation for more Information, and 2d - Training/Courses).

DGAM Survey: Vote on Museum Closure (2014)
The DGAM held a vote on their webpage to establish public opinion on whether to close the museums during the crisis.[9]
"Visitors vote: Are you with the closure of museums in light of the current crisis?"
As of 22 April 2014, there were 2116 votes: Yes: 74.2% | No: 13.42% | The matter does not concern me (i.e. do not care): 11.86%.

iii.   *Status of Sites*

Sites
A list of published damage assessments of sites can be found in the Publications sections. In addition, the ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiative in partnership with groups such as the Day After Tomorrow and the Association for the Protection of Syrian Archaeology has been publishing regular damage reports.[10] (For a full list see Section 2a xiii - Damage Assessment: Reports and Databases).

Preservation and conservation work has been ongoing at sites throughout the conflict. Listed here are the updates from the period covered by this report. Additional information is available in DGAM publications (see Section f xxvii – Publications Damage Reports for additional information, or the DGAM overview publication[11]).

Sites in Idlib
According to Lawyers for Justice, of the more than 760 sites in Idlib, "*490 have been recorded as damaged in one way or another*".[12]

---

[7] Bambuck, M. 2016. With jihadists at the door, Syrians rush to rescue history. *Times of Israel*. 1 April 2016. Available at: http://www.timesofisrael.com/with-jihadis-at-the-door-syrians-rush-to-rescue-history/ [Accessed 21/1/2017]

[8] ASOR. 2016. *Mitigation and Restoration Work at Bosra al Sham: Helping Syrians Protect and Preserve Cultural Rights.* Available at: http://www.asor.org/news/2016/07/bsad-summary.html [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[9] The survey was on the homepage of the *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://dgam.gov.sy/ [Accessed 22/04/14]

[10] *ASOR Website.* 2017. Reports. Available at: http://www.asor-syrianheritage.org/reports/ [Accessed 28/02/2017]

[11] DGAM. 2016. *Syrian Archaeological Heritage. Five years of Crisis 2011-2015*. Ministry of Culture, Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums. Available at: http://dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/File/downloads/Book_en_2016.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[12] Nassar, A. and Kieke, S. 2016. In Idlib's ancient Dead Cities, a few try to stem the tide of destruction. *Syria Direct*. 12 May 2016. Available at: http://syriadirect.org/news/in-idlib%E2%80%99s-ancient-dead-cities-a-few-try-to-stem-the-tide-of-destruction/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Palmyra updates
See Section 2a xv - Reconstruction Projects and Conservation.

DGAM and ICONEM documenting sites
The DGAM has begun a project to document the old city of Damascus using drones in collaboration with the Khani Media Company, ICONEM, and the CyArk Project Anqa Consortium. Together with ICONEM, they are also creating 3D models of the Umayyad Mosque, Ugarit, Palmyra and other sites using 3D photogrammetry techniques.[13] [14]

Syrians draw up plans to restore Aleppo (December 2016)
The DGAM, together with UNESCO, has already devised a master plan for restoration of the damaged buildings of Aleppo. A special team has been set up which includes many renowned engineers and historians.[15]

Locals and DGAM Work to Restore Sites (2015-ongoing)
There have been a number of initiatives by local Syrians to restore sites, particularly in Homs. For example, at the Church of Um al-Zenar "*community volunteers had recently created an excellent garden on top of the jihadists burn-pit and that locally financed major restoration work was underway*". Details of the sites they worked on in 2015, and others the DGAM have worked on, are available here.[16] [17] This collaboration is ongoing in 2016.

The DGAM / Department of Rural Damascus, in coordination with the Municipality of Rural Damascus supervised the restoration of Maaloula.[18] The work was complemented by returning villagers, who have begun work to repair and reconstruct the damaged sites.[19] [20]

According to USA Today[21] "*Despite a raging four-year civil war, rebel factions and Syrian officials are working together to protect the country's rich heritage site [...] The group*

[13] Murray, M. 2016. Building Digital Preservation Capacity in the Middle East Through Training. *Cyark Website.* Available at: http://cyark.org/news/building-digital-preservation-capacity-in-the-middle-east-through-training [Accessed 21/1/2017]

[14] *DGAM Website*. 2016. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2025, here: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1927 , here: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1989 and here: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1901 [Accessed 02/02/2017]

[15] Sputnik News. 2016. Syria Devising Master Plan to Restore Aleppo's Cultural Heritage. *Sputnik News.* 14/12//2016. Available at: https://sputniknews.com/middleeast/201612141048555945-syria-plan-restore-cultural-heritage/ [Accessed 21/1/2017]

[16] Lamb, F. 2015. Is the Phoenix Rising From the Ashes in Syria? *Counterpunch*. 29 July 2015. Available at: http://www.counterpunch.org/2015/07/29/is-the-phoenix-rising-from-the-ashes-in-syria/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

[17] Lamb, F. P. 2015. Syria's 'Monument Citizens' taking risks saving the future of our past. *Opednews*. 29 October 2015. Available at: http://www.opednews.com/articles/Syria-s-Monument-Citizens-by-Franklin-Lamb-Archeology_Syrian-Situation-151029-277.html [07/02/2017]

[18] *DGAM* Website. 25 October 2015. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1838 [Accessed 07/02/2017]

[19] Lamb, F. 2015. Return to Ma'loula. *Op Ed News*. 31 July 2015. Available at: http://www.opednews.com/articles/Return-to-Ma-loula-by-Franklin-Lamb-Christian_Jesus_Muslim_Repairs-150731-297.html [Accessed 10/10/15]

[20] Pleitgen, F., and Armstrong, P. 2016. Fear and living in Syria: Ancient Christian community rebuilds. *CNN News*. 16 May 2016. Available at: http://edition.cnn.com/2016/05/16/middleeast/syria-maaloula-christians/ [Accessed 07/02/2017]

21 Kusa, R. 2015. *Rebels, Syrian government work together to protect antiquities*. USA Today. 22/07/15. Available at: http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/world/2015/06/22/syria-archaeology/28977009/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

*counts Bosra — a former capital of the Roman province of Arabia and a UNESCO World Heritage Site in southern Syria — among its successes. The association helped coordinate a cease-fire between the rebels and the Syrian government, saving ancient ruins that included a well-preserved second-century Roman theatre. Under the deal, rebel groups withdrew from ancient parts of the city, and Syrian forces pledged not to shell the area. A month later, archaeologists were restoring parts of the damaged site, and a local militia took responsibility for protecting it from looter*s".

Conservation of late Roman floor mosaics at Afrin (October 2015)
The DGAM, in cooperation with the local community in Afrin, far Northern Syria, preserved several floor mosaic panels, which were uncovered near the village of Albiskeh (Khirbet Kouleh).[22]

Archaeological excavation continues where possible (Feb 2016)
The Syro-Hungarian archaeological mission at al-Marqab Citadel (Tartus) completed its fifteenth season. The intensive fieldwork primarily concentrated on the archaeological, architectural documentation and conservation of the site.[23]

Ongoing: DGAM staff continue to work with local communities to protect sites from illegal development and looting and other forms of damage.

iv.   *Status of Artefacts*

Deir Ez-Zor Museum artefacts taken to safety (June 2015)
In 2014, the Head of Antiquities in Deir el-Zor province and his staff packed up most of the contents of the museum, and then flew the 12 boxes of relics to Damascus. A second set of relics was transferred in June 2015.[24]

2014-15 Update:
Mar 2015: 300,000 Artifacts and Manuscripts from 34 Syrian Museums have been wrapped and transported to secret locations for safekeeping, including those from Palmyra.[25]

Sep 2015: All artefacts in Palmyra were transported to safety before the arrival of Da'esh.[26]

Sep 2015: 99% of museum artefacts has been transferred to a safe place.[27]

May 2016: The Syrian Cultural Heritage in Palmyra. The DGAM released a statement on Palmyra about the challenges and risks it is facing.[28]

---

[22] *DGAM Website.* 18 October 2015. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1826 [Accessed 07/02/2017]

[23] *DGAM Website.* 23 Feb 2016. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1922 [Accessed 01/02/2017]

[24] Bambuck, M. 2016. With jihadists at the door, Syrians rush to rescue history. *Times of Israel.* 1 April 2016. Available at: http://www.timesofisrael.com/with-jihadis-at-the-door-syrians-rush-to-rescue-history/ [accessed 21/1/2017]

[25] Neuendorft, H. *2015. Syria's Top Museum Hides 300,000 Artifacts To Protect Them From Looting.* ArteNet News Website. Available at: https://news.artnet.com/in-brief/syria-cultural-heritage-isis-282284 [Accessed 24/08/15]

[26] Bowen, J. 2015. *The men saving Syria's treasures from Isis.* New Statesman. 22 Sep 2015. Available at: http://www.newstatesman.com/culture/art-design/2015/09/men-saving-syria-s-treasures-isis [Accessed 10 /10/15]

[27] *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1708 [Accessed 09/09/15]

Ongoing: DGAM staff continue to work to catalogue and restore artefacts. DGAM staff continue to work with local communities to protect artefacts, many of which local people have saved from looting.

Syrian communities recapture looted antiquities in Qamishli (February 2016)
The DGAM thanked the local communities in Qamishli for helping to recover looted antiquities. Locals and public figures of Qamishli city, Hasaka province, seized some archaeological pieces which thieves had hidden in order to smuggle and sell them. [29] [30]

Volunteer Conservation Project (2014)
The Directorate of Scientific and Restoration Laboratories at the DGAM have launched a volunteer project at the Damascus University with the aim of qualifying and training more national staff and involving students of Damascus University in restoration works.[31]

v.   Cooperation with Local Authorities

The DGAM continues to work with local authorities to protect their heritage. These include: police, customs, local governorates and municipalities and other public bodies, in Damascus, Tartus, Palmyra, Homs, Hama, Deir ez-Zor, etc. in addition to Universities and various private associations (such as the Engineering union, Architecture University, Heritage commissions, and Archaeology University). Where necessary they continue to cooperate with military forces, as previously happened in the service of rescuing museums such as in Homs and Deir ez –Zor.[32]

vi.   Cooperation with International Authorities

In addition to the listed projects, many activities in the field of cultural heritage have been carried out with international assistance. The DGAM are cooperating with international organizations in exchanging visions and information, raising awareness and building capacities, including: UNESCO, ICOM, ICOMOS, ICCROM, the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage (ARC-WH) in Bahrain, The World Monuments Fund (WMF), and others. Cooperation continued with INTERPOL, by keeping track of the damages done to the cultural heritage since the beginning of the crisis: this close collaboration succeeded in fighting trafficking in Syrian antiquities. Objects continue to be seized internationally - Lebanon particularly, have returned a number of seized objects.[33] Throughout the report are many examples of cooperation with international authorities: as a result they are not listed here.

---

[28] *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=177&id=1701 [Accessed 30/05/15]

[29] DGAM Website. 2016. Restoring looted artifacts in collaboration with Qamishli local communities. *DGAM*. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1926 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[30] Raslan, R. 2016. Stolen archaeological pieces seized in Qamishli. *SANA*. Available at: http://ht.ly/YLsvf [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[31] Milhem, R., and Said, H. 2014. *Together We Restore Syria's Antiquities. SANA*. Available at: http://www.sana.sy/en/?p=5920 [Accessed 09/07/14]

[32] Agudo Villanueva, M. 2014. Interview with Maamoun Abdulkarim: "more than 6000 archaeological artifacts has returned to Syria during the past three years". *Mediterráneo Antiguo*. 11 August 2014. Available at: http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html [Accessed 14/08/14]

[33] Agudo Villanueva, M. 2014. Interview with Maamoun Abdulkarim: "more than 6000 archaeological artifacts has returned to Syria during the past three years". *Mediterráneo Antiguo*. 11 August 2014. Available at: http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html [Accessed 14/08/14]

vii. *Local / Regional Initiatives: Construction of Museums and Libraries*

Martyr Farhad's Museum of Kurdish Heritage in Qamishli continues (August 2016)
The first Kurdish museum in the predominantly Kurdish city of Qamishli, northeast of Syria, launched in April 2014. The museum embraces various kinds of tools used by Kurds hundreds of years ago. A variety of collections of traditional Kurdish tools and equipment could be, starting from clothes, daggers, weapons, and ending with wedding, agriculture, harvesting, lighting, hunting and cooking equipment. Kurdish folk music plays in the museum's main hall. As of August 2016, the museum was still open.[34]

Citizen Library in Daraa continues (March 2016)
In 2015, media reports circulated about a group of Syrian students building a library to preserve books taken from destroyed houses, some of which were still burning when the courageous students rescued the private libraries. More than 11,000 books, including Arabic and foreign novels, religious and academic books, were saved. The initiative was still ongoing as of March 2016.[35]

viii. *Local / Regional Initiatives: Locals Work to Protect Sites*

Local Syrians contribute to Million Image Database (October 2015)
Syrians have begun to contribute to the Oxford University Institute of Digital Archeology's Million Image Database. This relatively new application of recently developed technology is a large-scale scholarly project targeting both object documentation, and trafficked object identification. Scores of Syria's 'Monument Citizens' will use easy-to-use 3-D cameras to document archaeological sites and objects in their area. Images and videos collected in the nearly 14,000 images capacity memory cards will be send for processing to the project's technical team in the United Kingdom via uploads to the project's website. Some of these images will be used to create detailed maps of Syrian sites, and to create 3-D models of buildings and artifacts that will be usable as blueprints for full-scale reconstruction. Details of the 3D printed reconstructions can be found in Section 2a xv - Reconstruction Projects and Conservation. Syrians form 5-member 3-D digital camera photography teams to record every possible damaged and not yet damaged site wherever and whenever possible[36]. For more information on the project are available in Section 2 a xiii - Damage Assessment: Reports and Databases – Ongoing.

The Day After Heritage Protection Initiative: Site Monitors Project (ongoing)
TDA-HPI established the Site Monitors Project in spring of 2015[37], a network of local archaeologists, museum curators and activists who act as site monitors. It supports the site

---

[34] *IWPR*. 2016. Available at: https://iwpr.net/global-voices/qamishlis-museum-kurdish-heritage [Accessed 28/02/2017]

[35] BBC. 2016. The War Zone Librarian. *BBC*. Available at: http://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/p03m34cs [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[36] Lamb, F. P. 2015. Syria's 'Monument Citizens' taking risks saving the future of our past. *Opednews*. 29 October 2015. Available at: http://www.opednews.com/articles/Syria-s-Monument-Citizens-by-Franklin-Lamb-Archeology_Syrian-Situation-151029-277.html [07/02/2017]
The Million Image Database website is here: http://www.millionimage.org.uk/ [Accessed 11/02/2017]

[37] Oelbaum, J. 2016. One foot in the Levant. *Good*. Available at: https://www.good.is/features/issue-36-amr-al-azm?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 31/1/2017]

monitors by providing training and technical expertise through its contacts with professionals and institutions. The Site Monitors work to:

- Document violations and looting of cultural heritage sites outside areas of regime control. This includes sites controlled by ISIS (Daish).
- Document war damage caused by the ongoing conflict.
- Track the sale and transport of looted antiquities, obtaining them to return them if possible.
- Implement small-scale intervention/preservation projects.

Numerous Site Monitor reports and Damage Reports for sites are available on the website of The Day After Heritage Protection Initiative,[38] as are several publications.

Hekaya educational project: Idlib Antiquities Centre (February 2016)

Idlib Antiquities Centre released a documentary video by Al-Jazeera about the Hekaya educational project, which aimed to raise awareness about the importance of protecting the cultural heritage among the children of Idlib.[39]

The Syrian Association for Preserving Heritage and Ancient Landmarks (2014-ongoing)

This group continue to be active protecting sites, and have cropped up in several news articles about work in the region. To protect the group, no details are available.

In the Eye of the Storm at Tell Mozan (May 2014 – ongoing)

The archaeologists who previously excavated Tell Mozan were working with local villagers to protect the site. Villagers covered the mudbrick with sheeting and trellises to prevent degradation, and make basic repairs to the site. Although the dig house was looted in 2012, as of June 2015, the site was still thought to be in good condition, with no reports of looting. The project is undertaken by Gulfsands Urkesh Exploration Fund, International Institute for Mesopotamian Area Studies (IIMAS), and Cotsen Institute of Archaeology (UCLA).[40] No update was available online in 2016.

Protecting the Jobar Synagogue (2015-onwards)

An article published in the Wall Street Journal details the efforts to protect the synagogue, which was ultimately destroyed.[41] Due to the ongoing fighting, no further updates were available on this story, although in 2017 a news article commented that objects were saved by local people before it could be looted. The story also notes that Muslims worked together with Jews to save the synagogue, and that some died to try and save the building:
"*Aahed Sulayman volunteered to lead a committee that was created to protect the community's heritage. He himself is Muslim and he explained that given the "enormity of importance of this historical building" for his community, and it being a symbol of co-existence, he took charge. He risked his life. Some of his team members were killed in their*

---

[38] *The Day After Heritage Protection Initiative* - Site Monitor Reports available here: http://hpi.tda-sy.org/en/category/reports/site-monitor-reports/
Damage Reports available here: http://hpi.tda-sy.org/en/category/reports/damage-reports/
Publications http://hpi.tda-sy.org/en/category/publications/ [Accessed 2/3/17]
[39] *Idleb Antiquities Centre Facebook Page*. 29 Feb 2016.
https://www.facebook.com/1070868956264699/videos/1144092272275700/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[40] Marquez, L. 2014. Archaeologist, villagers protect ancient Syrian city as civil war rages. *UCLA Newsroom Website*. 23 May 2014. Available at: http://newsroom.ucla.edu/stories/archaeologist-villagers-protect-ancient-syrian-city-as-civil-war-rages [Accessed 02/07/14]
[41] Entous, A. 2014. One Muslim's Quest to Save a Revered Syrian Synagogue. *Wall Street Journal*. 01 December 2014. Available at: https://www.wsj.com/articles/one-muslims-quest-to-save-a-revered-syrian-synagogue-1417491144 [accessed 26/2/2017]

effort to protect their local heritage. The synagogue was destroyed, however, some of its artifacts could be saved before looters arrived".[42]

Idlib heritage workers (2012- ongoing)
Heritage workers, together with members of the local community in Idlib and Aleppo provinces are informally cataloguing damage to sites. In some cases, they wrap and bury objects at risk of being looted and record the GPS location. In 2012, archaeologists in Aleppo spent 12 hours talking to Western specialists on Skype to correctly preserve and move 600 medieval manuscripts and astrological instruments at the Aleppo Mosque's library at risk from regime airstrikes. Members of the group undertook training with Heritage for Peace and received technology after attracting the attention of NGOs and foreign governments: only eight could make the trip because fighting with Islamic State blocked their route.[43] Heritage for Peace reported on their continued efforts, and the extraordinary risks they take to protect heritage, at the CBRL 2016 conference.[44]

ix.   *Local and Regional Initiatives: New Groups*

Al Adeyat Archeological Society
A local organization present in various cities including Aleppo. They publish reports and articles.[45]

Aleppo: The Syrian Association for Preserving Heritage and Ancient Landmarks (2014-ongoing)
This group continue to be active protecting sites, and have appeared in several news articles about work in the region. To protect the group, no details are available.

Bosra: Department of Antiquities in the city of Bosra al-Sham
The Department of Antiquities in the city of Bosra Sham is an institution concerned with the archaeological interest of Bosra Sham through: documenting violations against archaeological locations; restoration of sites affected and ruined; protection of what remains of archaeological sites and conservation and maintenance against vandalism.[46]

---

[42] *ARCH International Facebook page*:
https://www.facebook.com/alliancefortherestorationofculturalheritage/photos/a.55562506455932 7.1073741830. 421063674682134/1155423581246136/?type=3&theater [Accessed 26 /02/2017]
[43] Parkinson, J., Albayrak, A., and Mavin, D. 2015. Culture Brigade. Syrian 'Monuments Men' Race to Protect Antiquities as Looting Bankrolls Terror. *Wall Street Journal*. 10 February 2015. Available at: http://www.wsj.com/articles/syrian-monuments-men-race-to-protect-antiquities-as-looting-bankrolls-terror-1423615241 [Accessed 24/08/15]
[44] *CBRL website*. 2016. Caring for the Past programme. 15 April 2016. Available at: http://cbrl.org.uk/common/events/CBRL%20Conference%202016%20Provisional%20Programme.pdf [Accessed 28/02/2017]
[45] *Al Adeyat Archeological Society* website. Available here: http://www.aladeyat.org/ [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[46] *Department of Antiquities in the city of Bosra al-Sham* Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/search/top/?q=bosra%20al-sham http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=795 [Accessed 28/02/2017]

Al-Jazira: The Authority Of Tourism and Protection Of Antiquities in Al Jazira Canton (Democratic Self-Management)

Al Jazira Canton have created a Tourism and Antiquities body. According to the website and the Facebook page,[47] the group monitor damage to sites under their jurisdiction, publishing a number of reports; repair and renovate sites; create exhibitions; and conduct research.

Idlib Antiquities Centre

An organisation dedicated to documenting damage to Idlib's tangible and intangible cultural heritage, protecting and restoring it where possible.[48]

Committee for Shared Culture (CSC) (May 2015)

According to The National, an anonymous group of people have come together to track down and recover the ancient artefacts that are disappearing from archaeological sites throughout Iraq and Syria. They are working to study the illegal trade, map it, disrupt it, and hand over the information they find to relevant national authorities. Their ranks include academics, linguists, institutions, legitimate collectors, and technical staff. They comb the internet for information, using advanced algorithms to search for images and key names and words to identify looting and their networks, in addition to "*going online into chatrooms and forums, having a look around and having conversations with people to try to work out what is going on*". Financial backing has come from an influential private organisation with a vested interest in protecting the world's shared heritage. The group would welcome more support, and is open to recruiting anyone who shares their concerns and thinks they have skills it could use (contact The National).[49] No 2016 update was available online.

Shirīn: Local Networks (2014-ongoing)

Shirīn are activating local networks to pay sites guards and protect warehouses.[50]

b) Awareness Raising (Campaigns / Events / Calls / Exhibitions)

The DGAM are continuing their general awareness raising work. Their photo galleries continue to document violations against the Syrian cultural heritage and archaeological and historic objects as well as the damage affecting them. Other work included: exhibitions and poster campaigns were held in major cities; lectures took place on the cultural heritage to pupils in primary and universities and local communities; encouraging the efforts of non-governmental organizations in the cultural heritage field, making the press and the public opinion more sensitive about the problems of the safeguard of the Syria's cultural heritage, promoting appeals, conferences and meetings, video documentary, press releases and slogans

---

[47] *The Authority Of Tourism and Protection Of Antiquities in Al Jazira Canton* website: http://desteya-shunwaran.com/ar/ http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=795 [Accessed 28/02/2017]
Facebook Page: https://www.facebook.com/rxd.Antiquities/ http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=795 [Accessed 28/02/2017]
[48] *Idleb Antiquities Center* Facebook Page. Available at: https://www.facebook.com/Idleb-Antiquites-Center-1070868956264699/ [Accessed 07/03/2017]
[49] Gornall, J. 2015. Mystery men hunt cultural past stolen by ISIL. *The National Website*. 28 May 0215. Available at: http://www.thenational.ae/world/middle-east/mystery-men-hunt-cultural-past-stolen-by-isil#full [Accessed 5/06/15]
[50] *Shirīn Website*. 2017. Concrete Measures. Available at: http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=795 [Accessed 28/02/2017]

were reinforced to be circulated and spread information and discourage purchases of Syrian cultural artefacts.[51]

x.   *Exhibitions in Syria*

For previous events, see previous reports. Specific events held in the period of this report include the following.

Save Syria's History campaign (ongoing)
This national campaign under the banner *Save Syria's History* was launched to raise awareness on the current looting of museums and illegal excavation of archaeological sites, run by the DGAM. It also serves to remind all Syrian people, regardless of their political allegiance, of the importance to protect their rich cultural heritage for the benefit of future generations. Posters and other audio-visual material were widely disseminated across Syria to support the campaign's message. According to Syrian sources, their outreach and apolitical campaign has successfully served to engage Syrian people in actively protecting their cultural heritage, as networks of volunteers from local communities have come together all over the country. Their actions include protecting Syrian museums from being looted by helping museum staff move archaeological artifacts to safe and secure places, as well as providing additional security, in cooperation with local authorities, around archeological sites at risk of being illegally excavated.[52]

Cultural Beheading exhibition (February 2016)
A part of a digital art series, *Cultural Beheading*, was undertaken by two artists in Damascus, Humam Alsalim and Rami Bakhos to highlight the destruction of Syrian heritage. The goal was both to understand how people currently relate to urban spaces as well as to start a discussion about the methods and tools architects could develop to help shaping better conditions in this context.[53]

Syria is Born Again exhibition (7 February 2016)
A photo exhibition titled *Syria is Born Again* was opened at Abu Rummaneh Cultural Centre in Damascus. The exhibition showcased 24 prints by young photographer Ali Baddour, depicting scenes from many Syrian cities (historic and modern) reflecting the destruction.[54]

Vision …Palmyra After Liberation exhibition (14 June 2016)
University students in the Faculty of Antiquities and Museums made portrayals documenting historical sites in Palmyra city before and after the terrorist organizations' attacks. These portrayals were shown in an exhibition held by the Faculty of Architecture, the Higher

---

[51] Agudo Villanueva, M. 2014. Interview with Maamoun Abdulkarim: "more than 6000 archaeological artifacts has returned to Syria during the past three years". *Mediterráneo Antiguo*. 11 August 2014. Available at: http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html [Accessed 14/08/14]

[52] UNESCO website. *National Campaign - Save Syria's History*. Available at: http://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/news/national-campaign-save-syrias-history [Accessed 3/4/2017]

[53] *Syrian Creative Heavens Website*. Available at: https://syriancreativehavens.com/2016/02/07/cultural-beheading/?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 01.02.2017]

[54] Reem/Barry. 2016. Photo exhibition sheds light on Syrian cities after eliminating terrorism-VIDEO. *SANA*. 8 February 2016. Available at: http://sana.sy/en/?p=68832 [Accessed 02/02/2017]

Institute of Regional Planning, the Directorate-General of Antiquities and Museums and Engineers Union.[55]

Sculpture exhibition held in Latakia National Museum (October 2016)
Stories about Syria, the suffering and steadfastness of its people over six years of war, the return of human values of love, family and home, and hopes of revival and restoration were among others highlighted by the artworks of the Syrian Sculptor Nizar Ali Badr. In more than 25,000 artworks, the majority of which have been photographed to be archived, the sculpture documented different stages of the war on Syria, the loss of beloved ones, the forced migration and the suffering.[56]

From Homeland's Memory **Handicraft exhibition (7-9 November 2016)**
From Homeland's Memory was an exhibition held at Damascus Citadel, which brought Syria's oldest traditional handicrafts into the spotlight. 45 exhibitors took part in the three-day exhibition, which was organized by the General Establishment for Exhibitions and International Markets in cooperation with the General Union of Syrian Craftsmen.[57]

Syria's Battle to defend its Past **exhibition (November 2016)**
An archaeological exhibition - *Syria's Battle to defend its Past* - opened at the National Center for Visual Arts in Damascus. The exhibition, held in cooperation with the General Directorate for Antiquities and Museums, showcased 70 archaeological artefacts, including small objects that had been stolen and recovered thanks to the efforts of the Syrian Arab army, parties concerned and the Directorate of Antiquities, in addition to huge archaeological objects.[58]

Aleppo is Our Destination **exhibition (November 2016)**
Aleppo is Our Destination exhibition, held at Alef Noon Gallery in Damascus, featured 20 artworks by 15 young and pioneering plastic artists from Aleppo.[59]

Art exhibition of Syrian art and archaeology (November 2016)
The Church of Holy Cross in Damascus hosted a lecture on the *Destiny of Syrian Christian monuments,* and a photography exhibition showing repair works in Saint George Church in Homs city.[60]

By Fine Arts We Build Aleppo **exhibition in Aleppo (18 November 2016)**
Over 1200 paintings by 40 children aged 4.5-12 years were featured in an exhibition of the Fine Arts Faculty in Aleppo city under the title *By Fine Arts We Build Aleppo.*[61]

---

[55] Qaddour, B. 2016. Syria's Vice-President: we are still able to restore damaged heritage. *The Syria Times*. 15 June 2016. http://syriatimes.sy/index.php/culturt/24561-syria-s-vice-president-we-are-still-able-to-restore-damaged-heritage [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[56] Raslan, R. / Ghossoun. 2016. Sculptor Nizar Ali Badr's impressive artworks reflect suffering of Syrian people in war. *SANA*. 31 October 2016. Available at: http://sana.sy/en/?p=92061 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[57] Raslan, R. / Ghossoun. 2016. From Homeland's Memory" exhibition sheds light on Syria's oldest traditional handicrafts. *SANA*. 10 November 2016. Available at: http://sana.sy/en/?p=92950 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[58] Raslan, R. /Mazen. 2016."Syria's Battle to Defend its Past" exhibition sheds light on Syria's archaeological treasures. *SANA*. 16 November 2016. Available at: http://sana.sy/en/?p=93599 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[59] Raslan, R. / Ghossoun. 2016. "Aleppo Is Our Destination" Exhibition pays heartfelt tribute to the steadfast city of Aleppo. *SANA*. 08 November 2016. Available at: http://sana.sy/en/?p=92775 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[60] Qaddour, B. 2016. Destiny of Syrian Christian monuments. *The Syria Times*. 22 November 2016. Available at: http://syriatimes.sy/index.php/culturt/27709-destiny-of-syrian-christian-monuments [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[61] Qaddour, B. 2016. Children rebuild Aleppo city by fine arts. *The Syria Times*. 20 November 2016. Available at: http://syriatimes.sy/index.php/culturt/27669-children-rebuild-aleppo-city-by-fine-arts [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Aramia: **Aramaic singing festival (10 September 2016)**
The Syrian Global Society for Preserving the Aramaic Language organised a musical event titled *Aramia 2016* in Maaloula in Damascus countryside that featured songs and poetry in Aramaic. The event also included honouring poets and Aramaic language enthusiasts from the town.[62]

Six Years **Art exhibition in Damascus (7 December 2016)**
Entitled *Six Years*, Nizar Sabour's art exhibition was opened at Khan As'ad Basha. The exhibition was a showcase of more than 120 artworks of different themes, stemming from the heart of the Syrian pain and suffering. It narrated stories of resistance and steadfastness. In a statement to SANA, Sabour said that the exhibition includes all art works of his own since 2010 up to the present date, adding that the first two paintings rose a question about if the intuition could tell anything about the future after which he worked on art as a witness of society and a way to defend life against death.[63]

Syrian artists work to create art based on their cultural heritage
In a refugee camp in Jordan, 8 refugee artists, art teachers and even a computer engineer have worked together on a six-month project to recreate Syria's most famous landmarks in miniature models. The artists made a dozen models using only basic tools and whatever materials they could find – local basalt rock, polystyrene, cement, MDF and hundreds of wooden kebab skewers.

"*We chose this project to draw attention to what's happening in Syria, as many of these sites are under threat or have already been destroyed,*" Ahmad explains. "*It felt like a good way to get the message out, because art is a language that doesn't need to be translated.*"

Through exhibitions in the camp, the project has helped to reconnect refugees with their own cultural heritage. For tens of thousands of children in Zaatari – many of whom have little or no memory of Syria – this is their first opportunity to see these famous landmarks.[64]

xi.   *Syrian Conferences*

Colloquium to help protect heritage (10-11 December 2016)
Under the patronage of the Ministry of Culture, and in collaboration with Ministry of Tourism, the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums and ICONEM held a colloquium: *New visions and proposals for the resilience of the Syrian heritage* at the National Museum in Damascus.[65]

The engagement of archaeologists and cultural heritage experts during times of conflict can be difficult to navigate and their actions can quickly become politicised. Actions can be perceived in many ways in these complex circumstances. In this case, the event created some

---

[62] Sabbagh, H. 2016. Aramaic singing festival in Maaloula for preserving Aramaic language. *SANA*. 10 September 2016. Available at: http://sana.sy/en/?p=87840 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[63] Raslan, R. / Ghossoun. 2016. Art defends life at Nizar Sabour's art exhibition. *SANA*. 09 December 2016. Available at: http://sana.sy/en/?p=95689 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[64] Dunmore, C. 2016. How art is helping Syrian refugees keep their culture alive. *The Guardian*. Available at: https://www.theguardian.com/global-development-professionals-network/2016/mar/02/art-helping-syrian-refugees-keep-culture-alive [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[65] *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2128 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

controversy, with some archaeologists issuing a statement against it.[66] The DGAM's annual address of 2017 also referred to the issue.[67]

c) Workshops / Training Courses (Internal)

A number of training courses have been held with / for staff of the DGAM and other Syrian heritage professionals. For previous courses, see previous reports, or the DGAMs most recent publication[68]. Due to increasingly complicated security situation, the majority of these courses are being held outside the country, and so are listed in Section 2d.

Documentation of historical buildings located in al-Midan quarter (November 2015)
In cooperation with DGAM and the Municipality of Damascus, the Faculty of Architecture at the University of Damascus presented a workshop on the documentation works of historical buildings located in al-Midan quarter, as part of the Damascene Pilgrimage road.[69]

d) Reports & Maps

This section has been moved to Section 2f - Publications.

---

[66] *Penn Cultural Heritage Centre* Facebook Page. Available here:
https://www.facebook.com/pennchc/posts/1254412277966796 [Accessed 31/1/2017]. Also reported in the French Press here: Kodmani, H. 2016. Guerre de tranchée autour du patrimoine syrien. *Liberation*. 28 December 2016. Available here: http://www.liberation.fr/planete/2016/12/28/guerre-de-tranchee-autour-du-patrimoine-syrien_1537926 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[67] *DGAM Website*. Available here: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2210 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[68] DGAM. 2016. *Syrian Archaeological Heritage. Five years of Crisis 2011-2015*. Ministry of Culture, Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums. Available at:
http://dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/File/downloads/Book_en_2016.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[69] *DGAM Website*. 2015. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1860 [Accessed 06/02/2017]

2.   International Actions

a) Projects and Documentation

xii.   Site and Object Inventories

Aleppo Archive in Exile
The Aleppo Archive in Exile, maintained by the Friends of the Old Town of Aleppo. The archive holds documentation on historical monuments, urban topography, socio-economic structures and 20 years of city planning on the basis of digitized cadastral maps, and as such it is a highly important tool in the rebuilding of devastated districts in the old town of Aleppo. The cadastral register also significantly contains information about ownership.[70]

Damascus History Foundation
Founded by eight Syrians of inter-disciplinary specialties, the Damascus History Foundation is a private organization fostering research on chosen themes related to the history of Damascus from the nineteenth century to present. Of particular relevance, the Damascus History Foundation is a venue to review the official papers of the Syrian Arab Republic. Correspondences, court records, treaties, maps compiled in the country's official archives since independence in 1946 will be available at the Damascus History Foundation. The also hold the private archives of Syrian leaders, politicians, novelists, poets, notable Syrian families, and others. These archives were willed to the Damascus History Foundation, or bequeathed from one generation to the next, and handed over to the Foundation by the families of those notable Damascene figures. They also hold many other archives of interest. The foundation will work on digitizing many of these archives, making them available to wider audiences.[71]

Digital Library of the Middle East (December 2016)
The Andrew Mellon Foundation has awarded nearly $150,000 to the Council on Library and Information Resources, in collaboration with the Antiquities Coalition and other institutions, to create a Digital Library of the Middle East (DLME). The DLME would create a digitally based, internationally shared inventory of cultural artifacts that includes detailed descriptions and images, and confirms objects' ownership and legal status. This information would help determine whether an item of cultural or historical significance offered for sale or being transferred was acquired illegally. Images and brief descriptions from the DLME could be made publicly available to encourage greater understanding of the region's cultural legacy and respect for the importance of the cultural commonwealth, while helping to safeguard a fundamentally important expression of our humanity.

Over eight months, the team will conduct a series of focused research projects; lead meetings, webinars, and other methods of education and outreach; identify and convene an advisory council; and travel to the Middle East and North Africa to explore potential partners and

---

[70] ArchHerNet: *Archaeology Worldwide Special Issue* 2016: Reconstruction. Available at: https://www.dainst.org/documents/10180/2082824/Archaeology+Worldwide+Special+Issue+2016/0e33097d-1071-4c7b-b4dc-85b81a5cb7b2 [Accessed 26/2/2017]
[71] *The Damascus History Foundation* website. http://www.damascus-foundation.org/library/government-archives [accessed 4/3/2017]

projects that may fall within the purview of the DLME. Information and insight gathered through these means will frame a final report that will either corroborate the efficacy and cost effectiveness of creating a DLME, or articulate why the concept is not currently feasible.

If feasible, development of the DLME would likely proceed in stages that include converting free standing analog/paper-based existing inventories to searchable, digital databases; new digitization of objects in the Middle East and North Africa, and the creation of linked metadata for them; and the aggregation of existing digital assets relevant to the regional legacy held in U.S. and European institutions.

An abridged version of the planning grant proposal is available on the website.[72]

Greek mosaics database (2016-onwards)
The European Center of Byzantine and Post-Byzantine Monuments in Thessaloniki has created a database of mosaics based on their work.[73]

Interpol: Object Inventory (ongoing)
Interpol has adding information on more than 1,300 items removed from the Deir Atiyah Museum and other sites in Syria to the database- viewed by more than 2,000 members of law enforcement and customs as well as partner organizations and private dealers,[74] including museums, journalists, and universities. It currently contains 46,000 stolen works of art.

From this 46,000, they have particularly highlighted 64 objects stolen from Palmyra.[75]

Shirīn / EAMENA: Sites and Monuments Records for Syria (2015-ongoing)
The British-French project *Sites and Monuments Records for Syria* is associated with the initiative Shirīn and the EAMENA Project, in close cooperation with the DGAM, is working towards the first Syrian Sites and Monuments database. The SMRS database is the result of the merging of data created by two major research projects, the *British Fragile Crescent Project* and the French *PaleoSYR/PaleoLIB*, and will constitute a powerful tool in the present circumstances. The database of Syrian cultural heritage currently comprises entries describing more than 15,000 archaeological sites, monuments and features throughout Syria: it will be augmented by the inclusion of further survey information (Euphrates Valley, parts of the Syrian Jezirah). The key tool provided by this platform is a unique identification system for sites and monuments. This database will play a key role in the future monitoring and protection of heritage, and will offer potential research opportunities. In addition to compiling available data on all surveyed sites, many will also have damage assessments carried out.

A funded PhD student at Durham University began work on the project in January 2016, and a post-doctoral position began collating data in October 2016. The Syrian HER will now form part of the Arches database created by EAMENA, and its development will be funded for 3

---

[72] *Digital Library of the Middle East*. Council on Library and Information Resources. 19 December 2016. Available at: https://www.clir.org/initiatives-partnerships/DLME [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[73] Mirtsioti, G. 2016. A guardian of Syria's imperiled cultural heritage. *Ekthimerini*. 29 September 2016. Available at: http://www.ekathimerini.com/212420/article/ekathimerini/life/a-guardian-of-syrias-imperiled-cultural-heritage [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[74] FoxNews. 2015. Interpol steps up search for ancient artefacts stolen in Syria and Iraq. *FoxNews* Website. 28 April 2015. Available at: http://www.foxnews.com/world/2015/04/28/interpol-steps-up-search-for-ancient-artifacts-stolen-in-syria-iraq/ [Accessed 24/08/15]

[75] *INTERPOL*. Available at: https://www.interpol.int/Media/Files/Crime-areas/Works-of-art/Poster/Sculptures-stolen-in-Palmyra,-Syria [Accessed 28/02/2017]

years from Jan. 2017, allowing an unrivalled opportunity to create a systematic record of heritage sites in Syria.[76]

Shirīn: Digital Inventories of Museums of Syria (DIMS) / Digitizing the official inventory of the Museum of Deir az-Zor
Shirīn encourages the creation of a Digital Inventories of Museums of Syria (DIMS).This project aims to produce a large database of the inventories of all the Museums of Syria, working in close cooperation with the Directory-General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM), international organizations (UNESCO), other relevant projects and the directors of excavations in Syria.[77]

The pilot project is "**Digitizing the official inventory of the Museum of Deir az-Zor**", supported by the Free University of Berlin and funded by the Foreign Ministry of Germany works since July 2015 in close cooperation with the DGAM under the umbrella of the *Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage* Project of the UNESCO to produce an illustrated list of the officially registered objects in the Museum of Deir az-Zor. A meeting of the stakeholders (FU Berlin, UNESCO, DGAM, DAI, ICOMCIDOC) sponsored by UNESCO was held in Berlin on August 20-21 2015, to organize the cooperation and to decide on further steps. Another meeting between the DGAM, DAI and FU Berlin was planned in Berlin on November 15-21, 2015. The transfer of data from the DGAM began, as did work on excavation inventories to filter the objects delivered to the Museum. The inventory and updates on the project are now available online on a new website.[78]

Raqqa Project (December 2016-ongoing)
The Centre for Global Heritage and Development at Leiden University is setting up Project Raqqa following a direct request from the DGAM. The project is funded by Prince Claus Fund. By combing archives, they aim to create a comprehensive object database of the objects in the national museum. The aims of the Focus Raqqa project are: 1) To assess the current and ongoing damage to archaeological heritage in the Raqqa Province of northern Syria; 2) To facilitate international organisations in the future recovery of stolen antiquities; 3) To contribute to post-conflict academic, historical, and heritage institutional rebuilding in Syria.[79] [80]

Syrian Heritage Archive Project (SYRHER): Digitisation and Damage Documentation Database
A joint project between the Museum für Islamische Kunst Berlin and the Deutsches Archäologisches Institut. The Syrian Heritage Archive Project (SHAP) is supported by the

---

[76] *Shirīn Website*. Available here: http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=1369 and here http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=795;
also see the Shirīn newsletters http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=2952 [Accessed 28/02/2017]
Digitizing the inventory of the Museum of Deir az-Zor website: http://www.museumdeirezzor.org/ [Accessed 28/02/2017]
[77] *Shirīn Website:* Museums. Updates are available here: http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=1356
November 2015 Newsletter http://Shirīn-international.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/SHIRĪN-Newsletter_Nov2015.pdf [Accessed 07/02/2017]
[78] *Shirīn Website:* November newsletter http://Shirīn-international.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/SHIRĪN-Newsletter_Nov2015.pdf [Accessed 28/02/2017
[79] Centre for Global Heritage and Development. 2016. Focus Raqqa project receives funding! 22 December 2016. Available at: http://www.globalheritage.nl/news/focus-raqqa-project-receives-funding [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[80] Centre for Global Heritage and Development. 2016. A future for a Dutch-Syrian shared research tradition. 11 July 2016. Available at: http://www.globalheritage.nl/news/focus-raqqa [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Federal Foreign Office. In cooperation with the Museum für Islamische Kunst (SMB), they are carrying out systematic digital documentation of the full spectrum of data that has been gathered on Syria's cultural heritage over more than 100 years. This will provide Syrian colleagues with a secure documentary basis for the reconstruction of cultural heritage in Syria and will also facilitate identification of looted objects that are being traded illegally on the art market. The SYHER Project aims to digitise old archives to ensure that the data can be used in the future and meaningfully integrated in larger database projects to provide a basis for the subsequent evaluation of data on the current status of Syria's cultural heritage. More than 100,000 data sets have already been gathered (photos, drawings and maps scanned and digitized), all at the disposal of Syrian colleagues. They are also creating the database to document the damage occurring to sites. A further goal of the initiative is to create an international network with similar projects focussing on the long-term documentation of Syria's cultural assets.[81] The SyrHer Project cooperates with the Syrian Antiquities Authority (DGAM) to contribute to a Syrian cultural heritage register – used for Syria, based on data from all over the world. SYHER are signing MOUs for data-sharing of damage information with other organisations.

The following components of the digital infrastructure of the DAI (idai.world) are used for data storage: idai.objects/Arachne (administration of objects), idai.gazetteer (administration of place names), idai.geoserver (analysis level Geo) und idai.bibliography/Zenon (administration of literature). The data are linked via the idai.gazetteer. Multilingual terminology is to be pursued in future to assist data sharing. The database is structured around the concept of a Digital Room Book[82]. The project uploads data to iDAI.objects/Arachne database, which is a comprehensive tool for scientific internet research. iDAI objects data can be exported via interfaces into other international platforms. The digital place-dictionary iDAI Gazetteer, which is an open internet-based platform, serves to manage and geo-locate the Syrian sites, places and monuments. Documentation is standardised according to European Standard *BS EN 16096:2012: Conservation of cultural property — Condition survey and report of built cultural heritage* (BSI Standards Publication).

xiii. *Damage Assessment: Reports and Databases*

There are now many groups raising awareness of damage via Facebook pages. These are listed in Section 2b xxiv – Other.

Antiquities Coalition Smart M.App and Map (2015-ongoing)
The Antiquities Coalition have developed a Culture Under Threat Map that uses a heat map to illustrate the geographic extent of terror groups control and the heritage sites under threat. The map can be viewed here.[83] A second map seeks to aid efforts to protect heritage by providing a foundation for identifying culture under threat in the broader context of terrorist activity in the region. It displays areas that are under the direct control of terrorist groups or

---

[81] *Syrian Heritage Archive Project Website*. Available at: http://syrian-heritage.org/
Additional information on the project is available on the German Archaeological Institute website: https://www.dainst.org/projekt/-/project-display/199951 and on the Arachne website: https://arachne.dainst.org/project/syrher [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[82] Taken from the presentations: R. Förtsch. 2015. DAI *Syrian Heritage Data in the idai.world. "Monuments Registers", id-lessDamage Assessments and some Defintions* (DAI, MIK),
Ballouz, I., and Vargas-Kock, C. 2015. Damage Assessment. How can European Standards contribute to "Conservation of Cultural Heritage"? (SYRHER, MIK)
Given at Berlin Meeting, 31 July 2015.
[83] AC *Culture Under Threat Map*. Available here: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/culture-under-threat-map/ [Accessed 02/02/2017]

threatened by areas they have occupied between January and October 2015; cultural heritage sites that have been deliberately targeted for destruction, demolition, or attack by violent extremist non-state actors and organizations; World Heritage and Tentative World Heritage sites; museum locations (dedicated specifically to archaeology, history and/or religion); and a heat map of areas with the highest concentrations of incidents of destruction.[84]

Archaeologik Blog (ongoing)
German blog promoting the protection of Syrian heritage since 2012, sharing monthly updates of damage to the Syrian archaeological heritage, with links to the media sources.[85]

Aleppo Project: Conflict Urbanism (2016)
Conflict Urbanism: Aleppo is a project in two stages. The Aleppo Project have built an open-source, interactive, data-rich map of the city of Aleppo, at the neighbourhood scale. Users can navigate the city, with the aid of high resolution satellite imagery from before and during the current civil war, and explore geo-located data about cultural sites and urban damage. They will add data as it becomes available; currently they are grateful for datasets from Human Rights Watch, the United Nations Operational Satellite Applications Programme (UNOSAT), and the Humanitarian Information Unit (HIU) at the U.S. Department of State.

Second, the map is a platform into which additional data of all sorts can be integrated. It is an invitation to students and invited collaborators to record and narrate urban damage in Aleppo — at the cultural, infrastructural, or neighbourhood scale — and to present that research in case studies which will be added to the website over time.[86] [87]

Association for the Protection of Syrian Archaeology (APSA)
APSA continue to update their webpage and Facebook page[88] with important news regarding damage, classified by regions, provinces, site names, monuments, etc. The Filemaker database is only partly public and is shared with other institutions like Interpol. The languages used are Arabic, English, and French.

APSA also now assists groups such as the ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiative in a consulting capacity to document and confirm damage to sites. In addition to individual site updates, they have a number of reports on their website[89] such as a special report on Palmyra.

ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiative (ASOR CHI)
Formerly, ASOR Syrian Heritage Initiative, the project has now expanded to include Iraq, and is now renamed to the Cultural Heritage Initiative.

---

[84] AC *Culture Under Threat Map*. Available here: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/cultureunderthreat-smart-m-app/ [Accessed 14/02/2017]
[85] *Archaeologik* website: Available at: http://archaeologik.blogspot.co.uk/ [Accessed 10/10/15]
Projects: Available at: http://archaeologik.blogspot.de/search/label/Syrien [Accessed 10/10/15]
[86] *Conflict Urbanism*. 2016. Available at: http://c4sr.columbia.edu/conflict-urbanism-aleppo/#about
Additional information is available here http://www.thealeppoproject.com/maps-soon/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[87] Kurgan, L., 2017, Conflict Urbanism, Aleppo: Mapping Urban Damage, *Architectural Design*, 97(1):72-77, http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/ad.2134/abstract
[88] *Association for the Protection of Syrian Archaeology* website. Available at: http://apsa2011.com/apsanew/ [Accessed 11/02/17]
Association for the Protection of Syrian Archaeology Facebook Page. Available at: https://www.facebook.com/apsa2011?fref=ts [Accessed 11/02/17]
[89] *Association for the Protection of Syrian Archaeology* Reports. Available at: http://apsa2011.com/apsanew/category/apsa-repports/ [Accessed 11/02/17]

ASOR CHI document damage in a database, using an Arches platform. Data is sourced from groups such as the Day After Tomorrow and the Association for the Protection of Syrian Archaeology, news and social media sources, Syrian heritage specialists, and satellite imagery analysis to monitor, document, and verify heritage damage. They publish regular reports, which include, a key summary of all reported damage, all published news articles, the military and political context of the damage (i.e. relevant battles, etc.), key recommendations and actions, details of the damage to each site including monitoring and mitigation measures, and whether each report has been checked via satellite imagery. They are available online.[90] More information on their work can also be found in an article by Michael Danti in *Near Eastern Archaeology* 78 (3), September 2015.[91]

As part of this, ASOR run the Heritage Monitor website, enabling anonymous crowdsourcing of damage reports.[92]

In 2016, ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiatives also partnered with TerraWatchers and the Center for Cyber-Archaeology and Sustainability at UCSD to monitor damage to archaeological sites via a crowdsourcing imagery analysis portal.[93]

Bosra al Sham: ASOR CHI and local partners work towards restoration (2015/2016)
ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiatives is working with Syrians on restoration and mitigation in southern Syria. Together with the Humanitarian Research Services (HRS), and supported by the U.S. Department of State and a private funder, they've helped Bosra al Sham Antiquities Department by purchasing equipment and providing relevant training, and by supporting the groups' activities (see Section 2a xv - Reconstruction Projects and Conservation for more Information, and Section 2d - Training/Courses).

After purchasing a generator, office equipment, computers, and digital cameras, the BSAD team performed emergency collections assessments and site assessments and began rehousing the remaining museum and archaeological storehouse collections. Employees catalogued and safely stored the Bosra museum's remaining collections — severely damaged and looted during clashes — and completed more thorough site condition assessments.[94]

Deakin University: Measuring Cultural Property Destruction in Iraq and Syria (2015)
Dr Benjamin Isakhan from Deakin University was awarded the first instalment of a major grant for a three-year project working with the Australian Department of Defence to document heritage destruction in Iraq and Syria. The project involves the creation of sophisticated databases cataloguing the destruction of heritage across Iraq and Syria.[95] This continues from his earlier work in Iraq.[96]

---

[90] *ASOR CHI Reports*: 2016. Available at: http://www.asor-syrianheritage.org/weekly-reports/ [Accessed 28/02/2017]

[91] Danti, M. 2015. The Cultural Heritage Crisis in the Middle East. *Near Eastern Archaeology*. September 2015. Available at: http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5615/neareastarch.78.3.0132 [Accessed 07/03/2017]

[92] *Heritage Monitor* page. Available at: http://www.heritagemonitor.com/en [Accessed 10/10/15]

[93] Savage, S., Danti, M., and Levy, T. 2016. The ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiatives Partner with TerraWatchers and the Center for Cyber-Archaeology and Sustainability at UCSD to Monitor Damage to Archaeological Sites. *ASOR Blog*. 31/5/2016. Available at: http://asorblog.org/2016/05/31/11930/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

[94] *ASOR*. 2016. Mitigation and Restoration Work at Bosra al Sham: Helping Syrians Protect and Preserve Cultural Rights. Available at: http://www.asor.org/news/2016/07/bsad-summary.html [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[95] *Deakin University Website*. Available at: http://www.deakin.edu.au/alfred-deakin-institute/news/documenting-heritage-destruction-in-iraq-and-syria [Accessed 10/04/15]

[96] Isakhan, B. 2012. Recording Heritage Destruction in Iraq. *Taarii Newsletter* 7 (2), 24-27.

Endangered Archaeology in the Middle East and North Africa (EAMENA) (2015 – 2020)

The EAMENA Project is primarily based at Oxford University, although the Syrian team is largely based at Durham University. The project is recording unsurveyed sites in the MENA region, using satellite imagery, survey data and aerial photography, and documenting information about sites and damage to them. They are also hoping to share information with various foreign missions who have worked in Syria (and elsewhere) to obtain as complete a site record as possible. Once complete, data will be made publicly available on their website. The project has now been renewed to December 2019.[97] EAMENA have also received a grant from the Cultural Protection Fund that may include additional work in Syria.[98]

EAMENA is also contributing to the SHIRĪN Syrian Sites and Monuments Record (see Section 2a xii – Site and Object Inventories).

Friends of Maaloula Photo documentation (2014-ongoing)

The Friends of Maaloula sent a camera to Maaloula to document the damage (Sept 2014 report). The photos taken have been uploaded online.[99] The group continue to fundraise to support the people and the town of Maaloula and the Aramaic language.

Heritage for Peace (HfP) Newsletter (2014-ongoing)

A bi-weekly e-newsletter of damage to sites, international actions, and other information concerning the protection of Syria's cultural heritage. Previous newsletters are available online.[100]

Le patrimoine archéologique syrien en danger (LPASD)

This group continue to post updates about damage via their Facebook page.[101]

Monuments of Syria

Ross Burns continues to update the *Monuments of Syria* website with details of damage.[102]

Russia assesses Syrian heritage sites (Autumn 2016)

A team of Russian scientists travelled to Syria in late 2016 to conduct a comprehensive inspection of World Heritage sites which reportedly have been destroyed by air strikes. Researchers visited historically important sites in response to media reports of damage during bombings, with a particular focus on the Ancient Villages of Northern Syria World Heritage

---

- 2014. Creating the Iraq Cultural Property Destruction Database: Calculating a Heritage Destruction Index. *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 2014 (1), 1-21.

[97] *EAMENA.* Available at: www.EAMENA.org [Accessed 10/10/15]

[98] *British Council.* Available at: https://www.britishcouncil.org/arts/culture-development/cultural-protection-fund/projects/endangered-archaeology [Accessed 11/02/17]

[99] *Friends of Maaloula* Website: http://www.rahim.eu/maaloula/aboutus.html
Facebook: https://www.facebook.com/friendsofmaaloula
Photos taken of damage to Maaloula: http://rahim.eu/maaloula/Bilder/ [Accessed 11/02/17]

[100] *Heritage for Peace.* You can subscribe to the newsletter, or, read previous newsletters online: Available at: http://www.heritageforpeace.org/syria-culture-and-heritage/damage-to-cultural-heritage/previous-damage-newsletters/ [Accessed 10/10/

[101] *Le patrimoine archéologique syrien en danger* Facebook page. Available at: https://www.facebook.com/Archeologie.syrienne [Accessed 10/10/2015]
YouTube: http://www.youtube.com/user/SyrianArchaeological [Accessed 10/10/2015]

[102] *Monuments of Syria* website. Available at: http://monumentsofsyria.com/syria-conflict/ [Accessed 11/02/17]

site.[103] According to Russian media, the expedition, headed by Timur Karmov, travelled 20-30 km North-West of Aleppo to monitor the 8 UNESCO archaeological parks. The expedition used the St Simeon Monastery as a base point at least some of the time, although it was on the front lines. Reporting is limited, but apparently, the area didn't suffer much damage. Roman bridges are still in use, although tarmac was laid over the top of them. As long as the site did not have images of animals/ people/ pagan gods, it was left relatively untouched[104].

Safeguarding the Heritage of Syria and Iraq Project Database
The Penn Cultural Heritage Center, the Smithsonian Institution and the American Association for the Advancement of Science have been building a database of the damage to historical sites across the region. Combining ground reports, information from databases and geospatial data to identify and record structures that have sustained damage, the effort has located over 1,200 sites so far, according to the Penn Cultural Heritage Center's website. The work is supported by the National Science Foundation.[105] More information on their work can also be found in an article by Brian Daniels in *Near Eastern Archaeology* 78 (3), September 2015.[106]

Shirīn: Damage Assessments
Shirīn are working with local contacts and other archaeologists to identify site damage and instigate protective measures and are making this information available to relevant people as tee instances are reported by official or non-governmental bodies in Syria and in the rest of the world, and by Shirīn informants. Shirīn intends to develop procedures for checking and confirming cases of damage, to reduce the flow of biased or partisan information. Damage assessments are also conducted by site directors (58 have completed forms), who are asked to review satellite imagery provided by UNOSAT of their site. A SHIRĪN volunteer, remote sensing specialist, made a systematic checking of free access satellite imagery (Google Earth, Bing) and of the 103 images obtained through UNOSAT. Assessments conducted by Directors are available online and they are uploading data concerning damage to sites on an interactive map.[107]

Syrian Heritage Archive Project (SYRHER): Digitisation and Damage Documentation Database
A joint project between the Museum für Islamische Kunst Berlin and the Deutsches Archäologisches Institut. The Syrian Heritage Archive Project (SHAP) is supported by the

---

[103] Izvestia. 2016. Russia to send archaeological expedition to Syria. *Russia Beyond the Headlines*. 23 September 2016. http://ht.ly/jb2j304xMAq [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[104] Rezunkov, V. 2016. Syria's War and Archaeology. *Svoboda*. 25 November 2016. Available at: http://www.svoboda.org/a/28137865.html [Accessed 31/01/2017]
Sputnik News. 2016. Russians in Aleppo: archaeological expedition under the nose of ISIS. *Sputnik News*. 11/11/2016. Available at: http://ru.sputniknews-uz.com/society/20161111/4105385/Russkie-v-Aleppo-ekspedicia.html [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[105] Dor, L B. 2015. Penn Museum works to document, preserve Syrian cultural sites. *The Daily Pennsylvanian*. 23 July 2015. Available at: http://www.thedp.com/article/2015/07/penn-museum-works-to-document-preserve-syrian-cultural-sites [Accessed 10/10/15]

[106] Daniels, B. 2015. The Cultural Heritage Crisis in the Middle East. *Near Eastern Archaeology.* September 2015. Available at: http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5615/neareastarch.78.issue-3 [Accessed 07/03/2017]

[107] *Shirīn Website*. Damage updates are available here: http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=878 and the interactive map is available here http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=799 ;
also see the November newsletter http://Shirīn-international.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/SHIRĪN-Newsletter_Nov2015.pdf
and the June 2016 Newsletter http://Shirīn-international.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/SHIRĪN-Newsletter-June-2016.pdf [Accessed 4/4/17]

Federal Foreign Office. In cooperation with the Museum für Islamische Kunst (SMB), they are creating the database to document the damage occurring to sites, as well as collating Syrian records and archives.[108] (See Section 2a xiv -Information Databases for more information).

TerraWatchers (2015-ongoing)
TerraWatchers is dedicated to providing web-based, crowd sourced satellite image monitoring and overwatch tools for critical missions related to current events. They use interactive Google Maps interfaces to display the latest freely available, high-resolution satellite imagery in their mission footprints, and then crowd source the interpretation, to cover as wide an area as possible, as quickly as possible. Submitted data is then verified and the results of recorded site damage are analysed.[109] In 2016, ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiatives partnered with TerraWatchers and the Center for Cyber-Archaeology and Sustainability at UCSD to monitor damage to archaeological sites via the TerraWatchers Portal. The blog post also contains preliminary results from the TerraWatchers project.[110]

The Day After Heritage Protection Initiative: Site Monitors Project
TDA-HPI established the Site Monitors Project in spring of 2015, a network of local archaeologists, museum curators and activists who act as site monitors. It supports the site monitors by providing training and technical expertise through its contacts with professionals and institutions. The Site Monitors work to:
- Document violations and looting of cultural heritage sites outside areas of regime control. This includes sites controlled by ISIS (Daish).
- Document war damage caused by the ongoing conflict.
- Track the sale and transport of looted antiquities.
- Implement small-scale intervention/preservation projects.

Numerous Site Monitor reports and Damage Reports for sites are available on their website,[111] as are several publications.

The Day After Heritage Protection Initiative: Documenting Damage and Protecting the Contents of the Apamea Museum Phase: I
The mosaics at Apamea are displayed in a 16th century Ottoman caravanserai or khan that has been converted into a museum. Within the courtyard (2450 ft. sq.) of the museum is an impressive collection of Roman military stele. There are also a number of mosaics, funerary stele and a basalt door; all in all about 150 pieces.
Project Objectives:[112]
- Assess the damage to the museum building and identify causes (military/environmental).

---

[108] *Syrian Heritage Archive Project*. Available at: http://www.smb.museum/en/museums-and-institutions/museum-fuer-islamische-kunst/research/erstellung-digitaler-kulturgueterregister-fuer-syrien.html [Accessed 19/10/15]

[109] *TerraWatchers* Website: http://terrawatchers.org/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

[110] Savage, S., Danti, M., and Levy, T. 2016. The ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiatives Partner with TerraWatchers and the Center for Cyber-Archaeology and Sustainability at UCSD to Monitor Damage to Archaeological Sites. *ASOR Blog*. 31/5/2016. Available at: http://asorblog.org/2016/05/31/11930/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

[111] *The Day After Heritage Protection Initiative* - Site Monitor Reports available here: http://hpi.tda-sy.org/en/category/reports/site-monitor-reports/
Damage Reports available here: http://hpi.tda-sy.org/en/category/reports/damage-reports/
Publications http://hpi.tda-sy.org/en/category/publications/ [Accessed 2/3/17]

[112] *Documenting Damage and Protecting the Contents of the Apamea Museum Phase: I*. Available at: https://tinyurl.com/zxcu4up [Accessed 2/3/17]

- Document the contents of the museum.
- Protect the contents of the museum from identified causes.

Work Stages Completed (Objectives 1 and 2):
The following work has been completed after 6 weeks from commencement of project.
First: Prepare an assessment of the damage to the museum and identify causes (military/environmental) (details available on their website).

UNESCO: Emergency assessment mission to Aleppo (16-19 January 2017)
UNESCO led an emergency mission to Aleppo to undertake a preliminary assessment of the extent of damages at the World Heritage site of the Ancient City of Aleppo, as well as the state of educational institutions in the city. The mission noted the incredible resilience of the people of Aleppo and the efforts led by heritage professionals to undertake mitigation actions during the conflict, as well as emergency measures for the recovery phase. Emergency measures were discussed during a number of working meetings with the Aleppo City Council, the DGAM and NGOs, in order to identify adequate proposals and coordinate action. During these consultations, it was proposed to declare the Ancient City of Aleppo an "emergency zone". At the same time, UNESCO is working on an emergency initiative to coordinate international efforts.[113]

UNESCO Rapid Assessment mission to the World Heritage site of Palmyra (April 2016)
The report of the UNESCO Rapid Assessment mission to the World Heritage site of Palmyra (Syrian Arab Republic), 23–27 April 2016 is available on the World Heritage website.[114]

UNESCO UNITAR Partnership uses satellite imagery to assess damage (2016-ongoing)
Thanks to a partnership between UNESCO and the United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR), satellite images developed through UNITAR's UNOSAT programme in 2015 have been contributing to the work of UNESCO and heritage experts to evaluate and protect sites in Iraq, Syria, Yemen and Nepal. A new UNESCO-UNITAR summary report demonstrates how satellite imagery analysis is an increasingly important tool for assessing potential damage to cultural heritage sites.[115]

xiv.   Information Databases (Photo Archives, 3D Models and Others)

Curious Travellers (2016-ongoing)
This project will use freely donated digital images to build computerised 3D-reconstructions of damaged buildings and statues to aid reconstruction and remembrance of important cultural sites. They will also scan older, analogue photographs to amass the largest amount of data possible. Existing models include Palmyra.[116]

---

[113] *UNESCO* Website. 2017. UNESCO reports on extensive damage in first emergency assessment mission to Aleppo. 19 January 2017. Available at: http://en.unesco.org/news/unesco-reports-extensive-damage-first-emergency-assessment-mission-aleppo [Accessed 14/02/2017]

[114] *UNESCO*. UNESCO World Heritage Committee Report 2016 for World Heritage Sites available at: http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/23/documents/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[115] *UNESCO*. 2016. Satellite Imagery helping to monitor cultural heritage sites under threat. Available at: http://en.unesco.org/news/satellite-imagery-helping-monitor-cultural-heritage-sites-under-threat [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[116] *Curious Travellers: Visualising Heritage* website. 2016. Available at: http://www.visualisingheritage.org/CT.php [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Medmak Syrian Archaeologist Centre
An NGO who raise awareness of the damage to Syria heritage with a variety of events. In addition, their website contains sections on laws, campaigns, articles, organisations, conferences, studies, reports and so on (in Arabic).[117]

Manar al-Athar open-access photo-archive (ongoing)
The Manar al-Athar open-access photo-archive at the University of Oxford that provides more than 17,000 high resolution, searchable images, freely-downloadable for teaching, research, heritage projects, and publication. It covers buildings and art in the areas of the former Roman empire which later came under Islamic rule (e.g. Syro-Palestine/the Levant, Arabia, Egypt, and North Africa), from ca. 300 BC to the present, but especially Roman, late antique, and early Islamic art, architecture, and sacred sites. Material is labelled in both English and Arabic. They could be of particularly use in damage assessment comparisons and reconstruction.[118]

Project Anqa (2015-ongoing)
Launched in June 2015 by CyArk and ICOMOS (International Council of Monuments and Sites), Project Anqa was created for the emergency recording of high risk heritage in the Middle East and North Africa. The initiative is designed to deploy teams of international professionals paired with local experts to document cultural heritage sites in 3D before they are damaged or entirely destroyed. Yale's Institute for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage (IPCH) joined the project in late 2015 and is committed to publishing scans online and guiding the annotation of the documents, so that they are accompanied by scholarly data. The approach involves program teams working directly on the ground or working through local partners that we have trained and also provided the necessary equipment. Building local capacity through training is a core part of the commitment to ensuring communities have the knowledge and tools to protect their own culture and heritage.

After training in January 2016, in February 2016 the Syrian team from the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums began 3D documentation of the most important historical monuments in Damascus. To date, laser scan documentation along with photogrammetry has been completed at the Madrasa al-Jaqmaqiyya, and the Bimaristan Nur al-Din. Data from both sites has been submitted to the CyArk Oakland team for further processing who will relay the data on to the Yale Institute for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage.[119]

Million Image Database Project (2015-ongoing)
Roger Michel, of the Institute of Digital Archaeology (a joint venture between Harvard University and the Classics Conclave) intends to flood the area with 3D cameras and enlist local partners to photograph as many items of historical interest as they can. They aim to deploy 5,000 3D cameras in the field in the MENA region by the end of 2015, and hope to capture one million 3D images of at-risk objects by the end of 2016. They have created a heavily modified version of an inexpensive consumer 3D camera that will permit inexperienced users to capture archival-quality scans. The camera has the facility to upload these images automatically to database servers where they can be used for study or, if required, 3D replication. They rely local museums, non-governmental organisations and

---

[117] *MEDMAK* Website. Available at:
https://www.facebook.com/MedmakSyrianArchaeologistStudiescentre/timeline [Accessed 10/10/15]
[118] *Manar al-Athar archive.* Available at: http://www.manar-al-athar.ox.ac.uk/ [Accessed 10/10/15]
[119] *Project Anqa* webpage: http://www.cyark.org/news/project-anqa-progresses-in-2016 [Accessed 4/3/207]

volunteers to carry out the digital archiving. Each camera contains an automated tutorial package that will help field users – local museum affiliates, embedded military, NGO employees and volunteers – both to identify appropriate subject matters and to capture useable images. Reports on the work of their Syrian volunteers are in the Section 1a viii - Local / Regional Initiatives: Locals Work to Protect Sites.

The project website is partially closed to the public to protect volunteer's anonymity and also to ensure that the initiative remains a purely scholarly venture, not a social media platform for activists. The images are collated in a huge, (partially) publicly accessible database (for example, 3D photographs of Palmyra are available here[120]). The archaeological catalogue brings together scholarly information about sites and artifacts, raises awareness of cultural heritage and cultural heritage preservation, and provides a new platform for the identification of trafficked objects. The database will be integratable with existing catalogues and lists of known missing or stolen items and employ the latest image comparison and feature recognition based search technology, removing the need for those inspecting suspect cargo or objects to have specialist knowledge.

They have partnered with New York University's Institute for the Study of the Ancient World to store the 3D images, and with Massachusetts Institute of Technology Three-Dimensional Printing Laboratory to print them, and with UNESCO. All of the associated technology and software is open-source.[121] Details of the 3D printed reconstructions can be found in Section 2a xv – Reconstruction Projects and Conservation.

3D Models - Perpetuity | Palmyra (launched September 2016)
A 3D photogrammetry project, created in partnership with the Institute for Digital Archaeology (above), using photos to make 3D models which are then displayed in virtual reality[122]. (Launched 17 September 2016, this is Arckive 001, 002 and 003 - referred to along with the research portal they intend to add as: Perpetuity | Palmyra).

3D Models – ICONEM
Working with the DGAM, the French company ICONEM have made a number of 3D models of sites in Syria[123]. These include: Crak des Chevaliers; the Umayyad Mosque of Damascus; part of the Royal Palace of Ugarit; the Jableh Theatre; Amrit; the Latakia Museum; Salah el-Din Citadel; and Masyaf Castle. At Palmyra they have completed, or are currently completing, the Museum; the Temple of Bel, architectural plans of the Temple of Bel; and the Citadel. They are also assisting in technical works there to map the damage.[124] An example of their work – the model of the damage to the Temple of Bel - is available on Sketchfab.[125]

---

[120] *The Million Image Database*. 2017. Available at:
http://www.millionimage.org.uk/about/navigator/syria/palmyra/ [Accessed 28/02/2017]
[121] *The IDA website*: http://digitalarchaeology.org.uk/projects [Accessed 18/10/15]
The Million Image Database website is here: http://www.millionimage.org.uk/ [Accessed 11/02/2017]
See also: Belton, P. 2015. *Indiana Joneses run hi-tech race against Islamic State*. 20 June 2015. BBC News. Available at: http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/business-33262530?ocid=socialflow_facebook [Accessed 07/09/15]
[122] *Perpetuity | Palmyra* Website. Available at: http://the-arckives.org/ [Accessed 11/02/2017]
[123] *ICONEM* website. Available here: http://syrianheritagerevival.org/ [Accessed 11/02/2017]
[124] *ICONEM* website. Available at: http://syrianheritagerevival.org/supporting-technical-works-in-palmyra/ [Accessed 11/02/2017]
[125] *ICONEM*. Available at: https://sketchfab.com/models/02c4e194c6d64a4385a30990ed9899bf [Accessed 11/02/2017]

You can also download a free 3D model kit of a statue from Palmyra's Museum on their website.[126]

3D Model - New Palmyra
A Syrian activist, together with an international team, launched #NEWPALMYRA - a project to 3D model Palmyra. The project collects data from international partners, analyzing it, creating a reconstruction of Palmyra in virtual space, and sharing the models and data in the public domain. It also hosts live workshops, building a network of artists, technologists, archaeologists, architects, and others to research, construct models, and create artistic works. It is an Open Data project, helping to advance open data policies in museums and institutions through advocacy, education, and consultation.[127] So far, the Roman theatre at Palmyra is 15% complete; the Temple of Baal Shamin is 20% complete; the Temple of Bel is 30% complete; and the Arch of Triumph is 40% complete. All models are available on their website.

3D Model - Parsons: Palmyra Photogrammetry / Palmyra (2015)
A project by Conan Parsons to use digital photos to build a 3D photogrammetric model of Palmyra before its destruction, perhaps for use in any potential rebuilding of the site.[128] The Facebook page also highlights a number of other similar projects, such as *Model of the Palmyra Bust* at the Australian War Memorial by D. J. Leahy (in progress). [129]

3D model - Palmyra: Temple of Bel 3D
Wissam Wahbeh and Stephan Nebiker in the University of Applied Sciences and Arts Northwestern Switzerland FHNW[130] with the collaboration of Gabriele Fangi from the polytechnic university of the Marche in Italy. The project exploits the potential of dense multi-image 3D reconstruction of destroyed cultural heritage monuments by either using public domain touristic imagery only or by combining them with professional panoramic imagery. The focus of their work is placed on the reconstruction of the lost heritage monuments. This model of the Temple of Bel[131] was created using images from Prof. Gabriele Fangi, the photographer Daniel Demeter, and public domain imagery. The work was presented in the ISPRS conference in Prague, and a link to the paper is below.[132]

---

[126] *ICONEM* website. Available here: http://syrianheritagerevival.org/modele-3d-portrait-palmyre/ [Accessed 11/02/2017]

[127] *Newpalmyra* Website. Available at: http://www.newpalmyra.org/ [Accessed 07/02/2017]

[128] *Palmyra Photogrammetry* available at: https://www.facebook.com/Palmyra3Dmodel [Accessed: 16/10/15]

[129] Facebook page. Available at:
https://www.facebook.com/photo.php?fbid=1763126493951165&set=o.1643549775926603&type=3&theater
[Accessed 28/02/2017]

[130] FHNW Website. Available at: http://www.fhnw.ch/habg/ivgi/startseite?set_language=de [Accessed 07/03/2017]

[131] Wahbhe, W. *Sketchfab* Website. Available at:
https://sketchfab.com/models/51e7f51ca0cf4f9b99d94f0f745e9452 [Accessed 01/2/17]

[132] ISPRS. 2016. COMBINING PUBLIC DOMAIN AND PROFESSIONAL PANORAMIC IMAGERY FOR THE ACCURATE AND DENSE 3D RECONSTRUCTION OF THE DESTROYED BEL TEMPLE IN PALMYRA. *ISPRS*. 6 June 2016. Available at: http://www.isprs-ann-photogramm-remote-sens-spatial-inf-sci.net/III-5/81/2016/ [Accessed 01/02/2017]

3D Model – Palmyra Citadel / Fakhr-al-Din al-Ma'ani Castle
3D model of the castle by Drones Imaging. 3D Modelling by photogrammetry from 260 aerial images taken by Gérard Pouillot & post processing by Drones Imaging - Dense cloud: 149 213 73 points.[133]

3D Model – Objects. Scanning for Syria project (2015 – ongoing)
Hosted by the University of Leiden, this project aims at producing 3D virtual reconstructions of archaeological objects lost during the Syrian conflict.[134] CT scans of casts made by archaeological teams before the conflict will help preserve important information as the techniques provides high definition pictures.

Palmyrena: City, Hinterland and Caravan Trade between Orient and Occident
The photo archive of the Syrian-Norwegian research project *Palmyrena: City, Hinterland and Caravan Trade between Orient and Occident* is also available online.[135]

Shirīn: Database of archaeological projects in Syria (2014-ongoing)
In 2015, Shirīn were working to release a preliminary database of archaeological projects in Syria, which can be ordered by governorate, most recent season, director(s), and damage, with both free access and restricted access files.[136] This project no longer appears on the website, and no further information is available.

Shirīn: Monuments & Buildings Task Force (2016)
In order to document monuments and buildings of cultural or religious value that are currently at risk in the city centres and elsewhere, scholars, architects and experts in the medieval and later periods considered create a special group, working in cooperation with UNESCO related agencies, particularly the UNESCO *Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage* project. However, the project was abandoned because it was not tenable given personnel and financial restraints.[137]

---

[133] Drones Imaging. 2016. *la modélisation 3D du château de Palmyre model*. 11 June 2016. Available at: http://www.dronesimaging.com/modelisation-3d-du-chateau-de-palmyre-syrie/ [Accessed 01/2/17]
[134] Global Heritage. 2016. *Scanning for Syria project*. 9 November 2016. Available at: http://www.globalheritage.nl/news/scanning-for-syria-project [Accessed 28/02/2017]
[135] The Photo Archive of the Syrian-Norwegian research project Palmyrena: City, Hinterland and Caravan Trade between Orient and Occiden*t*. *Ancient World* Online Blog. 02 09 2015. Available at: http://ancientworldonline.blogspot.co.uk/2015/09/the-photo-archive-of-syrian-norwegian.html [Accessed 10/10/15]

[136] *Shirīn Website*. Updates are available here: http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=795 [Accessed 10/10/15]
[137] *Shirīn Website: Concrete Measures*. Available here: http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=795; also see the November newsletter http://Shirīn-international.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/SHIRĪN-Newsletter_Nov2015.pdf [Accessed 28/02/2017]

UNESCO request Foreign Mission information (ongoing)

UNESCO encourages international archaeological missions to provide all available information on historical sites and archaeological artefacts that are potentially at risk in Syria.[138]

xv.   Reconstruction Projects and Conservation

Syrian Reconstruction (ongoing)

In September 2016, Damascus hosted the second international exhibition for the reconstruction of Syria. More than 120 international companies are participating in the event dubbed *Rebuild Syria 2016*[139]. Whilst many sectors were represented, culture was not mentioned in the Press TV report (excepting tourism). Damascus will lean primarily on Russia, China and Iran in rebuilding the country following the war, Syrian President Bashar Assad told Sputnik News[140]. Foreign Minister Walid al-Moualem confirmed Russian companies had been offered priority in reconstruction contracts, with a particular focus on oil and gas.[141] However, Russia has also repeatedly offered aid with the protection of cultural heritage, which has been accepted for at least 2 World Heritage sites (below).

Syrian experts from the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia (ESCWA) are preparing a normative plan that can be implemented by the legitimate authorities once the conflict is over. The reconstruction will be based on three pillars: Reconciliation and social cohesion, political governance and democratization, and economic reconstruction.[142]

---

[138] *UNESCO*. 2013. International archaeological missions in Syria. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-traffic-of-cultural-property/emergency-actions/international-archaeological-missions-in-syria/ [Accessed 12/11/13]

[139] Al-Derzi, Z. 2016. International exhibition for Syria reconstruction launched in Damascus. *Press TV*. 07/09/2016. Available at: http://www.presstv.ir/Detail/2016/09/07/483672/Rebuild-Syria-2016 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
Video clip available on You-Tube here: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZvNuJ1EScRU [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[140] Sputnik. 2016. Damascus to lean on Russia, China, Iran in rebuilding Syria: Assad. *Sputnik News*. 30/03/2016. Available at: http://in.rbth.com/world/2016/03/30/damascus-to-lean-on-russia-china-iran-in-rebuilding-syria-assad_580351 [Accessed 12/2/2017]

[141] *Baladi News*. 2016. Russia destroys Syria, and Damascus gives Moscow priority in reconstruction. 24/11/2016. Available at: http://baladi-news.com/en/news/details/13024/Russia_destroys_Syria,_and_Damascus_gives_Moscow_priority_in_reconstruction [Accessed 12/2/2017]

[142] Haddad, E. 2016. The reconstruction of Syria is preparing. *La Croix*. 27/9/2016. Available at: http://www.la-croix.com/Monde/Moyen-Orient/La-reconstruction-de-la-Syrie-se-prepare-2016-09-27-1200792048 [Accessed 12/2/2017]

Aleppo (ongoing)

The *Aleppo Archive in Exile* contains data of all kinds to the old city of Aleppo: historical documents and maps, plans, texts, 500 cadastral maps, photos, etc. The data derive from various sources like research projects, work of the GIZ and the Old Town administration of Aleppo. The original archive of Aleppo is probably lost, while the digitized one is still available on different hard disks. It is planned to safeguarding the documents of the old city of Aleppo and make data available for other institutes, researchers, etc. through a cooperation with the DAI. The existing Aleppo archive will be enriched with data from other initiatives.[143]

The project also aims to draft the *Plan of the Old City of Aleppo* at a scale 1: 500. The project will return one of the ground floor plan of the main monuments of the UNESCO site to its 2012 plan, selected on the basis of land registry maps and historical documents, and that will be accompanied by elaborate more specific documenting the state of the places of the buildings of that date. The project, which involves the collaboration of experts from the Technical University of Stuttgart and the University of Bari, will serve as the basis for establishing an archive of the ancient city of Aleppo in Cottbus and is part of Stunde Null (Zero Hour), a wider action documentation and digitization of the Syrian heritage that the German archaeological Institute (DAI) and the Museum of Islamic art (MIK) in Berlin have been developing since 2012. At the end of the war the data collected will be synchronized with the database of the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums of Syria (DGAM) and form the basic documentation for the urban restoration and post-war reconstruction.[144] [145]

Numerous debates have been held on reconstruction plans (e.g. Die Altstadt von Aleppo: Strategien für den Wiederaufbau (6 Feb 2015) in Berlin, attended by many experts.[146]; Nada Al Hassan, the Chief of the Arab States Unit at the World Heritage, organised a meeting with a group of multidisciplinary experts in 2015 to brainstorm on the issue of post-conflict reconstruction in the Middle-East context, and in the Ancient City of Aleppo, at UNESCO's Headquarters, in Paris[147]).

The Aleppo Project published a survey conducted with refugees to capture the views of the original residents of Aleppo, many of whom are now refugees, and of local and international professionals, especially those with relevant experience, for consideration during the reconstruction process. The survey is available on their website in Arabic and English.[148]

They have also published a number of reports intended to inform the reconstruction, including a comparison with Beirut, and a report on the possibilities and problems when clearing the rubble (see Section 2f xxxi-xxxii – Publications).

---

[143] Gangler, A., and Nagler, H. 2015. *Aleppo Archive in Exile*. (Universität Stuttgart / BTU Cottbus) Presentation given at Berlin Meeting 31 July 2015.
[144] Neglia, G. A. Aleppo, a map for the reconstruction. *Il giornale dell' Archittetura*. 21 November 2016. Available at: http://ilgiornaledellarchitettura.com/web/2016/11/21/aleppo-una-mappa-per-la-ricostruzione/ [Accessed 12/22017]
[145] *Archaeology Worldwide* Special Issue 2016: 2016. Available at: https://www.dainst.org/documents/10180/2082824/Archaeology+Worldwide+Special+Issue+2016/0e33097d-1071-4c7b-b4dc-85b81a5cb7b2 [Accessed 26/2/2017]
[146] *ANCB Website*. Full program available at: http://www.ancb.de/sixcms/detail.php?id=15009713#.Vgwd3XpViko [Accessed 20/2/15]
[147] *UNESCO Website*. Available at: https://en.unesco.org/events/post-conflict-reconstruction-middle-east-context-and-old-city-aleppo-particular [Accessed 9/09/15]
[148] *The Aleppo Project*: Surveys. Available at: http://www.thealeppoproject.com/surveys/ [Accessed 3/3/2017]

Apamea: The Day After Heritage Protection Initiative: Documenting Damage and Protecting the Contents of the Apamea Museum Phase: I (2016 – ongoing)

The mosaics at Apamea are displayed in a 16th century Ottoman caravanserai or khan that has been converted into a museum. Within the courtyard (2450 ft. sq.) of the museum is an impressive collection of Roman military stele commemorating. There are also a number of mosaics, funerary stele and a basalt door; all in all about 150 pieces.

Project Objectives[149]:
- Assess the damage to the museum building and identify causes (military/environmental).
- Document the contents of the museum.
- Protect the contents of the museum from identified causes.

Work Stages Completed (Objectives 1 and 2):
The following work has been completed after 6 weeks from commencement of project. The preparation of an assessment of the damage to the museum and identify causes (military/environmental) (available on their website).
Additional work is ongoing.

Bosra al Sham (2015/2016)

ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiatives is now working with Syrians on restoration and mitigation in southern Syria. Together with the Humanitarian Research Services (HRS), and supported by the U.S. Department of State and a private funder, they've helped Bosra al Sham Antiquities Department (BASD) by purchasing equipment and providing relevant training, and by supporting the groups' activities. The BSAD team oversaw the removal of military explosives from the site by demolition experts and facilitated cleanup efforts, drawing on local labor. Restoration work has included: restoration of important historic mosques and the museum. The Roman-period theater was cleaned and repaired. The structure has returned to being an important focal point for local community activities. After the restoration work was completed in the Roman theater, the community gathered to hold the First Annual Cell Phone Film Festival. [150] (For more information, see Section 2a xiii – Damage Assessment: Reports and Databases).

Damascus (2013 - ongoing)

In collaboration with ICOMOS, ICCROM and INTERPOL, the DGAM is involved in a project for the protection of the old city of Damascus.[151] An emergency response plan for the Ancient City of Damascus was developed by UNESCO and its partners in 2013 and implemented in 2016 after a major fire.

A first aid support meeting for the ancient city of Damascus was held at UNESCO Office Beirut in the framework of the Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage project funded by the European Union and supported by the Government of Flanders and Austria, and in partnership with the International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property (ICCROM) and the International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS). The meeting, co-organized with the Directorate-General of Antiquities and

---

[149] *Documenting Damage and Protecting the Contents of the Apamea Museum Phase: I.* Available at: https://tinyurl.com/zxcu4up [Accessed 2/3/17]
[150] *ASOR*. 2016. Mitigation and Restoration Work at Bosra al Sham: Helping Syrians Protect and Preserve Cultural Rights. Available at: http://www.asor.org/news/2016/07/bsad-summary.html [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[151] *DGAM* Website. Link no longer valid, but was http://dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=113

Museums (DGAM) and held on November 14 and 15 2016 was an occasion for a delegation from the World Heritage Centre to discuss reconstruction strategies with officials from the DGAM, the Governorate of Damascus, the Ministry of Tourism and other state and civil society experts. The DGAM are to develop a comprehensive and integrated management plan. This plan will be based on a documentation data-base to be developed in cooperation with all governmental institutions concerned, research institutions, universities and experts who studied the city. Following two days of talks about the rehabilitation of the neighbourhood as a pilot project, experts and officials came out with the following conclusions: the need for comprehensive coordination among the various parties managing heritage sites in the city, the inclusion of civil society in reconstruction efforts, awareness-raising among the local population about the risks of storing flammable materials, the value of their heritage and ways to respond effectively in crisis situations. As follow-up to the meeting, UNESCO plans to provide a training to an all-inclusive team from Damascus on disaster risk management issues as well as organise a meeting to identify the most important documentation on the ancient city and other monuments. Identified documents will be digitized in a later stage and kept in a safe place. A joint UNESCO mission is also planned to further discuss the reconstruction of al-Asrooniya neighbourhood on the field[152].

Homs Souk (Autumn 2016)
A UN Development Programme (UNDP) project has begun to revive the souq, which covers 10-20 per cent of the Old City. From August to September workers had cleared 99 per cent of the rubble and debris in the souq, completing the first phase of the UN Development Programme (UNDP) project. The second phase — rebuilding the infrastructure — has begun. A team of 35 architects and engineers are engaged in working out how to restore shops, homes, streets and alleyways using old skills and original materials — local black volcanic stone, wood and metal. The aim is to replicate the souq's 4,600 shops as they were a century ago. Ghassan Jansiz is the architect in charge of the renovation. [153]

Krak des Chevaliers (May 2016)
A French team visited the famous castle of Krak des Chevaliers to offer support and advice to Syrian heritage workers.[154]

Ma'aret al-Nu'man Museum and Ebla Emergency Protection Project (2014-2015)
The emergency project, first conceived during a Syrian cultural heritage emergency workshop in the summer of 2014, was a months' long initiative of an international group of organizations: the Safeguarding the Heritage of Syria and Iraq Project (SHOSI), which is a consortium of the Penn Cultural Heritage Center at the University of Pennsylvania Museum; the Office of the Under Secretary for History, Art, and Culture at the Smithsonian Institution; the Geospatial Technologies Project at the American Association for the Advancement of Science; Shawnee State University, The Day After—a Syrian NGO; and the U.S. Institute of Peace[155]. Local Syrians — activists, archaeologists, and museum staff - (including some members of the Antiquities Center in Free Idlib) repaired the museum under threat of bombardment and artillery fire to buttress the building's distressed structure. They packaged

---

[152] *UNESCO*. 2016. UNESCO meeting discusses the Ancient City of Damascus. 16/11/2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/member-states/single-view/news/unesco_meeting_discusses_the_ancient_city_of_damascus/ [Accessed 12/2/2017]
[153] Jansen, M. 2016. An Emblem of Homs. *The Gulf Today*. 14 October 2016. Available at: http://gulftoday.ae/portal/bb673405-46b8-475a-bae8-7914f4f45f91.aspx [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[154] Reuters. 2016. France helps Syrian archeologists fill in the cracks. *Saudi Gazette*. 27 May 2016. Available at: http://saudigazette.com.sa/world/mena/france-helps-syrian-archeologists-fill-cracks/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

and hid the more portable treasures, coated the mosaics with protective materials, and then set to piling a mountain of sandbags against the museum's walls and roof, a tactic meant to both dissuade looters and absorb shockwaves from bombs. In May, the museum was hit in an airstrike, but the sandbags protected them.[156] [157] The project's in-country team conducted a systematic looting documentation and applied emergency protection to most endangered structures. Additional information is available in Section 2d - Training Courses. Similar emergency intervention has been conducted at the early Bronze Age site of Ebla, a tentative UNESCO World Heritage Site.

A description of the mitigation and restoration work undertaken by The Day After: Heritage Protection Initiative can be found on their website.[158]

SHOSHI are attempting to work within a humanitarian framework in order to support Syrians and Iraqis who are undertaking emergency efforts to protect heritage at risk, assisting in-country professionals and civil society activists in their attempts to protect key heritage sites. The approach combines the empowerment of Syrians and Iraqis in decision-making about their heritage while supporting them with the logistics and resources necessary to carry out emergency efforts.[159]

Maaloula
SOS Chrétiens d'Orient - French Society for Oriental Christians (SOSCO) continue to support fellow Christians in the Middle East. In the Sep 2014 Report, they were hoping to rebuild St George's Church in Maaloula from donations. The photos they took of the damage and details of the trip are available on their website in French.[160]

A workshop at the University of Tübingen (7-9 November 2016) brought together experts from Syria and Germany to discuss the tangible and intangible heritage of Maaloula, to review the damage and loss of cultural and immaterial heritage and to explore possibilities of Arab-German cooperation to work together in post-conflict recovery efforts.
The website is no longer available and workshop outcomes are unknown.

Palmyra
Two Polish specialists representing the Polish Centre of Mediterranean Archaeology, University of Warsaw visited Palmyra just a few days after it was been taken over from the ISIS by Syrian government forces. Conservator, Bartosz Markowski and archaeologist,

---

[155] Penn Museum. 2015. *Emergency Preservation Activities Completed at Syria's Ma'arra Mosaic Museum 5 March 2015*. Available here: http://www.penn.museum/press-releases/1182-syria-emergency-preservation.html [Accessed 21/08/15]

[156] Oelbaum, J. 2016. One foot in the Levant. *Good*. Available at: https://www.good.is/features/issue-36-amr-al-azm?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[157] Nassar, A. and Kieke, S. 2016. In Idlib's ancient Dead Cities, a few try to stem the tide of destruction. Syria Direct. 12 May 2016. Available at: http://syriadirect.org/news/in-idlib%E2%80%99s-ancient-dead-cities-a-few-try-to-stem-the-tide-of-destruction/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[158] *The Day After: Heritage Protection Initiative*. Safeguarding Cultural Heritage. Available at: http://hpi.tda-sy.org/en/category/projects/safeguarding-cultural-heritage/ [Accessed 4/3/2017]

[159] Al Quntar, S., Hanson, K., Daniels, B., and Wegener, C. 2015. The Cultural Heritage Crisis in the Middle East. *Near Eastern Archaeology*. September 2015. Available at: http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5615/neareastarch.78.3.0154 [Accessed 14/02/2017]

[160] *SOS Chrétiens d'Orient*. Rebuilding of St George's Church. Available at: http://www.soschretiensdorient.fr/2014/09/les-travaux-de-reparation-finances-par-sos-chretiens-dorient-ont-commence-a-leglise-saint-georges-de-maaloula-syrie/ and http://www.soschretiensdorient.fr/une-eglise-pour-maaloula/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

Robert Żukowski were there from April 8th till April 14th, following an invitation extended to the PCMA by the Syrian Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums. They were the first foreign experts to reach the city. They presented their observations on the state of Palmyra's antiquities during a press conference on 20th April 2015 at the University of Warsaw[161]. The goal of their mission was to make an initial assessment of destructions in Palmyra, especially to the reliefs and sculptures in the Museum of Palmyra.

The report of the UNESCO Rapid Assessment mission to the World Heritage site of Palmyra (Syrian Arab Republic), 23–27 April 2016 is available on the World Heritage website.[162]

A Russia-drafted resolution on the role of UNESCO in restoring the devastated ancient city of Palmyra back to its former glory was unanimously approved by UNESCO[163]. However, a petition was circulated against UNESCO and Russian plans to reconstruct Palmyra[164]. The possibility of reconstruction at Palmyra proved controversial. The DGAM released a statement on 13 April 2016 about its vision for the reconstruction of Palmyra. [165] Le Patrimonie Archaeologique Syrien en Danger released *An open letter to UNESCO* on 12 April 2016 which voiced concerns over the possible restoration of Palmyra and the fact that Russia may emerge as "*the only partner for the restoration of [Syrian] national identity*". [166] Similarly, Blue Shield issued a statement on Palmyra on April 22 2016, urging caution in the development of plans for the sites' future.[167] Although some feel restoration is inappropriate during conflict, for many Syrians to rebuild is to "*issue a challenge to international terrorism, that no matter what you do you cannot erase our history, and we will not sit idle and weep over the ruins*." [168]

The ARCA blog statement suggested "*Syria's heritage staff deserve encouragement and support, not magnifying glass criticism before conservation projects have even get under way*." [169]

---

[161] *Life in Palmyra, life for Palmyra*. April 2016. Available at: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/life-in-palmyra-life-for-palmyra/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[162] *UNESCO*. UNESCO World Heritage Committee Report 2016 for World Heritage Sites available at: http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/23/documents/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[163] UNESCO Doc 199 EX/28. 08/04/2016. *UNESCO's ROLE IN SAFEGUARDING AND PRESERVING PALMYRA AND OTHER SYRIAN WORLD HERITAGE SITES*. Available here: http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0024/002443/244379e.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[164] *Avaaz Petition:* https://secure.avaaz.org/en/petition/UNESCO_To_act_as_a_neutral_organization_and_stop_the_Palmyra_reconstruction_plans_1/?pv=6 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[165] DGAM. 2016. Statement: The Road to Resurrecting Palmyra. *DGAM*. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1968 [Accessed 21/1/2017]

[166] Othman, A. 2016. Absolute despair with UNESCO: An Open Letter. *Le patrimoine archéologique syrien en danger*. Available at: https://tinyurl.com/hx7subz [Accessed 21/1/2017]

[167] *Blue Shield*. 2016. Palmyra and the wider historic environment in Syria. Available at: http://www.ifla.org/files/assets/hq/topics/cultural-heritage/documents/blue-shield-statement-on-palmyra.pdf [Accessed 21/1/2017]

[168] Abdelkarim, M. 2016. Restoring Syria's pearl of the desert: a reason for optimism amid the storm of terror. *The Guardian*. Available at: https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2016/mar/26/palmyra-syria-isis-maamoun-abdelkarim?CMP=share_btn_fb [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[169] Albertson, L. 2016. The Road to Recovery - DGAM in Syria Issues Initial Statement Regarding its Plans for Palmyra. *ARCA Blog*. Available at: http://art-crime.blogspot.de/2016/04/the-road-to-recovery-dgam-in-syria.html [Accessed 21/1/2017]

The DGAM are in discussion with the Agha Khan Foundation about a project for the restoration of the Museum of Palmyra and the possibility of expansion or construction of a new museum in the future plans. [170]

Syrian leadership offered Russia priority in contracts for the reconstruction of Palmyra, according to Russian senator Dmitry Sablin, who toured Syria[171]. However, Vladimir Tsvetnov, the director of the department of cultural heritage protection, part of the Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation, acknowledges that the task will require the work of international experts and institutions[172]. A large number of 3D models have already been created to aid with this (see Section 2a xiv – Information Databases). The Hermitage Museum has already prepared its Palmyra information.[173]

Demonstrating the potential of the technology, a scale model of the Arch of Triumph was made by the Institute of Digital Archaeology (IDA) using 3D technology, based on photographs of the original arch. Erected in London's Trafalgar Square, the model was unveiled by the mayor of London, Boris Johnson, who said people were there in solidarity with the people of Syria and "*in defiance of the barbarians who destroyed the original*".[174] The opening was attended by the Director of the DGAM. The Arch has gone on to be displayed in other countries, including in New York,[175] and Dubai. This has raised some ethical issues.[176]

Tell Beydar
The Authority of Tourism and Protection of Antiquities in al-Jazira Canton has released a report and pictures of restoration work at Tell Beydar.[177]

Project Tadhir (December 2013 – ongoing)
Ila Souria participated in the Tahdir (European Union) project with the Arab Reform Initiative (France) and the Olof Palme Institute (Sweden) in the training of reconstruction specialists in *Architecture, Urbanism and Sustainable Reconstruction*. The project was launched in December 2015 for 32 months. The objective is to train Syrian professionals for reconstruction in three areas: law and reform of the security sector; local government; and

---

[170] *DGAM* Website: Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2068 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[171] *Baladi News*. 2016. Russia destroys Syria, and Damascus gives Moscow priority in reconstruction. 24/11/2016. Available at: http://baladi-news.com/en/news/details/13024/Russia_destroys_Syria,_and_Damascus_gives_Moscow_priority_in_reconstruction [Accessed 12/2/2017]

[172] Решение о реконструкции Пальмиры может быть принято "спустя годы". 13/2/2017. Available at: https://ria.ru/syria/20170213/1487812202.html [Accessed 12/2/2017]

[173] RBH. 2015. State Hermitage gathering materials to help reconstruct Palmyra. *Russia Beyond the Headlines*. 16/12/2015. Available at: http://rbth.com/multimedia/history/2015/12/16/state-hermitage-gathering-materials-to-help-reconstruct-palmyra_551503 [Accessed 20/12/2015]

[174] Brown, M. 2016. Palmyra's Arch of Triumph recreated in Trafalgar Square. *The Guardian*. 19 April 2016. Available at: https://www.theguardian.com/culture/2016/apr/19/palmyras-triumphal-arch-recreated-in-trafalgar-square [Accessed 02/02/2017]

[175] Martinez, A. 2016. ISIS-Destroyed Syrian Landmark To Be Resurrected in City Hall Park. *The Observer*. 15 Sep 2016. Available at: http://observer.com/2016/09/isis-destroyed-syrian-landmark-to-be-resurrected-in-city-hall-park/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[176] Bond, S. 2016.The Ethics Of 3D-Printing Syria's Cultural Heritage. *Forbes*. 22 September 2016. Available at: http://www.forbes.com/sites/drsarahbond/2016/09/22/does-nycs-new-3d-printed-palmyra-arch-celebrate-syria-or-just-engage-in-digital-colonialism/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[177] Issa, J., Abdo, R., and Al Brri, A., 2016. Restorations of Tell Beydar (Nabada). *Authority of Tourism and Protection of Antiquities in al-Jazira Canton*. Available at: http://desteya-shunwaran.com/ar/restorations-archaeological-site-of-tel-baidar/ [Accessed 2/2/2017]

architecture-urbanism: sustainable reconstruction. [178] In this last area, the association took over the training of ten Syrian trainees last April (2016) in Gaziantep, in southern Turkey: "*We recruited architects, planners or engineers, as many men as women, All of whom have professional experience in the field. Some risked their lives to come from Syria. In the morning, they took theoretical courses on sustainable development, post-conflict reconstruction, heritage, etc. Then they worked on their project, focusing on the case of Maarrat Al-Numan, a town in the province of Idlib", detailed Claude Yacoub (founder of Ila Souria). "One student participated in the development of underground schools in Aleppo. The other has already built temporary terracotta homes in the Idlib area.*"

Project: Stunde Null: A Future for the Time after the Crisis
The German Archaeological Institute set up the project with partners from the Archaeological Heritage Network (ArcHerNet[179]), the Directorate-General for Culture and Communication at the Federal Foreign Office and the Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ). Funding from the Federal Foreign Office's Migration fund supported by the German Federal Parliament will contribute to the project being implemented in the next few years. Syrian experts are working with German colleagues on developing adequate planning processes which they will ultimately be able to implement in reconstruction. Central to the Stunde Null ("*zero hour*") project is the training of Syrian architects, archaeologists, heritage conservationists, construction history specialists, town planners and above all craftsmen with a variety of skills. A large part of the basic and further training will take place in neighbouring countries that have taken in Syrian refugees. For university graduates, scholarships are available for Master's degree courses in monument conservation at Helwan University in Cairo and at the German Jordanian University in Amman. In addition, local workers benefit from vocational training on monument conservation projects in Lebanon, Jordan, Iraq and Turkey and receive further training to become experts in their craft. The project thus complements humanitarian aid: it creates jobs, and through vocational training it improves career prospects in the field of reconstruction and hence preservation of important monuments in the region. Stunde Null is the first project to be carried out by the Archaeological Heritage Network, a network promoting cultural heritage preservation. The network and the project are both sponsored by the Federal Foreign Office.

In a Stunde Null pilot project, Syrian refugees in Jordan and Lebanon are being trained in restoration and conservation (alongside local participants) at the Gadara site, enabling them to acquire practical skills that improve their employment prospects since they will be in demand during post-war reconstruction. From 2016, young adults will receive training in workshops at Gadara. Refugees and local inhabitants are being taught stone masonry techniques at a training camp. Working together on the restoration and conservation of ancient monuments will point the way forward for the reconstruction.

Syrian archaeologists, architects and conservators can also receive further training at the Istanbul Department of the DAI thanks to the support of the Gerda Henkel Foundation. The main focus is on expanding their knowledge base and developing strategies for the consolidation and reconstruction phases in Syria. Freely chosen projects on surveying and documenting, preserving and presenting Syria's cultural assets will be accompanied by

---

[178] Haddad, E. 2016. The reconstruction of Syria is preparing. *La Croix*. 27/9/2016. Available at: http://www.la-croix.com/Monde/Moyen-Orient/La-reconstruction-de-la-Syrie-se-prepare-2016-09-27-1200792048 [Accessed 12/2/2017]

[179] *Archaeological Heritage Network* website. Available at: http://www.dainst.org/project/1869165 [Accessed 12/2/2017]

workshops and seminars offered by German, Turkish and international experts in particularly relevant subject areas. Furthermore, it is envisaged that Syrian refugees should be involved in specific projects on individual monuments in Turkey as skilled or unskilled labourers. This will lead to the formation and training of a primarily Syrian team that can subsequently be deployed in Syria, both in the planning stage and practical work. [180]

Project: Sketch for Syria
SKETCH FOR SYRIA is a global call to architects, artists and innovative thinkers to imagine postwar reconstruction. Follow these simple steps and join a global community of more then 500 personalities that have been invited to share their own personal ideas and designs. SKETCH FOR SYRIA represents a global effort to individuate creative solutions for the upcoming reconstruction. SKETCH FOR SYRIA is promoted by Università Iuav di Venezia in collaboration with UN-ESCWA the National Agenda for the Future of Syria and Aga Khan Award for Architecture.[181]

Supplies: International community supplies materials to DGAM (March 2016)
UNESCO collaborated with the Swiss and the French to support Syrian heritage professionals working in Syria buy supplying materials.[182]

Guidelines on Safeguarding the Cultural Significance of Places Damaged by War and Aggression (2016)
Brandenburg Technical University in Cottbus (BTU) organized a workshop, which included Syrian PhD students, to elaborate *Guidelines on Safeguarding the Cultural Significance of Places Damaged by War and Aggression*. The first workshop has already been held.[183]

Heritage Help Offer (circulated May 2013)
If you are in Syria, or know someone who is in Syria, and are in need of emergency advice on how to care for archaeological sites, historic buildings, and collections of objects, write to <syriaheritagehelp@gmail.com>. All questions will be sent to a professional conservator. The mailbox accepts questions in English and Arabic, and works anonymously.[184]

xvi.   Projects Fighting Illicit Trafficking

Artive: New art recovery database (launched November 2016)
Artive will serve as the first non-for-profit to identify claims in regards to artworks, and will consolidate the seemingly-limitless amount of information about at-risk, stolen, looted, and destroyed works of art and cultural property. The organization will function as an expansion

---

[180] *Stunde Null Project* website. Available at: http://www.dainst.org/projekt/-/project-display/1869856
More information is available in the ArchHerNet publication: Archaeology Worldwide Special Issue 2016: Reconstruction. Available at:
https://www.dainst.org/documents/10180/2082824/Archaeology+Worldwide+Special+Issue+2016/0e33097d-1071-4c7b-b4dc-85b81a5cb7b2 [Accessed 26/2/2017]
[181] *Sketch for Syria* Facebook page. https://www.facebook.com/sketchforsyria/ [Accessed 26/2/2017]
[182] UNESCO. 2016. UNESCO and French and Swiss heritage professionals stand up for the safeguarding of Syrian heritage. *UNESCO* 10 March 2016. Available at: http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1465/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[183] *Archaeology Worldwide* Special Issue 2016: 2016. Available at:
https://www.dainst.org/documents/10180/2082824/Archaeology+Worldwide+Special+Issue+2016/0e33097d-1071-4c7b-b4dc-85b81a5cb7b2 [Accessed 26/2/2017]
[184] The original circulation was in Arabic, and can be viewed here on Facebook:
https://www.facebook.com/Syrian.Antiquities/posts/450104105072347 [Accessed 17/10/15]

of Artclaim, Art Recovery International's pre-existing database project.[185] The database is now online and relevant individual can create an account to register a loss and check the database before an acquisition.[186]

ILLICID project collects data to fight trafficking (2015-2018)
A German project, ILLICID started in 2015 for a 3-year period. The project's scope includes an "*explorative study with special attention to archaeological objects from Iraq and Syria*", and hopes to form policy recommendations for those involved with cultural property, and to build a database for collecting information and tracking the movement of objects. Dr. Markus Hilgert is the ILLICID network coordinator. Next to comprehensive data collection, the project aims to develop recommended actions for actors in the trade with cultural property, to set up a database to collect information, for instance, about suspicious auctions. These data will then be made available to investigators via a dedicated app.[187] The project was initiated by the Prussian Cultural Heritage Foundation (SPK), Berlin, the Fraunhofer Institute for Secure Information Technology (SIT), Darmstadt, and GESIS – Leibniz-Institute for the Social Sciences, Mannheim and finances by the Federal Ministry for Education and Research. Associated partners include the German Federal Foreign Office, the Federal Commissioner for Culture and Media, the German Commission for UNESCO, as well as the ICOM International Observatory on Illicit Traffic in Cultural Goods.[188] A 2016 presentation on the work of the group (in German) is available online here[189].

In 2016 the group began to survey antiquities dealers.[190]

Past for Sale Project (2015-ongoing)
The project is a 3-year initiative, funded by Neubauer Collegium for Culture and Society[191]. It is composed of an interdisciplinary team: archaeologists, art historians, anthropologists, economists, policy makers, and a legal expert. The focus is not on the ground but on the market. It aims to understand looting and trafficking and policy analysis and conduct market design research on illicit trade. It is policy-oriented, focussing on markets and mechanism that regulate / police markets, and is looking at 3 questions:
1) How is the illicit market structured: geographically, industrially, socially. What is the shape of demand, price levels, and how do objects accrue value on the chain?

---

[185] Elbaor, C. 2016. Art Recovery International Launches Global Database to Protect Cultural Heritage. *Artnet news*. 16 November 2016. Available at: https://news.artnet.com/art-world/art-recovery-international-artive-non-profit-cultural-heritage-749840 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[186] Needs an account login: Available here: https://db.artclaim.com/Account/Login?ReturnUrl=%2F
[187] *Observatory Illicit Traffic*. 2015. ILLICID (Verfahren zur Erhellung des Dunkelfeldes als Grundlage für Kriminalitätsbekämpfung und -prävention am Beispiel antiker Kulturgüter). Available at: http://obs-traffic.museum/illicid-verfahren-zur-erhellung-des-dunkelfeldes-als-grundlage-f%C3%BCr-kriminalit%C3%A4tsbek%C3%A4mpfung-und [Accessed 07/02/2017]
[188] *Observatory Illicit Traffic Website*. Available at: http://obs-traffic.museum/illicid-verfahren-zur-erhellung-des-dunkelfeldes-als-grundlage-f%C3%BCr-kriminalit%C3%A4tsbek%C3%A4mpfung-und [Accessed 10/10/15]
[189] *ILLICID*. Illegaler Handel mit Kulturgütern in Deutschland. Transdisziplinäre Forschung für den Kulturgutschutz. Available at: http://www.sifo.de/files/4C_Hilgert_ILLICID_IF16.pdf [Accessed 07/02/2017]
[190] Kampmann, U. 2016. Unter falscher Flagge? Projekt *ILLICID* oder Meinungsumfrage. *MünzenWoche* 7/7/2016. Available at: https://muenzenwoche.de/de/News/Unter-falscher-Flagge-Projekt-ILLICID-oder-Meinungsumfrage/4?&id=4173 [Accessed 07/02/2017]
[191] *Past for Sale* Project: https://neubauercollegium.uchicago.edu/faculty/past_for_sale/
Oveview of the Project on YouTube:
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Y617utUr5jQ&index=5&list=PLFeDqOGNupYl8tiW5HWJmjq6s9Z5WuRL [Accessed 07/02/2017]

2) How do existing laws and regulations affect the market? For example, do seizures affect the market? How have legal actions against unprovenanced antiquities trafficking affected the price of auctioned antiquities?
Findings include the fact that heavy fines or imprisonment alter auction house behaviour and that Criminal penalties are much more effective than civil penalties.
3) How can policies be designed to disrupt market and prevent sale and shift demand from looted artefacts to well-provenanced artefacts? How is it possible to better finance heritage protection?

Modeling the Antiquities Trade in Iraq and Syria (MANTIS) (2015-ongoing)
The MANTIS project is building an innovative multidisciplinary model to estimate the hypothetical value of archaeological material to insurgent groups in Iraq and Syria. Their unique analytical point is a dataset consisting of archaeological and economic data. First, the archaeological data includes detailed observations of objects excavated at a representative sample of sites spanning the Early Bronze Age to the Islamic Period. In tandem, they gather data from observable market activity, separating categories of artifacts collected from auction catalogues and public gallery data. Combining these data sets, they match excavated objects with the same object categories sold on the market. Using a statistical technique called imputation, they then generate a range of reasonable prices for objects that may have come directly from the ground. With this range, they can estimate unexcavated objects' potential value on the visible market. The black market trade in antiquities is opaque and poorly understood. The prices paid directly to looters are difficult to measure. As a result, the team uses the most recent evidence to estimate the fraction of market price that may be paid to the source.[192]

Protecting Cultural Heritage: An Imperative for Humanity (2016)
In response to the growing international calls to protect cultural heritage, Italy and Jordan, together with INTERPOL, UNESCO and UNODC, embarked on a high-level partnership on *Protecting Cultural Heritage – An Imperative for Humanity: Acting Together Against the Destruction and Trafficking of Cultural Property by Terrorist Groups and Organized Crime*. The goal of the project is to galvanize the international community and the United Nations to implement the above-mentioned legal instruments and to take stronger and more coordinated action against growing threats to cultural property and heritage. This project has a strong component relating to looting and illicit trafficking; however, it also covers site destruction. For full details, see Section 2a xviii – Projects Other. The final report on the project with recommendations for actions is available online.[193]

ICOM / EU: International Observatory on Illicit Traffic in Cultural Goods (January 2013 - ongoing)
The European Commission is working to better enforce the prohibition of trade in certain cultural goods from Iraq and Syria. The EU is funding a collaborative platform designed by the International Council of Museums. Together with the European External Action Service, the Commission is exploring ways to intensify cooperation with organisations working for the preservation of cultural heritage.[194] The Project's website[195] presents various Emergency Red

---

[192] *MANTIS Project* website: https://oi.uchicago.edu/research/projects/mantis [Accessed 28/02/2017]
[193] The full report with recommendations is available here: United Nations. 2016. *Protecting Cultural Heritage – an Imperative for Humanity*. Document available at: http://www.unesco.se/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/2016-Protecting-cultural-heritage.-An-imperative....pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[194] EC Europa. A hidden gem: the role of culture in making Europe a stronger global actor. 03 September 2015. *EC Europa* Website. Available at: http://ec.europa.eu/commission/2014-

lists, updates on looting and thefts, recovery and restitutions, and offers a database of resources from cultural institutions from around the world. No new updates are available since 2015.

ICOM Syrian Red List (2014 ongoing)
ICOM continue to circulate their *Red List* of looted Syrian objects. The *Red Lists* classify the endangered categories of archaeological objects or works of art in the most vulnerable areas of the world, in order to prevent them being sold or illegally exported. In addition to providing border and customs forces with a valuable tool to recognise looted objects, they are an important awareness raising tool.[196]

International Observatory of Syrian Cultural Heritage (March 2014 – ongoing)
UNESCO are working to monitor and assess the cultural heritage situation in Syria through updated and continued knowledge and documentation. This webpage organizes information on the various initiatives.[197] UNESCO also work with the Syrian DGAM and others, such as Interpol to raise awareness about looting and illicit trafficking. The page of the project provides links to relevant stakeholders, policies, videos. More details of their work are available on their webpage[198] and in Section 2a xviii - Projects Other.

UNESCO hosts illicit trafficking meetings (30 March 2016, 28 April 2016)
The movement of cultural property in 2016: regulation, international cooperation and professional diligence for the protection of cultural heritage was held on 30 March 2016 by UNESCO. This one-day round table focused on the art market and its important role in the fight against the illicit trafficking of cultural property. This event brought together for the first time market stakeholders, including representatives of auction houses and online platforms, museum representatives, cultural heritage experts, specialized intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations as well as Member States, to take stock on the situation of the illicit trade in cultural heritage and identify areas to improve synergies and strengthen international cooperation to successfully overcome this worldwide issue.
Details of the event and webcasts are available online.[199]

The Permanent Missions of Jordan and Italy to the United Nations, together with UNESCO, INTERPOL, and UNODC, organized an expert meeting on the illicit trafficking of cultural property in transit countries. This meeting was organized within the partnership initiative

2019/navracsics/announcements/hidden-gem-role-culture-making-europe-stronger-global-actor_en [Accessed 07/09/15]

[195] *International Observatory on Illicit Traffic in Cultural Goods* Website. Available at: http://obs-traffic.museum/

[196] ICOM. Red List Database. *ICOM*. Available at: http://icom.museum/programmes/fighting-illicit-traffic/red-list/ [Accessed 28/02/2017]

[197] *International Observatory of Syrian Cultural Heritage*. Available at: http://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/ [Accessed 28/02/2017]

[198] *UNESCO Website*. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property/awareness-raising-initiatives/help-stop-the-destruction-of-cultural-heritage-in-syria-and-iraq/ [Accessed 24/09/15]

[199] Events details and links to webcasts: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/the-movement-of-cultural-property-in-2016-regulation-international-cooperation-and-professional-diligence-for-the-protection-of-cultural-heritage/ [Accessed 3/3/2017]

Protecting Cultural Heritage – an Imperative for Humanity: Acting together against the destruction and trafficking of cultural property by terrorist groups and organized crime.[200][201]

The Intergovernmental Committee for Promoting the Return of Cultural Property to its Countries of Origin or its Restitution in case of Illicit Appropriation (ICPRCP) convened on September 29 in UNESCO's Paris headquarters to discuss the problematic growth of freeports as means of illegally trafficking art and cultural property. A new UNESCO report suggests that freeports are providing havens for looted items.[202]

Interpol
Interpol continue to work to track stolen property from Syria and elsewhere and collaborate with UNESCO and other international institutions. This includes a special appeal for work stolen from Palmyra.[203] The sculptures are also featured in the INTERPOL database of stolen works of art, along with 42 other items reported stolen from Palmyra.

"Between 2014 and 2015, a total of 22 bas-relief sculptures were stolen from the Artaban tomb in Palmyra, Syria. At the request of the INTERPOL National Central Bureau in Damascus, a special poster featuring seven of the stolen sculptures has been issued to raise awareness of the thefts and to facilitate their recovery. In addition to highlighting the cultural damage being carried out in Syria, and in other conflict zones such as Afghanistan, Iraq and Libya, the posters are an effective reminder to private collectors and auction houses to check the provenance of objects before their purchase."

Interpol are also hosting expert meetings on stolen cultural property, attended by the DGAM wherever possible, on the situation in Syria and Iraq. The meeting on 8-9 March 2016 looked at the known transit and destination (end market) countries, in order to find ways to restrict the financing of organized crime and terrorism from the Middle East. The UNESCO Resolution 2199 of 2015 on the illicit funding of terrorist groups and the current status of work in its implementation was also been discussed.[204]

This was followed by an INTERPOL *Conference to Strengthen the Fight against Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Objects* (14-15 December 2016). The aim of the conference was to assess the implementation of UN Security Council Resolution 2199/2015 for the protection of cultural heritage in the Middle East, one year after its adoption. Experts and officials from Syria and Iraq spoke about the difficulties of providing proper documentation for artefacts taken from archaeological sites during illicit excavations. They also evoked the difficulties they sometimes faced in the requests for restitution from destination countries. Following discussions, the conference's attendees agreed on the importance of strengthening the legal

---

[200] UNESCO. 2016. Curbing the illicit trafficking of cultural property: focusing on countries of transition and the application of criminal justice. *UNESCO*. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property/meetings/un-april-meeting/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[201] United Nations. 2016. *Protecting Cultural Heritage – an Imperative for Humanity*. Document available at: http://www.unesco.se/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/2016-Protecting-cultural-heritage.-An-imperative....pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[202] *UNESCO*. 2016. *Free Ports and risks of illicit trafficking of cultural propert*y. ICPRCP/16/20.COM/12. UNESCO Paris, July 2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/pdf/2_FC_free_port_working_document_Final_EN_revclean.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[203] Interpol. *Sculptures stolen in Palmyra, Syria, Special Appeal*. Available here: https://www.interpol.int/Media/Files/Crime-areas/Works-of-art/Poster/Sculptures-stolen-in-Palmyra,-Syria [Accessed 20/2/2017]
[204] *DGAM* website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1934 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

framework for the seizure and restitution of cultural artefacts, as well as meeting effectively the demands of Syria and Iraq for restitution. Other recommendations included increased cooperation among national police and customs.[205]

Cultural Property: Protection of Iraqi and Syrian Antiquities
The United States Government Accountability Office was asked to examine the protection of Iraqi and Syrian cultural property, including views of art market experts. In August 2016, they published a report which describes (1) activities undertaken by U.S. agencies and the Smithsonian Institution to protect Iraqi and Syrian cultural property since 2011, and (2) art market experts' suggestions for improving U.S. government activities. GAO reviewed documents and interviewed U.S., international, and foreign officials. GAO interviewed a nongeneralizable sample of U.S.-based art market experts representing different categories of the art market to obtain suggestions for potentially improving U.S. government activities. GAO then asked experts to rate the importance of these suggestions and obtained U.S. officials' views on experts' top-rated suggestions[206].

Cairo Declaration Task Force and Centre (May 2015)
The Cairo Declaration was created by the Antiquities Coalition and partners, and agreed at the Cairo Conference: *Cultural Property Under Threat.* It outlines a regional action plan that the countries will take together, including:
- Establishing a high-level MENA task force that will coordinate regional and international efforts against cultural racketeering
- Creating an international Advisory Council that will provide support to the Task Force
- Initiating negotiations for a regional cultural Memorandum of Understanding with demand countries
- Launching domestic and international campaigns against looting, trafficking, and the black market trade
- Establishing an independent centre to combat antiquities laundering

Countries announcing the Declaration include Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Kuwait, Lebanon, Libya, Oman, Saudi Arabia, Sudan, and the United Arab Emirates.[207] Although Syria did not announce the declaration, it will impact the country. A number of Antiquities Coalition activities are listed in this report (e.g. next).

MENA diplomats convened in Washington DC in March 2016 to identify key regional concerns related to antiquities destruction and trafficking, develop common areas of interest, and determine specific goals for the regional Task Force established by the Cairo Declaration.[208]

---

[205] *UNESCO* Website. 2016. INTERPOL Conference to Strengthen the Fight against Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Objects. 20 December 2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/beirut/single-view/news/interpol_conference_to_strengthen_the_fight_against_illicit [Accessed 14/02/2017]

[206] *GAO*. 2016. *CULTURAL PROPERTY: Protection of Iraqi and Syrian Antiquities*. Report GAO-16-673. August 2016. Available at: http://www.gao.gov/assets/680/679075.pdf [Accessed 03/02/2017]

[207] *Middle East Institute*. 2015. Ten Middle East and North African Countries Announce Cairo Declaration to take steps to prevent the War Crime of Looting and the destruction of Heritage.14 May 2015. Available at: http://www.mei.edu/content/article/countries-sign-declaration-prevent-antiquities-looting-middle-east
Also see: *Antiquities Coalition*. 2015. Article on 2015 Cairo Conference: Cultural Property Under Threat. 26 May 2015. Available at: http://www.theantiquitiescoalition.org/2015-cairo-conference-cultural-property-under-threat/ [Accessed 24/08/15]

[208] Antiquities Coalition. 2016. MENA Diplomats Convene in Washington to Address #CultureUnderThreat. *Antiquities Coalition*. March 2016. Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/blog-posts/mena-diplomats-convene-in-washington-to-address-cultureunderthreat/?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 31/1/2017]

In September 2016, at the Culture Under Threat Conference (II) in Jordan, the MENA Task Force for Cultural Racketeering put into effect a five-part action for the coming year.

1. Develop capacity building programs
2. Explore bilateral Cultural Memoranda of Understanding and strengthen regional collaboration
3. Establish information sharing mechanisms
4. Raise awareness about cultural racketeering's impact on global economics and security
5. Launch jobs initiatives at heritage sites[209]

New Antiquities Coalition Policy Papers (2016-ongoing)
The Antiquities Coalition has launched a series of policy papers and recommendations aimed at stopping the trade in illicit antiquities. On 13 April 2016, the Antiquities Coalition launched its *Culture Under Threat Task Force Report*, with multiple recommendations for how America, and other countries can fight "cultural crimes", and prevent illicit trafficking.[210]

In November 2016, it was followed up by the formation of a Cultural Heritage Think Tank, who launched their first policy paper by Ricardo St. Hilaire titled *How to end Impunity for Antiquities Traffickers: Assemble a Cultural Heritage Crimes Prosecution Team*.[211] The paper suggests clear actions to be taken by the US Department of Justice such as the creation of an office of Cultural Heritage Crimes (CHC) Prosecutors in order to "*hold antiquities traffickers accountable, to disrupt and dismantle their networks, and to give support to police and prosecutors at the local, county, state, and federal levels*".

Policy Brief 2 was launched in December 2016, by Lawrence Rothfield, titled *How Can We Fund the Fight Against Antiquities Looting and Trafficking? A "Pollution" Tax on the Antiquities Trade*[212]. The key recommendation is an antiquities tax, tailored to fall more heavily on antiquities with weaker provenance or extremely high prices, and channelled into an antiquities-protection "Superfund" (as was done to clean up toxic chemical sites) or via existing governmental agencies, could provide a sustainable funding stream to pay for more robust monitoring and enforcement efforts against the illicit market and for better site security.

Expert recommendations from the conference: *Fighting the looting of Syria´s cultural heritage*, **Sofia (16 September 2015)**

---

[209] Antiquities Coalition. 2016. Middle East and North African Countries Unite to Fight Antiquities Looting, the Destruction of Cultural Heritage, and Terrorist Financing. *Antiquities Coalition*. Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/press-releases/middle-east-and-north-african-countries-unite-to-fight-antiquities-looting-the-destruction-of-cultural-heritage-and-terrorist-financing/ [Accessed 03/02/2017]

[210] *Antiquities Coalition Website*. 2016. Cultureunderthreat Task Force Report. Available at: http://taskforce.theantiquitiescoalition.org/ [Accessed 03/02/2017]

[211] *Antiquities Coalition*. 2016. Antiquities Coalition Launches New Think Tank Promoting Innovative Solutions to Combat Cultural Racketeering. Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/press-releases/antiquities-coalition-launches-new-think-tank-promoting-innovative-solutions-to-combat-cultural-racketeering/?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[212] *Antiquities Coalition Policy Brief no. 2*. Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/blog-posts/policy-brief-no-2-how-can-we-fund-the-fight-against-antiquities-looting-and-trafficking-a-pollution-tax-on-the-antiquities-trade/ [Accessed 2/2/2017]

The Norwegian Institute for Cultural Heritage Research offered 16 recommendations to fight the looting of Syria's heritage. These are based on the outcomes of their international conference held in September 2015. The recommendations are made as "ideal recommendations" with an understanding that differences in legislative traditions and political settings between the nations are going to inevitably affect the reception and eventual implementation of the recommendations offered.[213]

Culture Under Threat Videos (2016 ongoing)
The Antiquities Coalition launched a video series titled *Culture Under Threat: Terrorism and Profiteering*. It features international experts offering solutions to and analysis of the looting crisis, illicit antiquities trade, and its connection to terrorism. Videos are available on the Antiquities Coalition website.[214]

---

[213] *NIKU*. 2015. Expert recommendations - Fighting the looting of Syria´s cultural heritage. Available at : http://www.niku.no/en/international/conferences/Expert+recommendations+-+Fighting+the+looting+of+Syria%C2%B4s+cultural+heritage.9UFRDWZF.ips [Accessed 06/02/2017]
[214] *Culture Under Threat: Terrorism and Profiteering* - http://theantiquitiescoalition.blogspot.ca/2015/06/introducing-antiquities-coalitions-new_23.html [Accessed 10/10/15]

Dartmouth University study published on looting (2015)
Using high-resolution satellite imagery, a study from the Syrian Heritage Project (ASOR –
US Department of State) and Dartmouth University examined the widespread nature of
looting in Syria, arguing that numerous groups may be involved in the antiquities market. [215]
[216]

Shirīn: Looted object identification & contact with the art market (2014-ongoing)
The NGO Shirīn are assisting in the identification of objects that may have been illicitly
looted, using contacts with art markets. They can provide archaeological expertise to identify
looted objects, and, if possible, their place of origin.[217] They have a number of national
committees to provide expertise in specific countries, including Australia, Belgium, France,
Germany, Japan and Poland[218].

In order to contribute to a reduction in the illicit traffic in antiquities, Shirīn will contact the
main actors in the Art Market and all the national antiquarian trade associations to inform
them about the current situation and possible legal issues. They seek to encourage a fruitful
dialogue rather than unproductive confrontation. (Monitored by H. Kühne, together with the
heads of the Shirīn national committees)[219]. The initial goals of the Belgian national
committee in particular are to analyze the damages to archaeological sites and to bring
expertise on the trafficking of heritage objects by keeping in contact with auction houses[220].

The National Museum, Beirut, offers heritage protection advice (4 Sep 2015)
Having already been through a traumatic civil war, The National Museum in Beirut is
working to stop the illegal trade in Syrian antiquities.[221] In addition, they are collaborating
with the cultural heritage NGO Biladi to raise awareness in the Lebanese youth about the
importance of protecting cultural heritage. [222]

FBI Intelligence Threat Study (August 2014)
The FBI completed an *Intelligence Threat Study*, and sent it to the US Congress. It considers
new legislation to sanction dealing in looted antiquities in Syria. Listed are 12 areas in the
illicit antiquities trade for which the FBI claims there are "intelligence gaps." Seven of them
are:
-   What is the overall value of the illicit antiquities trade in the US?
-   Where are the largest global networks in this trade?

[215] Casana, J. 2015. Satellite Imagery-Based Analysis of Archaeological Looting in Syria. *Near Eastern
Archaeology* 78(3). September 2015. Available at:
http://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/10.5615/neareastarch.78.3.0142.pdf [Accessed 07/02/2017]
[216] Cascone, S. 2015. New Study Reveals ISIS Isn't the Only Group Looting and Destroying Syrian Cultural
Sites. *Artnet News*. 21 October 2015. Available at: https://news.artnet.com/art-world/looting-syrian-cultural-
sites-assad-regime-344165 [Accessed 07/02/2017]
[217] *Shirīn Website Traffic in Antiquities*. Updates are available here: http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=797
[Accessed 07/02/2017]
[218] *Shirīn National Committees*. Available here: http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=1283 [Accessed
28/02/2017]
[219] *Shirīn Website Concrete Measures*. Updates are available here: http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=795
[Accessed 07/02/2017]
[220] *Shirīn Website November 2015 Newsletter* http://Shirīn-international.org/wp-
content/uploads/2017/01/SHIRĪN-Newsletter_Nov2015.pdf [Accessed 07/02/2017]
[221] Metzker, J. 2015. Fighting to save the region's cultural heritage. *Qantara* Website. 04 Sep 2015. Available at:
https://en.qantara.de/content/the-national-museum-in-beirut-fighting-to-save-the-regions-cultural-heritage
[Accessed 10/10/15]
[222] *Biladi* Website. 2017. Available at: http://www.biladi.org/ [Accessed 27/02/2017]

- How many and which US-based art dealers are trading in stolen or looted goods from Syria?
- To what extent are US or foreign government workers involved in the illegal trade?
- Are the networks specializing in the illicit antiquities trade also involved in other criminal activities?
- How are the proceeds from illegal trade in the United States then transferred back to the networks in the countries of origin?
- Who are the most active carriers and which countries do they come from? Are the carriers also involved in the drug trade, human trafficking or any other smuggling?

The FBI is appealing for any information that can assist in filling these gaps.[223]

Reward for Information on Da'esh's programme of looting (Sep 2015)
The Rewards for Justice Programme announced they are offering a reward of up to $5 million for information leading to the significant disruption of the sale and/or trade of oil and antiquities by the Islamic State.[224]

Mailing list for further information (2015-ongoing)
The Anonymous Swiss Collector Webpage has created a list of opportunities and a mailing list related to opportunities and conferences in the fields of art crime, antiquities trafficking, provenance studies, art authentication, repatriation and cultural property law.[225]

xvii. Projects Relating to Intangible Heritage

Study to analyse damage to intangible heritage (November 2016)
The impact of forced displacement on Syria's traditional crafts and cultural heritage, and the people directly involved in it, is to be analysed in a new research project. Academics from the University of Plymouth will study the industries that have survived among refugee communities forcibly displaced to the neighbouring state of Jordan since 2011.[226]

Aramaic classes restart in Maaloula (June 2016)
With support from the Friends of Maaloula, Aramaic classes were able to restart in Maaloula on 16 June 2016: 60 children participated in the class.[227]

Syrian craftsmanship encouraged (ongoing)
The Lebanese NGO Ninurta-Artisans des Pays du Machrek hosts several Syrian artisans and help them present and sell their traditional production, providing economic revenue and participating to the protection of intangible heritage.[228]

---

[223] Lamb, F. 2014. Looting is the Greatest Threat to our Cultural Heritage in Syria. *Foreign Policy Journal*. 29 September 2014. Available at: http://www.foreignpolicyjournal.com/2014/12/29/looting-is-the-greatest-threat-to-our-cultural-heritage-in-syria/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

[224] *Rewards for Justice.* Act of Terror: Information that leads to the significant disruption of...Trafficking in Oil and Antiquities Benefiting the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL). Available at: https://www.rewardsforjustice.net/english/trafficking_oil_and_antiquities.html [Accessed 10/10/15]

[225] *Anonymous Swiss Collector Opportunities* - Subscribe here: http://www.anonymousswisscollector.com/opportunities

[226] Williams, A. 2016. Study examines challenges facing refugee artisans displaced by civil war in Syria. *Plymouth University*. 17 November 2016. Available at: https://www.plymouth.ac.uk/news/research-examines-challenges-facing-refugee-artisans-displaced-by-civil-war-in-syria [Accessed 03/02/2017]

[227] Aramäischunterricht in Maaloula26 .June 2016. *Hilfe für das Aramäerdorf Maaloula e.V.* Available at: http://friendsofmaaloula.de/blog/2016/06/26/aramaeischunterricht-in-maaloula%e2%80%8f/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

SHOSHI are also working with women in local Syrian communities to revive traditional handcrafts[229].

The Beirut-based NGO Basmeh and Zeitooneh has put in place a number of projects with refugees, some with a focus on near eastern arts and culture.[230] The women's workshop provides economic empowerment through craft production while the Arts and Cultural "*provide a free space for creativity and art to the community in Shatila refugee camp*".[231]

Several other projects aim at supporting Syrian craftsmanship have been developed in the past few years, such as SCI Ecovillage in Sweden,[232] the European Institute of cooperation and development[233], and the UNHCR.[234]

Syrian Music Preserved (2011-ongoing)
Jason Hamacher made several trips to Syria before the conflict, taking photos and recording ancient Sufi and Christian chants.[235] He is publishing recording of the chants on CD.[236]

With the aim of enhancing the safeguarding of Syrian traditional music, UNESCO organized a one-day first aid support meeting for Syrian musicians and music experts in Paris (13 May 2016). The meeting was organized within the framework of UNESCO's Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage project, funded by the European Union and supported by the Flemish Government and the Government of Austria. It brought together seven leading musicians and music experts from different cultural backgrounds and various regions of Syria, with representatives from the International Music Council, UNESCO specialized staff and UNESCO institutional partners. Participants shared their personal experiences in the meeting and discussed mechanisms to ensure the transmission and preservation of Syrian traditional musics in spite of the current crisis situation.[237]

al-Hakawati – the Storyteller - Syrian storytelling preserved (2014-2015)
The Swedish Foundation Cultural Heritage without Borders started a new project focussing on the preservation of one of Syria's intangible cultural heritages, the tradition of oral

[228] Institut Francais. 2015. *Marché de Noël solidaire*. Available at: http://www.institutfrancais-liban.com/Beyrouth/Cooperation-territoriale-ONG-Gouvernance/Actualites/Marche-de-Noel-solidaire [Accessed 27/02/2017]

[229] *Penn Cultural Heritage Centre Website.* Available here: https://penncurrent.upenn.edu/features/the-past-present-and-future-of-cultural-heritage

[230] Basmeh & Zeitooneh Website. 2017. *Our Programs*. Available at: http://www.basmeh-zeitooneh.org/our-programs [Accessed 27/02/2017]

[231] Basmeh & Zeitooneh Website. 2017. *Arts and Cultural Center*. Available at: http://www.basmeh-zeitooneh.org/our-programs/arts-and-cultural-center [Accessed 27/02/2017]

[232] Ecovillage Website. 2015. *The Syrian Initiative Craftsmanship Ecovillage (SICE).* Available at: http://www.ecovillage.nu/2015/03/29/the-syrian-initiative-peace-ecovillage-of-sweden-sipes/ [Accessed 27/02/2017]

[233] *IECD* Website. 2017. Available at: http://www.iecd.org/ [Accessed 27/02/2017]

[234] *UNHCR*. 2016. Refugee Artisan Project. Available at: http://innovation.unhcr.org/labs_post/refugee-artisan-project/ [Accessed 27/02/2017]

[235] Gross, T. 2014. Before War, A Punk Drummer Preserved Syrian Chants. *NPR interview – Fresh Air*. 07 August 2014. Available at: http://www.npr.org/2014/08/07/338586411/before-war-a-punk-drummer-preserved-syrian-chants [Accessed 09 August 2014]

[236] *SACRED VOICES OF SYRIA* VOL 1 - http://www.lostsoundseries.com/

[237] *UNESCO* Website. 2016. Syrian experts unite at UNESCO to preserve Syrian traditional music. 14 May 2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/beirut/single-view/news/syrian_experts_unite_at_unesco_to_preserve_syrian_traditiona [Accessed 14/02/2017]

storytelling. The name of the project is al- Hakawati – the Storyteller. The basic idea of the project is to capture elements of traditional storytelling and record them in a bilingual (Arabic -English) anthology to ensure that the stories remain available and can be spread outside of its direct targets groups.[238] In 2015, the project went on a storytelling tour in Sweden.[239]

Syriac Gazetteer (2014-ongoing)
The Syriac Gazetteer, an online geographical dictionary, is the first in a series of reference works launched by Syriaca.org to document and save ancient and medieval Middle Eastern cultural heritage now threatened by civil war and political instability. The Gazetteer contains descriptions of more than 2,400 places relevant to the study of Syriac. These entries, written in English, Arabic and Syriac, range from ancient centers of Syriac culture such as Edessa, located in what is modern-day Turkey, to Piscataway, N.J., where Syriac scholarship is still being produced by heritage communities. Syriaca.org's online tools serve a broad audience interested in the Syriac cultural heritage, including researchers and students in Middle Eastern studies, classics, medieval history, religious studies, biblical studies and linguistics. In addition, the online portal is available for use by Syriac heritage communities and the public. All resources of Syriaca.org are published in a free and open format using Creative Commons licenses. Interested individuals can explore The Syriac Gazetteer by browsing the interactive map. Readers can also search for specific types of places such as churches or topography.[240]
Canadian Centre for Epigraphic Documents (CCED)
An independent centre based at the University of Toronto (Canada). The centre doesn't receive funding and is staffed entirely by volunteers – librarians, archivists and graduate students who dedicate many hours to preserving and digitizing extant copies of inscriptions, and is giving particular focus to preserving Syriac inscriptions[241].

Website for inventory of intangible heritage of Syria (2014-201?)
An interactive website to inventory elements of the intangible heritage of Syria in a database was launched. Cooperation efforts included those of the Syrian Society for Culture and Knowledge, the Archeology and Museums Directorate of the Ministry of Culture and the Unit of Supporting and Developing National Museums and Cultural Heritage Sites.[242]

The Creative Memory of the Syrian Revolution (2014 - ongoing)
The revolution established a space for ingenuity that has astounded us, the Syrians, before even making its mark on the rest of the world, and we wonder, where had all this talent in satire, art, and innovation been? The outburst of the uprising against oppression and tyranny brought on a surge of these remarkable, latent energies, the spontaneous and the organized, in a way never before seen in all of Syria's years marked by repression and injustice. History relays similar experiences. This project aims to archive all the intellectual and artistic expressions in the age of revolution; it is writing, recording, and collecting stories of the

[238] Kulturarv utan gränser. 2013. Storytelling project for Syria. *Cultural Heritage Without Borders*. 09 January 2014. Available at: http://www.chwb.org/index.php?newsId=330 [Accessed 13 January 2014]
[239] Syria: 'al-Hakawati' – the Storytelling Tour in Sweden 2015. Available at:
http://chwb.org/others/activities/syria-al-hakawati-storytelling-tour-sweden-2015/ [Accessed 3/3/2017]
[240] *Gazeteer Website:* http://syriaca.org/geo/index.html [Accessed 03/02/2017]
Deer Owens, A M. 2014. 'Syriac Gazetteer' preserves endangered Middle East cultures'. *Research News@Vanderbilt*. 23 April 2014. Available at: http://news.vanderbilt.edu/2014/04/syriac-gazetteer/ [Accessed 25 April 2014]
[241] CCED website. Available here: http://www.epigraphy.ca/ [Accessed 03/02/2017]
[242] The website was launched in 2014 (www.ach.gov.sy) but the address is no longer valid.
Said, H. 2014. Website for inventory of intangible heritage of Syria launched. *SANA*. 24 April 2014. Available at: http://sana.sy/eng/28/2014/04/24/540808.htm [Accessed 25 April 2014]

Syrian people, and those experiences through which they have regained meaning of their social, political and cultural lives. Although most of the cultural and artistic output of the Syrian revolution is available somewhere on the internet, it rushes by and is difficult to find soon after its initial launching.

To create an online archive therefore serves a double aim : to gather and spread the messages expressed by the different artworks and other cultural productions and to help Syria's artistic resistance, be it individuals or groups, to create networks among themselves and connect to the outside world The promoters of this project believe that it participates in the documentation of contemporary history, so it is crucial that the revolution and its realities are explicitly described, for both contemporaries and makers of the revolution, for the coming generations, for the whole world. It is an archive of national legacies; to protect it is to preserve the Syrian memory, a duty because of its total consideration of historical accounts of all Syrian people.[243]

Modern Heritage Observatory (2011-ongoing)
Consisting of institutions and individuals from the Middle East and North Africa, the Modern Heritage Observatory (MoHO)[244] is working for the preservation of the region's modern cultural heritage. MoHO was initiated by the Arab Image Foundation (AIF), the Cinémathèque de Tanger, IRAB Arab Association for Arabic Music and the Arab Center for Architecture (ACA). Its members, now numbering over 40, include the Lebanese National Library, Riwaq Center for Architectural Conservation, Sound of Iraq, the Institute for Palestine Studies, and many more across Morocco, Egypt, Jordan, Syria and Lebanon. The network was set up in 2011 and is funded by the European Union and the Heinrich Böll Foundation.

MedLiHer: Safeguarding Mediterranean Living Heritage (2009-2013)
The strategy was in three phases: the first phase was devoted to drawing up surveys of existing structures and programmes connected with safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage in the countries mentioned below; the second phase involved developing national projects conceived on the basis of the needs of each partner country, the third phase was implementing national projects, and to preparing candidatures for inscription on the UNESCO Convention lists. The project, addressed to the partner countries' governmental communities and institutions, will lead to the safeguarding of the regional intangible cultural heritage according to the Convention's criteria, as well as with the reinforcement of governmental institutions' capacities. The Medliher project was led by UNESCO, in partnership with the "Maison des cultures du Monde" Association and the concerned ministries in Egypt, Jordan, Lebanon and Syria.

(*) The activities in the Syrian Arab Republic under the project MedLiHer, have been, as of 11 October 2011, suspended. This decision was taken by the European Union - the funding source for this project - in view of the increasing civil unrest in the country. The Syrian

---

[243] *The Creative Memory of the Syrian Revolution* website. Available at: http://www.creativememory.org/?page_id=134 [Accessed 03/02/2017]
[244] *MoHo* website. Available here: http://www.modernheritageobservatory.org/ [Accessed 03/02/2017]
Bucher, N R. 2013. Working to preserve modern heritage. *Now.* 10 November 2013. Available at: https://now.mmedia.me/lb/en/features/520050-520050-working-to-preserve-modern-heritage [Accessed 12 November 2013]

partners will however continue to be included in exchanges of information (e.g. training materials, workshops, documents, audiovisuals) among other MedLiHer project countries.[245]

xviii. Projects: Other

AMAL in Heritage Programme (2014-ongoing)
The Global Heritage Fund, partnering with the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage (ARC-WH), the International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property (ICCROM), and the International Scientific Committee on Risk Preparedness of ICOMOS (ICOMOS-ICORP) is launching the *AMAL in Heritage* program.

AMAL in Heritage is a program for managing disaster and conflict risks for cultural heritage through a combination of tools, training, planning, and community development. Through user-friendly mobile/web applications and a participatory design process with local partners, AMAL builds capacity for both heritage professionals and laypeople to respond to cultural crises proactively. The first element is a rapid impact assessment tool, in the format of a mobile app, including database and mapping as well as distance learning.[246] The DGAM participated in a meeting in association with the Global Heritage Fund in Manama 23-25 October, evaluating an app designed to help respond to heritage crises.[247]

The Beta version of the application can be requested on AMAL's website.[248]

Ettijahat: Cultural Policy in the Arab Region (Regional Database) (ongoing)
Collaboration Project with Al Mawred Al Thaqafi and the European Cultural Foundation Ettijahat.Independent Culture acts as regional coordinator and editor for the *Cultural Policy in the Arab Region* programme, which was launched by Culture Resource (al-Mawrid al-Thaqafy) in 2009. Ettijahat's role includes working with advocacy groups in ten Arab countries to coordinate their work and support them to achieve their goals in the development and activation of transparent and democratic cultural policy in their countries. Twice a year, Ettijahat issues a report covering developments in the region regarding cultural legislations, infrastructure, funding, production, and creativity, in addition to core changes that are expected to effect cultural work in the ten Arab countries participating in the programme. Ettijahat also launched *a regional database of cultural policy*,[249] which is expected to become a recognised resource for participation and knowledge in this field.

In cooperation with the European Cultural Foundation, Ettijahat reports current cultural developments in the region by conducting studies and circulating them within the Arab region and internationally[250]. Ettijahat monitors developments in cultural policy in eleven Arab countries and constructs profiles for each by coordinating with the Cultural Policies Task Forces in each of these countries and acting as liaison point between the National Task Forces and the World CP. The countries covered by Ettijahat are Morocco, Algeria, Tunisia, Egypt, Sudan, Syria, Lebanon, Palestine, Iraq, Jordan, and Mauritania.[251]

---

[245] *MedLiHer* Project: http://www.euromedheritage.net/intern.cfm?menuID=12&submenuID=13&idproject=50 [Accessed 03/02/2017]
[246] *AMAL in Heritage Website*. Available here: http://amal.global/introduction/ [Accessed 06/02/2017]
[247] *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2089 [|
[248] *AMAL in Heritage*. Mobile App Beta Program. Available at: http://amal.global/beta/ [Accessed 06/02/2017]
[249] The regional database is available here: http://www.arabcp.org/site/index |
[250] *Ettijahat* reports on cultural policies in the Arab Region: http://ettijahat.org/index.php/page/type/29
[251] *Ettijahat* website. Cultural Policy in the Arab Region.Available at: http://ettijahat.org/page/46 [Accessed 01/03/2017]

The country profile for the cultural policy of Syria can be downloaded online.[252]

Ettijahat: Cultural Priorities in Syria (2013)
Ettijahat have completed a research study entitled *The role of culture and arts in reconciliation and civil peace in countries that witnessed severe conflicts*. Within the context of this project, a survey about the priorities of cultural work was taken in 2013. It aimed to build a knowledge base of the visions and expectations shared by the people concerned regarding change on the cultural level, allowing for agreement of priorities and goals of cultural practice. In September 2013 *Ettijahat* organised a workshop with four aims: to discuss the results of the survey and accompanied research; to agree on methods of developing an action plan; to publish a document about the general direction of cultural practice; and to start designing pilot projects based on the priorities identified in the above steps. The document was based on a range of research studies, of which the main ones were: *Cultural Tools and Production in Times of Crisis: Syria, Iraq and Lebanon*, by Dr. Marie Elias; *The Role of Arts and Culture in Reconciliation and Achievement of Civil Peace in Countries that Witnessed Severe Conflicts*, by researcher Rama Najma; and: *Toward Development of Cultural Infrastructure in Syria*, by the Syrian Centre for Policy Research. (See Section 2f xxxi-xxxii – Publications Other).[253]

Ettijahat: Research: to Strengthen the Culture of Knowledge\ Fourth Edition (2016)
Ettijahat is an organization that stimulates the growth of independent culture in Syria. It does this by encouraging a positive and real relationship between culture and Syria's diverse communities.[254] This capacity-building programme aims at providing full-time research opportunities for young Syrian and Palestinian- Syrian researchers (22-35 years old) within the field of cultural studies. The programme seeks to enhance the researchers' skills, providing them the tools and guidance to accomplish their research project (The programme will probably be their first research endeavour since their academic studies). Experienced cultural researchers, who constitute the programme's selection committee, will directly supervise the projects. The current edition programme's annual course consists of three key phases:
1) The application submission and the selection of young researchers: 2 months
2) Training and skill enhancement phase: 1 month
3) Completion of actual research supervised by experienced researchers: 4 months.

The programme will focus on current topics in cultural research that are relevant to the situation in Syria. Topics will range in scope, but they will revolve around the changes in perspectives of Syrian artists with regard to their relationship with society and the transformations it is witnessing.[255] A training manual will shortly be published.[256]

---

[252] Country Profile: Cultural Policy in Syria. *Ettijahat* website. Available here: http://ettijahat.org/page/130 [Accessed 3/4/2017]
[253] *Ettijahat* website. Cultural Priorities in Syria. Available at: http://ettijahat.org/page/69 [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[254] *Ettijahat* website. Research: to Strengthen the Culture of Knowledge Available at: http://ettijahat.org/site/index?_lang=1 [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[255] Research: to Strengthen the Culture of Knowledge\ Fourth Edition. *Ettijahat* website. Available at: http://ettijahat.org/page/266 [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[256] Research To Strengthen Culture of Knowledge programme publishes a training guide on cultural research. *Ettijahat* website. Available at: http://ettijahat.org/page/329 [Accessed 05/03/2017]

Ettijahat: Research: Development of Cultural Infrastructure in Syria (2013-2015)
The research aims to diagnosing the condition of the cultural infrastructure in Syria before and during the crisis, based on research and modern deontology, in addition to the development of the methodology of work to identify the settings for cultural policy and effectiveness of institutions and their impact on cultural life before and during the crisis, the research found that the weak institutional performance in the cultural field before the crisis and the degradation during it manifested in suffocating restrictions on cultural freedoms, and the absence of vision and strategy and weak community participation and accountability, poor environment for cultural creativity, all these factors has negatively affected the rich cultural life and diversity. The crisis has aggravated the cultural challenges as a result of the appearance of the first two contradictory factors: the first is a mobile community seeks the respect for all humans and demands providing the necessary conditions to actively participate in society, the second is an explosion of violence and militias accompanied by domination of armed forces and political tyranny and extremism, which led to a state of fear and polarization. The research finds that a cultural vision with a change in the structure of the institutions to be participatory, accountable and depends on the investments of rich cultural diversity for everyone's benefit.

This research has been prepared by a team from the Syrian Policy Research Center under the supervision of Professor Jad Alkarim Aljbaai. In the framework of the competition, launched by the Culture Resource (Al Mawred AL Thaqafy) institution to select researchers' studies on the development of cultural governmental structures in Tunisia, Syria, Egypt, and announced the program of cultural policies in June/june 2013 within the program for action in Syria priorities 2014-2015for Etijahat. independent culture. The research can be downloaded online.[257]

Friends of Maaloula fundraise (2014-ongoing)
The Friends of Maaloula continue to fundraise to support the people and the town of Maaloula and the Aramaic language.[258]

The Extraordinary Ordinary Syrian: Syria's Heritage Protectors (2015-2016)
A Heritage for Peace project collecting information on heritage protection in conflict. H4P analysed numerous media reports to collate accounts of the lengths Syrians go to protect their heritage, and to understand why it matters. This was supported by a number of interviews with Syrians still working in the field. The project aimed to collate examples of the lengths they go to in order to protect cultural heritage, many risking their lives, and why it matters so much to them. An initial outline of the results was presented at the SOAS / CBRL Caring for the Past April 2016 conference, and the full results are in preparation for publication.[259]

Mare Nostrum (ongoing)
In the area of the Zaatari Refugee Camp in northern Jordan the Gerda Henkel Foundation is supporting a set of projects called *Mare Nostrum* and initiated by Thomas Weber, the DAAD

---

[257] Development of Cultural Infrastructure in Syria. *Ettijahat* website. Available at: http://ettijahat.org/page/129 [Accessed 05/03/2017]

[258] *Friends of Maaloula* Website: http://www.rahim.eu/maaloula/aboutus.html [Accessed 06/02/2017] Facebook: https://www.facebook.com/friendsofmaaloula [Accessed 06/02/2017] Photos taken of damage to Maaloula: http://rahim.eu/maaloula/Bilder/ [Accessed 11/02/17]

[259] Publication of the results has been delayed due to staff illness, but a news article can be viewed here. Cunliffe, E. 2016. Ordinary Syrians are risking their lives to protect their cultural heritage. *The Conversation* 15/04/2016. Available at: http://theconversation.com/ordinary-syrians-are-risking-their-lives-to-protect-their-cultural-heritage-57841 [Accessed 05/03/2017]

assistant at Amman University. There archaeological research is combined with projects in which jobs are created and specialist training offered, and which have the objective of raising awareness about the region's past. A cultural programme for Syrian and local children and young people about the history of the Hauran is being offered in cooperation with local government and a women's cooperative. The project shows that providing vocational training for the young is not enough: young people, children included, need to have an appreciation of cultural heritage communicated to them.[260]

Multaqa: Museum as Meeting Point (2016-ongoing)
A collaboration between the Museum für Islamische Kunst, the Vorderasiatisches Museum, the Skulpturensammlung und Museum für Byzantinische Kunst and the Deutsches Historisches Museum. As part of the project *Multaqa: Museum as Meeting Point – Refugees as Guides in Berlin Museums*, Syrian and Iraqi refugees are being trained as museum guides so that they can then provide guided museum tours for Arabic-speaking refugees in their native language. *Multaqa* (Arabic for "meeting point") also aims to facilitate the interchange of diverse cultural and historical experiences. In collaboration with the department of *Education, Outreach and Visitor Services* of the Staatliche Museen and the *Education and Outreach* department of the Deutsches Historisches Museum, a training program for the guides-to-be was fleshed out, based around the themes of the museums and issues of didactics and methodology. The program is aimed primarily at teenagers and young adults, but also addresses older people in mixed groups. Through addressing visitors in clear and simple language aimed at all age groups and using peer-to-peer communication, the *Multaqa - Museum as Meeting Point* project hopes to facilitate refugee access to museums, and to help them to find social and cultural points of connection, as well as to increase their participation in the public sphere. In order to create reciprocal awareness of the diverse cultural backgrounds of the refugees, starting in March 2016, *Multaqa: Museum as Meeting Point* offers workshops as a complement to the guided tours in Arabic that will be aimed simultaneously at Arabic-speaking refugees and a German-speaking public. By bringing these two groups into close proximity to work together, the workshops are intended to create the conditions for mutual exchange and opportunities for participants to get to know one another.[261]

Protecting Cultural Heritage: An Imperative for Humanity (2016)
In response to the growing international calls to protect cultural heritage, Italy and Jordan, together with INTERPOL, UNESCO and UNODC, embarked on a high-level partnership on *Protecting Cultural Heritage – An Imperative for Humanity: Acting Together Against the Destruction and Trafficking of Cultural Property by Terrorist Groups and Organized Crime*. The goal of the project is to galvanize the international community and the United Nations to implement the above-mentioned legal instruments and to take stronger and more coordinated action against growing threats to cultural property and heritage.

Three main challenges were identified by the project partners: preventing destruction, spoliation, looting and other illegal activities in the provenance areas (especially those in conflict or crisis situations), countering all aspects of transnational trafficking, and repressing

---

[260] ArchHerNet: *Archaeology Worldwide Special Issue* 2016: Reconstruction. Available at: https://www.dainst.org/documents/10180/2082824/Archaeology+Worldwide+Special+Issue+2016/0e33097d-1071-4c7b-b4dc-85b81a5cb7b2 [Accessed 26/2/2017]
[261] For more information on Multaqa, see *Museum für Islamische Kunst*: http://www.smb.museum/en/museums-institutions/museum-fuer-islamische-kunst/collection-research/research-cooperation/multaka.html
Multaqa Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/MultakaTreffpunktMuseum/ [Accessed 4/4/17]

illegal markets in destination areas. The partnership kicked off at the United Nations Headquarters on September 27, 2015[262]. An awareness-raising exhibition was held on December 14-24, 2015, at UN Headquarters. Priceless antiquities recovered by the Italian Carabinieri were exhibited alongside photographs and interactive videos explaining the importance of the issue, as well as the work currently being done by all project partners.

Three expert meetings were held at the UN Headquarters. The first was held on 2 March 2016: *Addressing the illicit trafficking of cultural property at the end of the market chain*.[263] The Permanent Missions of Jordan and Italy to the United Nations, together with UNESCO, INTERPOL, and UNODC, organized the First Meeting on Art Markets of Stolen Works of Art as part of the partnership initiative *Protecting Cultural Heritage –an Imperative for Humanity: Acting together against the destruction and trafficking of cultural property by terrorist groups and organized crime*. It was chaired by the Ambassador H.E. Dina Kawar (Jordan) and Ambassador H.E. Inigo Lambertini (DPR of Italy) with the participation of other permanent representatives of member states, Ms. Emily Rafferty, Former director of Metropolitan Museum, as well as representatives of UNESCO, INTERPOL, UNODC, Antiquities Coalition and others. Participants deliberated on where are the real final destination countries, what could be done to address this problem, what were the risk and the consequences of inaction. In this context, the discussions emphasized the need to address the critical issues at the "Final Destination Countries" and some participants highlighted the importance of due diligence, careful search of provenance, border controls, training and awareness raising, the criminalization of specific harmful conduct or the establishment of administrative offences, international cooperation in response to crime, intelligence sharing, implementation of existing legal frameworks, cooperation of stakeholders, and the importance of implementing the current obligations on countering terrorist financing. Concrete recommendations were made targeting different stakeholders such as destination countries' governments, museums, auction houses, international art market dealers, tour operators, companies specialized in the transport of antiquities, judges, magistrates, prosecutors, asset managers, bankers and investment advisors.

The second was on 28 April 2016 *Curbing the illicit trafficking of cultural property: focusing on countries of transition and the application of criminal justice.*[264] The Permanent Missions of Jordan and Italy to the United Nations, together with UNESCO, INTERPOL, and UNODC, organized an expert meeting that focused on the illicit trafficking of cultural property in transit countries. The meeting was chaired by the Ambassador H.E. Dina Kawar (Jordan) and Ambassador H.E. Sebastiano Cardi (Italy) with the participation of other permanent representatives of member states, Ms. Emily Rafferty, Former director of Metropolitan Museum, as well as representatives of UNESCO, INTERPOL, UNODC, WCO, Antiquities Coalition, Carabinieri and others. UNESCO's role in curbing the illicit trafficking of cultural property was highlighted by a number of participants. Some referred to the recent initiative for the creation of the Task Force for the protection of cultural heritage at UNESCO, while others commended the UNITE4Heritage Campaign. Furthermore, the

---

[262] *United Nations* Website. 2015. At UN, global initiative launched boost protection of cultural heritage targeted by terrorists and traffickers. Available at:
http://www.un.org/apps/news/story.asp?NewsID=51994#.Vg09CIKFNHz [07/02/2017]

[263] UNESCO. 2016. Addressing the illicit trafficking of cultural property at the end of the market chain. *UNESCO*. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property/meetings/un-march-meeting/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[264] UNESCO. 2016. Curbing the illicit trafficking of cultural property: focusing on countries of transition and the application of criminal justice. *UNESCO*. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property/meetings/un-april-meeting/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

importance of global ratification and implementation of the 1970 UNESCO Convention and the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention, which are essential instruments for the return and restitution of cultural property, was emphasized. Additionally, participants advocated for the most efficient use of UNESCO Export Model Certificate. Additionally, discussions focused on the concerted efforts to prevent illicit trafficking, including strengthening of the international cooperation in the law enforcement and criminal prosecution fields. In this context, participants stressed that the specialization and training of the law enforcement authorities in investigations of illicitly trafficked cultural property was important as well as the efficient implementation of the respective international and national law. The need to ensure proper border and customs control and to timely share data was stressed as well. Likewise, an appeal was made to make the best use of existing bilateral agreements and to continue efforts in raising awareness around the issue of illicit trafficking of cultural property and the links with the financing of terrorist and criminal groups. A number of member states shared their national practices in the legislation and policy domains such as existing and upcoming legislation initiatives, lessons learned best practices and others.

The third expert meeting was held on 27 May 2016, focussing on the situation of trafficking from "source" countries as well as on the more general issue of cultural heritage destruction.[265]

The meetings culminated in a report with recommendations and key actions, drawn up by Italy, Jordan, INTERPOL, UNESCO, and UNODC.[266] These are based on the outcomes of these meetings, the comprehensive guidelines adopted to support the implementation of the 1970 UNESCO Convention and the UN Convention on Transnational Organized Crime, and the priorities of experts working in the field. The report was presented to the UN on 27 September 2016.[267] A video of the launch is available online.[268]

Safe haven network (December 2016)
A new international partnership between the United Arab Emirates and France aimed at protecting cultural heritage during armed conflicts. The mandate sought ways to define practical and sustainable means to safeguard cultural resources, as well as create a network of safe havens for threatened heritage.[269]

---

[265] *UNESCO*. 2016. Third Expert Meeting on "Protecting Cultural Heritage – an Imperative for Humanity". *UNESCO.* Available at: http://en.unesco.org/events/third-expert-meeting-protecting-cultural-heritage-imperative-humanity [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[266] An overview of the project is available in this booklet (for the ministerial meeting in September 2016): http://www.italyun.esteri.it/Rappresentanza_ONU/resource/doc/2016/09/protecting_cultural_heritage_brochure.pdf
The full report with recommendations is available here:
United Nations. 2016. *Protecting Cultural Heritage – an Imperative for Humanity.* Document available at: http://www.unesco.se/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/2016-Protecting-cultural-heritage.-An-imperative....pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[267] UNESCO. 2016. Countering destruction and trafficking of cultural property - an Imperative for Humanity. *UNESCO*. 22/09/2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/media-services/single-view/news/countering_destruction_and_trafficking_of_cultural_property/#.V-o4z_ArK70 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[268] *Italy Mission to the UN*. 2016. Protecting Cultural Heritage – An Imperative for Humanity. YouTube. 27/09/2016. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MZ071XUPkGQ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[269] Al Wasmi, N. 2016. Safeguarding Cultural Heritage conference kicks off in Abu Dhabi. *The National*. 2 December 2016. Available at: http://www.thenational.ae/uae/heritage/safeguarding-cultural-heritage-conference-kicks-off-in-abu-dhabi [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Shirīn: Security of Sites & Excavation Houses (2015-ongoing)

As a priority, Shirīn advises the relevant international funding bodies to help the DGAM administration to pay the guardians of sites and excavation houses. This is because most of the archaeological missions concerned, in particular foreign projects, are no longer in receipt of the necessary financial support, and because financial transactions between Syria and most of the relevant countries are currently forbidden.[270]

Shirīn: national Committees (2015-ongoing)

Working together with national scientific communities: Shirīn National Committees were created in Belgium, Australia, France, and soon to be in Germany (27th November 2015), Switzerland (25th November 2015) and USA. The formation of National Committees is an important step in the organization's development and there is a need to encourage other Shirīn representatives to form National Committees: national initiatives for Syrian Heritage are more numerous than international ones. Shirīn can give an international echo to these dispersed initiatives. The sharing of information is important to avoid duplicating previous efforts and thus losing valuable resources and time.

In many countries, state, local administrations and universities have launched actions to protect heritage in war torn countries. These initiatives require local interlocutors. The National Committees are recognized as qualified and informed interlocutors by national institutions. They can then aid in launching actions in support of Syrian colleagues and students in exile. Part of their function is to help to assess the inventories and scientific archives concerning Syrian heritage in various countries. National Committees can also provide options for the many volunteers who want to "do something" for Syrian Heritage. These committees are also essential in raising awareness of Syrian heritage to a more general audience. Finally, National Committees are the best medium for contacting our colleagues, and for launching campaigns for affiliation to Shirīn. They provide a way to get the minimal independent funds which we need to maintain a basic functioning of the association including website maintenance and travels for representation (Remember that half part of the fees paid to Shirīn come back to the legally declared national committees). [271]

Syrian Cultural Heritage Centre Proposed (October 2016)

Organised by the Smithsonian Institution and the Gerda Henkel Foundation, the meeting discussed the arrangements needed and the steps necessary for the possible establishment of a Syrian Cultural Heritage Center in Istanbul to act as a focal point for refugee scholars and heritage professionals in order to support ongoing research and documentation activities about damage and loss to Syrian cultural heritage; to coordinate in-country emergency conservation actions; conduct needed training for Syrian heritage workers; and to distribute educational material.[272]

---

[270] *Shirīn Website: Concrete Measures*. Updates are available here: http://Shirīn-international.org/?page_id=795; also see the November newsletter http://Shirīn-international.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/SHIRĪN-Newsletter_Nov2015.pdf [Accessed 4/4/17]

[271] *Shirīn Website November 2015 Newsletter* http://Shirīn-international.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/01/SHIRĪN-Newsletter_Nov2015.pdf [Accessed 07/02/2017]

[272] Agenda available on the Blue Shield website: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/syrian-cultural-heritage-centre/ [Accessed 14/02/2017]

UNESCO: Safeguarding Syrian Cultural Heritage & Observatory of Syrian Cultural Heritage (2014-2017)

The main objective of the Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage project is to contribute to restoring social cohesion, stability and sustainable development through the protection and safeguarding of cultural heritage in view of the on-going and growing destruction and loss of Syria's rich and unique cultural heritage. The project is a first step to monitor the damage and loss of cultural heritage, to mitigate its destruction, and to prepare post-conflict priority actions, as well as establish medium and long term actions to restore normalcy and social cohesion in the country. UNESCO is implementing a three-pronged approach:

1) monitor and assess the cultural heritage situation in Syria through updated and continued knowledge and documentation shared by UNESCO, its partners and all stakeholders involved in safeguarding Syria's cultural heritage, which are widely disseminated on the Observatory of Syrian Cultural Heritage. This platform provides information on damages and looting of sites and structures, as well as information on on-going projects and initiatives to protect and safeguard cultural heritage. In parallel, a database of experts and available documentation on cultural heritage in Syria are being constantly updated to create optimal conditions for post-conflict recovery activities.

2) mitigate the destruction and loss of Syrian cultural heritage through national and international awareness-raising efforts. A multimedia awareness-raising campaign, using international, regional and national media and social networks, and will include the dissemination of video clips, a documentary and a publication on Syrian cultural heritage. Educational activities on cultural heritage aimed specifically at children and educators will be developed in the coming months.

3) protect and safeguard Syrian cultural heritage through enhanced technical assistance and capacity-building for national stakeholders and beneficiaries, by:
   - providing technical support for the establishment of a police database of looted artefacts;
   - training police forces and customs officers in Syria and adjacent countries to fight illicit trafficking of cultural property (and on the specific tools available to facilitate and improve the implementation of the 1970 UNESCO Convention);
   - training national stakeholders to protect movable heritage and museums during and after the conflict;
   - providing technical assistance and training for the protection of built cultural heritage and planning conservation and restoration works in view of the recovery phase;
   - training of national stakeholders concerning the core concepts and mechanisms of the 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage; and
   - specialized training of national stakeholders, civil society organizations and communities concerning the creation of inventories for intangible cultural heritage.

UNESCO has taken a key role in bringing together experts and facilitating training and support (see Section 2b xxiv - Other for some of the many examples), in addition to many other projects highlighted through the report (e.g. below). Their website contains brief updates on major sites, and links to sources of other information and damage assessments. In addition, updates, news and events are also available. The UNESCO Syrian Observatory is online.[273] And overview of the outputs of year 1 and year 2 of the project is available here.[274]

---

[273] *Safeguarding Syrian Cultural Heritage & Observatory of Syrian Cultural Heritage*. Available at: https://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/ [Accessed 2/3/17]

UNESCO: Syrian Shapers - Innovative approach for social cohesion through culture, creativity and social venture (5 October 2016)
Fifty Lebanese and Syrian youth involved in artistic and cultural fields were introduced to the key concepts and approaches on entrepreneurship and brainstormed on creating create revenue-generating social ventures, based on artistic creations or work that promotes cultural heritage during a 2-day workshop.[275]

UNESCO: Reinforcement of UNESCO's Action for the Protection of Culture and the Promotion of Cultural Pluralism in the Event of Armed Conflict (
UNESCO has developed a strategy for reinforcing UNESCO's action for the protection of culture and the promotion of cultural pluralism in the event of armed conflict with a view to its adoption by the General Conference, as revised following deliberations by the Executive Board at its 197th session. The strategy has been developed into an action plan, after comments. A second consultation with Member States took place from 28 October 2016 to 9 January 2017. Consequential revisions to the draft Action Plan and the proposed rapid response mechanism will be presented to the Executive Board in April 2017.[276]

b) Talks, Conferences, Discussions, Workshops

xix. *Cooperation Discussions*

This section has been removed and specific discussions are now referenced directly under projects.

xx. *Appeals / Calls / Offers of Aid*

Edinburgh World Heritage
Edinburgh World Heritage has offered to help the DGAM with restoration of damaged sites in Syria.[277]

---

[274] UNESCO. *Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage: Outputs of the project in Year I and II*. Available at: http://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/system/files/ESSCH%20poster%20verso.pdf [accessed 4/3/2017]

[275] *UNESCO*. 2016. Fifty Lebanese and Syrian youth meet at UNESCO Office in Beirut to brainstorm social ventures based on artistic creations and cultural heritage. UNESCO. 08/09/2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/beirut/single-view/news/fifty_lebanese_and_syrian_youth_meet_at_unesco_office_in_bei#.WASpkuB96M8 [Accessed 14/02/2017]

[276] Details and the consultations responses are available at:
UNESCO. 2016. *Strategy for the Reinforcement of UNESCO's Action for the Protection of Culture and the Promotion of Cultural Pluralism in the Event of Armed Conflict*. Available at: http://en.unesco.org/heritage-at-risk/strategy-culture-armed-conflict
The strategy itself is available here: *Reinforcement of UNESCO's Action for the Protection of Culture and the Promotion of Cultural Pluralism in the Event of Armed Conflict* 38 C/49. General Conference 38th Session Paris 2015. http://en.unesco.org/system/files/235186e1.pdf [Accessed 5/3/2017]

[277] Miller, P. 2016. Edinburgh heritage charity to aid Syrian cultural protection. *The Herald*. 27 August 2016. Available at:
http://www.heraldscotland.com/news/homenews/14708405.Edinburgh_heritage_charity_to_aid_Syrian_cultural_protection/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

The DGAM director speaks to international bodies

The Director of the DGAM, Maamoun Abdulkarim, made an appeal to the Italian parliament for help protecting Syria's monuments from further destruction. The destruction of Syrian antiquities prompted the Italian government to propose a United Nations-led mission of peacekeepers to protect World Heritage sites from attacks by Islamic militants.[278]

UNESCO continues to appeal for site protection

UNESCO has continued to appeal for the application of international law and the protection of sites in a number of statements.[279]

Call to Action Appeal (issued 24 Sep 2015)

At their Culture Under Threat forum on 24 Sep, the Antiquities Coalition launched a Call to Action petition on Change.org.[280] The appeal addresses the United Nations Security Council, International Criminal Court, and International Governments and calls on them to:

- The United Nations to formulate action plans to address "cultural cleansing"
- The International Criminal Court to launch a war crimes investigation against those entities that engage in "cultural cleansing"
- The international community, to support states in protecting, preserving, and documenting items of cultural heritage endangered by armed conflicts
- A global campaign to raise awareness about the purchase of conflict antiquities and terrorist financing
- All governments to take steps to prevent the trade in conflict antiquities
- All actors involved in the cultural property trade to be vigilant when obtaining antiquities from countries in conflict

xxi. Conferences / Workshops

In previous years, we have collated all conferences we had information about here. This year, we have only included those with known outputs, such as videos available online, and only from the period of this report. A list of many of the conferences relating to heritage in conflict (passed and forthcoming) is available on the UK Blue Shield website[281]. Previous conference outputs are available in earlier reports. If you have a conference or a conference output you would like including in forthcoming summaries and overviews, please contact Dr Emma Cunliffe.[282]

---

[278] Poggioli, S. 2015. Syrian Antiquities Chief Calls For Help From International Community. *NPR*. 7 November 2015. Available at: http://www.npr.org/sections/parallels/2015/11/07/455092931/syrian-antiquities-chief-calls-for-help-from-international-community [Accessed 06/02/2017]

[279] UNESCO's statements can be found on their website here: http://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/statements-decisions/official-statements ; and their joint statements with the UN here http://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/un-and-unesco-joint-statements [Accessed 06/02/2017]

[280] The petition is available here: https://www.change.org/p/united-nations-security-council-international-criminal-court-international-governments-a-call-to-action-to-protect-the-world-s-cultural-heritage-d2a2d438-e6ac-4386-b090-aaf2f4f6ccd0

[281] Forthcoming events - UK Blue Shield website: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/forthcoming-conferences/ Previous events - UK Blue Shield website: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/ [Accessed 01/03/2017]

[282] Emma.l.cunliffe@dur.ac.uk

***Heritage Destruction in the Middle East: Beyond the Media Hype* (15 October 2015)**
Deakin University hosted this half-day symposium that focused on the recent heritage destruction in Syria and Iraq by ISIS. Presenters discussed a variety of interpretations on the factors driving the destruction and the challenges of mounting effective responses.
  - A summary of the panel and discussions is available online.[283]

***Religious and Cultural Pluralism And Peaceful Coexistence In The Middle East* (18-20 October 2015)**
The conference looked at the plight of various religious, cultural and ethnic communities in the Middle East, interrelation of religion with international politics, international initiatives undertaken so far for the protection of these communities and their cultural heritage and how to enhance cooperation with the international community to alleviate the plight of these groups and the promotion of a peaceful interreligious coexistence, through dialogue between cultures and religions.
  - The opening address is available online,[284] as are some of the comments of the participants.[285]

***Culture and Heritage after Palmyra* (29 October 2015)**
Focusing on how notions of culture are being challenged, and maybe even redefined, through the current destruction of cultural objects and historical monuments in the war in Iraq and Syria, this event considered alternative ways of thinking about contemporary culture and the role of heritage in it, with the hope of advancing a more critical and informed dialogue across campus. Organized by GSAPP Associate Professor of Architecture, Planning, and Preservation Jorge Otero-Pailos.
  - Watch the panel on You-Tube.[286]

***Conflict and Cultural Heritage* Conference (31 October 2015)**
The Conference aimed to raise public awareness and develop understanding of the issues surrounding the protecting of cultural heritage at risk from armed conflict. Focussing on the Middle East, the area currently undergoing the greatest destruction and where the heritage is most at risk, they demonstrated the importance of the heritage, why its destruction matters, and what can be done. Topics explored included the material heritage of the region from international and local perspectives, and the living heritage of communities with rich and longstanding traditions, why such destruction is happening, and the beliefs that underlie extremist practices. Focus then moved to an overview of what is being done already, and what more the international community can do. The conference was intended to provide information from a variety of cultures, perspectives, and organisations, including academics, archaeologists, the military, and the media, raising awareness of the multi-cultural nature of Middle Eastern heritage, and its global relevance in the past and today.

---

[283] Hamilton, A. 2015. Heritage Destruction in the Middle East: Beyond the Media Hype. *AICCM* 27/11/2015. Available here: https://aiccm.org.au/national-news/heritage-destruction-middle-east-beyond-media-hype [Accessed 1/2/2017]
[284] Religion Cultural Pluralism and Peaceful Coexistence in the Middle East. (Athens 19-10-2015) *Opening Address By His All-Holiness Ecumenical Patriarch Bartholome*w: https://www.patriarchate.org/-/religion-cultural-pluralism-and-peaceful-coexistence-in-the-middle-east-athens-19-10-2015- [Accessed 12/2/2017]
[285] *Basilica.ro*. 2015. International Conference "Religious and Cultural Pluralism and Peaceful Coexistence in the Middle-East". Available at: http://basilica.ro/en/international-conference-religious-and-cultural-pluralism-and-peaceful-coexistence-in-the-middle-east/ [Accessed 12/2/2017]
[286] *Columbia GSAPP*. 2015. Culture and Heritage After Palmyra, Interdisciplinary Discussion available here: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kLm3Uf6Xtvc [Accessed 12/2/2017]

- Podcasts of the event are available online.[287]

Why ISIS Is Destroying Syrian Cultural Heritage (November 2015)

Asia Society Annual Summit: Preserving and Protecting Heritage and Antiquities, including *Why ISIS is Destroying Syrian Cultural Heritage*.
- Video available online.[288]

Arts and Culture in Times of Conflict (December 2015)

Opening of the Forum on European Culture - *Provide Them With The Tools – Art and Culture in Times of Conflict*.
- Video available online.[289]

Syrian Cultural Heritage Summit (December 2015)

The Archaeological Institute of America (AIA) and American Schools of Oriental Research (ASOR) announced that they have jointly received a Chairman's Grant from the National Endowment for the Humanities (NEH) to support a two-day invitational summit in Washington, D.C., on December 10–11, 2015. During the summit, representatives from organizations engaged in collecting data on the cultural heritage of Syria explored ways to cooperate and reduce duplication of effort. NEH Chairman William "Bro" Adams was in attendance for the public event to be held on Friday, December 11, at the National Geographic Society.

Abstract: This is an urgent matter. Every day, sites and buildings in Syria are being damaged or destroyed by conflict, looting, and terrorism. Moreover, industrial-scale looting has resulted in the theft of artifacts that are then sold to support ISIL and other terrorist groups. Dozens of non-profit organizations and non-governmental organizations have responded to this crisis, and some of them have received significant funding from European countries, Canada, UNESCO, and the United States. In just the past three weeks, cultural heritage conferences held at the Smithsonian, the Metropolitan Museum of Art, and the Asia Society have called for all working on this problem to find ways to achieve a division of labor and greater collaboration. The goal of this summit is to do just that. ASOR and the AIA are pleased that NEH Chairman Adams has responded to this need by sponsoring this conference and agreeing to participate.

The event featured more than 20 international organizations who meet to discuss collaborative solutions to this crisis: AIA; American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS); The Antiquities Coalition; ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiatives; Computational Research of the Ancient Near East (CRANE, at the University of Toronto); CyArk; Endangered Archaeology in the Middle East & North Africa (EAMENA, at Oxford University); The Getty Conservation Institute (GCI); International Council on Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS); Manar al-Athar; The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago; Penn Cultural Heritage Center; Shirīn; The Smithsonian Institute; The Syrian Heritage

---

[287] Listen to the podcasts on the Oxford University website: https://podcasts.ox.ac.uk/series/conflict-and-cultural-heritage-conference [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[288] *Why ISIS Is Destroying Syrian Cultural Heritage*. Available at: http://asiasociety.org/video/why-isis-destroying-syrian-cultural-heritage-complete?utm_campaign=socialmedia&utm_source=facebook&utm_medium=socialmedia

[289] *European Cultural Foundation*. Provide Them With The Tools - Arts and Culture in Times of Conflict. Available here: http://www.culturalfoundation.eu/library/rethinking-europe-debalie-20november [Accessed 3/3/2017]

Archive Project (a joint project of German Archaeological Institute and the Museum for Islamic Art, Berlin); The Day After Project; The Past For Sale Initiative at The University of Chicago; UNESCO; UNOSAT; United Nations Security Council; U.S. Committee of the Blue Shield; The World Monuments Fund (WMF); and Yale University.[290]

- Podcasts are available online,[291] and UK Blue Shield have made a rough transcript of the summit available as a pdf.[292]

The Destruction of World Heritage Sites as It Concerns Cultural Property and International Laws **(January 2016)**

Moderated by Peter Herdrich, a co-founder of the Antiquities Coalition and the founding Partner of the Heritas Group, the panel included Colonel Matthew Bogdanos, Esq., New York County District Attorney's Office; Megan E. Noh, Esq., Associate General Counsel, Bonhams; Steven D. Feldman, Esq., Murphy & McGonigle; Brenton Easter, Special Agent, Homeland Security Department's Immigration and Customs Enforcement Agency. Panelists discussed how the ongoing illegal traffic in looted antiquities is fueling the sectarian and other conflicts. Beautiful remnants of the past, improperly excavated and exported in violation of domestic law to financially benefit militants and looters, are poised to enter private art collections. Protection of cultural property is a perennial problem, exacerbated by the current political events on the territories of Syria and Iraq under the Islamic State (ISIS) control. With irreparable harm inflicted by looting and demolition, panelists discussed the current events in ISIS-controlled territories and present possible scenarios for handling legal matters concerning cultural valuables that are bound for the American art market. The presenters focused on various channels of distribution available in the source countries, as well as suggested best practices on handling looted property (always ask for provenance information, credible documents from exhibitions and insurance, and cooperate with authorities).

- An overview of the event is available online.[293]

Palmyra Forever **(February 2016)**

- The only details available are in an Italian news article about the event in Sanremo News, and another one here in Bordighera.net.[294]

Symposium on Art and Terrorism **(February 2017)**

Bringing together scholars of the image, art and violence with experts on counter-terrorism and conflict antiquities, the Courtauld Institute of Art and the Association for Research into Crimes against Art (ARCA) presented a day-long symposium on the subject of art and terrorism. The collaborative event aimed to provide a forum for engaging issues of urgent and wider public concern. Two strands of inquiry informed the discussion. One concerns histories

---

[290] *ASOR* Website. 2015. Protecting Our Shared Heritage in Syria - An International Summit to Promote Collaboration. Available at: http://ht.ly/VA27T [Accessed 06/02/2017]

[291] *Syrian Cultural Heritage Summit* podcasts: [Accessed 3/3/2017]https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o7MXPe_eomo&list=PLFeDqOGNupYl8tiW5HWJmjq6s9Z5WuRL

[292] Transcripts of *Syria Cultural Heritage Summit*: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/ASOR-Protecting-Our-Shared-Heritage-in-Syria-Lightning-Round.pdf

[293] E. Weber. 2016. U.S. Museums May Serve As Safe Havens to protect ISIS-Looted Antiquities from Destruction. *Center for Art Law*. Available at: https://itsartlaw.com/2016/02/04/u-s-museums-may-serve-as-safe-havens-to-protect-isis-looted-antiquities-from-destruction/ [Accessed 4/3/2017]

[294] 2016. BORDIGHERA: OGGI ALL'ANGLICANA LA CONFERENZA "PALMYRA FOREVER" CON ISBER SABRINE. *Bordighera News* 13/2/2016. Available at: http://www.bordighera.net/bordighera-oggi-allanglicana-la-conferenza-palmyra-forever-con-isber-sabrine-n54964 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

and theories of war and images, including terrorist use of visual images and media, such as YouTube videos and the documented destruction of cultural monuments. The other takes a criminological approach, examining the use and abuse of art and antiquities by terrorist groups, including ISIS, al-Qaeda, the Taliban and the IRA. The Art Newspaper summarised some of the main discussions and issues.[295]

ICOMOS: Post-trauma reconstruction (4 March 2016 / October 2016)
The symposium, which hosted about 75 participants, took place in two parts: six keynote speakers gave short presentations in the morning, before thematic discussions were held in small groups during the afternoon. This was also the theme of the 2016 ICOMOS Advisory Committee and Annual General Assembly in October 2016.
- The proceedings are available for download in two volumes.[296]

Beyond Destruction: Archaeology & Cultural Heritage in the Middle East and North Africa (March 2016)
The well- publicized destruction of antiquities at the hands of the self-proclaimed Islamic State has highlighted the urgent, long- standing need for a global discussion of cultural heritage protection in the Middle East. This symposium aims to move public discourse around cultural heritage beyond reactions to looting and destruction and to engage more deeply with responses from academic and governmental institutions. The program will also focus on emerging currents within the discipline of Middle Eastern archaeology that emphasize a well-rounded approach to cultural heritage and ask invited scholars and practitioners, government officials, artists, and the public to engage both with archaeological remains and the living communities in which research is conducted.
- Video available online.[297]

UNESCO: *The movement of cultural property in 2016: regulation, international cooperation and professional diligence for the protection of cultural heritage* (30 March 2016)
This one-day round table focused on the art market and its important role in the fight against the illicit trafficking of cultural property. This event brought together for the first time market stakeholders, including representatives of auction houses and online platforms, museum representatives, cultural heritage experts, specialized intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations as well as Member States, to take stock on the situation of the illicit trade in cultural heritage and identify areas to improve synergies and strengthen international cooperation to successfully overcome this worldwide issue.
- Details of the event and webcasts are available online.[298]

---

[295] Ruiz, C. 2016. *What do we really know about Islamic State's role in illicit antiquities trade?* The Art Newspaper 1/3/2016. Available at: http://theartnewspaper.com/news/news/what-do-we-really-know-about-islamic-state-s-role-in-illicit-antiquities-trade/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[296] *ICOMOS Post-trauma reconstruction* - Proceedings available for download. Available at: http://www.icomos.org/en/what-we-do/focus/6149-post-trauma-reconstruction-proceedings-available-for-download [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[297] *Beyond Destruction 1: Archaeology & Cultural Heritage in the Middle East*. Available at: https://vimeo.com/159990416 [Accessed 4/3/2017]
[298] Events details and links to webcasts: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/the-movement-of-cultural-property-in-2016-regulation-international-cooperation-and-professional-diligence-for-the-protection-of-cultural-heritage/ [Accessed 3/3/2017]

***Archaeological Heritage in the Arab World: Challenges and Solutions* (4 April 2016)**
Under the auspices of the Arab League, the Faculty of Archaeology at Fayoum University, in collaboration with the Egyptian National Committee of the International Council of Museums (ICOM Egypt), Bibliotheca Alexandrina and ISESCO organised this international conference.
- A resolution was drafted by the Arab League for the protection of cultural heritage.[299]

***Culture in Crisis Workshop II* (co-hosted with V&A London) (11 April 2016)**
The principle aim of the workshop was to convene stakeholders and decision-makers from the most affected regions to discuss relevant questions to help inform the Global Colloquium of the current situation, especially on efficient responses to looting, illicit trade, the destruction of sites and urban fabric, the humanitarian impact and loss of local skills, crafts and indigenous knowledge.[300]
- The conference proceedings are available online.[301]

ICAANE 10 (April 2016)
The bi-annual International Conference for the Archaeology of the Ancient Near East included several sessions regarding cultural heritage destruction, some with a focus on Syria.
- During the conference, participants were invited to sign the Vienna Statement, calling for the protection of cultural heritage.[302]

Young Experts Forum *Unite for Syrian Heritage* Part 1 (1-2 June 2016).
Preceding the International Expert Meeting on safeguarding Syria's cultural heritage taking place in Berlin, the German commission for UNESCO, supported by Gerda Henkel Stiftung, gathered a group of young scholars and heritage experts from Syria and the E.U. to discuss the current situation of cultural heritage, propose new approaches to this question, and set the foundations of a collaborative network. The forum culminated in an 8-minute presentation during the official opening of the Expert meeting**.**[303]

***International Expert Meeting on safeguarding Syria's cultural heritage* (2-4 June 2016).**
The meeting was organized by the UNESCO, the German Commission for UNESCO, the German Federal Foreign Office, along with the German Archaeological Institute, the Prussian Cultural Heritage Foundation, supported by the Gerda Henkel Stiftung. This meeting invited representative of all institutions and NGOs involved in the safeguarding of Syrian Heritage to discuss the previous Action Plan "*to identify gaps in the safeguarding of the Syrian built, movable and intangible heritage, coordinate ongoing national and international documentation, damage assessment, and capacity building efforts and define the next steps focusing on future emergency and protection plans*".[304]

---

[299] Al-Youm, Al-M. 2016. Arab League draft resolution to protect Arab antiquities. *Egypt Independent*. 05/04/2017. Available at: http://www.egyptindependent.com/news/arab-league-draft-resolution-protect-arab-antiquities-araby [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[300] Yale University. 2016. *Culture in Crisis Workshop II* (co-hosted with V&A London). Available at: http://ipch.yale.edu/event/culture-crisis-workshop-ii-co-hosted-va-london [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[301] Conference can be viewed here:
https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLqHnHG5X2PXBUshnhzn89DJqGRqraPRMX [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[302] *The Vienna Statement*:
http://www.orea.oeaw.ac.at/fileadmin/user_upload/veranstaltungen/2016/ICAANE_Allgemein/Vienna_Statement_Online.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[303] UNESCO. 2015. Young Experts Forum. *UNESCO* 18 February 2015. Available at:
http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1238/ Accessed [28/02/2017]
[304] The programme and press releases are available on the UK Blue Shield website:
http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/international-expert-meeting-on-preservation-of-cultural-heritage-in-syria/

#Unite4Heritage. *Cultural Diversity under Attack: Protecting Heritage for Peace* **(9-10 June 2016)**

UNESCO organized a high-level meeting and technical conference which also celebrated heritage and those devoted to its protection. *#Unite4Heritage. Cultural Diversity under Attack: Protecting Heritage for Peace* was held at the Royal Flemish Academy of Arts and Science with the support of the Government of Flanders. Responding to the increase in attacks on cultural heritage and cultural pluralism notably in the Middle East and Africa, the event was held to emphasize the human face of cultural preservation, highlighting the vital importance of heritage and diversity in addressing humanitarian, human rights and security challenges in all parts of the world, and to discuss how this vision can strengthen conflict prevention and crisis management policies.[305] [306]

Looted Art & Antiquities in the Middle East **(28 June 2016)**

Herrick's Art Law Group and The Art Newspaper hosted *Looted Art & Antiquities in the Middle East*: the second instalment in our 2016 Art Business Forum series of discussions on business issues affecting the art world. The panel of speakers covered recent issues relating to looted art and antiquities including: AAMD's new protocol for safeguarding "conflict antiquities"–cultural heritage in war torn countries; a recently passed bill preventing looted Syrian antiquities from entering the U.S. The discussion was moderated by Julia Halperin, museums editor, The Art Newspaper.

- The discussion is available online[307].

Solutions for Heritage Conservation After Armed Conflict **held in Cottbus, Germany (30 June-1 July 2016**)

The colloquium gathered participants from multiple international organizations, including ICCROM, ICOMOS, ARC-WH, ASOR, Global Heritage Fund, and others. Representatives of these organizations produced draft guidelines for the creation of a future *Cottbus Document: Guidelines on Safeguarding the Cultural Significance of Places Damaged by War and Aggression*, which will be instrumental in organizing an emergency response to future crises for both affected communities and the heritage professionals who advise them.[308]

Astrkom International Archaeology Conference (7-28 August 2016)

The DGAM took part in an international conference in Hungary, beginning on August 7, addressing cultural heritage protection and 3D documentation methods.[309]

UNESCO. 2016. International Expert Meeting: "Rallying the International Community to Safeguard Syria's Cultural Heritage". *UNESCO*. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/safeguarding-syrian-cultural-heritage/international-initiatives/syria-expert-meeting/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[305] UNESCO. 2016. UNESCO calls to harness the role of heritage in peace-building. *UNESCO* 9 June 2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/media-services/single-view/news/unesco_calls_to_harness_the_role_of_heritage_in_peace_buildi#.V2D4gK62s7A [Accessed 14/02/2017]

[306] The programme website is available here: https://en.unesco.org/cultural-diversity-under-attack-2016 Conference program available UNESCO Website. 2016. Available at: https://en.unesco.org/sites/default/files/final_programme_eng_06_06_2016.pdf [Accessed 14/02/2017]

[307] Herrick and The Art Newspaper Present: Looted Art & Antiquities in the Middle East. *Herrick.com*. Available at: http://www.herrick.com/events/herrick-and-the-art-newspaper-present-looted-art-antiquities-in-the-middle-east/ [Accessed 14/02/2017]

[308] *Global Heritage Fund*. 2016. Global Heritage Fund Joins Effort to Safeguard Cultural Heritage at Cottbus University Colloquium. Available at: http://globalheritagefund.org/index.php/news/global-heritage-fund-joins-effort-safeguard-cultural-heritage-cottbus-university-colloquium/ [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[309] *DGAM* Website: Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2037 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Edinburgh International Culture Summit (24-26 August 2016).
This year's International Culture Summit was dedicated to *Culture: Building Resilient Communities*[310]. The DGAM director Maamoun Abdulkarim was invited to present the state of cultural heritage in Syria and the experience of the "concerned National parties" in dealing with the situation.[311]

- The event was part of the Edinburgh International Culture summit, during which Edinburgh World Heritage offered assistance to Syria.[312]

Antiquities Coalition: *Culture Under Threat Conference* **(8 September 2016)**
Part of a continuing global initiative, this Ministerial summit in Jordan brought together ministers from 17 Arab League nations, hosted by Jordanian Deputy Prime Minister Nasser Judeh. These regional leaders coordinated actions to fight against the security, economic, and cultural crisis now facing the Middle East and North Africa (MENA). In addition, the Middle East and North African Task Force Against Cultural Racketeering, consisting of government representatives from each country, held its inaugural meeting to finalize an action plan for 2016-2017 on specific actions to be taken in this fight (see Section 2a xvi – Projects Fighting Illicit Trafficking).[313]

The MENA Task Force for Cultural Racketeering put into effect a five-part action for the coming year.
1. Develop capacity building programs
2. Explore bilateral Cultural Memoranda of Understanding and strengthen regional collaboration
3. Establish information sharing mechanisms
4. Raise awareness about cultural racketeering's impact on global economics and security
5. Launch jobs initiatives at heritage sites[314]

As part of the conference, the ministers signed the Amman Communique.[315] The signatories of the Amman Communiqué include the Governments of the Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan, Arab Republic of Egypt, Islamic Republic of Mauritania, Kingdom of Bahrain, Kingdom of Morocco, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, Lebanese Republic, the Palestinian Authority, Republic of Iraq, Republic of Sudan, Republic of Tunisia, Republic of Yemen, State of Kuwait, State of Libya, State of Qatar, Sultanate of Oman, and United Arab Emirates. The League of Arab States also participated in the conference.

---

[310] 2016 Edinburgh International Culture Summit. *Edinburgh Culture Summit*. 04 May 2016. Available at: http://www.culturesummit.com/news/2016-edinburgh-international-culture-summit?page=1 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[311] *DGAM* Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2042 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[312] Miller, P. 2016. Edinburgh heritage charity to aid Syrian cultural protection. *The Herald*. 27 August 2016. Available at:
http://www.heraldscotland.com/news/homenews/14708405.Edinburgh_heritage_charity_to_aid_Syrian_cultural_protection/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[313] *Antiquities Coalition*. 2016. CultureUnderThreat Regional Conference. Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/jordan2016/ [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[314] Antiquities Coalition. 2016. Middle East and North African Countries Unite to Fight Antiquities Looting, the Destruction of Cultural Heritage, and Terrorist Financing. *Antiquities Coalition.* Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/press-releases/middle-east-and-north-african-countries-unite-to-fight-antiquities-looting-the-destruction-of-cultural-heritage-and-terrorist-financing/ [Accessed 03/02/2017]

[315] The text of *the Amman Communique* is available here: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/Amman-Communique%CC%81-EN-Final.pdf [Accessed 18/02/2017]

Antiquities Coalition: *Culture Under Threat Forum (II)* **(16 September 2016).**

The Asia Society, the Antiquities Coalition and the Middle East Institute hosted an event in New York on September 16 addressing culture under threat. The Forum brought together high-level representatives from intergovernmental bodies, governments, law enforcement agencies, the armed forces, and business. A discussion moderated by ABC News' Jon Williams focused on how these varied sectors can work together to combat the growing use of historical and cultural artifacts as a terrorist financing tool. The event also explored what has been learned in the past year about this illicit trade in "blood antiquities" — including the US government's revelation that ISIS has made antiquities transactions totalling $1.25 million over just three months. The event was presented in conjunction with the 71st session of the UN General Assembly. (This event builds on the September 2015 *Culture Under Threat: The Security, Economic and Cultural Impact of Antiquities Trafficking and Terrorist Financing* symposium (24 September 2015)[316] [317]).

- A video of the 2016 panel is available online,[318] along with overviews of the event. [319]

Today's Struggle to Protect and Preserve the Cultural Heritage of Religious Minorities **(20 September 2016)**

The symposium was co-sponsored by The Metropolitan Museum of Art and The U.S. Department of State. A variety of thought leaders from universities and cultural heritage NGOs explored ways in which the international community can assist religious minority communities in the Middle East and elsewhere in their efforts to protect and preserve their cultural heritage in the wake of aggressive and morally reprehensible attacks on their heritage by terrorists and other violent extremists. Symposium participants also addressed how attacks against cultural heritage and cultural diversity have become strategies for undermining the cohesion, morale, and viability of religious minority communities, and assess the prospects of stronger international legal remedies, such as the prosecution of the perpetrators of cultural heritage destruction.

- A video of the event is available online.[320]
- The event also included a tribute to role models in the global campaign against violent extremism: read more on UNESCOs webpage.[321]

---

[316] Henry, C. 2015. Culture Under Threat and Digital Libraries. *Council on Library and Information Resources*. 01 October 2015. Available at: http://connect.clir.org/blogs/charles-henry/2015/10/01/culture-under-threat-and-digital-libraries [Accessed 07/02/2017]

[317] *UK Blue Shield* Website. 2015. Available at: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/culture-under-threat-the-security-economic-and-cultural-impact-of-antiquities-trafficking-and-terrorist-financing/ [Accessed 07/02/2017]

[318] FlorCruz, M. 2016. Progress in Protecting Stolen Antiquities Is Real — But Challenges Remain. *Asia Society*. 19 September 2016. Available at: http://asiasociety.org/blog/asia/progress-protecting-stolen-antiquities-real-%E2%80%94-challenges-remain?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 31/1/2017]
YouTube video of the full conference - *#CultureUnderThreat - New York Forum* - September 16, 2016. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pL3GFs7ptno&index=1&list=PLfqpDYGgaVRRzy9VVR5muC-s6ZSI9xW4p [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[319] Art Forum in NY. *Professional Security Magazine Online*. 19 September 2016. Available at: http://www.professionalsecurity.co.uk/news/case-studies/art-forum-in-ny/?platform=hootsuite
Antiquities Coalition. 2016. Asia Society and Antiquities Coalition Convene Leaders to Promote Protection of Conflict Antiquities. *Antiquities Coalition* Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/press-releases/asia-society-and-antiquities-coalition-convene-leaders-to-promote-protection-of-conflict-antiquities/
---. 2016. *#CultureUnderThreat New York Forum*. Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/2016-new-york/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[320] *Today's Struggle to Protect and Preserve the Cultural Heritage of Religious Minorities*. On Facebook. 20/09/2016. Available at: https://www.facebook.com/metmuseum/videos/10154019929362635/ [Accessed 18/02/2017]

- French President Francois Hollande announced a \$100m fund for the protection of Middle Eastern cultural heritage, discussed in the Art Newspaper.[322]

  This event follows on the from the 2015 event *Conflict Antiquities: Forging a Public / Private Response*. Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York (29/9/2015). [323] [324]

UNESCO Young Experts Forum *Unite for Syrian Heritage* (22-25 September 2016)
Second meeting of the UNESCO Young Experts Forum *Unite for Syrian Heritage*, supported by Gerda Henkel Stiftung, to discuss ways for the YEF to assist in protecting Syrian heritage.[325]

Fitch Colloquium: *Preservation and War* (30 September 2016)
To what degree, we may ask, is preservation thinkable outside of militarization, and its prewar—war—postwar continuum? What is the range of acceptable preservation actions and non-actions in the face of today's wars, when spectacles are made of the dynamiting of monuments, and the killing of preservationists? The 2016 Fitch Colloquium brought together some of the world's leading experts in the spirit of dialogue and common pursuit of answers to these urgent questions.
The videos are available online.[326]

Cultural Heritage: *A Target in War, an Engine for Peace* (24 October 2016)
The United States Institute of Peace and the Smithsonian hosted this conference that focussed on the work of the organisation Turquoise Mountain in Kabul and its impact on local communities through the revival of traditional Afghan craftsmanship. However, the conference also addressed various cultural initiatives around the world.
- A report from Georges Mihaies, member of the Intangible Cultural Heritage Task Force at UNESCO, is available online on the symposium.[327]
- Videos of the event are available online. [328] [329]

---

[321] UNESCO Media Services. 2016. Highlighting Role Models in the Global Campaign against Violent Extremism. *UNESCO* 23/9/2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/media-services/single-view/news/highlighting_role_models_in_the_global_campaign_against_viol/#.V-VVtZMrKRs?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[322] D'Arcy, D. 2016. François Hollande announces \$100m fund to protect cultural heritage in the Middle East. *The Art Newspaper.* http://theartnewspaper.com/news/news/fran-ois-hollande-announces-100m-fund-to-protect-cultural-heritage-in-the-middle-east/ [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[323] *UK Blue Shield* Website. 2015. Available at: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/conflict-antiquities-forging-a-publicprivate-response-to-save-iraq-and-syrias-endangered-cultural-heritage/ [07/02/2017]

[324] Video of symposium available at: https://www.dvidshub.net/video/425861/conflict-antiquities-symposium#.Vhk21Sv-UhT [07/02/2017]

[325] Programme available on the UK Blue Shield website: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/wp-admin/post.php?post=1172&action=edit [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[326] Watch videos here: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zRjNr21_An0, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AsuHfVX6_eM, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E8hBAIH2Lfs [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[327] *UK Blue Shield* website. 2016. Cultural Heritage: A Target in War, an Engine of Peace. Available at: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/cultural-heritage-a-target-in-war-an-engine-of-peace/ [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[328] Mihaies, G. 2016. *Cultural Heritage: A Target in War, an Engine of Peace* Report. 26 October 2016. Available at: https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/cultural-heritage-target-war-engine-peace-georges-mihaies [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[329] Watch video here: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wzF1mxXmO2o, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IiJRgj_C0HU [Accessed 18/02/2017]

The Syrian Peace Action Centre in Oslo (24-26 October 2015)
The Syrian Peace Action Centre hosted a 3-day event in Oslo, *The Question of Syria* with panel discussions and film screenings about resistance, art and revolution in Syria. They introduced the work of Syrian artists and intellectuals and cultural actors. *Who are Syrians, and what do they want, and what are they doing?*[330]

Protecting Cultural Heritage in an Uncertain Time **(26 October 2016)**
New York University, in partnership with Friends of Florence and the City of Florence convened two meetings to commemorate the anniversary of "L'Alluvione," a flood that ravaged the city of Florence and damaged countless pieces of art of immeasurable value, some irreparably. On the occasion of that commemoration, the two conferences, one in Washington, DC and the other in Florence, Italy called attention to an equally devastating contemporary challenge to our cultural patrimony: intentional destruction of cultural property for ideological reasons. This symposium brought together regional actors together with international experts and scholars from the fields of art, conservation and museums, international culture, law and law enforcement agencies and organizations to discuss the challenges and solutions to protecting our cultural heritage.[331]
- Videos of the event are available online:
  Panel 1: Conservation Challenges in Emergency Preparation: challenges and methods in use to conserve items facing immediate threat by human catastrophes.[332]
- *Panel 2: Methods of Documentation*: the existing and developing technologies being used to reconstruct and document destroyed objects, artifacts, heritage sites and architecture, in order to preserve a digital copy of the past that is lost to the elements, human conflict and the passing of time. [333]
- *Panel 3: The Feasibility, Desirability and Ethics of Reconstructing Destroyed Cultural Properties.*[334]

UNESCO: *World Heritage Sites and Museums Conference* **(2-3 November 2016)**
The aims of the conference were to highlight the important link between the World Heritage Sites and related museums in enhancing the preservation of sites and artifacts and increasing their relevance to a variety of audience through education and outreach. The conference was attended by the DGAM.[335]

INTERPOL Conference to Strengthen the Fight against Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Objects **(14-15 December 2016)**
The aim of the conference was to assess the implementation of UN Security Council Resolution 2199/2015 for the protection of cultural heritage in the Middle East, one year after its adoption. Experts and officials from Syria and Iraq spoke about the difficulties of providing proper documentation for artefacts taken from archaeological sites during illicit excavations. They also evoked the difficulties they sometimes faced in the requests for restitution from destination countries. Following discussions, the conference's attendees agreed on the importance of strengthening the legal framework for the seizure and restitution

---

[330] *SPACE* Website. 2015. Available at: http://syria-are.space-org.no/ [Accessed 07/02/2017]
[331] *New York University* Website. 2016. Protecting Cultural Heritage in an Uncertain Time. October 2016. Available at: https://www.nyu.edu/washington-dc/nyu-washington--dc-events/protecting-cultural-heritage-in-an-uncertain-time.html [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[332] Watch video here: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jhVs48PeO2w&t=1s [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[333] Watch video here: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Tt9XtUYP6mE [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[334] Watch video here: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RdyCk-dY0iY [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[335] *DGAM* website. 2016. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2095 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

of cultural artefacts, as well as meeting effectively the demands of Syria and Iraq for restitution. Other recommendations included increased cooperation among national police and customs.[336]

***Safeguarding Endangered Cultural Heritage conference* (Culture versus Terrorism) (2-3 December 2016)**
The two-day conference brought together heads of state and ministers from over 40 countries affected by heritage loss due to armed conflicts, alongside key players involved in the field of heritage preservation, international public and private institutions, museums and private donors engaged in the field of cultural heritage, as well as experts working in the field.
- The conference announced the creation of an international cultural protection fund (with $100 M to be raised, and $30M already pledged) and demanded the UN Security Council intervention to protect cultural heritage during armed conflicts.[337]
- In addition, on Saturday, 3 December 2016, the Abu Dhabi Declaration was adopted at the close of the International Conference on Safeguarding Cultural Heritage in Conflict Areas for the protection of heritage in conflict.[338]

CPAVO: *Planning Conference of Archaeologists of the Near East – Iraq and Syria. The Archaeological Heritage of Risks and Prospects* (16-17 December 2016)
CAMNES and the Municipality of Florence (UNESCO Office) have constituted a Scientific and Organizing Committee, which met in Florence on June 28th with the specific purpose to define and organize this upcoming event. The project behind this conference is based on the fact that the scientific community of archaeologists of the Near East is able to make an active and important contribution in addressing issues related to prevention, conservation and enhancement of archaeological and cultural heritage in contexts currently affected by conflicts, more specifically Iraq and Syria. The Scientific and Organizing Committee feels it is necessary to bring together all the scholars of this discipline, currently active, involved or potentially interested in projects of excavations and research in Syria and Iraq, with the aim of producing concrete proposals and projects based on the topics of heritage at risk, local strategies of protection, stakeholders, archaeologists as a source of information in the context of crisis and public archaeology and communication. The event will bring together all the scholars of this subject, involved or potentially interested in the excavations and research projects in Syria-Iraq and with the aim of producing concrete proposals and projects.[339]
It is unknown what the projects / proposal were produced.

xxii.   Speeches / Talks

There have a large number of talks presented across the world on the destruction of Syria's heritage, and the destruction of heritage more widely. The below represents only those for which we have weblinks.

---

[336] UNESCO. 2016. INTERPOL Conference to Strengthen the Fight against Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Objects. *UNESCO* 20/12/2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/beirut/single-view/news/interpol_conference_to_strengthen_the_fight_against_illicit [Accessed 14/02/2017]
[337] *Association for the Protection of Syrian Archaeology* Facebook page. Available at: https://www.facebook.com/apsa2011/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[338] The *Abu Dhabi Declaration* text is available on the ICOMOS website: http://www.icomos.org/en/what-we-do/image-what-we-do/401-heritage-at-risk/8262-icomos-adopts-the-abu-dhabi-declaration-on-heritage-at-risk-in-the-context-of-armed-conflicts [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[339] *CPAVO* website. Available here: http://camnes.org/cpavo-strategy-setting-conference-of-the-italian-archaeologists-of-the-near-east-iraq-and-siria-archaeological-heritage-between-risks-and-perspectives [Accessed 31/1/2017]

The Idols of ISIS (**October 2015**)
Video of a talk by Aaron Tugendhaft at CMES, Berkeley. On February 26, 2015, the Islamic State released a video depicting the destruction of ancient sculptures in the Mosul Museum. The video announced that the sculptures were idols that needed to be destroyed, while international organizations countered that they belonged to Iraq, and to world heritage, and needed to be preserved. This talk explored how religion, politics, and art intersect in this image of image destruction, and raised questions about the aesthetics of totalitarian governance in the age of the "selfie."
- Video available online.[340]

Heritage and Conflict. Syria's Battle to Protect its Past (**12 November 2015**)
The inaugural event in a new series of World Monuments Fund Talks: *The Past, Today*. The tragic loss of ancient heritage in Palmyra and throughout Syria is repeatedly making the headlines. In an exclusive talk by World Monuments Fund Britain, the World Monuments Fund welcomed Prof. Maamoun Abdulkarim, Director-General of Antiquities for Syria, in his first visit to the UK, to talk about the story behind the headlines.
- The podcast of the event is available online.[341]

Using Satellites to Connect the Dots: Looted Antiquities, ISIL, and the Syrian Civil War (**November 2015**)
ASOR Annual meeting 2015 (American Schools of Oriental Research).
- The keynote speech by Dr Jesse Casana, Dartmouth, *Using Satellites to Connect the Dots: Looted Antiquities, ISIL, and the Syrian Civil War* is available online.[342]

Deploying Technology to Rescue the Past (**28 January 2016**)
FutureTense and New America hosted a one hour discussion – Deploying Technology to Rescue the Past – featuring ASOR CHI's Scott Branting, Salam Al Kuntar of the SHOSHI project, and Dr Johnson of the Smithsonian.
- A video of the event is available online. [343]

The Destruction of Syria and the Crisis of Universal Values (**18 March 2016**)
- Lecture by Michael Ignatieff: available on You-Tube.[344]

The movement of cultural property in 2016: regulation, international cooperation and professional diligence for the protection of cultural heritage (**March 2016**)
One-day round table focused on the art market and its important role in the fight against the illicit trafficking of cultural property took place at UNESCO Headquarters.
- Details of the event and links to podcasts here.[345]

---

[340] *The Idols of ISIS*: http://cmes.berkeley.edu/aaron-tugendhaft-on-the-idols-of-isis/ [Accessed 2/3/2017]
[341] AbdulKarim, M. 2015. Heritage and Conflict. Syria's Battle to Protect its Past. *WMF*. Available at: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iSolxbv_61o&app=desktop [Accessed 2/3/2017]
[342] ASOR podcast. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Q1wpXwXHDh4&feature=youtu.be [Accessed 3/3/2017]
[343] *New America*. 2016. Deploying Technology to Rescue the Past. 28 January 2016. Available at: https://www.newamerica.org/future-tense/events/deploying-technology-to-rescue-the-past/ [Accessed 02/02.2017]
[344] 18 March 2016. Lecture by Michael Ignatieff: available on You-Tube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1PMD1onFIvc&t=378s [Accessed 4/3/2017]

Europe lecture on heritage protection **(16 June 2016)**
On June16th the DG of UNESCO addressed the Europe Lecture and discussed heritage protection.

- The text of her speech is available online.[346]

Cultural heritage crises in Syria after the liberalisation of Palmyra from IS occupation **(6 July 2016)**
The event, held during the Dutch Presidency of the EU, gathered some 300 people at the Klosterklerk and was honoured by the presence of H.R.H Princess Laurentien of the Netherlands. Judge Silvia Fernández de Gurmendi, President of the International Criminal Court, Sada Mire, a Somali Archaeologist and Researcher at Leiden University, and Sneška Quaedvlieg-Mihailović, Secretary-General of Europa Nostra, Europe's leading heritage organisation headquartered in The Hague, contributed to this year's Europe Lecture. The opening remarks were made by City Councilor Ingrid van Engelshoven. The event was an exchange of views on the Cultural heritage crises in Syria after the liberalisation of Palmyra from IS occupation.[347] [348]

- Videos of the event are available online.[349]
- Details and text of the address by the head of UNESCO, Irina Bokova, are available online.[350]

Syria: A Living History: **DGAM lecture (15 October 2016)**
Dr. Maamoun Abdulkarim gave a lecture about Syrian heritage during the opening ceremony of the Agha Khan Exhibition *Syria: A Living History*.

- A video is available online[351]

ISIS and the Media: Iconoclasm in the Era of Clickbait **(2 December 2015)**
Jason Felch and Dr. Bastien Varoutsikos gave a lecture at the harvard SCA Special Event: *Breaking Iconoclasm: Destroying and Rebuilding Past and Present Heritage*.[352] The talk looked into the intersections between modern media strategy (clickbait) and mechanisms of iconoclastic urges in the context of the destruction of Syrian cultural heritage.

- Videos of the event are available online.[353]

[345] Details of the event: *The Movement of Cultural Property*. http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/the-movement-of-cultural-property-in-2016-regulation-international-cooperation-and-professional-diligence-for-the-protection-of-cultural-heritage/ [Accessed 4/3/2017]
[346] UNESCO. 2016. UNESCO Director-General addresses the Europe Lecture 2016 on heritage protection as a security issue. *UNESCO Media Services.*14 June 2016. Available at: http://ht.ly/ABFc301oUT8 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[347] *Europe Lecture*. 2016. Available at: https://www.europelecture.com/ [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[348] Read the full speech here: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/14th-Europe-Lecture-on-Protecting-cultural-heritage-in-times-of-conflict.pdf [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[349] *Europe Lecture - Cultural Heritage*. Available at: http://www.europelecture.com/id/vk1lecrl7cvb/europe_lecture_cultural_heritage [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[350] Address by Irina Bokova, Director-General of UNESCO on the occasion of the 14th Europe Lecture on "*Protecting cultural heritage in times of conflict*" The Hague, Klosterklerk, 13 June, 2016 http://ukblueshield.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/14th-Europe-Lecture-on-Protecting-cultural-heritage-in-times-of-conflict.pdf [Accessed 18/02/2017]
[351] *DGAM* Website: Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2068 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[352] *Harvard University Standing committee on Archaeology* website. Available at: http://archaeology.harvard.edu/event/breaking-iconoclasm-roundtable [Accessed 6/3/2017]
[353] *Harvard University Standing committee on Archaeology* Youtube channel. Available at:

xxiii. Exhibitions

Museum Tribute to Khalad al Assad (6 October 2015)
Museum of Fine Arts in Boston designed a small display that would create a moment of in-gallery reflection by focusing on al-Assad's dedication to Palmyra and his contributions to the fields of art history and archaeology.[354]

***Syria Widowed: Remembering Palmyra* exhibition (December 2015)**
Remembering Palmyra commemorated recently destroyed monuments at Palmyra, Syria, only one of a growing number of ancient sites devastated by ISIL. The exhibit, on view until 10 December 2015 in the rear atrium of Cohen Memorial Hall, was organized by Betsey Robinson, associate professor of the history of art, and E.B. Armstrong, a junior in the College of Arts and Science. The exhibit juxtaposed 18th-century engravings of temples, tombs, and cityscapes with photographs taken by Robinson in 1995. Relying on the power of images, the organizers respond to ISIL not with scenes of violence and destruction but with memories of more peaceful times. Co-sponsors are the Departments of History of Art, Anthropology, Religious Studies, Islamic Studies, and Classical Studies, as well as the Robert Penn Warren Center for the Humanities, Divinity School, Fine Arts Gallery, and syriaca.org.[355]

***The Missing: Rebuilding the Past* (December – February 2015/6)**
The Missing: Rebuilding the Past was the first exhibit to showcase the efforts of artists and scholars to resist the destruction of the past through creative and innovative reactions, protests, and reconstructions. Professor Thompson co-curated the exhibit - a variety of media, including photography, drawing, video, 3D printing - which explore the destruction of art at many historical moments, from ancient Greece to World War II to the present. ISIS' destruction of cultural property is meant to show its power through convincing its audience of the West's helpless impotence to protect the artworks Westerners love. But the artists and scholars of The Missing showed that this is a false message – that there are many ways, from the creative to the technical, in which they and we can help fight ISIS' message by making the destroyed past live again.
(Website no longer available).

***Pop-Up Palmyra: Responses to the Destruction of the Past* (April 2016)**
CMES, in partnership with the Phoebe A. Hearst Museum of Anthropology, organized Pop-Up Palmyra: Responses to the Destruction of the Past. The informal, short-term exhibition was on display in the Stanley Hall Atrium on March 12, and then again in other campus locations during CalDay on April 16 2016.[356]

Australian artist pays tribute (September 2016)
Australian stencil artist Luke Cornish travelled from his country to Syria to see with his own eyes what is happening. He painted a portrait of Khaled al-Asaad in the Amphitheater where

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=wohdAnJPzik&list=PLY9g_34UpEiwnD5jRsZJJluPlMmGHnlgs [Accessed 6/3/2017]

[354] Segal, P. 2016. One museum's tribute to the murdered Syrian archaeologist, Khaled al-Asaad. *Apollo Magazine. 4* February 2016. Available at: https://www.apollo-magazine.com/one-museums-tribute-to-the-murdered-syrian-archaeologist-khaled-al-asaad/ [Accessed 02/02/2017]

[355] *Syria Widowed: Remembering Palmyra*. Available at: https://as.vanderbilt.edu/historyart/syriawidowed.php [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[356] Exhibition Pop Up Palmyra, Hearst Museum of Anthropology. Available at: http://hearstmuseum.berkeley.edu/popuppalmyra [Accessed 31/1/2017]

he was executed. Cornish added "*I wanted to paint this portrait of Khaled al-Asaad to pay homage to his sacrifice, a symbolic gesture of returning his head to the place that it was taken away, a place he dedicated his life, and ultimately sacrificed it, to protect*." He also paid tribute to the kind and hopeful spirit of the Syrians he met there.[357]

Rising from Destruction (6 October - 12 November 2016)
The DGAM took part in an exhibition in Rome entitled *Rising from Destruction* featuring several artefacts from Syria and Iraq destroyed by ISIS.[358]

Heritage left behind - Photo exhibitions in Oss, Netherlands (started 20 October 2016)
The DGAM participated in the development of a photo exhibition dedicated to the destruction of Syrian Heritage. The exhibition took a historical perspective to put in parallels photos of the Netherlands during WWII and the current destructions taking place in Syria. It also highlighted some of the preservation and restoration efforts of the DGAM359. A brochure is also available[360].

Photo exhibition depicting devastation of Aleppo in Moscow (October 2016)
A photo exhibition by the Syrian artist and photographer Hagop Wanisian was opened at the Moscow State Museum of the East, in cooperation with the Syrian Embassy in Moscow.[361]

Massimiliano Gatti - *The Day Memory Dissolved: an artistic perspective on endangered archaeological sites in the Middle East* (18 October-16 November 2016)
Massimiliano Gatti presented a stunning record of work: recent images from Syria (Palmyra, Apamea, Resafa) and Iraq (Khorsabad, and the Jerwan site, both near Mosul). The exhibition – which includes photographs of structures before their deliberate destruction; sites looted for profit; and fragile ruins that remain intact – is not a work of journalism, but rather a poetic investigation of objects and structures as metaphor.

This exhibition is part of *Protecting our Heritage*, a focal topic for the Washington cluster of EUNIC (the European Union National Institutes of Culture).[362]

Exhibition in Moscow showing the effects on the ongoing Syrian War (November 2016)
Syrian and Russian visual artists held an exhibition in Moscow showing Syria's situation before and after the war on the country. Their art works depicted the effect of the ongoing war on Syria and the steadfastness of Syrian people.[363]

[357] Ghinwa, M. / Sabbagh, H. Australian Artist Luke Cornish Pays Tribute to Palmyra and Archeaologist Khaled As-Asaad. *SANA*. 30 September 2016. Available at: http://sana.sy/en/?p=89356 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[358] *DGAM* Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2062 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[359] *DGAM* Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2046 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[360] Achtergelaten erfgoed. Heritage left behind. Available *DGAM* website here: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/File/downloads/Brochure.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[361] Raslan, R. / Ghossoun. 2016. Photo exhibition depicting the devastation of Aleppo by terrorists opened in Moscow. *SANA*. 27 October 2016. Available at: http://sana.sy/en/?p=91682 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[362] *The Day Memory Dissolved: an artistic perspective on endangered archaeological sites in the Middle East:* http://us8.campaign-archive1.com/?u=a1136ed9597a1f59943ef9fac&id=beb6a5627e&e= [Accessed 04/03/2017]

[363] Qaddiyr, B. 2016. Syrian, Russian Artists Hold Exhibition in Moscow. *The Syria Times*. 25 November 2016. Available at: http://syriatimes.sy/index.php/culturt/27787-syrian-russian-artists-hold-exhibition-in-moscow [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Syria: A Living History **Exhibition at the Aga Khan Museum Toronto (15 October 2016 to 26 March 2017)**

"*Stories of conflict and displacement dominate the media and define people's awareness of the place. Syria: A Living History brings together artifacts and artworks that tell a different story — one of cultural diversity, historical continuity, resourcefulness, and resilience.*"[364]

La Syrie Et Le Désastre Archéologique Du Proche-Orient: Palmyre, Cité Martyre **(2016)**
This exhibition features photos and documents reflecting the recent destruction of Syrian heritage as well as archaeological Palmyrian pieces from the AUB Museum. Curators: Dr. Michel al- Maqdissi & Dr. Leila Badre.[365]

xxiv. *Other*

Antiquities Coalition Smart M.App and Map and Infographics
The Antiquities Coalition have created several Infographics to raise awareness of problems like looting. In addition, they have developed a Culture Under Threat Map that uses a heat map to illustrate the geographic extent of terror groups control and the heritage sites under threat. The map can be viewed here.[366] A second map seeks to aid efforts to protect heritage by providing a foundation for identifying culture under threat in the broader context of terrorist activity in the region. It displays areas that are under the direct control of terrorist groups or threatened by areas they have occupied between January and October 2015; cultural heritage sites that have been deliberately targeted for destruction, demolition, or attack by violent extremist non-state actors and organizations; World Heritage and Tentative World Heritage sites; museum locations (dedicated specifically to archaeology, history and/or religion); and a heat map of areas with the highest concentrations of incidents of destruction.[367]

Conflict in Culture website launched (June 2016)
In 2014, the University of Pennsylvania Museum, the Smithsonian Institution, and the American Association for the Advancement of Science launched a project to study "conflict culture"—the heritage of communities attacked during periods of war or violence. Now joined by researchers from around the world, the Conflict Culture Research Network supports rigorous, interdisciplinary research that examines how conflict impacts the culture of communities experiencing violence.[368]

Action for Hope
Action for Hope was established to provide cultural relief and cultural development programs to meet the cultural, social and psychological needs of distressed and displaced communities.[369]

---

[364] Syria: A Living History. *Aga Khan Museum*. Available at: https://www.agakhanmuseum.org/syria-living-history [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[365] *Beiteddine Art Festival* website: http://www.beiteddine.org/event-details.asp?eventId=401 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[366] *AC Infographics*. Available here: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/resources/infographics/
Culture Under Threat Map. Available here: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/culture-under-threat-map/ [Accessed 02/02/2017]
[367] AC *Culture Under Threat Map*. Available here: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/cultureunderthreat-smart-m-app/ [Accessed 14/02/2017]
[368] *Conflict Culture*. 2016. Available at: http://conflictculture.info/ [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[369] *Action for Hope*. Website coming soon: http://act4hope.org/

Groups involved in awareness raising activities
The following groups were listed in previous reports, conducting awareness raising (and other) activities. (See previous reports for more details)

It is important to stress that a lack of updates below does not necessarily indicate an inactive group. Given the political sensitivities and complexities of the Syrian conflict, it is not always possible to publicise work.

- *Aleppo Archaeology*: Facebook group that continues to post updates.[370]
- *Alliance for the Restoration of Cultural Heritage (ARCH) International*: *The Working Group to Protect Syrian Heritage in Crisis.*[371]
  As of going to press, the project is no longer on their website.
- *Arab British Centre (ABC)*: The ABC is continuing to raise awareness, with numerous events related to Syria, it's history, the people, and the war.[372]
- *American Institute of Archaeology*: Continues to promote awareness of archaeology in conflict in Syria, and elsewhere, with sessions at its major annual conference.[373]
- *Archaeology in Syria Network*: This organisation promotes the protection of the Syrian archaeological heritage sharing updates, interviews, articles and other type of information on its website and Facebook page.[374]
- *Blue Shield*: UK Blue shield has launched a Facebook page which shares information on the damage to Syrian heritage via its Facebook page.[375]
- *BANEA*: Organisation that raises awareness of the damage to Syrian heritage via its Facebook page.[376]
- *Cultural Heritage in Syria in the current conflict (Heritage in Syria in Danger)*[377]: The project finished at the end of 2016.
- *Division of Antiquities of the Free Council of Aleppo*[378]: The Facebook page has not been updated since April 2015, but was not regularly updated, given the power / internet situation in Aleppo. Current status: unknown.
- *Documenting the Injured Archaeological Sites of Homs*: Page no longer active.
- *Eyes to protect Syrian Heritage (a.k.a. Eyes on Heritage)*[379]: The Facebook page was updated in November 2016, but that is the only post in a year.
- *Fides News Agency*[380]: The website continues to post updates on the status of Syrian Christians.

---

[370] *Aleppo Archaeology.*2016. Facebook page available at: https://www.facebook.com/pages/Aleppo-Archaeology/459668177425042?sk=timeline [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[371] *ARCH* Website. 2016. Available at: http://www.archinternational.org/index.html [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[372] *Arab British Centre* Website. 2016. Available at: http://www.arabbritishcentre.org.uk[Accessed 01/03/17]
[373] *American Institute of Archaeology* Website. 2017. Available at: http://www.archaeological.org/ [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[374] *Archaeology in Syria Network.* 2017. Website available at: http://ainsyria.net/ [Accessed 01/03/2017] Facebook page available at: https://www.facebook.com/Archaeology.in.Syria [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[375] *UK Blue Shield* Facebook page available at: https://www.facebook.com/ukblueshield?ref=bookmarks [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[376] *BANEA* Facebook page available here: https://www.facebook.com/BAneareastarch [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[377] *Cultural Heritage in Syria in the current conflict* Website. Available at: http://hisd.tors.ku.dk/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[378] *Division of Antiquities of the Free Council of Aleppo* Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/Department.Archaeology [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[379] *Eyes to protect Syrian Heritage* Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/eyesonheritage [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[380] *Fides* Website. Available at: http://www.fides.org/en [Accessed 02/03/2017]
Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/pages/Agenzia-Fides/166937210010364 [Accessed 02/03/2017]

- *Friends of Maaloula:* are continuing their awareness raising.[381]
- *Global Heritage Fund*[382]: the organisation remains extremely active in protecting heritage under threat, although have no specifically Syrian work that the authors are aware of.
- *Ila Souria*: Ila Souria continue to raise awareness on their Facebook Page, highlighting a number of events.[383]
- *Institute du Monde Arabe*[384]: The IMA have run several events focussing on the conflict on Syria, but none have been specifically about the cultural heritage.
- *International Association for Assyriology* (IAA) - The main goals of IAA are "to serve as a platform for scholars working in Cuneiform Studies, and Near Eastern Archaeology" and "to discuss all matters concerning these fields". They continue to be active in advocating in these areas.[385]
- *Institute for Cultural Diplomacy* (ICD) [386] and *Italian Priorità Cultura* (IPC): hosted the campaign *The forgotten victim in Syria: The Cultural Heritage*, and the exhibition in Rome Syria: *Splendors and Dramas*
- *Medmak Syrian Archaeologist study Centre*: this group post regular updates of Syrian heritage damage and news articles on their website and Facebook page[387].
- *Oriental Heritage Without Borders*: No specifically Syrian updates, but the group continue to raise awareness of the importance of the heritage of the wider region.[388]
- *National Research Institute for Cultural Properties, Tokyo*[389]: The organisation continues to work with the DGAM to offer assistance where possible.
- *Rescue the Old City of Aleppo*: This Facebook group continues to post intermittent updates to raise awareness of Aleppo's heritage.[390]
- *SAADEH Cultural Foundation*[391]: The organisation continues to raise awareness of the damage to Syria's cultural heritage, and to assist in the prevention of the sale of looted objects where possible.
- *SAFE*: this group have continued to raise awareness of heritage destruction and loss across the world through a wide variety of methods.[392]

[381] *Friends of Maaloula* Website. Available at: http://www.rahim.eu/maaloula/aboutus.html [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[382] *Global Heritage Fund* Website: http://globalheritagefund.org/[Accessed 02/03/2017]
Facebook page*:* https://www.facebook.com/GlobalHeritageFund?fref=ts [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[383] *Ila Souria* Website: http://www.ilasouria.org/en/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]
Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/ila.souria?fref=ts [Accessed 02/03/2017]
YouTube page: https://www.youtube.com/user/ilasouria [Accessed 10/10/2015]

[384] *Institute du Monde Arab* Website: http://www.imarabe.org/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]
Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/institutdumondearabe [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[385] IAA Website: http://iaassyriology.org/
Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/MarShiprim
Project: http://iaassyriology.org/wp-content/uploads/IAA-English.pdf [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[386] *Institute for Cultural Diplomacy* website. 2017. Available at: http://www.culturaldiplomacy.org/index.php?en [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[387] Medmak website: http://medmak.org/ar/%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%B5%D9%81%D8%AD%D8%A9-%D8%A7%D9%84%D8%B1%D8%A6%D9%8A%D8%B3%D9%8A%D8%A9 [Accessed 02/03/2017]
Medmak Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/MedmakSyrianArchaeologistStudiescentre/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[388] *Oriental Heritage Without Borders* Website: http://ohwb.net/?page_id=9 [Accessed 02/03/2017]
Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/ohwb.e.v?fref=ts [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[389] *National Research Institute for Cultural Properties* Website: http://www.tobunken.go.jp/index_e.html [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[390] *Rescue the Ancient City of Aleppo* Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/rescue.aleppo [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[391] *Saadeh Cultural Foundation*: Website: http://saadehcf.org/Home.aspx [Accessed 10/10/15]

- *Save Muslim Heritage*: this group have continued to work to raise awareness of the heritage of the region[393]. They are currently working a project with Heritage for Peace in addition to their wider awareness raising work
- *Schweizerische Gesellschaft für Orientalische Altertumswissenschaft - Swiss Society for Ancient Near Eastern Studies (SGOA)*[394]: No update available.
- *Syria – A cry for heritage*: the group continues to raise awareness via their Facebook Page[395]
- *Syria is Here*[396]: Website. No longer available but the Facebook page is active.
- *Syrian Association for the Preservation of Archaeology and Heritage (SAPAH)*: the group continue to raise awareness via their Facebook page.[397]
- *The Syria Campaign*: the group continue to promote the Syrian heritage on their webpage as part of wider awareness raising activities about the conflict.[398].
- *Syrian Club in Chile*: A "Syrian Tourism Day" was organised by the Syrian Club in Chile to draw awareness to the destruction of Syria's heritage.[399] No new updates available.
- *Syrian Heritage Archive*: the group continues to raise awareness via their Facebook Page.[400]
- *Syrian Heritage Pages*: the group continues to raise awareness via their Facebook Page.[401]
- *The National Archives*: Included for completeness. No new UK legislation has been published.
- *World Monuments Fund*: This organisation placed several major sites in Syria on its 'Watch List' of endangered sites in 2014 and continued to monitor them and raise awareness of the damage to heritage, with regular updates in 2015. However, there were no updates available in 2016[402].

[392] *SAFE* Website: http://www.savingantiquities.org/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]
Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/Savingantiquities?fref=ts [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[393] *Save Muslim Heritage* Website: http://savemuslimheritage.org.uk/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]
Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/SaveMuslimHeritage [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[394] *SGOA* Website: http://sgoa.ch/en/ [Accessed 10/10/2015]
[395] *Syria – A Cry for Heritage Facebo*ok Page:
https://www.facebook.com/%D8%B3%D9%88%D8%B1%D9%8A%D8%A9-
%D8%B5%D8%B1%D8%AE%D8%A9-%D8%AA%D8%B1%D8%A7%D8%AB-1595169457432294/
[Accessed 26/02/17]
[396] *Syria is Here* Website. No longer available. http://syriaishere.com/ar/index.html [Accessed 02/03/2017]
Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/SyriaIsHere.sy [Accessed [Accessed 02/03/2017]]
[397] *Syrian Association for the Preservation of Archaeology and Heritage Facebook Page:*
https://www.facebook.com/psahrteam/timeline [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[398] *The Syria Campaign*: Website: https://thesyriacampaign.org/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[399] 2015. *Syrian Tourism Day highlighting terror threat to cultural heritage held in Chile*. SANA. Available at:
http://www.syriaonline.sy/?f=Details&pageid=18127&catid=27 [Accessed 10/10/2015]
[400] *Syrian Heritage Archive* Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/Syrher.ISL/?fref=ts [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[401] *Syrian Heritage Pages* Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/Syrianheritagep/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[402] *World Monuments Fund.* See their webpage: https://www.wmf.org/project/cultural-heritage-sites-syria
[Accessed 02/03/2017]

c) Laws, Legislation and Resolutions

xxv. *Implemented*

Regulations on Metal Detecting (29-30 September 2016)
UNESCO Intergovernmental Committee For Promoting The Return Of Cultural Property To Its Countries Of Origin Or Its Restitution In Case Of Illicit Appropriation: *Treasure hunters and cultural trafficking* – regulation on metal detectors and underground monitoring systems.[403]

Doha Declaration on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice (12-19 Apr 2015)
(Draft) *Doha Declaration* on integrating crime prevention and criminal justice into the wider United Nations agenda to address social and economic challenges and to promote the rule of law at the national and international levels, and public participation.[404]

European Commission: Return of Illegally Removed Items (25 July 2016)
The European Commission has given Spain, Cyprus, Finland, France, Lithuania, Poland, Portugal and Romania, two months "*to incorporate into national law new rules on returning cultural items illegally taken from other member states. Failure to comply will mean the beginning of legal action*".[405]

Council of the European Union:
Council Decision 2013/760/CFSP 13 December 2013 amending Decision 2013/255/CFSP concerning restrictive measures against Syria[406].
Council Regulation (EU) No 1332/2013 of 13 December 2013 amending Regulation (EU) No 36/2012 concerning restrictive measures in view of the situation in Syria[407].
Both deal with amendments to concerning restrictive measures against Syria, specifically relating to illegally removed cultural objects.

German law to tackle illicit antiquities trafficking (8 July 2016)
The German upper House of Parliament passed a law aimed at tackling illegal trafficking in looted antiquities and protecting German national heritage, introducing what dealers call the

---

[403] *UNESCO*. 2016."Treasure hunters" and cultural trafficking –regulation on metal detectors and underground monitoring systems. Available at: http://ht.ly/G8o7305h6bC [Accessed 02/02/2017]
[404] In *UNODC Website*. Available at:
http://www.unodc.org/documents/congress/Documentation/ACONF222_L6_e_V1502120.pdf [Accessed 1/05/15]
[405] Morgan, S. 2016. EU countries failing to protect cultural heritage. *Euractiv*. 25 July 2016. Available at:
https://www.euractiv.com/section/languages-culture/news/eu-countries-failing-to-protect-cultural-heritage/ [Accessed 02/02/2017]
[406] *Official Journal of the European Union*. L335/50. 14/12/2013. Available at: http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ%3AL%3A2013%3A335%3A0050%3A0051%3AEN%3APDF [Accessed 02/02/2017]
[407] *Official Journal of the European Union*. L335/3. 14/12/2013. Available at: http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ%3AL%3A2013%3A335%3A0003%3A0007%3AEN%3APDF [Accessed 02/02/2017]

most stringent import and export restrictions on cultural objects in the world.[408] The bill has been the subject of some debate.[409]

UK: 1954 Hague Convention for Protection of Cultural Property in Armed Conflict and both Protocols (2016)

In 2017, the UK will ratify the 1954 Hague Convention for Protection of Cultural Property in Armed Conflict and both Protocols. At the end of 2016 the Armed Conflicts (Cultural Property) Bill was about to have its final reading in Parliament[410]. Once the Bill passes, the UK will become the first permanent member of the UN Security Council to ratify the Convention and both its Protocols.

USA: Law H.R.5703 and 1493 - Protect and Preserve International Cultural Property Act (Passed 01 Jun 2015)

A new law to protect and preserve international cultural property at risk of destruction due to political instability, armed conflict, or natural or other disasters, and for other purposes. H.R. 1493: directs the State Department to designate an existing employee to coordinate efforts to protect art around the world from being stolen and/or destroyed; establish a Coordinating Committee on International Cultural Property Protection to facilitate the Coordinator's work, which will meet once a year and be made up of representatives from various Federal agencies, who will "*coordinate and inform Federal efforts to protect international cultural property*"; block importation of "*archaeological or ethnological material of Syria*" starting 120 days after the bill's enactment. The import restrictions would expire in five years, but can be extended.[411] It authorizes any agency involved in international cultural property protection activities to enter into agreements with the Smithsonian Institution to engage Smithsonian personnel temporarily to assist in such activities.

President Obama signed the Protect and Preserve Cultural Property Act H.R. 1493 into law on 9 May 2016 which "*directs the President to exercise his authority to impose import restrictions with respect to archaeological or ethnological material of Syria*".[412] [413] [414].

[408] Hickley, K. 2016. German Parliament passes controversial law to protect cultural heritage. *The Art Newspaper*. 8 July 2016. Available at: http://theartnewspaper.com/news/news/german-parliament-passes-controversial-law-to-protect-culture/ [Accessed 02/02/2017]

[409] Puhze, G., Henker, M. 2016, Is the German Cultural Property Protection Act to be welcomed? *Apollo*, 183(638): 16-17. Available at: https://www.apollo-magazine.com/is-the-german-cultural-property-protection-act-to-be-welcomed/ [Accessed 02/02/2017]

[410] Regular updates on the passage of the Bill and the ratification campaign are available on the UK Blue Shield Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/ukblueshield/ [Accessed 02/02/2017]

[411] *Congress.Gov Website*. Available at: https://www.congress.gov/bill/113th-congress/house-bill/5703/text [Accessed 21/08/14]

The White House. 2016. Statement by the Press Secretary on H.R. 1493 and H.R. 2908. 9 May 2016. Available at: https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/the-press-office/2016/05/09/statement-press-secretary-hr-1493-and-hr-2908 [Accessed 02/02/2017]

[413] Jarus, O. 2016. Syrian Antiquities Import Restrictions Are Law, But Will They Work? *Live Science*. Available at: http://www.livescience.com/54698-obama-signs-syrian-antiquities-import-restrictions.html [Accessed 02/02/2017]

[414] *Sputnik*. 2016. Obama Imposes Restrictions on Imports of Archaeological Material From Syria. 9 May 2016. Available at: https://sputniknews.com/politics/201605091039335825-obama-syria-archeological-material/ [Accessed 02/02/2017]

USA H.R.2285 - Prevent Trafficking in Cultural Property Act (Passed House amended (22/09/2016)

This legislation refers to the enforcement and domestic implementation of the previous Act. (Sec. 3) This bill declares that it is U.S. policy to: (1) ensure that Department of Homeland Security (DHS) components enhance and unify their efforts to interdict, detain, seize, and investigate cultural property illegally imported into the United States, disrupt and dismantle smuggling and trafficking networks engaged in or facilitating illegal trade in cultural property, and support prosecutions of persons engaged in such illegal trade; and (2) protect cultural property pursuant to obligations under international conventions.

(Sec. 4) It directs the U.S. Customs and Border Protection (CBP) and the U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) to: (1) designate a principal coordinator to direct, manage, coordinate, and update policies and procedures, and conduct interagency communications, regarding illegally imported cultural property; (2) update and devise directives, regulations, rules, and memoranda of understanding relating to policies and procedures on the illegal importation of cultural property; and (3) train relevant personnel on cultural property laws, identification of at-risk items, and investigative techniques with respect to illegally traded cultural property.

(Sec. 5) DHS must authorize relevant component heads to enter into agreements or memoranda of understanding with the Smithsonian Institution to further activities to protect cultural property.

(Sec. 6) The CBP and ICE must jointly report to Congress on implementation of this bill and other actions to prevent the illegal importation of cultural property into the United States.[415]

USA: Emergency Import Restrictions To Protect the Cultural Heritage of Syria (17 August 2016)

The US Department of State announced that it had imposed emergency restrictions on the import of "*archaeological and ethnological*" material from Syria. These "*restrictions are intended to reduce the incentive for pillage to better preserve Syria's cultural heritage and to combat profiting from the sale of these artifacts by terrorists and criminal organizations*."[416]

United Nations Security Council Resolution 69/196: International Guidelines for Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice Responses with Respect to Trafficking in Cultural Property and Other Related Offences (Jan-Dec 2014)

UNESCO released guidelines for crime prevention and criminal justice responses with respect to trafficking in cultural property in January 2014[417]. The UN General Assembly officially adopted these guidelines on 18 December 2014 at the 69th session.[418]

---

[415] *Congress.gov*. H.R.2285 - Prevent Trafficking in Cultural Property Act. Available at: https://www.congress.gov/bill/114th-congress/house-bill/2285 [Accessed 3/3/2017]

[416] *U.S. Department of State*. 17 August 2016. Available at: https://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2016/08/261099.htm [Accessed 17/8/2016]

[417] UNODC. 2014. *Draft specific guidelines for crime prevention and criminal justice responses with respect to trafficking in cultural property*. UNODC/CCPCJ/EG.1/2014/CRP.1. Available at: https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC_CCPCJ_EG.1_2014/UNODC_CCPCJ_EG.1_2014_CRP1.pdf [Accessed 10/10/2015]

[418] Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 18 December 2014. 69/196. *International Guidelines for Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice Responses with Respect to Trafficking in Cultural Property and Other Related Offences*. Available at: http://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/69/196 [Accessed 30/01/15]

United Nations Security Council Resolution 2139 (22 Feb 2014)

This resolution primarily focussed on the escalating deterioration of the humanitarian situation, and called on all parties to immediately end all violence which has led to human suffering in Syria, save Syria's rich societal mosaic and cultural heritage, and take appropriate steps to ensure the protection of Syria's World Heritage Sites.[419] This was supported by a report of the Secretary-General on the implementation.[420]

United Nations Security Council Resolution 2199 (2015) (12 Feb 2015)

The resolution explicitly recognises the link between illicit traffic and security, outlaws all trade in cultural goods from Iraq and Syria, and requests that UNESCO coordinate efforts in this domain with Interpol.[421]

As part of this, UNESCO released a *Legal study on the protection of cultural heritage through the resolutions of the Security Council of the United Nations.*[422]

An INTERPOL *Conference to Strengthen the Fight against Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Objects*, held in December 2016, assessed the implementation of this resolution.[423]

UNESCO and ICC to examine war crimes (June 2016)

Director General of UNESCO, Irina Bokova, held a bilateral working meetings with President Ms Silvia Fernandez de Gurmandi, and deputy prosecutor James Stewart, to explore ways to deepen cooperation on the protection of cultural heritage and the fight against impunity of war crimes.[424]

MOU UNESCO and ICRC

Considerable attention has focused recently on the destruction of historic monuments in many of the world's armed conflicts. What is however not so widely realized is that in the event of armed conflict, cultural property is protected under International Humanitarian Law. The ICRC recently signed a Memorandum of Understanding with UNESCO's the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation to further strengthen cooperation on this issue. This is the first agreement of its kind signed between the two organisations.[425]

---

[419] United Nations Security Council. *Resolution 2139 (2014). United Nations*. Available at: http://www.un.org/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=S/RES/2139%282014%29 [Accessed 6/06/2014]

[420] United Nations Security Council. 2014. *Report of the Secretary-General on the implementation of Security Council resolution 2139 (2014).* 24 March 2014. Available at: http://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=S/2014/208&referer=/english/&Lang=E [accessed 18/10/2015]

[421] UNSCR *Resolution 2199 (2015).* UN Website. Available at: http://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=S/RES/2199%20%282015%29 [Accessed 28/02/15]

[422] Négri, V. 2015. *Legal study on the protection of cultural heritage through the resolutions of the Security Council of the United Nations. Cultural heritage through the prism of resolution 2199 (2015) of the Security Council.* UNESCO. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/pdf/Study_Negri_RES2199_01.pdf [Accessed 18/10/15]

[423] UNESCO. 2016. INTERPOL Conference to Strengthen the Fight against Illicit Trafficking of Cultural Objects. *UNESCO* 20/12/2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/beirut/single-view/news/interpol_conference_to_strengthen_the_fight_against_illicit [Accessed 14/02/2017]

[424] UNESCO. 2016. UNESCO Director-General and ICC President reaffirm joint commitment to end impunity for deliberate destruction of heritage. *UNESCO Media Services*. 16/6/2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/media-services/single-view/news/unesco_director_general_and_icc_president_reaffirm_joint_com-1/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[425] ICRC. 2015. Cultural property must be protected in times of war - Q&A. *ICRC website*, 8/3/2016. Available at: https://www.icrc.org/en/document/cultural-property-protected-in-armed-conflict [accessed 4/3/2017]

MOU Iran and Syria to fight illicit trafficking (22 Jun 2015)
Iran and Syria signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on 22 June 2015 on cooperation in domestic security, and the fight against terrorism and its financing. The MoU also calls for cooperation against the stealing of antiquities.[426]

xxvi.   Proposed

EU: Regulation of the import of cultural goods (3 Sep 2015)
At the *Importance of Provenance Research and Cultural Heritage Protection* Workshop (15-16 September 2-15), the Committee on Legal Affairs commissioned a study into the viability and suitability of introducing legislation to the European Parliament to mandate provenance research as an indispensable mechanism to combat the trade in illicit antiquities and plundered cultural heritage.[427]

The EU is considering putting forward legislation that would regulate the import of cultural goods into the EU. As a first step, they launched a study on gaps in national legislations in this area in 2016: the consultation was open from 28-10-2016 – 23-01-2017. The measures under consultation aim to protect cultural heritage, fight illicit trafficking, prevent terrorist factions from acquiring income through cultural goods sales and promote legal trade in cultural goods in the EU and worldwide. It also aims to empower EU customs to seize illegal shipments and increase knowledge and traceability of cultural goods that come through the EU external border. Lastly, it will endeavour to ensure that seized goods are safely stored until they can be returned and will promote international co-operation in safeguarding world heritage.[428]

d) Training / Courses

This section covers only course courses that have taken place in the period covered by the report. Additional courses are covered in previous reports.

Museum and Site Protection Training, Idlib (2015)
Syrians working in opposition controlled areas were trained in Turkey in antiquities-preservation techniques by SHOSHI. [429] [430] [431] Workshops succeeded in delivering much

---

[426] 2015. Iran, Syria sign security cooperation MOU. *Kuwait News Agency*. 22 June 2015. Available at: http://www.kuna.net.kw/ArticleDetails.aspx?id=2447891&language=en [Accessed 10/10/15]

[427] *European Parliament Legislation to combat the illicit antiquities trade.* The conference booklet is available here: http://shoahlegacy.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/Final-Booklet.pdf [accessed 17/10/15]
Full details are available on the UK Blue Shield website; http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/importance-of-provenance-research-and-cultural-heritage-protection/ [Accessed: 16/10/ 2015]

[428] *Consultation on rules on the import of cultural goods*. Available at:
https://ec.europa.eu/taxation_customs/consultations-get-involved/customs-consultations/consultation-rules-import-cultural-goods_en [Accessed 1/3/2017]

[429] Oelbaum, J. 2016. One foot in the Levant. *Good*. Available at: https://www.good.is/features/issue-36-amr-al-azm?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[430] Nassar, A. and Kieke, S. 2016. In Idlib's ancient Dead Cities, a few try to stem the tide of destruction. *Syria Direct*. 12 May 2016. Available at: http://syriadirect.org/news/in-idlib%E2%80%99s-ancient-dead-cities-a-few-try-to-stem-the-tide-of-destruction/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[431] Al Quntar, S. and Daniels, B. I. 2016. 'Responses to the Destruction of Syrian Cultural Heritage: A Critical Review of Current Efforts', *International Journal of Islamic Architecture*, 5(2), 381–397, doi: 10.1386/ijia.5.2.381_1

needed training on emergency procedures and, perhaps even more importantly, delivering conservation and preservation supplies in areas of northern Syria. In early 2015, the SHOSI Project completed an emergency protection project at the Maarra Mosaic Museum in Idlib province, which houses a large Late Antique and Byzantine mosaic collection that could not be evacuated to safe storage. SHOSHI training, coupled with sufficient financial resources, enabled the museum's curators and conservators, with the assistance of local labour, to coat the mosaics with water-soluble glue and to cover their surface with a protective polyethylene-fibre fabric or cotton sheeting. The mosaics were then sandbagged for in situ protection from the potential structural collapse of the historic building.

Rapid recording of at-risk cultural heritage (11 January 2016; 27 June - 1 July 2016)
Training was held in collaboration with ICOMOS, CyArk (as Part of Project Anqa) and the UNESCO Beirut office *Emergency Safeguarding to the Syrian Cultural Heritage* Project. The training, attended by DGAM staff, focused on the rapid recording of at-risk cultural heritage in Syria & Iraq. The hands-on workshop provided five representatives from the Syrian Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) with the skills needed to utilize the latest digital preservation technologies, including; laser scanning, hand-held structured light scanners and photogrammetry.[432]

5 DGAM employees attended additional training in Beirut for emergency recording and archiving of cultural heritage in high risk zones.[433]

Improving inventories of built movable cultural heritage (6 May 2016)
The DGAM and other government agencies participated in a meeting in Beirut titled, *Improving inventories of built movable cultural heritage*.[434]

Risk management training in Sharjah (October 2016)
The ICCROM-ATHAR centre at Sharjah conducted a training programme on protecting cultural heritage in war zones. The aim of the training, which was attended by DGAM employees, was to introduce a risk management methodology designed for museum collections, addressing the different types of risks that threaten cultural heritage from sudden and catastrophic events to gradual and cumulative deterioration processes.[435] [436] [437]

Safeguarding manuscripts and archives (26-30 October 2016)
UNESCO and German Archaeological Institute (DAI) trained Syrian experts to safeguard their manuscripts and archives. Participants, including staff members from several Syrian ministries, municipalities, NGOs and members of syndicates and the civil society, gathered in UNESCO Office in Beirut where they were trained on the use of modern techniques for the digitalization of their archives, and provided with appropriate workflows, equipment and software. One of the main aims of the workshop was to create a standard, accessible and simple guide in Arabic for Syrian experts to be able to use tools for the preservation and digitization of archives effectively. In addition to the theoretical sessions, hands-on exercises

---

[432] *Project Anqa* webpage: http://www.cyark.org/news/project-anqa-progresses-in-2016 [Accessed 4/3/207]
DGAM Website. 2016. Training on using new techniques in archaeological documentation started in Beirut. Available at: http://dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1896 [Accessed 02/02/2017]
[433] *DGAM* Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2002 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[434] *DGAM* Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1984 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[435] *DGAM* Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2055 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[436] *DGAM* Website. Available at:http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=2058 [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[437] Crompton, P. Sharjah course shows how to save Arab heritage sites. *Gulf News*.4 October 2016. Available at: http://gulfnews.com/news/uae/culture/sharjah-course-shows-how-to-save-arab-heritage-sites-1.1906830

were carried out with the support of the Syrian Heritage Archive Project and the University of Balamand in Lebanon.[438]

Museum Photographic Documentation course (14 - 18 November 2016)
The Bosra Sham Archaeology Department participated in a *Museum Photographic Documentation* course in Jordan under the supervision and training of a specialized tutor from the Metropolitan Museum of Art.[439]

Heritage for Peace SHeLTr Project (2016-ongoing)
The *SHELTr (Syrian Heritage Law Training)* is an e-course in development by Heritage for Peace with the assistance of Save Muslim Heritage, in order to provide legal training to court staff in the opposition-held Syria on matters pertaining to cultural heritage. SHELTr relies on the development of a curriculum addressing legal aspects of cultural heritage protection in three legal frameworks relevant in Syria: Syrian National Law, Islamic Law, and International Humanitarian Law. This training program will be organized as a 5-day e-learning workshop that will be hosted in a regional training centre early 2017.[440]

Endangered Archaeology in the Middle East and North Africa (EAMENA) (2015 – 2020)
The EAMENA Project is primarily based at Oxford University, although the Syrian team is largely based at Durham University.[441] EAMENA have also received a grant from the Cultural Protection Fund that may include additional training work site recording and database use in Syria.[442]

Disaster Risk Management Training for a Damascus Team (TBC)
A first aid support meeting for the ancient city of Damascus was held at UNESCO Office Beirut (see Section 2a xv - Reconstruction Projects and Conservation). As follow-up to the meeting, UNESCO plans to provide a training to an all-inclusive team from Damascus on disaster risk management issues.[443]

---

[438] UNESCO. 2016. Syrian Experts trained to safeguard their manuscripts and archives. *UNESCO* 30/9/2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/beirut/single-view/news/syrian_experts_trained_to_safeguard_their_manuscripts_and_ar#.V_X7IoVOKM8 [Accessed 14/02/2017]

[439] *Department of Antiquities in the City of Bosra Sham* Facebook page. 18 November 2016. https://www.facebook.com/permalink.php?story_fbid=1868164760093348&id=1642112122698614 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[440]Varoutsikos, B. 2016. SHELTr, a legal training program to preserve cultural heritage in Syria. *Gerda Henkel Stiftung*. Available at: https://lisa.gerda-henkel-stiftung.de/sheltr_a_legal_training_program_to_preserve_cultural_heritage_in_syria?nav_id=6717 [Accessed 02/02/2017]

[441] *EAMENA*: Available at: www.EAMENA.org [Accessed 10/10/15]

[442] Details available here: https://www.britishcouncil.org/arts/culture-development/cultural-protection-fund/projects/endangered-archaeology [Accessed 11/02/2017]

[443] *UNESCO*. 2016. UNESCO meeting discusses the Ancient City of Damascus. 16/11/2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/member-states/single-view/news/unesco_meeting_discusses_the_ancient_city_of_damascus/ [Accessed 12/02/2017]

---

e) Military Operations

UN 'blue helmets' proposed to protect heritage sites
Francesco Rutelli proposed the need for UN "Blue Helmets" to protect heritage sites.[444]

UN Peacekeeping Mandate to protect Cultural Heritage
UN Secretary-General Ban Ki-moon reiterated that – as seen in Mali – protecting cultural heritage threads through the UN Peacekeeping Strategy.[445]

f) Publications

xxvii.   Damage Reports / Publications

Maps: Damage Maps of Syria (October 2013 – ongoing)
DGAM has created maps documenting damage to archaeological heritage on their website.[446]
Map 1 – historic buildings:
http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site_damage01.jpg
Map 2 – museums http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site_damage02.jpg
Map 3 – Dead Cities
http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site_damage03.jpg
Map 4 – more museums:
http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site_damage04.jpg
Map 5 – Palmyra: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site_damage05.jpg
Map 6 – Bosra: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site_damage06.jpg

Report: Site Damage Analysis - The American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS) (2014)
AAAS published two reports, using satellite imagery to assess damage to Syria's World Heritage Sites,[447] and the Tentative World Heritage Sites.[448]

---

[444] Interview with Francesco Rutelli on 29 March 2016 (in Italian)
Barzaghi, I. 2016. Proteggere la cultura dall'ISIS per salvare l'identità di tutti. *VNY*. 24 March 2016. Available at: http://www.lavocedinewyork.com/onu/2016/03/24/francesco-rutelli-proteggere-la-cultura-da-isis/ [03/02/2017]

[445] Ban Ki-Moon. 2016. Protecting Cultural Heritage Threads through United Nations Peacekeeping Strategy, Secretary-General Tells Yale University Colloquium. *UN Press*. 12/4/2016. Available at: https://www.un.org/press/en/2016/sgsm17664.doc.htm [Accessed 12/02/2017]

[446] *DGAM Website.* Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=239&id=1001 [Accessed 10/10/13]

[447] AAAS, Wolfinbarger, S., Drake, J., Ashcroft, E. and Hanson, K. 2014a. *Ancient History, Modern Destruction: Assessing the Current Status of Syria's World Heritage Sites Using High-Resolution Satellite Imagery. September 2014*. Washington DC: American Association for the Advancement of Science, Smithsonian Institution, Penn Museum. Available at: http://www.aaas.org/page/ancient-history-modern-destruction-assessing-current-status-syria-s-world-heritage-sites-using [Accessed 4/04/15]

[448] AAAS, Wolfinbarger, S., Drake, J., Ashcroft, E. and Hanson, K. 2014b. *Ancient History, Modern Destruction: Assessing the Status of Syria's Tentative World Heritage Sites Using High-Resolution Satellite Imagery. Part One - December 2014*. Washington DC: American Association for the Advancement of Science, Smithsonian Institution, Penn Museum. Available at: http://www.aaas.org/report/ancient-history-modern-destruction-assessing-status-syria-s-tentative-world-heritage-sites [Accessed 08/08/15]

Report: Site Damage Analysis - UNOSAT / UNITAR (2014)
UNOSAT, the satellite imagery branch of the UN, in the UNITAR section, have released an analysis of a selection of several hundred damaged sites including world heritage sites, and some of the sites nearby.[449]

Report: Site Damage Analysis – UUNESCO and UNOSAT / UNITAR (2015)
UNESCO and UNOSAT (the satellite imagery branch of the UN, in the UNITAR section) have released an analysis of damage to sites Iraq, Nepal, Syria and Yemen.[450]

Interactive Map: Conflicted Archaeological Sites in Syria (Feb 2015 – ongoing)
The DGAM launched an interactive map of damaged sites on their webpage to help document and disseminate information on damage (available in Arabic[451] and English[452]).

Reports: Site Damage in Al-Jazira Area (2016 onwards)
The Authority of Tourism and Protection of Antiquities in al-Jazira Canton have numerous reports on site damage, available on their website[453].

Report: DGAM: Damage Assessment Reports.
Initial damage assessment from 1/07/14 until 30/09/14 for archaeological and historic sites and buildings.[454] Initial damage assessment from 1st Jan 2015 to 31st March 2015.[455] These were replaced by the annual State of Conservation Reports (next). In 2016, the DGAM also published and five-year overview from 2011-2015.[456]

Report: *UNESCO State of Conservation Report* (2013-2016.
The DGAM State of Conversation yearly report to the UNESCO World Heritage Committee was made available in August 2016 on the World Heritage website, as are previous reports[457]

Report: *UNESCO World Heritage Committee report* (2013-2016).
The UNESCO World Heritage Committee report 2016 for Syria's World Heritage Sites was made available on the World Heritage website.

---

[449] Bjørgo, E., Boccardi, G., Cunliffe, E., Fiol, M., Jellison, T., Pederson, W. and Saslow, C. 2014. *Satellite-Based Damage Assessment to Cultural Heritage Sites in Syria*. [Online]: UNITAR, UNOSAT. Available: http://www.unitar.org/unosat/chs-syria [Accessed 16/10/15]

[450] UNOSAT. 2016. *Satellite-Based Damage Assessment of Cultural Heritage Sites 2015 Summary Report of Iraq, Nepal, Syria & Yemen*. June 2016. Available at: http://en.unesco.org/system/files/full-chs-report_28062016_final.pdf [Accessed 10/02/17]

[451] *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1595 [Accessed 10/02/17]

[452] *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=177&id=1678 [Accessed 10/02/17]

[453] *The Authority of Tourism and Protection of Antiquities in al-Jazira Canton* site reports: http://desteya-shunwaran.com/ar/category/news/ [Accessed 10/02/17]

[454] DGAM. 2014. *Initial damage assessment from 1/07/14 until 30/09/14 for archaeological and historic sites and building.* 1 Oct 2014. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1441. English Table available at:
http://dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/File/downloads/damage_assessment_table%20july_september%20en.pdf [Accessed 09/03/15]

[455] DGAM. 2015. *Initial damage assessment from 1st Jan 2015 to 31st March 2015*. 10 April 2015. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1652 [Accessed 24/10/15]

[456] DGAM. 2016. *Syrian Archaeological Heritage. Five years of Crisis 2011-2015*. Ministry of Culture, Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums. Available at:
http://dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/File/downloads/Book_en_2016.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[457] UNESCO. DGAM *State of Conservation Reports* for their World Heritage Sites are available at: http://whc.unesco.org/en/soc/3350 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

The website also contains the report of the *UNESCO Rapid Assessment mission* to the World Heritage site of Palmyra (Syrian Arab Republic), 23–27 April 2016.[458]

Report: *Conflict Urbanism, Aleppo: Mapping Urban Damage (2017)*
One of the oldest continuously inhabited cities on the planet, Aleppo now lies in tatters. This devastation of a designated World Heritage Site is a poignant example of the human and cultural cost of armed conflict – in this case the Syrian Civil War. A project run by the Center for Spatial Research at the Graduate School of Architecture, Planning and Preservation of New York's Columbia University is analysing satellite imagery and reports from the ground to assess the damage and casualties caused there by barrel bombs. Associate Professor Laura Kurgan describes the initiative and its sometimes puzzling findings. [459]

Syrian- Spanish Project in the Middle Euphrates Reports: El Conflicto Armado En Siria Y Su Repercusión Sobre El Patrimonio Cultural.
Three Spanish articles listing damage to sites have been published. The first article deals with the archaeological sites and monuments in Deir ez-Zor governorate, description of the sites, relevant bibliography, date and assessment of the damage. The second article is about Raqqa governorate, and the third about Hasseke. All three can be freely downloaded from the web site of the Syrian- Spanish Project in the Middle Euphrates. [460]

xxviii.   Looting

Report: *Monumental Fight: Countering the Islamic State's Antiquities Trafficking* (2016)
In November 2015, the Foundation for Defense of Democracies released a document entitled *Monumental Fight: Countering the Islamic State's Antiquities Trafficking*. The brief examines Daesh, its revenue streams, and places its looting and vandalism activities in a broader context.[461] The report is one of the most accurate and comprehensive publications widely available to date.

Report / Policy: *Cash to Chaos: Dismantling ISIS' Financial Infrastructure* (2016)
David Grantham, of the National Center for Policy Analysis, authored the report *Cash to Chaos: Dismantling ISIS' Financial Infrastructure*, for the US Department of Homeland Security report. It discusses the looting of archaeological artefacts[462][463]. The report also

---

[458] UNESCO. UNESCO *World Heritage Committee Report 2016* for World Heritage Sites available at: http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/23/documents/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[459] Kurgan, L., 2017, Conflict Urbanism, Aleppo: Mapping Urban Damage, *Architectural Design*, 97(1):72-77, http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/ad.2134/abstract

[460] Spanish Project in the Middle Euphrates Reports available at: http://www.arqueologiaoriente.com/publicaciones.html [Accessed 10/10/15]

[461] Fanusie, Y. and Joffe, A. 2015. *Monumental Fight Countering the Islamic State's Antiquities Trafficking.* Foundation for Defense of Democracies. November 2015. Available at: http://www.defenddemocracy.org/content/uploads/documents/Monumental_Fight.pdf [Accessed 06/02/2017]

[462] Grantham, D. 2016. *Shutting Down ISIS' Antiquities Trade*. National Center for Policy Analysis. January 2016. Available at: http://www.ncpa.org/pdfs/ib185.pdf [Accessed 02/02/2017]

[463] Grantham, D. 2016. *Cash to Chaos: Dismantling ISIS' Financial Infrastructure* Report. Homeland Security Commitee Website 10 June 2016. Available at: https://homeland.house.gov/press/committee-releases-new-report-cash-chaos-dismantling-isis-financial-infrastructure/ [03/02/2017]

featured in Defense Dossier (December 2016): 18.[464] However, the looting figures it contains have been discredited as inaccurate.[465]

Report / Policy: *Study into Syrian war economies* **(2016)**
The Aleppo Project has published a report on how conflict has transformed the Syrian economy. Three groups shape the Syrian war economy today: a violent, power-seeking elite that now controls most sources of wealth; a new opportunistic class providing services to a third group; that is the urban poor living on the edge of survival.[466]

Data (Free E-Book): *Countering Illicit Traffic in Cultural Goods: The Global Challenge of Protecting the World's Heritage* **(2015)**
The International Council of Museums (ICOM) has produced an open access digital book entitled *Countering Illicit Traffic in Cultural Goods: The Global Challenge of Protecting the World's Heritage.*[467]

Policy / Recommendations: *Culture Under Threat Task Force Repor***t (2016)**
The Antiquities Coalition has launched a series of policy papers and recommendations aimed at stopping the trade in illicit antiquities. On 13 April 2016, the Antiquities Coalition launched its *Culture Under Threat Task Force Repor*t, with multiple recommendations for how America, and other countries can fight "cultural crimes", and prevent illicit trafficking.[468]

Policy / Recommendations: *How to end Impunity for Antiquities Traffickers: Assemble a Cultural Heritage Crimes Prosecution Team* **(2016)**
In November 2016, it was followed up by the formation of a Cultural Heritage Think Tank, who launched their first policy paper by Ricardo St. Hilaire titled *How to end Impunity for Antiquities Traffickers: Assemble a Cultural Heritage Crimes Prosecution Team.*[469] The paper suggests clear actions to be taken by the US Department of Justice such as the creation of an office of Cultural Heritage Crimes (CHC) Prosecutors in order to "*hold antiquities traffickers accountable, to disrupt and dismantle their networks, and to give support to police and prosecutors at the local, county, state, and federal levels*".

---

[464] *Defense Dossier 18* (Dec 2016): http://www.afpc.org/files/defense_dossier_december_issue_18.pdf 03/02/2017
[465] For an example of the discussion, see *The Gates of Ninevah Blog*, here: https://gatesofninevah.wordpress.com/2016/01/12/how-much-money-is-isis-making-from-antiquities-looting/ [Accessed 4/3/2017]
[466] Tokmajyan, A. 2016. *The War Economy in Northern Syria*. The Aleppo Project. 4 December 2016. Available at: http://www.thealeppoproject.com/papers/war-economy-northern-syria/ [03/02/2017]
[467] ICOM. 2015. *Countering Illicit Traffic in Cultural Goods The Global Challenge of Protecting the World's Heritage*. 8 December 2015. Available at: https://issuu.com/internationalcouncilofmuseums/docs/book_observatory_illicit_traffic_ve [Accessed 02/02/2017]
[468] Antiquities Coalition Website. 2016. *Cultureunderthreat Task Force Report*. Available at: http://taskforce.theantiquitiescoalition.org/ [Accessed 03/02/2017]
[469] Antiquities Coalition. 2016. Antiquities Coalition Launches New Think Tank Promoting Innovative Solutions to Combat Cultural Racketeering. *Antiquities Coalition* Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/press-releases/antiquities-coalition-launches-new-think-tank-promoting-innovative-solutions-to-combat-cultural-racketeering/?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Report / Recommendations: *CULTURAL PROPERTY: Protection of Iraqi and Syrian Antiquities* **(2016)**
United States Government Accountability Office: CULTURAL PROPERTY.
Protection of Iraqi and Syrian Antiquities. Report GAO-16-673. August 2016[470].
GAO was asked to examine the protection of Iraqi and Syrian cultural property, including views of art market experts. This report describes (1) activities undertaken by U.S. agencies and the Smithsonian Institution to protect Iraqi and Syrian cultural property since 2011, and (2) art market experts' suggestions for improving U.S. government activities. GAO reviewed documents and interviewed U.S., international, and foreign officials. GAO interviewed a nongeneralizable sample of U.S.-based art market experts representing different categories of the art market to obtain suggestions for potentially improving U.S. government activities. GAO then asked experts to rate the importance of these suggestions and obtained U.S. officials' views on experts' top-rated suggestions.

Policy / Recommendation: Free Ports and risks of illicit trafficking of cultural property (2016)
A new UNESCO report suggests that freeports are providing havens for looted items.[471]

Policy / Recommendations: *How Can We Fund the Fight Against Antiquities Looting and Trafficking? A "Pollution" Tax on the Antiquities Trade* **(2016)**
Policy Brief 2 was launched in December 2016, by Lawrence Rothfield, titled *How Can We Fund the Fight Against Antiquities Looting and Trafficking? A "Pollution" Tax on the Antiquities Trade*[472]. The key recommendation is an antiquities tax, tailored to fall more heavily on antiquities with weaker provenance or extremely high prices, and channelled into an antiquities-protection "Superfund" (as was done to clean up toxic chemical sites) or via existing governmental agencies, could provide a sustainable funding stream to pay for more robust monitoring and enforcement efforts against the illicit market and for better site security.

Policy / Recommendations: Thinking on Policies (2015)
Neil Brodie, for The European Union National Institutes for Culture, suggested policy possibilities to fight Daesh's revenues from antiquities trafficking.[473]
These opinions were expanded in the article:

Brodie, N. 2015. Syria and Its Regional Neighbors: A Case of Cultural Property Protection
     Policy Failure? *International Journal of Cultural Property* 22 (2-3), 317-335.

Policy / Recommendations: *Fighting the looting of Syria´s cultural heritage* **(2015)**
The Norwegian Institute for Cultural Heritage Research offered 16 recommendations to fight the looting of Syria's heritage. These are based on the outcomes of their international conference *Fighting the looting of Syria´s cultural heritage,* held in September 2015. The

---

[470] *GAO.* 2016. *CULTURAL PROPERTY: Protection of Iraqi and Syrian Antiquities.* Report GAO-16-673. August 2016. Available at: http://www.gao.gov/assets/680/679075.pdf [Accessed 03/02/2017]
[471] *UNESCO.* 2016. *Free Ports and risks of illicit trafficking of cultural property.* ICPRCP/16/20.COM/12. UNESCO Paris, July 2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/pdf/2_FC_free_port_working_document_Final_EN_revclean.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]
[472] *Antiquities Coalition Policy Brief no. 2.* Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/blog-posts/policy-brief-no-2-how-can-we-fund-the-fight-against-antiquities-looting-and-trafficking-a-pollution-tax-on-the-antiquities-trade/ [Accessed 2/2/2017]
[473] Brodie, N. 2015. Thinking on Policies. *European Union National Institutes for Culture.* Available at: http://washington-dc.eunic-online.eu/?q=content%2Fthinking-policies-0 [Accessed 06/02/2017]

recommendations are made as "ideal recommendations" with an understanding that differences in legislative traditions and political settings between the nations are going to inevitably affect the reception and eventual implementation of the recommendations offered.[474]

Report: *The balance-sheet of conflict: criminal revenues and warlords in Syria* (2015)
The Norwegian Peacebuilding Resource Centre has looked at revenue for Opposition groups in Syria, including a section on looting of archaeological artefacts.
"A *ballpark figure has been suggested for the volume of revenues of local rebel groups of between $300 to $500 million in the past two years.13 While these figures are substantial, it should be remembered that the share of any single brigade is likely to be minimal. Moreover, the largest sites are now mainly in the hands of the al-Nusra Front or the Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham (ISIS)*".
However, they admit there is little evidence for their figures.[475]

xxix.   Guidelines

Guidelines: *Safe Haven Guidelines* (2015)
The Association of Art Museum Directors (AAMD) has provided new guidelines on Safe Havens to assist in "*aiding cultural organizations and institutions to better understand how to shepherd works of art and archaeological objects of importance that are at risk of being damage, looted, or destroyed*".[476] However, they are slightly controversial.[477]

Guidelines: *Post-trauma reconstruction* (March 2016)
The proceedings of the colloquium on post-trauma reconstruction, which was held at the ICOMOS headquarters in Charenton-le-Pont on 4 March 2016, are now available online. The symposium, which hosted about 75 participants, took place in two parts: six keynote speakers gave short presentations in the morning, before thematic discussions were held in small groups during the afternoon. The proceedings of the day are presented in two volumes.[478] The first volume includes a summarized version of the speakers' presentations, followed by a global report of the group discussions and an overall conclusion as to the next steps. As for the second volume, it contains the long version of the presentations and the detailed discussions of each group.

---

[474] *NIKU*. 2015. Expert recommendations - Fighting the looting of Syria´s cultural heritage. Available at : http://www.niku.no/en/international/conferences/Expert+recommendations+-+Fighting+the+looting+of+Syria%C2%B4s+cultural+heritage.9UFRDWZF.ips [Accessed 06/02/2017]
[475] Hallaj, O. A. 2016. *The balance-sheet of conflict: criminal revenues and warlords in Syria*. Norwegian Peacebuilding Resource Centre. May 2015. Available at: https://www.clingendael.nl/sites/default/files/Hallaj_NOREF_Clingendael_The%20balance-sheet%20of%20conflict_criminal%20revenues%20and%20warlords%20in%20Syria_Apr%202015_FINAL.pdf [03/02/2017]
[476] Art Forum. 2015. Association of Art Museum Directors Establish New Protocol for Protecting Antiquities. *Art Forum* Website. Available at: https://www.artforum.com/news/id=55233 [Accessed 07/02/2017]
[477] Rothfield, L. 2015. Why I am worried about AAMD's new "safe haven" protocols. *Larry Rothfield Blog*. 03 September 2015. Available at: http://larryrothfield.blogspot.de/2015/10/why-i-am-worried-about-aamds-new-safe.html [Accessed 07/02/2017]
[478] ICOMOS *Post-trauma reconstruction* - Proceedings available for download. Available at: http://www.icomos.org/en/what-we-do/focus/6149-post-trauma-reconstruction-proceedings-available-for-download [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Guidelines: *Teacher's Guide on the Prevention of Violent Extremism* (2016)
UNESCO have published a guide for teachers on the prevention of violent extremism.[479]

Guidelines: *Training guide on cultural research design* (forthcoming)
Ettijahat- Independent Culture will publish, in association with Mamdouh Adwan Publishing House, a specialised training guide on cultural research design, by researcher Rama Najmeh. The guide proposes a number of methods that can help researchers explore and learn more about research approaches and their suitability to different goals and lines of work. It also provides young researchers of different academic backgrounds, with the necessary knowledge of cultural research skills and practices.[480]

xxx.   Policy / Recommendations (Other)

Policy / Recommendations: OHCHR Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights (2016)
This year's OHCHR Report is dedicated to tackling the issue of intentional destruction of cultural heritage[481]. The Special Rapporteur Karima Bennoune insists on the use of cultural heritage destruction as a form of "cultural warfare" and "cultural cleansing" justifying its definition as a clear violation of human rights, whether carried out by States or non-State actors. The report also justifies the need to adopt a human rights approach to cultural heritage protection to "*emphasizes accountability and the combating of impunity*" and to complement existing IHL provisions. This definition also justifies the support needed by defenders of cultural heritage from the international community.

Policy / Recommendations: *Protecting Cultural Heritage – An Imperative for Humanity* (2016)
The report from the UNODC/UNESCO/INTERPOL initiative *Protecting Cultural Heritage – An Imperative for Humanity* calls for better efforts to combat terrorists and looters, with a number of recommendations, developed jointly by UNODC, UNESCO, INTERPOL and the Governments of Italy and Jordan.[482] [483] (See Section 2a xviii – Projects: Other for full details of the Project).

Policy / Recommendations: *Reinforcement of UNESCO's Action for the Protection of Culture and the Promotion of Cultural Pluralism in the Event of Armed Conflict (2015)*
The document presents UNESCOs strategy for reinforcing UNESCO's action for the protection of culture and the promotion of cultural pluralism in the event of armed conflict

---

[479] *UNESCO's Teacher's Guide on the Prevention of Violent Extremism*. Available at: http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0024/002446/244676e.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[480] Research To Strengthen Culture of Knowledge programme publishes a training guide on cultural research. *Ettijahat* website. Available at: http://ettijahat.org/page/329 [Accessed 05/03/2017]

[481] UNOHCHR. *Special Rapporteur in the Field of Cultural rights* (link to report on right). Available at: http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/CulturalRights/Pages/SRCulturalRightsIndex.aspx   [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[482] *UNDOC*. 2016. New report details actions to better protect our cultural heritage. Available at: http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/frontpage/2016/September/new-report-details-actions-to-better-protect-our-cultural-heritage.html?ref=fs1 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[483] The full report with recommendations is available here:
United Nations. 2016. *Protecting Cultural Heritage – an Imperative for Humanity.* Document available at: http://www.unesco.se/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/2016-Protecting-cultural-heritage.-An-imperative....pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]

with a view to its adoption by the General Conference. Consultation is ongoing, and revisions will be presented in 2017 (see Section 2a xviii – Projects: Other).[484]

Policy / Recommendation: European Council of the European Union Conclusions on the EU regional strategy for Syria and Iraq a the ISIL/Da'esh threat (2015)
This presents the EU regional strategy for Syria and Iraq as well as the ISIL/Da'esh threat. "*The EU strongly condemns ISIL/Da'esh's deliberate destruction of archaeological and cultural heritage in Syria and Iraq and the extremist ideology behind it, noting that such actions may amount to a war crime according to the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court. The EU is committed to help document and protect the heritage of Syria and Iraq while taking appropriate steps in accordance with UNSCR 2199 to prevent the illegal trade of cultural property, noting that such illicit traffic of cultural artefacts, directly contributes to the financing of ISIL/Da'esh and other terrorist organizations.*"[485]

Policy / Recommendations: *Propositions for the protection of global heritage* **(November 2015)**
Under instruction from the French Government, Jean-Luc Martinez, the president of the Louvre, has drawn up a 50-point plan to protect cultural treasures around the world. The plan also includes the creation of a special fund to preserve and reconstruct imperilled antiquities and a programme to train more archaeologists in Iraq and Syria.[486] [487]

Policy / Recommendations: *On Syrian Cultural Work During the Years of Embers*
On Syrian Cultural Work During the Years of Embers, *Three studies in one book from the Cultural Prio* - Ettijahat- Independent Culture published, in association with Mamdouh Adwan Publishing House, a new book titled On Syrian Cultural Work During the Years of Embers. The book includes three studies:
- Cultural Mechanisms and Cultural Production During the Crisis by Mary Elias, PhD.
- The Role of Culture and Art in Achieving Reconciliation and Peace in Countries of Violent Conflicts by Rama Najmeh
- Toward the Development of Cultural Structures in Syria by the Syrian Centre for Policy Studies.[488]

Report: *Country Profile: Cultural Policy in Syria*
Ettijahat completed a profile for cultural policy in Syria.[489]

---

[484] Details and the consultations responses are available at:
UNESCO. 2016. *Strategy for the Reinforcement of UNESCO's Action for the Protection of Culture and the Promotion of Cultural Pluralism in the Event of Armed Conflict*. Available at: http://en.unesco.org/heritage-at-risk/strategy-culture-armed-conflict
The strategy itself is available here: *Reinforcement of UNESCO's Action for the Protection of Culture and the Promotion of Cultural Pluralism in the Event of Armed Conflict* 38 C/49. General Conference 38th Session Paris 2015. http://en.unesco.org/system/files/235186e1.pdf [Accessed 5/3/2017]
[485] Council conclusions on the EU regional strategy for Syria and Iraq as well as the ISIL/Da'esh threat
[486] Martinez, J-L. 2015. *Cinquante propositions françaises pour protéger le patrimoine de l'humanité*. Musée du Louvre. November 2015. Available at: http://www.elysee.fr/assets/Uploads/Cinquante-propositions-francaises-pour-proteger-le-patrimoine-de-lhumanite.pdf [Accessed 06/02/2017]
[487] Jones, J. 2015. Asylum for artefacts: Paris's plan to protect cultural treasures from terrorists. *The Guardian*. 20 November 2015. Available at:
https://www.theguardian.com/artanddesign/jonathanjonesblog/2015/nov/20/asylum-artefacts-paris-terrorists-louvre-isis?CMP=oth_b-aplnews_d-2 [Accessed 06/02/2017]
[488] On Syrian Cultural Work During the Years of Embers, Three studies in one book from the Cultural Prio. *Ettijahat* website. Available at: http://ettijahat.org/page/330 [Accessed 02/03/2017]

Report: *Architectural Environment and Refugees* (2015)
Ettijahat- Independent Culture published, in association with Mamdouh Adwan Publishing
House, a book titled *Five Research Papers on Contemporary Syrian Questions*. Seven young
researchers worked on the book, published as a part of the Research To Strengthen Culture of
Knowledge programme 2015, in order to write five research papers including:
- Architectural Environment and Refugees by Alina Oueishek.
- The Body Between Presence and Absence by Ammar Al Maamoun.
- Refugee Theater by Omar Jbaee.
- Media as a Source of Knowledge: Its Role in Creating Cultural Trends in Society by Louay
Alhammada, Maher Samaan and Naline Malla.
- The Images of The Tortured Body in Contemporary Syrian Fine Art by Mohammed
Omran[490]

Policy / Recommendations: *Rebuilding Downtown Beirut (Lessons for Aleppo)* (2015)
Published by the Aleppo Project, this report looks at the lessons for Aleppo from the
rebuilding of Beirut's City Centre. "*Beirut's city centre is now mostly rebuilt. A quarter
century after it was destroyed during the Lebanese civil war, the area is now a polished mix
of restored buildings, ancient ruins and glass towers. But a place that once drew all of
Lebanon's diverse people to its souks, cafes, cinemas and hotels is a somewhat rootless zone
of empty luxury stores and unoccupied apartments. There are many lessons for Aleppo from
what has happened in Beirut.*"[491] A comment published with the report (below the main
report) considers this from a heritage perspective.

Policy / Recommendations – *Clearing Rubble* (2015)
A report published by the Aleppo Project examines the difficulties of clearing the rubble in
Aleppo, ready for reconstruction.
Abstract: Clearing the rubble from Aleppo and protecting its inhabitants from future
environmental risks are going to be serious challenges. Unexploded bombs, toxic hazards,
likely shortages of funds and almost certain mismanagement could well plague the process
but could be avoided with the right planning. The extent of destruction in Aleppo is better
known than in almost any previous city harmed by war. We have thousands of photographs of
destroyed buildings and satellite images show the extent of damage across the city. In some
neighbourhoods the debris is piled as high as the buildings. The starting point of
reconstruction is clearance. At first glance this should not be too great a challenge. Aleppo is
a fairly flat and accessible city. Outside the Old City, most areas can be easily reached by
heavy equipment that can remove debris rapidly. Asbestos and other mineral fibres were not
widely used in construction and so some of the worst toxic dangers will be manageable.
Much of the rubble can be pulverized and recycled as roadbed or aggregate for concrete.
Areas outside the city are not densely populated and therefore it should be possible to find
sites to dump debris safely and with minimal impact. But problems will arise.[492]

---

[489] Country Profile: Cultural Policy in Syria. *Ettijahat* website. Available here: http://ettijahat.org/page/130
[Accessed 3/4/2017]
[490] Five Research Papers on Contemporary Syrian Questions published by Research To Strengthen Culture.
Ettijahat website. Available at: http://ettijahat.org/page/328 [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[491] Ilona Ilma Ilyes. 2015. *Rebuilding Downtown Beirut*. The Aleppo Project 9/10/2015. Available at:
http://www.thealeppoproject.com/papers/reconstructing-downtown-beirut/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]
[492] Templar, R. 2015. *Clearing Rubble*. The Aleppo Project 20/10/2015. Available at:
http://www.thealeppoproject.com/papers/clearing-rubble/ [Accessed 4/3/2017]

Other: The Battle for Home (2016)
The Battle for Home, by Marwa al-Sabouni. Drawing on the author's personal experience of living and working as an architect in Syria, this book offers an eyewitness perspective on the country's bitter conflict through the lens of architecture, showing how the built environment offers a mirror to the community that inhabits it.[493]

Policy / Review: *Responses to the Destruction of Syrian Cultural Heritage: A Critical Review of Current Efforts* (2016)
Abstract: The Syrian civil war has resulted in over 250,000 deaths and several million displaced refugees within Syria and abroad. In addition to this human toll, the conflict has resulted in the devastation of the country's acclaimed cultural heritage
 sites and the historical fabric that composed the country's social landscape and the identity of its population. In this article, we consider the reaction of the international heritage community to this moment of crisis. To date, the international heritage community has developed three kinds of projects: site documentation projects; public-awareness-raising projects; and emergency training and mitigation projects. Most of these undertakings have prioritized the collection and dissemination of information about heritage loss. Less attention has been given to emergency interventions to support Syrians inside the country and the at-risk heritage. A significant gap exists between international knowledge about heritage in this crisis and the immediate needs of Syrian heritage professionals. Here, we consider some of the reasons for the divergence between on-the-ground-need and international response, along with the intended and unintended outcomes resulting from the documentation and public-awareness-raising projects. In terms of tangible results, there is no substitute for efforts conducted within a humanitarian framework. The challenge is in encouraging the international heritage community to embrace such an approach.[494]

Policy / Recommendations: *Cultural heritage that heals: factoring in cultural heritage discourses in the Syrian peacebuilding process* (2016)
Abstract: Transitional justice is considered a building block of peacebuilding in post-conflict scenarios. Processes may include criminal justice mechanisms, reparation programmes, truth-seeking bodies and institutional reforms which seek to provide redress for victims of human rights atrocities. However, it is now widely acknowledged that the destruction of cultural heritage plays a significant role in and of itself in modern conflicts, affecting entire societies, as it is linked to the destruction of group identity, and can even prolong violence in the post-conflict period. The loss of cultural heritage has been devastating in the ongoing civil war in Syria, most notably in World Heritage sites. Despite this, discussions of potential peacebuilding methods and ideas for transitional justice programmes in Syria have failed to incorporate it. This paper argues that cultural heritage should be included in such work in its own right, and suggests ways this could be accomplished to encourage greater awareness of Syria's cultural diversity, and the understanding and healing that can bring.[495]

---

[493] al-Sabouni, M. 2016. *The Battle for Home*. Available through the Guardian bookshop: https://bookshop.theguardian.com/the-battle-for-home.html
[494] Al Quntar, S. and Daniels, B. I. 2016. Responses to the Destruction of Syrian Cultural Heritage: A Critical Review of Current Efforts, *International Journal of Islamic Architecture*, 5(2), 381–397, doi: 10.1386/ijia.5.2.381_1
[495] Lostal, M. & Cunliffe, E. 2016. Cultural heritage that heals: factoring in cultural heritage discourses in the Syrian peacebuilding process, *The Historic Environment: Policy & Practice*, DOI: 10.1080/17567505.2016.1172781

Aleppo Weekly
The CCNR staff is working on the week's most compelling stories, images, videos, and other resources that provide information about the life in the Syrian city, analyse the conflict that is destroying it, and help residents plan for their future. The weekly follows topics of interest to the Center's researchers, and has a special focus on those displaced from the city and others whose voices are rarely heard when it comes to peace-making or reconstruction.[496]

xxxi.   2016 Academic publications (Other)

Cunliffe, C., Muhesin, N., and Lostal, M. 2016. The Destruction of Cultural Property in the Syrian Conflict: Legal Implications and Obligations. *International Journal of Cultural Property* 23: 1-31.

Friedman, L.L. 2016. ISIS' get rich quick scheme: sell the world's cultural heritage on the black market - purchasers of ISIL-looted Syrian artifacts are not criminally liable under the NSPA and the McCLain doctrine in the Eleventh Circuit.(National Stolen Property Act). *University of Miami Law Review*, 70(4): 1068-1097

Gerstenblith, P. 2016. The Destruction of Cultural Heritage: A Crime Against Property Or A Crime Against People? *15 J. MARSHALL REV. INTELL. PROP. L. 336*
Available online:
http://repository.jmls.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1382&context=ripl

Kurgan, L. 2017. Conflict Urbanism, Aleppo: Mapping Urban Damage, *Architectural Design,* 87(1):72-77

Lenzerini., F. 2016. Terrorism, Conflicts and the Responsibility to Protect Cultural Heritage, *The International Spectator*, 51:2, 70-85, DOI: 10.1080/03932729.2016.1155028

Moore, A. 2016. Heritage in Peril. *Archaeology*, 69(3):6

Pollock., S. 2016. Archaeology and Contemporary Warfare. *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 45:215-231

Puhze, G., Henker, M.A. 2016. Is the German Cultural Property Protection Act to be welcomed?, *Apollo,* 183(638):16-17

Stone, P. 2016. The Challenge of Protecting Heritage in Times of Armed Conflict. *Museum International*.

Tapete, D., Cigna, F., Donoghue, D.N.M. 2016. Looting marks' in space-borne SAR imagery: Measuring rates of archaeological looting in Apamea (Syria) with TerraSAR-X Staring Spotlight. *Remote Sensing of Environment,* 178:42-58

xxxii.   2015 Publications

Bauer, A. 2015. Editorial: The Destruction of Heritage in Syria and Iraq and Its Implications. *International Journal of Cultural Property* 22 (1), 1-6.

Brodie, N. 2015. Syria and Its Regional Neighbors: A Case of Cultural Property Protection Policy Failure? *International Journal of Cultural Property* 22 (2-3), 317-335.

Burns, R. 2014. Protecting the Cultural Heritage. *Critical Muslim* July-Sept 2014, 103-112.

Danti, M. and MacGinnis, J. 2015. Prophet and Profit. *World Current Archaeology* 71.[497]

Casana, J. and Panahipour, M. 2014. Satellite-Based Monitoring of Looting and Damage to Archaeological Sites in Syria. *Journal of Eastern Mediterranean Archaeology & Heritage Studies* 2 (2), 128-151.

---

[496] *Aleppo Weekly*: Available at: http://ccnr.ceu.edu/aleppo-weekly [Accessed 07/3/17]

[497] Available at: http://www.world-archaeology.com/world/asia/iraq/prophet-and-profit.htm [Accessed 20/10/15]

Cunliffe, E. 2014. Archaeological Site Damage in the Cycle of War and Peace: A Syrian Case Study. *Journal of Eastern Mediterranean Archaeology & Heritage Studies* 3 (2), 229-247.

Drazewska, B. 2015. The Human Dimension of the Protection of the Cultural Heritage from Destruction During Armed Conflicts. *International Journal of Cultural Property* 22 (2-3), 205-228.

Guidetti, M. and Perini, S. 2015. Civil War and Cultural Heritage in Syria, 2011-2015. *Syrian Studies Association Bulletin* 20 (1).[498]

Hardy, S. A. 2015. Is Looting-to-Order "Just a Myth"? Open-Source Analysis of Theft-to-Order of Cultural Property. *Cogent Social Sciences* 1 (1). Open-access.[499]

Howard, R., Prohov, J. and Elliott, M. 2015. Digging in and Trafficking Out: How the Destruction of Cultural Heritage Funds Terrorism. *CTC Sentinel, Combating Terrorism Center* February 2015, 14-18.

Lababidi, R. 2015. The International Protection of Cultural Heritage in Times of Conflict: Efficient or Deficient. *News in Conservation* 46.[500]

Miznazi, D. 2015. Post-Conflict Reconstruction of Old Aleppo. *News in Conservation.* [Online].[501]

Moreland, A. 2015. *In the Absence of Sovereignty, How Will Isis Be Held Accountable for Their Crimes?* [Online]: University of Miami School of Law.[502]

Morris, I. 2015. The Struggle for Soft Power in the Middle East. *Stratfor Global Intelligence* (9 September 2015).[503]

Phillips, C. 2015. Sectarianism and Conflict in Syria. *Third World Quarterly* 36 (2), 357-376.

Sahner, C. 2014. *Among the Ruins: Syria Past and Present.* Oxford: Oxford University Press

Lamb, F. 2015. *Syria's Endangered Heritage. An International Responsibility to Protect and Preserve.* Orontes Publishing House

Smith, C., Burke, H., de Leiuen, C., and Jackson, G. 2015/6. The Islamic State's symbolic war: Da'esh's socially mediated terrorism as a threat to cultural heritage. *Journal of Social Archaeology*. DOI: 10.1177/1469605315617048

Near Eastern Archaeology published a special open-access volume: The Cultural Heritage Crisis in the Middle East (Vol. 78, No. 3), containing a number of very useful articles on that central theme.[504]

---

[498] Available at: https://ojcs.siue.edu/ojs/index.php/ssa/article/view/3115/1129

[499] Available at: http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/23311886.2015.1087110 [Accessed 15/10/15]

[500] Available at: https://www.iiconservation.org/node/5495 [Accessed 30/03/15]

[501] Available at: https://www.iiconservation.org/node/5495 [Accessed 30/03/15]

[502] Available at: http://nsac.law.miami.edu/absence-sovereignty-isis-held-accountable/ [Accessed 30/05/2015]

[503] Available at: https://www.stratfor.com/sample/weekly/struggle-soft-power-middle-east [accessed 18/10/15]

[504] Available at: http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5615/neareastarch.78.issue-3 [Accessed 16/10/15]

g) Others

xxxiii.   *Statements and Declarations*

The Dead Sea Accord
The World Archaeological Congress has agreed and published *The Dead Sea Accord*, an ethical statement that outlines the *WAC Accord on the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict*.[505]

Milan Declaration - *Culture as an Instrument of Dialogue among Peoples* **(August 2015)**
A total of 83 countries have signed a declaration for protection of cultural heritage in Italy's Milan city, presented at the International Conference of the Ministers of Culture, July 31-August 1, 2015. The declaration, titled *Culture as an Instrument of Dialogue among Peoples* appealed to the United Nations (UN) and UNESCO to continue to support the international community in fostering positive communication between different cultures.[506]

Antiquities Coalition Cairo Declaration (May 2015)
The *Cairo Declaration* was created by the Antiquities Coalition and partners, and agreed at the Cairo Conference: *Cultural Property Under Threat.* It outlines a regional action plan that the countries will take together, including:
- Establishing a high-level MENA task force that will coordinate regional and international efforts against cultural racketeering
- Creating an international Advisory Council that will provide support to the Task Force
- Initiating negotiations for a regional cultural Memorandum of Understanding with demand countries
- Launching domestic and international campaigns against looting, trafficking, and the black market trade
- Establishing an independent centre to combat antiquities laundering

Countries announcing the Declaration include Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Kuwait, Lebanon, Libya, Oman, Saudi Arabia, Sudan, and the United Arab Emirates.[507] Although Syria did not announce the declaration, it will impact the country. MENA diplomats convened in Washington DC in March 2016 to identify key regional concerns related to antiquities destruction and trafficking, develop common areas of interest, and determine specific goals for the regional Task Force established by the Cairo Declaration.[508]

---

[505] *Dead Sea Accord* on the ethics of acting in armed conflict. 3 March 2015. Available at: http://www.worldarchaeologicalcongress.org/about-wac/codes-of-ethics/635-the-dead-sea-accord [Accessed 21/08/15]

[506] Expo Milano 2015. *Culture as an Instrument of Dialogue among Peoples* (Draft Declaration). Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/ERI/pdf/Declaration_Culture_as_an_instrument_of_dialogue.pdf [Accessed 05/03/2017]

[507] *Middle East Institute*. 2015. Ten Middle East and North African Countries Announce Cairo Declaration to take steps to prevent the War Crime of Looting and the destruction of Heritage.14 May 2015. Available at: http://www.mei.edu/content/article/countries-sign-declaration-prevent-antiquities-looting-middle-east
Also see: *Antiquities Coalition*. 2015. Article on 2015 Cairo Conference: Cultural Property Under Threat. 26 May 2015. Available at: http://www.theantiquitiescoalition.org/2015-cairo-conference-cultural-property-under-threat/ [Accessed 24/08/15]

[508] Antiquities Coalition. 2016. MENA Diplomats Convene in Washington to Address #CultureUnderThreat. *Antiquities Coalition*. March 2016. Available at: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/blog-posts/mena-diplomats-convene-in-washington-to-address-cultureunderthreat/?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Antiquities Coalition Amman Communique (September 2016)

Part of a continuing global initiative, the Culture Under Threat summit brought together ministers from 17 Arab League. As part of the conference, the ministers signed the *Amman Communique*[509]. The signatories of the Amman Communiqué include the Governments of the Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan, Arab Republic of Egypt, Islamic Republic of Mauritania, Kingdom of Bahrain, Kingdom of Morocco, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, Lebanese Republic, the Palestinian Authority, Republic of Iraq, Republic of Sudan, Republic of Tunisia, Republic of Yemen, State of Kuwait, State of Libya, State of Qatar, Sultanate of Oman, and United Arab Emirates. The League of Arab States also participated in the conference.

Arab League drafts document to protect heritage sites (April 2016)

Under the auspices of the Arab League, the Faculty of Archaeology at Fayoum University, in collaboration with the Egyptian National Committee of the International Council of Museums (ICOM Egypt), Bibliotheca Alexandrina and ISESCO organised the International Conference *Archaeological Heritage in the Arab World: Challenges and Solutions*.[510]

The ICAANE Vienna Statement (April 2016)

On April 27 The Organising Committee and Scientific Board of the 10th ICAANE and participants in the conference provided the *Vienna Statement* about the threat to cultural heritage in the Middle East and North Africa.[511]

Istanbul Declaration (July 2016)

On July 11th 2016, World Heritage Committee Member States adopted the *Istanbul Declaration* on the Protection of World Heritage during the 40th Session of the UNESCO Committee, being organised in Istanbul under the chairmanship of Turkey. The Declaration, prepared with the initiative of the Chair of the Committee, Turkey, was unanimously adopted by the Committee Member States. By the so-called Istanbul Declaration, referring to the importance of cultural and natural heritage, States Parties are invited to take measures and act together against the destruction of common heritage of humankind, in cooperation with UNESCO and in correspondence with relevant UNESCO cultural conventions. The full text of the Declaration is available online.[512]

Gyeongju Declaration (October 2016)

The *Gyeongju Declaration*, was drafted, revised, discussed and ratified, paragraph by paragraph, by all participants at the 6th International Conference of Experts on the Return of Cultural Property which took place in Gyeongju, the Republic of Korea, from October 17-19, 2016. The conference set about to make recommendations that they believe will work to deter the illicit trafficking of cultural property and build capacity and cooperation between countries, restitution experts and civil society. The recommendations are available on the ARCA Blog.[513]

---

[509] The text of *the Amman Communique* is available here: https://theantiquitiescoalition.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/Amman-Communique%CC%81-EN-Final.pdf [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[510] Al-Youm, Al-M. 2016. Arab League draft resolution to protect Arab antiquities. *Egypt Independent*. 05/04/2016. Available at: http://www.egyptindependent.com/news/arab-league-draft-resolution-protect-arab-antiquities-araby [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[511] *The ICAANE Statement* is available here. http://www.orea.oeaw.ac.at/fileadmin/user_upload/veranstaltungen/2016/ICAANE_Allgemein/Vienna_Statement_Online.pdf [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[512] *The Istanbul Decla*ration: http://whc.unesco.org/document/147733 [Accessed 4/3/2017]

[513] ARCA. 2016. What is the Gyeongju Declaration? *ARCA Blog* 31/10/2016. Available at: http://art-crime.blogspot.co.uk/2016/10/what-is-gyeongju-declaration.html [Accessed 31/1/2017]

Abu Dhabi Declaration (December 2016)

On 3 December 2016, the *Abu Dhabi Declaration* was adopted at the close of the International Conference on Safeguarding Cultural Heritage in Conflict Areas for the protection of heritage in conflict.[514] The two-day conference brought together heads of state and ministers from over 40 countries affected by heritage loss due to armed conflicts, alongside key players involved in the field of heritage preservation, international public and private institutions, museums and private donors engaged in the field of cultural heritage, as well as experts working in the field.

xxxiv. *Actions (Other)*

Russian orchestra plays concert in ancient Syrian ruins of Palmyra (May 2016)

On May 5, renowned Russian conductor Valery Gergiev led a concert in the amphitheatre at Palmyra, with 100 journalists in attendance.[515][516]

ARCA Blog offers opportunity for heritage lovers to pay tribute (September 2015)

The ARCA blog issued a call for tributes from heritage lovers, offering them the opportunity to express their sorrow, and pay tribute to what is being lost. These are collated on their blog – *In Memoriam: The Heritage Community Speaks Out on Destruction in Syria and Iraq* (4 Sept 2015). Due to the high response, they are displaying only some of the many statements and tributes given, and have linked to their original sources when not directly submitted.[517]

Historic Seedbank saved (2015)

Ahmed Amri saved 141,000 packets of seeds sitting in cold storage 19 miles south of Aleppo. They included ancient varieties of wheat and durum dating back nearly to the dawn of agriculture in the Fertile Crescent, and one of the world's largest collections of lentil, barley, and faba bean varieties—crops that feed millions of people worldwide every day. If these seeds were decimated, humanity could lose precious genetic resources developed over hundreds, or in some cases thousands, of years.[518]

xxxv. *Funds and Scholarships*

UK Cultural Protection Fund (£30 Million) (2016-ongoing)

In partnership with the Department for Culture Media and Sport, the British Council has launched a new £30 million fund to help to create sustainable opportunities for economic and social development through building capacity to foster, safeguard and promote cultural heritage affected by conflict overseas. The Fund aims to protect and preserve physical monuments and religious sites, as well as 'intangible' heritage: inherited traditions, beliefs and

---

[514] The *Abu Dhabi Declaration* text is available on the ICOMOS website: http://www.icomos.org/en/what-we-do/image-what-we-do/401-heritage-at-risk/8262-icomos-adopts-the-abu-dhabi-declaration-on-heritage-at-risk-in-the-context-of-armed-conflicts [Accessed 18/02/2017]

[515] Pleitgen, F. 2016. Russian orchestra plays concert in ancient Syrian ruins of Palmyra. *CNN*. 6 May 2016. Available at: http://edition.cnn.com/2016/05/05/middleeast/syria-palmyra-russia-concert/index.html [Accessed 03/02/2017]

[516] Tharoor, I. 2016. How ancient ruins are perfect propaganda in the Middle East. *The Washington Post*. 6 May 2016. Available at: https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2016/05/06/how-ancient-ruins-are-perfect-propaganda-in-the-middle-east/?platform=hootsuite&utm_term=.1a9ee0f44b2c [Accessed 03/02/2017]

[517] *ARCA Blog*. Available at: http://art-crime.blogspot.co.uk/2015/09/in-memoriam-heritage-community-speaks.html [Accessed 7/09/15]

[518] Portside. 2015. How Syrians Saves an Ancient Seedbank From Civil War. *Portside* 17/04/2015. Available at: http://portside.org/2015-04-19/how-syrians-saved-ancient-seedbank-civil-war [Accessed 25 Jan. 16]

cultural identity, passed down through generations – all of which have been increasingly under threat in the Middle East and North Africa as so-called Islamic State have gained power in the region. Application details are available on their webpage.[519]

$100 Million Cultural Protection Fund (2016-ongoing)
French President Francois Hollande announced a $100m fund for the protection of Middle Eastern cultural heritage[520]. The event, *Today's Struggle to Protect and Preserve the Cultural Heritage of Religious Minorities,* was a symposium co-sponsored by The Metropolitan Museum of Art and The U.S. Department of State. A variety of thought leaders from universities and cultural heritage NGOs explored ways in which the international community can assist religious minority communities in the Middle East and elsewhere in their efforts to protect and preserve their cultural heritage in the wake of aggressive and morally reprehensible attacks on their heritage by terrorists and other violent extremists. Symposium participants also addressed how attacks against cultural heritage and cultural diversity have become strategies for undermining the cohesion, morale, and viability of religious minority communities, and assess the prospects of stronger international legal remedies, such as the prosecution of the perpetrators of cultural heritage destruction.[521] [522]

US Government Grant: *Safeguarding the Heritage of the Near East Initiative Collaborative Services Award* (2014-?)
The US Department of State and its partners have opened their competition to preserve heritage in the Near East. "*The program addresses the extraordinary challenges to governments and NGOs working to preserve the cultural heritage of Syria, Iraq, and Libya. Ancient and historic monuments, objects, and archaeological sites of the world enrich and inform today societies, and help connect us to our cultural origins. ECA/CHC specializes in the protection and preservation of these irreplaceable resources, working on many fronts to safeguard the patrimony of other countries.*" The Department intends to award one cooperative agreement for one base year at $900,000, pending availability of funds. Closing date for this years' round was 14/12/2016. [523]

Scholarships
Many of these are annual: by including them here we hope you will be able to apply next year if you are interested. (*Although be aware, deadlines may change*).

---

[519] *Cultural Protection Fund* Webpage. Available here: https://www.britishcouncil.org/arts/culture-development/cultural-protection-fund [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[520] D'Arcy, D. 2016. François Hollande announces $100m fund to protect cultural heritage in the Middle East. *The Art Newspaper*. 21 September 2016. Available at: http://theartnewspaper.com/news/news/fran-ois-hollande-announces-100m-fund-to-protect-cultural-heritage-in-the-middle-east/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[521] *The Metropolitan Museum of Art* Facebook page. 20 September 2016. https://www.facebook.com/metmuseum/videos/10154019929362635/ [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[522] UNESCO. 2016. Highlighting Role Models in the Global Campaign against Violent Extremism. *UNESCO Media Services*. 23 September 2016. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/media-services/single-view/news/highlighting_role_models_in_the_global_campaign_against_viol/#.V-VVtZMrKRs?platform=hootsuite [Accessed 31/1/2017]

[523] *Grants.gov*. General information can be found here: http://www.grants.gov/web/grants/view-opportunity.html?oppId=287635 and https://www.grants.gov/web/grants/view-opportunity.html?oppId=289884 [Accessed 31/1/2017]

- **The Said Foundation** made several postgraduate scholarships available to students of Syrian, Lebanese, Jordanian or Palestinian citizenship.[524]
Deadline: 1 November 2016

- **The Fulbright Scholar-in-Residence (S-I-R) Program** assists U.S. higher education institutions in expanding programs of academic exchange. By supporting non-U.S. scholars through grants for teaching at institutions that might not have a strong international component, both the U.S. institution and the scholar grantee benefit. The program was offering additional grant opportunities for all U.S. colleges and universities to apply to host scholars or professionals in Cultural Heritage Protection and Preservation from Morocco, Tunisia, Algeria, Libya or Iraq.[525]
Deadline: 17 October 2016

- **Oxford University Student Refugee Campaign (OXSRC)** aims at coordinating the efforts of student, academic and administrative members of the Oxford universities to work with refugee assistance organisations to develop organised, proportionate, clear and comprehensive financial and welfare support for displaced students whose studies have been disrupted. The programme aims to offer support to students to continue their studies at Oxford University.[526]

xxxvi. Projects / Groups

The Aleppo Project (Central European University and Columbia University) (2014-ongoing)

The Aleppo Project, joining the Center of Conflict, Negotiation and Recovery (CCNR) at Central European University and Columbia University, aims to come up with policy tools and ideas that enhance the power of communities to determine their own futures and helps donors do more with less. They are looking at city life in peace and at war, conflict analysis, planning, architecture and reconstruction with an aim to raise awareness of what has happened in the city and provide resources for the future. The core principle is to help people, particularly refugees and women who are shut out of decisions on aid and reconstruction, find a voice. They work in diverse ways - from surveying and interviewing refugees and residents to using satellite imagery to map the impact of war on the city of Aleppo. They have an online survey to capture the views of the original residents of Aleppo, many of whom are now refugees, and of local and international professionals, especially those with relevant experience, for consideration during the reconstruction process, in addition to a number of other publications.[527]

Archaeological Heritage Network (ArcHerNet)

Archaeological Heritage Network is a network of experts dedicated to preserving cultural heritage. The network of experts is not a new institution. Rather, it is a question of bundling

---

[524] *Saïd Foundation* scholarship applications for 2017/18 closed at 23.59 UK time on 1 November 2016. General information can be found here: http://www.saidfoundation.org/general-information [Accessed 01/03/2017]

[525] *The Fulbright Scholar-in-Residence (S-I-R) Program* closed 17 October 2016. General information can be found here: http://www.cies.org/program/fulbright-scholar-residence-program [Accessed 01/03/2017]

[526] *OXSRC* Eligibility criteria and selection criteria: http://www.oxfordrefugeecampaign.org/scholarship-fund/ [Accessed 4/3/2017]

[527] *CCNR Website,* available at: http://ccnr.ceu.edu/thealeppoproject and Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/aleppoproject, and YouTube link: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Hktdy-Lc2Dw [Accessed 01/10/2015].

---

already existing competences and thus creating the necessary synergy effects. The increasingly complex multilateral projects require joint efforts, even if it is necessary to raise funds successfully at the international level and to increase the visibility of German engagement. Numerous experts from the relevant international networks expect a strong German Archaeological Heritage Network to have a positive effect on the development of profound concepts in culture - which would have inversely positive feedback effects on research, education and training in Germany. ArcHerNet's first project is Stunde Null (see Section 2a xv – Reconstruction Projects and Conservation). A list of the founding members of ArcHerNet can be found on their website.[528]

Conflict in Culture website (June 2016)
The University of Pennsylvania Museum, the Smithsonian Institution, and the American Association for the Advancement of Science launched a project to study "conflict culture"—the heritage of communities attacked during periods of war or violence. Now joined by researchers from around the world, the Conflict Culture Research Network supports rigorous, interdisciplinary research that examines how conflict impacts the culture of communities experiencing violence.[529]

European Commission
The European Strategy for Culture is available on their website.[530] As part of this strategy, they are providing significant funding for the UNESCO Action Plan to safeguard cultural heritage in Syria. It is unclear what their strategy for Syria is beyond this at present.[531]

Institute for Cultural Diplomacy (ICD):
Whilst the ICD does not appear to have carried out any specifically Syrian activities recently, they have carried out a number of events on the wider themes of strengthening international relations and encouraging cooperation between diverse communities based upon values of peace, democracy, human rights and the rule of law.[532]

International Observatory for Cultural Heritage (2016)
The International Observatory for Cultural Heritage (IOCH) was inaugurated in 2016 as a forum for dialogue among scholars, professionals, and other key actors in cultural heritage and related fields of archaeology, art history, architecture, and law. The Observatory also welcomes all those engaged in the protection and preservation of heritage that is threatened by natural disaster, armed conflict, urban development, or other perils. Designed to support academic research on both tangible and intangible cultural heritage, and to promote awareness of the multiplicity of cultural expressions, the IOCH aims to foster an inclusive and cross-cultural understanding of heritage preservation, management, and interpretation. Established at the Italian Academy, the IOCH is empowered by the research of the

---

[528] *ArcHerNet* webpage: http://www.dainst.org/projekt/-/project-display/1869165 [Accessed 4/4/17]
[529] *Conflict Culture*. 2016. Available at: http://conflictculture.info/ [Accessed 01/03/2017]
[530] European Commission. 2014. *Mapping of Cultural Heritage actions in European Union policies, programmes and activities*. Available at: http://ec.europa.eu/assets/eac/culture/library/reports/2014-heritage-mapping_en.pdf [Accessed 4/3/2017] (This appears to be the most recent document on the website.)
[531] The most recent strategy document available on the website is: Strategy for the development of Euro-Mediterranean cultural heritage: priorities from Mediterranean countries (2007–2013). Available at: http://www.euromedheritage.net/euroshared/doc/Culture%20strategy%202007%20-%202013.pdf [Accessed 4/3/2017]
[532] *Institute for Cultural Diplomacy* website. 2017. Available at: http://www.culturaldiplomacy.org/index.php?en [Accessed 02/03/2017]

Academy's 2016–17 Fellows whose work focuses on protection, preservation, and conservation of cultural heritage and the contemporary destruction of art and architecture.[533]

Islamic Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization (ISESCO)
ISESCO have carried out several projects for the wider MENA region that encompass Syria.[534]

V&A Culture in Crisis Programme (2015-ongoing)
V&A Culture in Crisis programme brings together institutions with a shared interest in protecting cultural heritage. It provides a forum for sharing information, inspiring and supporting action and raising public awareness.[535]

Priorities:
- To understand the impact of cultural heritage loss on communities and the contrasting positive role that nature conservation and heritage protection can have in rebuilding and recovering these areas following wars and disasters. As such we aim to encourage a cross-disciplinary approach to protecting cultural heritage around the globe. Raising public awareness and working with organisations from a variety of backgrounds to take a holistic approach to the protection of heritage in all its forms.
- The V&A and the Yale Institute for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage, in collaboration with the National Museums of Rwanda and the Museum für Naturkunde in Berlin, are preparing for a major international conference in late in 2017, to be held in Kigali, Rwanda with a unique focus on nature and cultural heritage conservation.
- In collaboration with the British Museum the V&A have created a European Museum Security Group. The group considers strategic security issues, looking at innovative and safe ways for museums to assist in the protection of cultural heritage, while ensuring the safety and security of visitors, staff and collections.
- Working closely to support law-enforcement, nationally and internationally, and the British Armed forces to develop strategies to prevent the illicit trade of cultural goods.

Culture in Crisis Conference June 2017
The V&A and the Yale Institute for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage, in collaboration with the National Museums of Rwanda and the Museum für Naturkunde, Berlin have announced that the initial planning phases for the 3rd annual Culture in Crisis conference have now begun. Following a workshop in Kigali, Rwanda during August 2016 the partners have progressed plans for the upcoming conference (anticipated to take place in June 2017) which will explore the links between cultural heritage protection and environmental and wildlife conservation within an African context. Taking place in Kigali, Rwanda, the 2017 conference will address key areas of debate such as; *'Who owns culture?', 'How do we organise collections for the future?'* and *'Natural Solutions and sustainability in preserving heritage'.*

---

[533] *International Observatory for Cultural Heritage* website: http://italianacademy.columbia.edu/international-observatory-for-cultural-heritage [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[534] *ISESCO* Website. Available at: http://www.isesco.org.ma/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[535] V&A. 2017. *Culture in Crisis*. Available here: https://www.vam.ac.uk/info/culture-in-crisis/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]

Stockholm Centre for the Ethics of War and Peace

The Stockholm Centre for the Ethics of War and Peace has recently started researching the ethics of cultural property destruction and military activity in conflict, sometimes focussing on Syria. Read more in some of their blog posts.[536]

Syria Cultural Heritage Initiative, Cultural Heritage Centre

The Bureau of Education and Cultural Affairs, a Branch of the American Department of State, has set up a Syrian Cultural Heritage Initiative as part of the work of its Cultural Heritage Centre[537]. This initiative has significantly contributed to the conference Conflict Antiquities: Forging a Public/Private Response to Save Iraq and Syria's Endangered Cultural Heritage. In addition, the Department of State has donated significant funding to other projects to protect the heritage of the Middle East, and conducted research into Looting in Syria.

UNESCO #Unite4Heritage Campaign (8 Apr 2015)

UNESCO's *#Unite4Heritage* project was inaugurated during Irina Bokova's visit to the University of Baghdad in Iraq. The project aims to unite forces through the social media network Twitter to protect cultural heritage threatened by war and fight against the smuggling of cultural artefacts, she said. The UNESCO chief has recently called on more young people to join in cultural heritage protection activities and fight the destruction of world heritage and the smuggling of cultural artefacts.[538]

Mailing list for further information

The Anonymous Swiss Collector Webpage has created a list of opportunities and a mailing list related to opportunities and conferences in the fields of art crime, antiquities trafficking, provenance studies, art authentication, repatriation and cultural property law.[539]

---

[536] *The Ethical War Blog*. Stockholm Centre for the Ethics of War and Peace. Available at: http://stockholmcentre.org/category/ethical-war-blog/ [Accessed 02/03/2017]

[537] *Syrian Cultural Heritage Initiative* website: http://eca.state.gov/cultural-heritage-center/syria-cultural-heritage-initiative [Accessed 10/10/15]

[538] Xinhua News Agency. 2015. UNESCO chief calls on young people to join in cultural heritage protection efforts. *Global Post Website*. 08/04/2015. Available at: http://www.globalpost.com/article/6509176/2015/04/08/unesco-chief-calls-young-people-join-cultural-heritage-protection-efforts [Accessed 24/08/15]

[539] *Anonymous Swiss Collector* - Subscribe here: http://www.anonymousswisscollector.com/opportunities [Accessed 02/03/2017]

Conclusions

Thanks in no small part to the expert meetings hosted by UNESCO and others, many projects are well informed about the actions of their contemporaries, or are actively collaborating. This increase in available information is aided by a greater number of publications published in online / open-access forums, a policy we hope will continue as many of those working inside Syria lack access to such resources otherwise. We hope that this report will continue to be beneficial in contributing to that, providing information to encourage that collaboration, reduce duplication of effort, and highlight areas where further work may be beneficial.
It is no longer relevant to count actions by type, or by whether they are national or international. The lines between project types are not distinct, and any assessment made along those lines could be misleading. Databases holding site inventories may also hold damage records, and may contribute to restoration work and assessments for illicit trafficking, for example. Instead, we present an overview here of the previous 15 months.

Although it is difficult to estimate how much any armed group is profiting from the sale in looted antiquities, reports and satellite imagery from last year suggests that illegal excavations are rampant. Syrian artefacts have been recovered in London, Vienna, Munich, and New York, leading governments to review current laws. In the last year, the US imposed emergency import restrictions on artefacts coming from Syria while Germany implemented a new law that requires dealers to show a valid export permit. The EU is undergoing a consultation process to implement additional restrictions. How effective these new national laws will be remains to be seen: some argue that it is only by tackling the demand side of the market through laws like this that the trade can be stopped. Yet there is a low arrest, and even lower prosecution, rate for such crimes. Nonetheless, the buying and selling of so-called "blood antiquities" that fund conflict has helped to create a stigma that could perhaps create a small dent in the trade. Without the trade, there would be no need to loot.

Since the last report in September 2015, there has been further international support to help train Syrians from the DGAM and other institutions in areas such as documentation, restoration, site recording, risk management and legal protection. It is also worth noting the growing increase in the use of technology to help protect cultural heritage. Web-based applications are being used as tools for mapping, monitoring and documenting. Crowd sourced satellite images are allowing groups to record site damage. Digital modelling and the latest in 3D printing technology have helped to document sites and to raise awareness about cultural destruction, whilst also sparking a lively debate over the issues of authenticity and the ethics of restoration and reconstruction in a digital age.[540] Promisingly, work by institutions such as Cottbus University and the German Archaeological Institute are ensuring that Syrians are at the front of those discussions.

Cultural heritage destruction continues to devastate Syria's museums and sites. The reconstruction costs continue to rise, and with them the need for funding, materials, expertise, and capacity building. There have been many commendable efforts by the international community to document damage and create digital information databases that can hopefully help with restoration of sites and looted objects. However, as noted last year, fewer attempts have been made to assist Syrians who are working on the ground. This is certainly more

---

[540] Bond, S. 2016. The Ethics Of 3D-Printing Syria's Cultural Heritage. *Forbes* 22/09/2016. Available at: https://www.forbes.com/sites/drsarahbond/2016/09/22/does-nycs-new-3d-printed-palmyra-arch-celebrate-syria-or-just-engage-in-digital-colonialism/#74d1c9f777db

difficult to implement: nonetheless there is still much that can be done in the way of supporting their emergency efforts (without risking the lives of the Syrians concerned), such as providing training, funding, and resources, modelled on the internationally supported work carried out at Bosra, Ebla and Ma'aret al-Nu'man. Such steps could also raise awareness about local activism and help empower Syrians working on the ground.

The Syrian conflict has already destroyed much of the country's ancient cities. Once the war ceases, the focus will naturally move to reconstruction. Beirut demonstrated that reconstruction projects that ignore the people and the original fabric of the city could potentially turn cities such as Aleppo into cities of exclusion. It is a cautionary note that, in that case, 'cultural heritage' was separated into ancient archaeological sites (some parts of which were preserved), and more recent heritage – the historic buildings of the people of Beirut – which were not. Heritage must be considered comprehensively with a focus on the local people, so it can be used to recreate social fabric and generate places of reconciliation. It is our hope that the Syrians being trained in such processes now, and those already working on it, such as Marwa al-Sabouni, will be able to influence reconstruction agendas. To that end, if possible heritage workers should also consider attending the reconstruction conferences that are already underway in Syria, in order to place cultural heritage at the centre of the reconstruction agenda. Cultural heritage will play a key role in the social and economic re-development of the country, and local communities must be involved as much as possible, forming part of the peace-building process. It is heartening how many of the reconstruction projects listed in this report take Syrians and Syrian values as their starting point, not their end.

The last two years have also seen a large number of expert recommendations published by some of the leaders in the field, such as the Antiquities Coalition, the Louvre, Protecting Cultural Heritage: An Imperative for Humanity, the United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner Special Rapporteur, and UNESCO. We have already begun to see the first implementations of these recommendations at the end of 2016. Now that the agenda has been established, it is our hope that 2017 will see further implementation of these actions.

A great many of the actions listed here focus on Syrians, and the effects of the conflict on them, looking at ways to aid them through capacity building, skills, empowerment, and if possible the creation of jobs. 2016 also saw the United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner Special Rapporteur place cultural heritage destruction and cultural heritage protection firmly on the human rights agenda, where we fervently hope it will stay.

"This is a wake-up call for our times. [...]. Too numerous are the artists, writers, theatre directors, dancers, museum curators, educators and human rights defenders who are threatened or attacked by fundamentalist and extremist State and non-State actors and risk their lives to continue their work, to express themselves and to defend cultural rights for all, without discrimination. They are on the frontlines, together with people who simply wish to participate in cultural life in their own way and are also under attack. The international community must stand with them.

Cultural rights, understood as fully integrated within the human rights system, are critical counterweights to fundamentalism and extremism; they call for free self-determination of individuals, respect for cultural diversity, universality and equality." [541]

---

[541] K. Bennoune. 2016. *Report of the Special Rapporteur in the field of cultural rights.* Report A/HRC/34/56. Human Rights Council 34th session, P20.