

# Towards a protection of the Syrian cultural heritage: A summary of the national and international responses Volume III

(Sept 2014 - Sept 2015)

Silvia Perini and Emma Cunliffe

in association with Heritage *for* Peace

~ October 2015 ~

Dr Silvia Perini and Dr Emma Cunliffe in association with Heritage for Peace

Contact

Silvia Perini: <a href="mailto:perini.sil@gmail.com">perini.sil@gmail.com</a>
Heritage for Peace: <a href="mailto:contact@heritageforpeace.org">contact@heritageforpeace.org</a>

Published by Heritage for Peace, 2015 Hotel d'Entitats Rutlla, 20-22 Girona, Catalonia 17002 Spain

All rights reserved.

# **Table of Contents**

Introduction	5
Activities to protect Syria's Archaeological Heritage	7
1. National Actions and Local Initiatives	7
a) Projects	7
i) Status of Staff	7
ii) Status of the Site and Museum Records	8
iii) Status of Sites	9
iv) Status of Artefacts	9
v) Cooperation with Local Authorities	10
vi) Cooperation with International Authorities	10
vii) Local Initiatives: Construction of Museums and Libraries	11
viii) Local Initiatives: Locals Work to Protect Sites	12
ix) Local Initiatives: New Groups	13
b) Awareness Raising (Campaigns / Events / Calls / Exhibitions)	14
c) Workshops / Training Courses (Internal)	16
d) Reports & Maps	17
2. International Actions	18
a) Projects and Documentation	18
x) Site and Object Inventories	18
xi) Damage Assessment: Reports and Databases	20
xii) Information Databases (Other)	25
xiii) Reconstruction Projects and Conservation	27
xiv) Projects Fighting Illicit Trafficking	29
xv) Projects: Other	32
b) Awareness Raising (Talks, Conferences, Discussions, Workshops, etc.)	33
xvi) Cooperation Discussions	33
xvii) Appeals / Calls / Offers of Aid	34
xviii) Conferences / Workshops	35
xix) Speeches / Talks	45

xx) Exhibitions	47
xxi) Awareness Raising: Other	49
c) Laws, Legislation and Resolutions	52
xxii) Implemented	52
xxiii) Proposed	53
d) Training / Courses	57
e) Military Operations	59
f) Academic Publications	59
g) Others	61
Conclusions	65
Appendix 1: Group Information: Updates	69

#### Introduction<sup>1</sup>

"Humans are important, but our history is the second most important thing. If we lose these monuments, we will kill our history"

Hakyat al Shmal, member of the Syrian Association for Preserving Heritage and Ancient Landmark, 13 May 2013

During this last year and since the publication of the report *Towards a protection of the Syrian cultural heritage:* A summary of the international responses. Volume II (March 2014 – September 2014) (here called "September 2014 Report"), and its preceding volume ("March 2014 Report"), many more crucial activities have been undertaken towards the protection of the Syrian heritage. There is thus a need to create an update of such activities. However, the majority of the organisations/groups listed in the September 2014 report are now working in collaboration within each other to develop new projects leading to a considerable increase in collaborative projects. Because of this major change from the previous years, the format of this report presents a new shape that reflects such changes: new activities are now listed under the broad classifications of "action type" instead of an alphabetic list of "organisations/groups".

An even broader classification has been undertaken between "national/local" and "international" actions. With this classification in place, the following typologies of action have been observed:

- Projects and Documentation
- Awareness Raising (Campaigns, Events, Calls, Exhibitions, Talks, etc.)
- Workshops / Training Courses
- Reports & Maps
- Exhibitions
- Training / Courses
- Laws, Legislation and Resolutions
- Military Operations
- Academic Publications
- Others

In addition, an appendix is included at the end of the report, providing an update of information about some of the groups, and information about the newest groups.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The authors wish to thank Paul Bishop for the final proofreading.
In addition, the data collection for this report could not have been accomplished without the Heritage for Peace Damdalgition wheletata Tellection Green Fisher, Wasselm Albahri, and Paul Bishop. The authors are also particularly grateful to Lydia Magnavacca for her extensive assistance in data recording and logging the international actions.

It must be stressed that many actions overlap into multiple categories. The assignment to a particular category is intended for ease of reference for the reader. Some actions are repeated in multiple sections to limit the amount of cross-referencing necessary to check work in a given area. In addition, many actions were conducted by multiple groups, and many projects are carried out in partnership between external groups and Syrians. Those projects are published primarily under International Actions, but the distinction is arbitrary, and largely based on whose the website the action is published on. It is also intended to aid understanding of which groups have contributed to assisting Syria.

Actions and initiatives undertaken towards the protection of the Syrian intangible heritage are not included in this report.

# Activities to protect Syria's Archaeological Heritage

#### 1. National Actions and Local Initiatives

# a) Projects

# i) Status of Staff

# 14 Staff killed

As of the publication of this report, the DGAM have lost 14 staff protecting the heritage of Syria. Some were killed during shelling of the buildings they worked in, others by snipers on their way into work. Some were threatened not to go to work, and when they did so, they were killed. In addition, Khalad al-Assad, a retired member of the DGAM, and world expert on the site of Palmyra was killed by Da'esh. Several others have been injured, some seriously.<sup>2</sup>

The DGAM has committed to provide extra budget to help those affected by the conflict, providing support including accommodation and transporting if possible, new offices in safer areas. In addition, sometimes it has offered some workers in besieged areas to stay in their towns for security reasons and work with the local community to raise awareness in protecting cultural heritage. During this crisis, it is difficult for staff to gain access to areas of active conflict, travel in some areas was hazardous. However, the DGAM's Field personnel regularly risk their lives to protect their cultural heritage by collecting and passing on information on archaeological sites using a wide range of telecommunication aids: fixed and mobile telephones and computer networks.<sup>3</sup>

#### Volunteer Conservation Project (13 Jul – 12 Aug 2014)

The Directorate of Scientific and Restoration Laboratories at the DGAM have launched a volunteer project at the Damascus University with the aim of qualifying and training more national staff and involving students of Damascus University in restoration works.<sup>4</sup>

#### Staff save antiquities from Da'esh: May 2015

Read about the race to remove the artefacts from Palmyra museum before Da'esh arrived, and the losses suffered by the Syrians who did it.<sup>5</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=314&id=1812 [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Agudo Villanueva, M. 2014. *Interview with Maamoun Abdulkarim: "more than 6000 archaeological artifacts has returned to Syria during the past three years"*. Mediterráneo Antiguo. 11 August 2014. Available at: <a href="http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html">http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html</a> [Accessed 14/08/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Milhem, R., and Said, H. 2014. *Together We Restore Syria's Antiquities. SANA*. Available at: <a href="http://www.sana.sy/en/?p=5920">http://www.sana.sy/en/?p=5920</a> [Accessed 09/07/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Bowen, J. 2015. *The men saving Syria's treasures from Isis*. New Statesman. 22 Sep 2015. Available at: http://www.newstatesman.com/culture/art-design/2015/09/men-saving-syria-s-treasures-isis [Accessed 10/10/15]

# ii) Status of the Site and Museum Records

*June 2014:* The DGAM have worked to digitise the records and plans of 1500 castles, museums, archaeological sites and mosques in province of Aleppo.<sup>6</sup>

*Dec 2014:* They have created a database of icons from Syrian Churches to help preserve and reduce trafficking of stolen icons/archaeological finds from churches.<sup>7</sup>

*Mar 2015*: More than 1000 files for built cultural heritage have been digitised, to preserve the original archive at risk of damage due to the crisis. Files include historic documents, maps and building blueprints.<sup>8</sup>

June 2015: According to the DGAM presentation at the Strategies for Restoration and Reconstruction: Museums, Heritage Sites and Archaeological Parks in Post-War Countries Conference (Bern, 25 June 2015), the DGAM have created a database of sites and are recording the damage to them. Files are available as Google Earth.kmz and GIS shapefiles, and on the website. By the end of 2015 they aim to have 160 000 electronic records, and 150 000 objects will have been photographed.<sup>9</sup>

July 2015: The DGAM reported on the progress of their "centralized database of archaeological archives" of the DGAM in Damascus. It combines the databases of the Syrian museums and of archaeological sites, which are listed in GIS-based maps. So far, around 134,000 objects from the museums of Damascus, Palmyra, Aleppo and Hama are integrated in the database. Work on the data of the Damascus old city, Damascus Citadel and Bosra is completed. A 'unified cataloguing system of museums objects in Syria' was made available in 2012 in English and Arabic. A looted objects database is currently being developed. Data is open to researchers and editors. The output of GIS documentation will be produced as site maps, risk and damage map. All information is electronically published.<sup>10</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=239&id=1143 [Accessed 07/02/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1545 [Accessed 21/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1607 [Accessed 21/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Notes taken by Cunliffe during the conference.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Almidani, A., and Gerrouge, T. 2015. DGAM *Digital Information Systems for built and movable heritage*. Presentation given at the Syrian Cultural Heritage Initiatives Meeting in Berlin, 31 July 2015.

# iii) Status of Sites

*Jun 2014*: In addition to documenting the damage to sites, and publishing the information on their website, Dr. Maamoun Abdulkarim and DGAM technicians have been visiting monuments to determine their conditions and plan emergency interventions wherever possible, for example, visiting Crac des Chevaliers and those in Homs with the Minister of Culture.<sup>11</sup>

*Ongoing*: DGAM staff continues to work with local communities to protect sites from illegal development and looting and other forms of damage.

# iv) Status of Artefacts

*Mar* 2015: 300,000 Artifacts and Manuscripts from 34 Syrian Museums have been wrapped and transported to secret locations for safekeeping, including those from Palmyra. <sup>12</sup>

May 2016: The Syrian Cultural Heritage in Palmyra. The DGAM released a statement on Palmyra about the challenges and risks it is facing.<sup>13</sup>

Sep 2015: All artefacts in Palmyra were transported to safety before the arrival of Da'esh. 14

Sep 2015: 99% of museum artefacts has been transferred to a safe place. 15

*Ongoing*: DGAM staff continue to work with local communities to protect artefacts, many of which local people have saved from looting.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=314&id=1294 [Accessed 30/06/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Neuendorft, H. 2015. Syria's Top Museum Hides 300,000 Artifacts To Protect Them From Looting. ArteNet News Website. Available at: <a href="https://news.artnet.com/in-brief/syria-cultural-heritage-isis-282284">https://news.artnet.com/in-brief/syria-cultural-heritage-isis-282284</a> [Accessed 24/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=177&id=1701 [Accessed 30/05/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Bowen, J. 2015. *The men saving Syria's treasures from Isis*. New Statesman. 22 Sep 2015. Available at: http://www.newstatesman.com/culture/art-design/2015/09/men-saving-syria-s-treasures-isis [Accessed 10 /10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1708 [Accessed 09/09/15]

# v) Cooperation with Local Authorities

As part of their work to protect the Syrian heritage, the DGAM are strengthening cooperation with local authorities. As of summer 2014, "more than 6000 archaeological artifacts has returned during the past three years through confiscations carried out by the concerned bodies (the police, the customs, the governorate, the municipalities and other public bodies) in Damascus, Tartus, Palmyra, Homs, Hama, Deir ez-Zor, etc. Cooperate with Organizations, governmental and non-governmental, Universities and various private Associations (Engineering union, Architecture University, Heritage commissions, Archaeology University). Organize trainings for university students on the protection of cultural heritage in critical areas. In some cases DGAM collaborating with military in the service of rescuing museums like what happened in Homs and Deir ez –Zor". <sup>16</sup>

# vi) Cooperation with International Authorities

In addition to the listed projects, many activities in the field of cultural heritage have been carried out with international assistance. Cooperating with the international organizations in exchanging visions and information, raising awareness and building capacities as: UNESCO, ICOM, ICOMOS, ICCROM, the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage (ARC-WH), in Bahrain, The World Monuments Fund (WMF), and others. Cooperation continued with INTERPOL, by keeping track of the damages done to the cultural heritage since the beginning of the crisis: this close collaboration succeeded in fighting trafficking in Syrian antiquities. Objects continue to be seized internationally - Lebanon particularly, have returned a number of seized objects.<sup>17</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Agudo Villanueva, M. 2014. *Interview with Maamoun Abdulkarim: "more than 6000 archaeological artifacts has returned to Syria during the past three years"*. Mediterráneo Antiguo. 11 August 2014. Available at: <a href="http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html">http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html</a> [Accessed 14/08/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Agudo Villanueva, M. 2014. *Interview with Maamoun Abdulkarim: "more than 6000 archaeological artifacts has returned to Syria during the past three years"*. Mediterráneo Antiguo. 11 August 2014. Available at: <a href="http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html">http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html</a> [Accessed 14/08/14]

# vii) Local Initiatives: Construction of Museums and Libraries

#### Construction of a New Museum

The first Kurdish museum in the predominantly Kurdish city of Qamishli, northeast of Syria, launched in April 2014. The museum embraces various kinds of tools used by Kurds hundreds of years ago. A variety of collections of traditional Kurdish tools and equipment could be, starting from clothes, daggers, weapons, and ending with wedding, agriculture, harvesting, lighting, hunting and cooking equipment. Kurdish folk music plays in the museum's main hall. Qamishli museum was opened under the name of "Martyr Ferhad Mohamad Ali Museum for the Kurdish Heritage". The museum comprises more than 850 traditional Kurdish antique pieces, mainly collected by Ahmed Sabri, Ferhad Mohamd Ali's uncle, who spent more than twenty years of his life trying to collect these pieces from different Kurdish areas. The museum has attracted the residents of the city and its environs, as well as dozens of prominent artists and politicians interested in the Kurdish heritage.<sup>18</sup>

## Construction of a Citizen Library in Daraa (Aug 2015)

A group of brave Syrian students are attempting to build a library to preserve books taken from destroyed houses, some of which were still burning when the courageous students rescued the private libraries. More than 11,000 books, including Arabic and foreign novels, religious and academic books, have been saved. The volunteers take turns to work as librarians and have created a check out system to keep track of borrowed books. They also wrote the original owner's name inside each book, in the hope of restoring them to them after the war.<sup>19</sup>

Aziz, J. 2014. *Kurdish Heritage revived*. ARA News. 16 April 2014. Available at: <a href="http://www.aranews.org/en/culture-art/1261-kurdish-heritage-revived.html">http://www.aranews.org/en/culture-art/1261-kurdish-heritage-revived.html</a> [Accessed 16/04/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Dixon, M. 2015. *The Syrians defying napalm bombs and sniper fire to build a library*. The Mirror. 30 Aug 2015. Available at:

#### viii) Local Initiatives: Locals Work to Protect Sites

#### In the Eye of the Storm at Tell Mozan (May 2014 – ongoing)

The archaeologists who previously excavated Tell Mozan are still working with local villagers to protect the site. Villagers covered the mudbrick with sheeting and trellises to prevent degradation, and make basic repairs to the site.<sup>20</sup> Although the dig house was looted in 2012, as of June 2015, the site is still thought to be in good condition, with no reports of looting. The project is undertaken by Gulfsands Urkesh Exploration Fund, International Institute for Mesopotamian Area Studies (IIMAS), and Cotsen Institute of Archaeology (UCLA).

#### Reconstruction work at Maaloula (2015)

Returning villagers have begun work to repair and reconstruct the damaged sites.<sup>21</sup>

#### Locals and DGAM Work to Restore Sites (2015)

There have been a number of initiatives by local Syrians to restore sites, particularly in Homs. For example, at the Church of Um al-Zenar "community volunteers had recently created an excellent garden on top of the jihadists burn-pit and that locally financed major restoration work was underway". Details of the sites they have worked on, and others the DGAM have worked on, are available in this article. <sup>22</sup>

In addition, the DGAM have reported that local people have continued to safeguard sites, monuments, and museums in areas the government staff have not always been able to access, for example, in Idlib.

According to USA Today<sup>23</sup> "Despite a raging four-year civil war, rebel factions and Syrian officials are working together to protect the country's rich heritage site [...] The group counts Bosra — a former capital of the Roman province of Arabia and a UNESCO World Heritage Site in southern Syria — among its successes. The association helped coordinate a cease-fire between the rebels and the Syrian government, saving ancient ruins that included a well-preserved second-century Roman theatre. Under the deal, rebel groups withdrew from ancient parts of the city, and Syrian forces pledged not to shell the area. A month later, archaeologists were restoring parts of the damaged site, and a local militia took responsibility for protecting it from looters".

#### The Syrian Association for Preserving Heritage and Ancient Landmarks:

This group continue to be active protecting sites, and have cropped up in several news articles about work in the region. To protect the group, no details are available.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Marquez, L. 2014. *Archaeologist, villagers protect ancient Syrian city as civil war rages*. UCLA Newsroom Website. 23 May 2014. Available at: <a href="http://newsroom.ucla.edu/stories/archaeologist-villagers-protect-ancient-syrian-city-as-civil-war-rages">http://newsroom.ucla.edu/stories/archaeologist-villagers-protect-ancient-syrian-city-as-civil-war-rages</a> [Accessed 02/07/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Lamb, F. 2015. *Return to Ma'loula*. Op Ed News. 31 July 2015. Available at: <a href="http://www.opednews.com/articles/Return-to-Ma-loula-by-Franklin-Lamb-Christian\_Jesus\_Muslim\_Repairs-15073">http://www.opednews.com/articles/Return-to-Ma-loula-by-Franklin-Lamb-Christian\_Jesus\_Muslim\_Repairs-15073</a> 1-297.html [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Lamb, F. 2015. *Is the Phoenix Rising From the Ashes in Syria?* Counterpunch. 29 July 2015. Available at: <a href="http://www.counterpunch.org/2015/07/29/is-the-phoenix-rising-from-the-ashes-in-syria/">http://www.counterpunch.org/2015/07/29/is-the-phoenix-rising-from-the-ashes-in-syria/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>23</sup> Kusa, R. 2015. *Rebels, Syrian government work together to protect antiquities.* USA Today. 22/07/15. Available at: <a href="http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/world/2015/06/22/syria-archaeology/28977009/">http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/world/2015/06/22/syria-archaeology/28977009/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

# ix) Local Initiatives: New Groups

#### Unnamed Group: Syria's Monuments Men (Aug 2015)

Syria's monuments men, a group of academics, archaeologists and volunteers, are seeking to halt the plunder at its source. Formed in 2012 by the Damascus University-trained archaeologist and another Syrian archaeologist colleague, the group started informally cataloguing damage to sites in battle-scarred Idlib and Aleppo provinces. The founders enlisted Syrian colleagues and friends from universities, museums and government directorates, and later, European and American specialists joined as advisers. In some cases, they wrap and bury objects at risk of being looted and record the GPS location. Earlier in 2012, archaeologists in Aleppo spent 12 hours talking to Western specialists on Skype to correctly preserve and move 600 medieval manuscripts and astrological instruments at the Aleppo Mosque's library at risk from regime airstrikes. Senior members of the group have also undertaken international training and received technology after attracting the attention of NGOs and foreign governments. Only eight could make the trip because fighting with Islamic State blocked their route.<sup>24</sup> The group were given training by Heritage for Peace.

#### Committee for Shared Culture (CSC) (May 2015)

According to The National, an anonymous group of people have come together to track down and recover the ancient artefacts that are disappearing from archaeological sites throughout Iraq and Syria. They are working to study the illegal trade, map it, disrupt it, and hand over the information they find to relevant national authorities. Their ranks include academics, linguists, institutions, legitimate collectors, and technical staff. They comb the internet for information, using advanced algorithms to search for images and key names and words to identify looting and their networks, in addition to "going online into chatrooms and forums, having a look around and having conversations with people to try to work out what is going on". Financial backing has come from an influential private organisation with a vested interest in protecting the world's shared heritage. The group would welcome more support, and is open to recruiting anyone who shares their concerns and thinks they have skills it could use (contact The National). <sup>25</sup>

#### Shirīn: Local Networks (2014-ongoing)

Shirīn are activating local networks to pay sites guards and protect warehouses.<sup>26</sup>

#### Protecting the Jobar Synagogue

An article published in the Wall Street Journal details the efforts to protect the synagogue, which was ultimately destroyed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Gornall, J. 2015. *Mystery men hunt cultural past stolen by ISIL*. The National Website. 28 May 0215. Available at: <a href="http://www.thenational.ae/world/middle-east/mystery-men-hunt-cultural-past-stolen-by-isil#full">http://www.thenational.ae/world/middle-east/mystery-men-hunt-cultural-past-stolen-by-isil#full</a> [Accessed 5/06/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Shirīn Website. Updates are available here: http://shirin-international.org/?page\_id=795

# b) Awareness Raising (Campaigns / Events / Calls / Exhibitions)

The DGAM are undertaking general awareness raising work. According to Mamoun Abdul Karim, they aim "to involve all Syrians in defending the archaeological heritage representing their history, their common memory and all that brings them together throughout history. Campaigns are held frequently with photo gallery documenting violations against the Syrian cultural heritage and archaeological and historic objects as well as the damage affecting them, exhibitions and poster campaigns in major cities; lectures on the cultural heritage to pupils in primary and universities and local communities; encouraging the efforts of non-governmental organizations in the cultural heritage field. Make the press and the public opinion more sensitive about the problems of the safeguard of the Syria's cultural heritage, promoting appeals, conferences and meetings, video documentary, press releases and slogans were reinforced to be circulated and spread information and discourage purchases of Syrian cultural artefacts. Several workshops were held to enrich the topic of illegally smuggled artifacts with the participation of representatives of all ministries and authorities involved in the protection of Syrian cultural property in addition to NGOs, members of the local community, researchers, artists and writers within the field".<sup>27</sup>

Specific events held in the period of this report include:

# Syrian Heritage Days Festivity (21-23 Apr 2014)

Under the patronage of the Minister of Culture, this 3-day festivity celebrated Syrian heritage and highlights the diversity and richness in the fields of art, music, folklore and fashion, and popular and traditional food. In the Damascus Citadel, a photo exhibition was devoted to document attacks on cultural property and Syrian archaeological and heritage sites.<sup>28</sup>

#### Maaloula: History, Reality and Horizons (Jun 2014)

Under the patronage of the Minister of Culture, DGAM held this cultural event concerned with the issue of preserving the archaeological heritage of the Tentative World Heritage Site of Maaloula, which was heavily damaged after Extremist occupation, and during the fighting in 2013-2014.<sup>29</sup>

#### Syrian Archaeological Treasures (Aug 2014)

An exhibition, titled "Syrian Archaeological Treasures", was organised by the Syrian Tourism Ministry in cooperation with Friends of Maaloula Association as part of the Syrian Tourism Day. It includes over 100 documented photos of Syrian landmarks before and after they were damaged by armed terrorist groups. It was held in Madrid.<sup>30</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Agudo Villanueva, M. 2014. *Interview with Maamoun Abdulkarim: "more than 6000 archaeological artifacts has returned to Syria during the past three years"*. Mediterráneo Antiguo. 11 August 2014. Available at: <a href="http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html">http://www.mediterraneoantiguo.com/2014/08/interview-with-maamoun-abdulkarim-more.html</a> [Accessed 14/08/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=177&id=1215 [Accessed 15/10/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=177&id=1244 [Accessed 7/06/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Sabbagh, H. 2015. UNWTO Secretary-General: Vandalism of Syrian heritage sites by terrorists unjustifiable. SANA Website. 04 August 2014. Available at: http://www.sana.sy/en/?p=8971 [Accessed 06/08/14]

# Reality of Syrian Antiquities During The Crisis (8 Feb 2015)

Seminar held at the National Museum of Damascus discussing measures of protection, damage documentation to the immovable and movable cultural heritage, as well as cooperation with the local community to ensure the protection of archaeological sites from looting and theft.<sup>31</sup>

# DGAM appeal to the people of Bosra (Mar 2015)

The DGAM appealed to the local community in Bosra to help protect the ancient city from the ongoing conflicts, specifically the Roman theatre and its small museum.<sup>32</sup>

#### DGAM appeal to the people of Idlib City (Mar 2015)

The DGAM appealed to the local people to help staff at Idlib Museum to keep the area and Museum safe and continue protection procedures.<sup>33</sup>

# Syrian Archaeological Treasures: A Heritage for Humanity (June 2015)

A photo exhibition entitled "Syrian Archaeological Treasures: A Heritage for Humanity" was organised by the Syrian community in Italy in cooperation with the Syrian Tourism Ministry and European Front for Defending Syria. It showcased the scale of destruction inflicted by terrorists on Syria's archaeological and historical sites. It concluded with a seminar on what is currently happening in Syria. The itinerant exhibition toured in several cities, including Rome, Catania, Lecce, Florence, and Caracas.<sup>34</sup>

#### Work with Local Communities (Ongoing)

The DGAM work with local communities to protect sites, such as Cyrrhus, and other sites are protected by the actions of local communities.<sup>35</sup>

#### Save Syria's History - Previous Campaign – possibly ongoing

In collaboration with UNESCO, the DGAM is engaged in a project called Save Syria's History. This project aims to combat illicit trafficking by running courses to enhance staff capacity in the fields of protection, documentation (i.e. posters and other audio-visual material widely disseminated around Syria), restoration and setting future plans for restoration and rehabilitation. See April 2014 report.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=314&id=1590 [Accessed 10/04/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1631 [Accessed 24/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1634 [Accessed 24 August 2015]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Sabbagh, H. 2015. *Syrian Archeological Treasures photo exhibition opens in Italian city of Asti*. SANA Website. 05 June 2015. Available at: <a href="http://sana.sy/en/?p=43828">http://sana.sy/en/?p=43828</a> [Accessed 10/06/15] Sabbagh, H. 2015. *Syrian Archeological Treasures photo exhibition concluded in Rome*. SANA Website. 15

February 2015. Available at: <a href="http://sana.sy/en/?p=28679">http://sana.sy/en/?p=28679</a> [Accessed 06/03/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> See many reports on the DGAM website.

# c) Workshops / Training Courses (Internal)

The DGAM and others have also attended a number of externally run training courses (See International Actions).

#### Supporting Capacities in Safeguarding Cultural Heritage (20-21 May 2015)

The Ministry of Interior and the Ministry of Culture (DGAM) organised this workshop at the Damascus national museum with the intention of discussing how the country has responded to the cultural heritage crisis.<sup>36</sup>

#### Cultural heritage site management (1-5 Oct 2015)

This workshop held in Tartous and organised by the DGAM, brought together participants currently working in built heritage management from different regions in Syria. It aimed to improve human resources in the field of cultural heritage management, increase awareness of the requirements for systematic recording of heritage sites and to increase knowledge of and skills in procedures for site management and interpretation.<sup>37</sup>

# Supporting Capacities in Safeguarding Cultural Heritage (20-21 May 2015)

The Ministry of Interior and the Ministry of Culture (DGAM) organised this workshop at the Damascus National Museum. The speakers focussed on how both Ministries have responded to the cultural heritage crisis. A list of speakers and topics covered is available on the webpage.<sup>38</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://dgam.gov.sy/index.php?p=314&id=1708 [Accessed 13/09/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=314&id=1819 [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1708 [Accessed 09/09/15]

# d) Reports & Maps

# Damage Maps of Syria (October 2013 – ongoing)

DGAM has created maps documenting damage to archaeological heritage on their website.<sup>39</sup> Map 1 – historic buildings:

http://www.dgam.gov.sv/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site\_damage01.jpg

Map 2 – museums http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site\_damage02.jpg

Map 3 – Dead Cities <a href="http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site\_damage03.jpg">http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site\_damage03.jpg</a>

Map 4 – more museums:

http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site\_damage04.jpg

Map 5 – Palmyra: <a href="http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site\_damage05.jpg">http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site\_damage05.jpg</a>

Map 6 – Bosra: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/Image/news/239/site\_damage06.jpg

# Interactive Map of Conflicted Archaeological Sites in Syria (Feb 2015 – ongoing)

The DGAM launched an interactive map of damaged sites on their webpage to help document and disseminate information on damage (available in Arabic<sup>40</sup> and English<sup>41</sup>).

#### Directorate-General of Antiquities and Museums (2015)

Initial damage assessment from 1/07/14 until 30/09/14 for archaeological and historic sites and building. <sup>42</sup> Initial damage assessment from 1<sup>st</sup> Jan 2015 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2015. <sup>43</sup>

# DGAM Survey: Vote on Museum Closure (2014)

The DGAM held a vote on their webpage to establish public opinion on whether to close the museums during the crisis.<sup>44</sup>

"Visitors vote: Are you with the closure of museums in light of the current crisis?"

As of 22 April 2014, there were 2116 votes: Yes: 74.2% | No: 13.42% | The matter does not concern me (i.e. do not care): 11.86%.

#### DGAM State Party Report to the World Heritage Committee (Submitted Feb 2015)

Report submitted to the World Heritage Committee in February 2015 for the 39<sup>th</sup> Session of the World Heritage Committee in June 2015.

DGAM. 2015. State Party Report On The State of Conservation of The Syrian Cultural Heritage Sites (Syrian Arab Republic). 45

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=239&id=1001 [Accessed 10/10/13]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1595 [Accessed 21/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: <a href="http://dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=177&id=1678">http://dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=177&id=1678</a> [Accessed 21/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> DGAM. 2014. *Initial damage assessment from 1/07/14 until 30/09/14 for archaeological and historic sites and building*. 1 Oct 2014. Available at: <a href="http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1441">http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1441</a>. English Table available at: <a href="http://dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/File/downloads/damage\_assessment\_table%20july\_september%20en.pdf">http://dgam.gov.sy/archive/docs/File/downloads/damage\_assessment\_table%20july\_september%20en.pdf</a> [Accessed 09/03/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> DGAM. 2015. *Initial damage assessment from 1<sup>st</sup> Jan 2015 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2015*. 10 April 2015. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1652 [Accessed 24/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> The survey was on the homepage of the *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://dgam.gov.sy/ [Accessed 22/04/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> DGAM report available on the World Heritage Committee website: <a href="http://whc.unesco.org/en/soc/3183">http://whc.unesco.org/en/soc/3183</a> [Accessed 10/10/2015]

# 2. International Actions

# a) Projects and Documentation

# x) Site and Object Inventories

#### Aleppo Archive in Exile

The "Aleppo Archive in Exile" contains data of all kinds to the old city of Aleppo: historical documents and maps, plans, texts, 500 cadastral maps, photos, etc. The data derive from various sources like research projects, work of the GIZ and the Old Town administration of Aleppo. The original archive of Aleppo is probably lost, while the digitized one is still available on different hard disks. It is planned to long-term safeguarding the documents of the old city of Aleppo and making data available for other institutes, researchers, etc. - probably through a cooperation with the DAI. The existing Aleppo archive should be enriched with data from other initiatives. 46

Shirīn: Sites and Monuments Records for Syria, and Museum Inventories (2014-ongoing) The British-French project "Sites and Monuments Records for Syria", which is associated with the initiative Shirīn, in close cooperation with the DGAM, is working towards the first Syrian Sites and Monuments database, incorporating all the foreign mission survey data. It focuses on the processing and long-term accessibility of ca. 15.000-20.000 survey data on archaeological sites in Syria.

Shirīn, in close cooperation with the DGAM, and international organisations like UNESCO, is also working toward the creation of a large database of the inventories of all the Museums of Syria.<sup>47</sup>

#### Interpol: Object Inventory

Interpol is adding information on more than 1,300 items removed from the Deir Atiyah Museum and other sites in Syria to the database -- viewed by more than 2,000 members of law enforcement and customs as well as partner organizations and private dealers.<sup>48</sup>

Improving Inventories of Built, Movable and Intangible Cultural Heritage (16-18 Feb 2015) Held in the framework of the "Emergency safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage" project, the meeting aimed at creating new synergies of collaboration among the participating entities and ensuring operational and accurate post-recovery planning. At the request of the DGAM, UNESCO organised this meeting in Beirut-Lebanon to discuss the current inventories and documentation systems in Syria and to propose measures to improve them in order to document

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Gangler, A., and Nagler, H. 2015. *Aleppo Archive in Exile*. (Universität Stuttgart / BTU Cottbus) Presentation given at Berlin Meeting 31 July 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> *Shirīn Website*. Updates are available here: <a href="http://shirin-international.org/?page\_id=795">http://shirin-international.org/?page\_id=795</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> FoxNews. 2015. *Interpol steps up search for ancient artefacts stolen in Syria and Iraq.* FoxNews.com Website. 28 April 2015. Available at:

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{http://www.foxnews.com/world/2015/04/28/interpol-steps-up-search-for-ancient-artifacts-stolen-in-syria-iraq/leacessed 24/08/15]}{(Accessed 24/08/15)}$ 

cultural heritage, track losses and destruction, as well as enable the national cultural heritage stakeholders to be operational and accurate when planning post-recovery actions.<sup>49</sup>

#### Berlin Meeting (31 Jul 2015)

A one-day meeting hosted by the Syrian Heritage Archive Project, held in Berlin, with the Museum für Islamische Kunst and the Deutsches Archäologisches Institut. Attendees included members of the DGAM. The workshop stressed how international efforts are complementary to the national efforts exerted by DGAM to protect the Syrian antiquities. It focused on the topics of digital archives, and damage assessment, as well as monitoring the art market and illicit trafficking.<sup>50</sup>

#### Recommendations:

- As all projects are already obliged to hand copies of any data generated during fieldwork to the DGAM, digital data of this type should be handed over as well.
- For future networking, multilingual databases are necessary. Arabic and English versions, if possible, must be developed.
- It was agreed that specific standards for recording the damage will be used, for example the guidelines similar to those of ICCROM, and standardised databases for damage assessment.
- Future work should also address the data synchronization of the individual initiatives.
- Since most initiatives focus on the tangible heritage while the situation of the intangible heritage is still neglected. Greater efforts to collect data of the intangible heritage would be important.
- Finally, it was agreed to hand over research data on the Syrian Cultural Heritage to the DGAM and to discuss the technical issues concerning data linking on various levels.
- UNESCO offered to act as a platform for further cooperation.

#### Outcomes:

- SYHER are signing MOUs for datasharing of damage documentation
- SYHER, UNESCO, ICOMOS, and Heritage *for* Peace are looking at ways to standardise documentation in line with European Standards. *See damage assessment*.
- A follow up technical meeting was held on 20-21 August for a "Digital inventory of Dayr az-Zor Museum".

http://www.unesco.org/new/en/beirut/single-view/news/experts\_meet\_in\_unesco\_beirut\_office\_to\_discuss\_inventories\_of\_cultural\_heritage\_in\_syria#.Ve9EOJf-UhQ;

DGAM Website. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1601 [Accessed 24/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> *UNESCO Website*. Available at:

Minutes are available from Issam Ballouz, Syrian Heritage Project, Museum für Islamische Kunst] <issam.ballouz@svrian-heritage.org>

# Digital inventory of Deir ez-Zor Museum (20-21 Aug 2015)

A meeting was held to discuss the digital inventory of Deir ez-Zor Museum. Attending parties were the DGAM, DAI, Islamic Museum, UNESCO, CIDOC (ICCROM).

Recommendations: data has to be prepared to be shared with Syrians (DGAM) and a priority is given to standards of data exchange, acknowledging the technical standard they have reached in database systems, and empowering the DGAM to improve their work with help from international actors. [Link not available].

# xi) Damage Assessment: Reports and Databases

# Aleppo Weekly

The CCNR staff is working on the week's most compelling stories, images, videos, and other resources that provide information about the life in the Syrian city, analyse the conflict that is destroying it, and help residents plan for their future. The weekly follows topics of interest to the Center's researchers, and has a special focus on those displaced from the city and others whose voices are rarely heard when it comes to peace-making or reconstruction. <sup>51</sup>

#### Archaeologik Blog (ongoing)

German blog promoting the protection of Syrian heritage since 2012, sharing monthly updates of damage to the Syrian archaeological heritage, with links to the media sources.<sup>52</sup>

#### Association for the Protection of Syrian Archaeology (APSA)

APSA continue to update their webpage and Facebook page<sup>53</sup> with important news regarding damage, classified by regions, provinces, site names, monuments, etc. The Filemaker database is only partly public and is shared with other institutions like Interpol. The languages used are Arabic, English, and French.

APSA also now assists groups such as the ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiative in a consulting capacity to document and confirm damage to sites. In addition to individual site updates, they have a number of reports on their website, <sup>54</sup> such as a special report on Palmyra.

#### The American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS)

AAAS have published two reports, using satellite imagery to assess damage to Syria's World Heritage Sites<sup>55</sup>, and the Tentative World Heritage Sites.<sup>56</sup>

Facebook Page: https://www.facebook.com/apsa2011?fref=ts [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Aleppo Weekly: Available at: http://ccnr.ceu.edu/aleppo-weekly [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> *Archaeologik* website: <a href="http://archaeologik.blogspot.co.uk/">http://archaeologik.blogspot.co.uk/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15] Projects: <a href="http://archaeologik.blogspot.de/search/label/Syrien">http://archaeologik.blogspot.de/search/label/Syrien</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Association for the Protection of Syrian Archaeology website: http://www.apsa2011.com/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Association for the Protection of Syrian Archaeology website: http://apsa2011.com/apsanew/category/apsa-repports/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> AAAS, Wolfinbarger, S., Drake, J., Ashcroft, E. and Hanson, K. 2014a. *Ancient History, Modern Destruction: Assessing the Current Status of Syria's World Heritage Sites Using High-Resolution Satellite Imagery. September*2014. Washington DC: American Association for the Advancement of Science, Smithsonian Institution, Penn Museum. Available at:

(For previous AAAS reports, see September 2014 Report).

#### ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiative (ASOR CHI)

Formerly, ASOR Syrian Heritage Initiative, the project has now expanded to include Iraq, and is now renamed to the Cultural Heritage Initiative.

ASOR CHI document damage in a database, using an Arches platform. Incidents of heritage damage since July 2014 are documented at Aleppo, Hasakah, Daraa, Deir ez-Zor, etc. Ca. 4.500 sites (published and unpublished) are recorded so far. Data is sourced from news and social media sources, communicating with Syrian heritage specialists, analysing satellite imagery to monitor, document, and verify heritage damage. They publish regular reports, which include, a key summary of all reported damage, all published news articles, the military and political context of the damage (i.e. relevant battles, etc.), key recommendations and actions, details of the damage to each site including monitoring and mitigation measures, and whether each report has been checked via satellite imagery. They are available online. <sup>57</sup>

As part of this, ASOR continue to run the Heritage Monitor website, enabling anonymous crowdsourcing of damage reports<sup>58</sup>.

# Deakin University: Measuring Cultural Property Destruction in Iraq and Syria (2015)

Dr Benjamin Isakhan from Deakin University has been awarded the first instalment of a major grant for a three-year project working with the Australian Department of Defence to document heritage destruction in Iraq and Syria. The project involves the creation of sophisticated databases cataloguing the destruction of heritage across Iraq and Syria. This continues from his earlier work in Iraq. 60

Endangered Archaeology in the Middle East and North Africa (EAMENA) (2015 – 2016)
The EAMENA Project is based at Oxford University. The project is recording unsurveyed sites in the MENA region, including Syria, and documenting information about the site and site

 $\frac{http://www.aaas.org/page/ancient-history-modern-destruction-assessing-current-status-syria-s-world-heritage-sites-u}{sing} \ [Accessed \ 4/04/15]$ 

http://www.aaas.org/report/ancient-history-modern-destruction-assessing-status-syria-s-tentative-world-heritage-site s [Accessed 08/08/15]

http://www.deakin.edu.au/alfred-deakin-institute/news/documenting-heritage-destruction-in-iraq-and-syria [Accessed 10/04/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> AAAS, Wolfinbarger, S., Drake, J., Ashcroft, E. and Hanson, K. 2014b. *Ancient History, Modern Destruction:*Assessing the Status of Syria's Tentative World Heritage Sites Using High-Resolution Satellite Imagery. Part One - December 2014. Washington DC: American Association for the Advancement of Science, Smithsonian Institution, Penn Museum. Available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> ASOR CHI Reports: http://www.asor-syrianheritage.org/weekly-reports/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Heritage Monitor page: http://www.heritagemonitor.com/en [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Deakin University Website. Available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Isakhan, B. 2012. Recording Heritage Destruction in Iraq. *Taarii Newsletter* 7 (2), 24-27.

<sup>- 2014.</sup> Creating the Iraq Cultural Property Destruction Database: Calculating a Heritage Destruction Index. *International Journal of Heritage Studies* 2014 (1), 1-21.

damage sustained, whether in peace or during conflict. They are also hoping to share information with various foreign missions who have worked in Syria (and elsewhere) to obtain as complete a site record as possible. Once complete, at least some of the database will be made publically available on their website. <sup>61</sup>

### Friends of Maaloula Photo documentation (2014-ongoing)

The Friends of Maaloula sent a camera to Maaloula to document the damage (Sept 2014 report). The photos taken have been uploaded online.<sup>62</sup>

#### Heritage for Peace (HfP) Newsletter (2014-ongoing)

A bi-weekly e-newsletter of damage to sites, international actions, and other information concerning the protection of Syria's cultural heritage. Previous newsletters are available online.<sup>63</sup>

#### Heritage of Syria: documentation

Heritage of Syria is requesting photos of Palmyra. All the images collected will be kept in a special file to be used in any future restoration project. Also, the best of these images collected will be used in a photo exhibition in a prominent international museum and other places.<sup>64</sup>

#### Le patrimoine archéologique syrien en danger (LPASD)

This group continue to post updates about damage via their Facebook page. 65

# Million Image Database Project (2015-ongoing)

Roger Michel, of the Institute of Digital Archaeology (a joint venture between Harvard University and the Classics Conclave) intends to flood the area with 3D cameras and enlist local partners to photograph as many items of historical interest as they can. They aim to deploy 5,000 3D cameras in the field in the MENA region by the end of 2015, and hope to capture one million 3D images of at-risk objects by the end of 2016. They have created a heavily modified version of an inexpensive consumer 3D camera that will permit inexperienced users to capture archival-quality scans. The camera has the facility to upload these images automatically to database servers where they can be used for study or, if required, 3D replication. He is relying on a patchwork of local museums, non-governmental organisations and volunteers to carry out the digital archiving. Each camera contains an automated tutorial package that will help field users – local museum affiliates, embedded military, NGO employees and volunteers – both to identify

Photos taken of damage to Maaloula: <a href="http://rahim.eu/maaloula/Bilder/">http://rahim.eu/maaloula/Bilder/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>61</sup> EAMENA: www.EAMENA.org [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>62</sup> Friends of Maaloula Website: http://www.rahim.eu/maaloula/aboutus.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> You can subscribe to the newsletter, or, read previous newsletters online: <a href="http://www.heritageforpeace.org/syria-culture-and-heritage/damage-to-cultural-heritage/previous-damage-newsletters/">http://www.heritageforpeace.org/syria-culture-and-heritage/damage-to-cultural-heritage/previous-damage-newsletters/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> *Heritage of Syria Facebook page*. Available at: https://www.facebook.com/439242389432464/photos/a.439538522736184.97837.439242389432464/95633166105 6865/?type=3&fref=nf [Accessed 16/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Le patrimoine archéologique syrien en danger Facebook page: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/Archeologie.syrienne">https://www.facebook.com/Archeologie.syrienne</a>
YouTube: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/user/SyrianArchaeological">https://www.facebook.com/Archeologie.syrienne</a>

appropriate subject matters and to capture useable images. They have partnered with New York University's Institute for the Study of the Ancient World to store the 3D images, and with Massachusetts Institute of Technology Three Dimensional Printing Laboratory to print them, and with UNESCO. All of the associated technology and software is open-source. <sup>66</sup>

#### Medmak Syrian Archaeologist Centre

NGO who raise awareness of the damage to Syria heritage with a variety of events. In addition, their website contains sections on laws, campaigns, articles, organisations, conferences, studies, reports and so on (in Arabic).<sup>67</sup>

#### Monuments of Syria

Ross Burns continues to update the *Monuments of Syria* website with details of damage.<sup>68</sup>

# "Near Eastern Archaeology" special open-access volume: "The Cultural Heritage Crisis in the Middle East" (2015)

Near Eastern Archaeology 78 (3), September 2015 - a Journal containing articles on that central theme. The special issue is free-of-charge thanks to ASOR and is available online. <sup>69</sup> The work of several projects are detailed in this volume, in particular the work of ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiative, and Safeguarding the Heritage of Syria and Iraq.

## Safeguarding the Heritage of Syria and Iraq Project Database

The Penn Cultural Heritage Center, the Smithsonian Institution and the American Association for the Advancement of Science have been building a database of the damage done to historical sites across the region. Combining ground reports, information from databases and geospatial data to identify and record structures that have sustained damage, the effort has located over 1,200 sites so far, according to the Penn Cultural Heritage Center's website. The work is supported by the National Science Foundation.<sup>70</sup>

# Syrian Heritage Archive Project (SYRHER): Digitisation and Damage Documentation Database

Joint project between the Museum für Islamische Kunst Berlin and the Deutsches Archäologisches Institut The SYHER Project aims to digitise old archives to ensure that the data

See also: Belton, P. 2015. *Indiana Joneses run hi-tech race against Islamic State*. 20 June 2015. BBC News. Available at: http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/business-33262530?ocid=socialflow\_facebook [Accessed 07/09/15]

Facebook page: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/MedmakSyrianArchaeologistStudiescentre/timeline">https://www.facebook.com/MedmakSyrianArchaeologistStudiescentre/timeline</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> The IDA website: http://digitalarchaeology.org.uk/projects [Accessed 18/10/15]

<sup>67</sup> MEDMAK Website: https://medmakblog.wordpress.com/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Monuments of Syria website: <a href="http://monumentsofsyria.com/syria-conflict/">http://monumentsofsyria.com/syria-conflict/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Near East Online: Available at: http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5615/neareastarch.78.issue-3 [Accessed 16/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Dor, L B. 2015. *Penn Museum works to document, preserve Syrian cultural* sites. The Daily Pennsylvanian. 23 July 2015. Available at:

 $<sup>\</sup>underline{\text{http://www.thedp.com/article/2015/07/penn-museum-works-to-document-preserve-syrian-cultural-sites}} \ [Accessed 10/10/15]$ 

can be used in the future and meaningfully integrated in larger database projects to provide a basis for the subsequent evaluation of data on the current status of Syria's cultural heritage. They are also creating a database to document the damage occurring to sites. A further goal of the initiative is to create an international network with similar projects focussing on the long-term documentation of Syria's cultural assets.<sup>71</sup>

The following components of the digital infrastructure of the DAI (idai.world) are used for data storage: idai.objects/Arachne (administration of objects), idai.gazetteer (administration of place names), idai.geoserver (analysis level Geo) und idai.bibliography/Zenon (administration of literature). The data are linked via the idai.gazetteer. So far, more than 100,000 data, especially to archaeological sites, have been processed. Multilingual terminology is to be pursued in future to assist data sharing. The database is structured around the concept of a Digital Room Book. For a test version, see: E-culturalheritage.de; Restaurierungsberatung.de, Leapfrog.cl.

The question of how the project data can be merged with other projects, in particular with the DGAM database, will be the subject of further discussions.<sup>72</sup>

- Outcomes to date: See *Conferences: Berlin Meeting*.
- SYHER are signing MOUs for data-sharing of damage information.
- SYHER, UNESCO, ICOMOS, and Heritage for Peace are looking at ways to standardise documentation in line with European Standard *BS EN 16096:2012: Conservation of cultural property Condition survey and report of built cultural heritage* (BSI Standards Publication).

# Safeguarding Syrian Cultural Heritage & Observatory of Syrian Cultural Heritage (UNESCO)

The UNESCO Syrian Observatory is available online. Their website contains brief updates on major sites, and links to sources of other information. In addition, updates, news and events are also available.<sup>73</sup>

#### Shirīn: Database of archaeological projects in Syria (2014-ongoing)

Shirīn are working with local contacts and other archaeologists to identify site damage and instigate protective measures and are making this information available to relevant people as tee instances are reported by official or non-governmental bodies in Syria and in the rest of the world, and by Shirīn informants. Shirīn intends to develop procedures for checking and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Syrian Heritage Archive Project. Available at: http://www.smb.museum/en/museums-and-institutions/museum-fuer-islamische-kunst/research/erstellung-digitaler-kulturgueterregister-fuer-syrien.html [Accessed 19/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Taken from the presentations: R. Förtsch. 2015. DAI Syrian Heritage Data in the idai.world. "Monuments Registers", id-lessDamage Assessments and some Defintions (DAI, MIK),

Ballouz, I., and Vargas-Kock, C. 2015. Damage Assessment. How can European Standards contribute to "Conservation of Cultural Heritage"? (SYRHER, MIK)

Given at Berlin Meeting, 31 July 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Safeguarding Syrian Cultural Heritage & Observatory of Syrian Cultural Heritage. Available at: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/safeguarding-syrian-cultural-heritage/ and https://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

confirming cases of damage, to reduce the flow of biased or partisan information. Damage assessments are also conducted by site directors (58 have completed forms), who are asked to review UN satellite imagery of their site. They are uploading data concerning damage to sites on an interactive map.<sup>74</sup>

#### Syria – A cry for heritage

Facebook page documenting damage to Syria's heritage sites.<sup>75</sup>

# Syrian- Spanish Project in the Middle Euphrates Reports: El Conflicto Armado En Siria Y Su Repercusión Sobre El Patrimonio Cultural.

Three Spanish articles listing damage to sites have been published. The first article deals with the archaeological sites and monuments in Deir ez-Zor governorate, description of the sites, relevant bibliography, date and assessment of the damage. The second article is about Raqqa governorate, and the third about Hasseke. All three can be freely downloaded from the web site of the Syrian-Spanish Project in the Middle Euphrates.<sup>76</sup>

#### TerraWatchers (2015(?))

TerraWatchers is dedicated to providing web-based, crowd sourced satellite image monitoring and overwatch tools for critical missions related to current events. They use interactive Google Maps© interfaces to display the latest freely available, high-resolution satellite imagery in their mission footprints, and then crowd source the interpretation, to cover as wide an area as possible, as quickly as possible. Submitted data is then verified and the results of recorded site damage are analysed.<sup>77</sup>

#### UNOSAT / UNITAR

UNOSAT, the satellite imagery branch of the UN, in the UNITAR section, have released an analysis of a selection of several hundred damaged sites including world heritage sites, and some of the sites nearby.<sup>78</sup>

# xii) Information Databases (Other)

Endangered Archaeology in the Middle East and North Africa (EAMENA) (2015 – 2016) The EAMENA Project is based at Oxford University. The project is recording unsurveyed sites in the MENA region, including Syria, and documenting information about the site, in addition to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Shirīn Website. Updates are available here: http://shirin-international.org/?page\_id=795 [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Syria – a Cry for Heritage Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/%D8%B3%D9%88%D8%B1%D9%8A%D8%A9-%D8%B5%D8%B1%D8%AE%D8

https://www.facebook.com/%D8%B3%D9%88%D8%B1%D9%8A%D8%A9-%D8%B5%D8%B1%D8%AE%D8 %A9-%D8%AA%D8%B1%D8%A7%D8%AB-1595169457432294/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Spanish Project in the Middle Euphrates Reports available at: http://www.arqueologiaoriente.com/publicaciones.html [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> TerraWatchers Website: http://terrawatchers.org/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Bjørgo, E., Boccardi, G., Cunliffe, E., Fiol, M., Jellison, T., Pederson, W. and Saslow, C. 2014. *Satellite-Based Damage Assessment to Cultural Heritage Sites in Syria*. [Online]: UNITAR, UNOSAT. Available: http://www.unitar.org/unosat/chs-syria [Accessed 16/10/15]

documenting damage about the site. They are also hoping to share information with various foreign missions who have worked in Syria (and elsewhere) to obtain as complete a site record as possible. Once complete, at least some of the database will be made publically available on their website.<sup>79</sup>

#### Shirīn: Database of archaeological projects in Syria (2014-ongoing)

Shirīn are working to release a preliminary database of archaeological projects in Syria, which can be ordered by governorate, most recent season, director(s), and damage, with both free access and restricted access files.<sup>80</sup>

# UNESCO Request Foreign Mission Information

UNESCO encourages international archaeological missions to provide all available information on historical sites and archaeological artefacts that are potentially at risk in Syria.<sup>81</sup>

#### Manar al-Athar open-access photo-archive (ongoing)

The Manar al-Athar open-access photo-archive at the University of Oxford that provides more than 17,000 high resolution, searchable images, freely-downloadable for teaching, research, heritage projects, and publication. It covers buildings and art in the areas of the former Roman empire which later came under Islamic rule (e.g. Syro-Palestine/the Levant, Arabia, Egypt, and North Africa), from ca. 300 BC to the present, but especially Roman, late antique, and early Islamic art, architecture, and sacred sites. Material is labelled in both English and Arabic. They could be of particularly use in damage assessment comparisons and reconstruction. <sup>82</sup>

# Palmyrena: City, Hinterland and Caravan Trade between Orient and Occident

The photo archive of the Syrian-Norwegian research project *Palmyrena: City, Hinterland and Caravan Trade between Orient and Occident* is also available online. <sup>83</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> EAMENA: www.EAMENA.org [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>80</sup> Shirīn Website. Updates are available here: http://shirin-international.org/?page\_id=795 [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> *UNESCO*. 2013. International archaeological missions in Syria. Available at: <a href="http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-traffic-of-cultural-property/emergency-actions/international-archaeological-missions-in-syria/">http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-traffic-of-cultural-property/emergency-actions/international-archaeological-missions-in-syria/</a> [Accessed 12/11/13]

<sup>82</sup> Manar al-Athar archive: http://www.manar-al-athar.ox.ac.uk/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> The Photo Archive of the Syrian-Norwegian research project *Palmyrena*: *City, Hinterland and Caravan Trade between Orient and Occident*. Ancient World Online Blog. 02 09 2015. Available at: http://ancientworldonline.blogspot.co.uk/2015/09/the-photo-archive-of-syrian-norwegian.html [accessed 10/10/15]

# xiii) Reconstruction Projects and Conservation

#### Stabilisation at the Ma'aret al-Nu'man Museum

The emergency project, first conceived during a Syrian cultural heritage emergency workshop in the summer of 2014, was a months' long initiative of an international group of organizations: the Safeguarding the Heritage of Syria and Iraq Project (SHOSI), which is a consortium of the Penn Cultural Heritage Center at the University of Pennsylvania Museum; the Office of the Under Secretary for History, Art, and Culture at the Smithsonian Institution; the Geospatial Technologies Project at the American Association for the Advancement of Science; Shawnee State University, The Day After—a Syrian NGO; and the U.S. Institute of Peace.<sup>84</sup>

# Die Altstadt von Aleppo: Strategien für den Wiederaufbau (6 Feb 2015)

Public debate on reconstruction strategies of Aleppo discussed at the ANCB The Aedes Metropolitan Laboratory in Berlin, attended by many experts. 85

Central European University and Columbia University – The Aleppo Project (2014- ongoing)
The Aleppo Project, joining the Center of Conflict, Negotiation and Recovery (CCNR) at Central European University and Columbia University, aims to come up with policy tools and ideas that enhance the power of communities to determine their own futures and helps donors do more with less. They are looking at city life in peace and at war, conflict analysis, planning, architecture and reconstruction with an aim to raise awareness of what has happened in the city and provide resources for the future. The core principle is to help people, particularly refugees and women who are shut out of decisions on aid and reconstruction, find a voice. They work in diverse ways - from surveying and interviewing refugees and residents to using satellite imagery to map the impact of war on the city of Aleppo. They have an online survey to capture the views of the original residents of Aleppo, many of whom are now refugees, and of local and international professionals, especially those with relevant experience, for consideration during the reconstruction process. The survey is available on their website in Arabic and English. 86

# UNESCO Post-Conflict Reconstruction in the Middle East Context, and in the Old City of Aleppo in particular (Jun 2015)

Due to escalation of the conflicts in the Middle East and to the significant destruction of cultural heritage, Nada Al Hassan, the Chief of the Arab States Unit at the World Heritage organised a meeting with a group of multidisciplinary experts to brainstorm on the issue of post-conflict

Penn Museum. 2015. Emergency Preservation Activities Completed at Syria's Ma'arra Mosaic Museum 5 March 2015. Available here: <a href="http://www.penn.museum/press-releases/1182-syria-emergency-preservation.html">http://www.penn.museum/press-releases/1182-syria-emergency-preservation.html</a> [Accessed 21/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> *ANCB Website*. Full program available at: <a href="http://www.ancb.de/sixcms/detail.php?id=15009713#.Vgwd3XpViko">http://www.ancb.de/sixcms/detail.php?id=15009713#.Vgwd3XpViko</a> [Accessed 20/2/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> *CCNR Website*, available at: <a href="http://ccnr.ceu.edu/thealeppoproject">http://ccnr.ceu.edu/thealeppoproject</a> and Facebook page: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/aleppoproject">https://www.facebook.com/aleppoproject</a>, and YouTube link: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Hktdy-Lc2Dw">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Hktdy-Lc2Dw</a> [Accessed 01/10/2015].

reconstruction in the Middle-East context, and in the Ancient City of Aleppo, at UNESCO's Headquarters, in Paris.<sup>87</sup>

# SOS Chrétiens d'Orient - French Society for Oriental Christians (SOSCO): Work at St George's Church in Maaloula.

The organisation is continuing to support fellow Christians in the Middle East. In the Sep 2014 Report, they were hoping to rebuild St George's Church in Maaloula from donations. The photos they took of the damage and details of the trip are available on their website in French.<sup>88</sup>

## V&A Culture in Crisis Project

The V&A has entered into discussion with business leaders to develop long-term strategies to assist in rebuild and protect cultural heritage assets in a number of countries. 89

#### Heritage Help Offer (circulated May 2013)

"If you are in Syria, or know someone who is in Syria, and are in need of emergency advice on how to care for archaeological sites, historic buildings, and collections of objects, write to <syriaheritagehelp@gmail.com>. All questions will be sent to a professional conservator. The mailbox accepts questions in English and Arabic, and works anonymously. 90

#### Parsons: Palmyra Photogrammetry

A project by Conan Parsons to use digital photos to build a 3D photogrammetric model of Palmyra before its destruction, perhaps for use in any potential rebuilding of the site. <sup>91</sup>

From previous reports

#### Damascus Reconstruction

In collaboration with ICOMOS, ICCROM and INTERPOL, the DGAM is involved in a project for the protection of the old city of Damascus (Jan 2014). See April 2014 Report.

https://en.unesco.org/events/post-conflict-reconstruction-middle-east-context-and-old-city-aleppo-particular [Accessed 9/09/15]

http://www.soschretiensdorient.fr/2014/09/les-travaux-de-reparation-finances-par-sos-chretiens-dorient-ont-commence-a-leglise-saint-georges-de-maaloula-syrie/ and http://www.soschretiensdorient.fr/une-eglise-pour-maaloula/[Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> UNESCO Website. Available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Rebuilding of St George's Church:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> *Culture in Crisis Programme*. V&A webpage. Available at: http://www.vam.ac.uk/content/articles/v/the-v-and-as-culture-in-crisis-programme/ [Accessed 19/10/15]

The original circulation was in Arabic, and can be viewed here on Facebook: https://www.facebook.com/Syrian.Antiquities/posts/450104105072347 [Accessed 17/10/15]

Palmyra Photogrammetry available at: https://www.facebook.com/Palmyra3Dmodel [Accessed: 16/10/15]

# xiv) Projects Fighting Illicit Trafficking

# Shirīn: Looted object identification (2014-ongoing)

Shirīn are assisting in the identification of objects that may have been illicitly looted, using contacts with art markets. They can provide archaeological expertise to identify looted objects, and, if possible, their place of origin. 92

# Verfahren zur Erhellung des Dunkelfeldes als Grundlage für Kriminalitätsbekämpfung und -prävention am Beispiel antiker Kulturgüter (ILLICID) (2015-2018)<sup>93</sup>

The National research project ILLICID<sup>94</sup> focuses on the illicit traffic in archaeological objects in Germany. From 2015 the project undertakes a 3-year explorative study with special attention to archaeological objects from Iraq and Syria (object types, turnover, operation modes etc.).

In addition to comprehensive data collection, the project aims to develop recommended actions for actors in the trade with cultural property, to set up a database to collect information, for instance, about suspicious auctions. Data will then be made available to investigators via a dedicated app.

The project was initiated by the Prussian Cultural Heritage Foundation (SPK), Berlin, the Fraunhofer Institute for Secure Information Technology (SIT), Darmstadt, and GESIS – Leibniz-Institute for the Social Sciences, Mannheim and finances by the Federal Ministry for Education and Research. Associated partners include the German Federal Foreign Office, the Federal Commissioner for Culture and Media, the German Commission for UNESCO, as well as the ICOM International Observatory on Illicit Traffic in Cultural Goods. 95

# ICOM, EU: International Observatory on Illicit Traffic in Cultural Goods (3 Sep 2015)

The European Commission is working to make sure that we better enforce the prohibition of trade in certain cultural goods from Iraq and Syria. The EU is funding a collaborative platform designed by the International Council of Museums. Together with the European External Action Service, the Commission is exploring ways to intensify cooperation with organisations working for the preservation of cultural heritage.<sup>96</sup>

http://ec.europa.eu/commission/2014-2019/navracsics/announcements/hidden-gem-role-culture-making-europe-stronger-global-actor\_en [Accessed 07/09/15]

<sup>92</sup> Shirīn Website. Updates are available here: http://shirin-international.org/?page\_id=795

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Heritage for Peace would like to thank Aylin Polzer for assisting us with the translation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Stiftung Preuβischer Kulturbesitz Website. 04 March 2015. Available at: <a href="http://www.preussischer-kulturbesitz.de/pressemitteilung/news/2015/03/04/nationales-forschungsprojekt-illicid-will-illegalen-handel-mit-kulturgut-in-deutschland-untersuchen.html">http://www.preussischer-kulturbesitz.de/pressemitteilung/news/2015/03/04/nationales-forschungsprojekt-illicid-will-illegalen-handel-mit-kulturgut-in-deutschland-untersuchen.html</a> [Accessed 25/03/15]

English PDF available here: <a href="http://ukblueshield.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/ILLICID-English-Summary.pdf">http://ukblueshield.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/ILLICID-English-Summary.pdf</a> [Accessed 18/10/15]

<sup>95</sup> Observatory Illicit Traffic Website. Available at: http://obs-traffic.museum/illicid-verfahren-zur-erhellung-des-dunkelfeldes-als-grundlage-f%C3%BCr-kriminalit%C 3%A4tsbek%C3%A4mpfung-und [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> A hidden gem: the role of culture in making Europe a stronger global actor. 03 September 2015. EC Europa Website. Available at:

#### International Observatory of Syrian Cultural Heritage (March 2014 – ongoing)

UNESCO are working to monitor and assess the cultural heritage situation in Syria through updated and continued knowledge and documentation. This work is carried out in partnership with the Syrian DGAM and others, such as Interpol. Details of their work are available on their webpage.<sup>97</sup>

#### ICOM Red List

ICOM continue to circulate their Red List of looted Syrian objects (see April 2014 Report). It is now joined by an updated Red List for Iraq (2015).

#### Interpol

Interpol continue to work to track stolen property from Syria and elsewhere. (See April 2014 Report).

#### Cairo Declaration Task Force and Centre (May 2015)

The Cairo Declaration was created by the Antiquities Coalition and partners, and agreed at the Cairo Conference: *Cultural Property Under Threat*. It outlines a regional action plan that the countries will take together, including:

- Establishing a high-level MENA task force that will coordinate regional and international efforts against cultural racketeering
- Creating an international Advisory Council that will provide support to the Task Force
- Initiating negotiations for a regional cultural Memorandum of Understanding with demand countries
- Launching domestic and international campaigns against looting, trafficking, and the black market trade
- Establishing an independent centre to combat antiquities laundering

Countries announcing the Declaration include Egypt, Iraq, Jordan, Kuwait, Lebanon, Libya, Oman, Saudi Arabia, Sudan, and the United Arab Emirates. Although Syria did not announce the declaration, it will impact the country.

## FBI Intelligence Threat Study, August 2014

The FBI completed an Intelligence Threat Study, and sent it to the US Congress. It considers new legislation to sanction dealing in looted antiquities in Syria. Listed are 12 areas in the illicit antiquities trade for which the FBI claims there are "intelligence gaps." Seven of them are:

- What is the overall value of the illicit antiquities trade in the US?

http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property/awareness-raising-initiatives/help-stop-the-destruction-of-cultural-heritage-in-syria-and-iraq/ [Accessed 24/09/15]

Also see: Antiquities Coalition. 2015. *Article on 2015 Cairo Conference: Cultural Property Under Threat*. 26 May 2015. Available at: <a href="http://www.theantiquitiescoalition.org/2015-cairo-conference-cultural-property-under-threat/">http://www.theantiquitiescoalition.org/2015-cairo-conference-cultural-property-under-threat/</a> [Accessed 24/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> UNESCO Website. Available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> Middle East Institute. 2015. *Ten Middle East and North African Countries Announce Cairo Declaration to take steps to prevent the War Crime of Looting and the destruction of Heritage*.14 May 2015. Available at: <a href="http://www.mei.edu/content/article/countries-sign-declaration-prevent-antiquities-looting-middle-east">http://www.mei.edu/content/article/countries-sign-declaration-prevent-antiquities-looting-middle-east</a>

- Where are the largest global networks in this trade?
- How many and which US-based art dealers are trading in stolen or looted goods from Syria?
- To what extent are US or foreign government workers involved in the illegal trade?
- Are the networks specializing in the illicit antiquities trade also involved in other criminal activities?
- How are the proceeds from illegal trade in the United States then transferred back to the networks in the countries of origin?
- Who are the most active carriers and which countries do they come from? Are the carriers also involved in the drug trade, human trafficking or any other smuggling?

The FBI is appealing for any information that can assist in filling these gaps.<sup>99</sup>

#### Reward for Information on Da'esh's programme of looting (Sep 2015)

The Rewards for Justice Programme announced they are offering a reward of up to \$5 million for information leading to the significant disruption of the sale and/or trade of oil and antiquities by the Islamic State. <sup>100</sup>

#### The National Museum, Beirut offers heritage protection advice (4 Sep 2015)

Having already been through a traumatic civil war, The National Museum in Beirut is working to stop the illegal trade in Syrian antiquities. <sup>101</sup>

#### Mailing list for further information

The Anonymous Swiss Collector Webpage has created a list of opportunities and a mailing list related to opportunities and conferences in the fields of art crime, antiquities trafficking, provenance studies, art authentication, repatriation and cultural property law. 102

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Lamb, F. 2014. *Looting is the Greatest Threat to our Cultural Heritage in Syria*. Foreign Policy Journal. 29 September 2014. Available at:

http://www.foreignpolicyjournal.com/2014/12/29/looting-is-the-greatest-threat-to-our-cultural-heritage-in-syria/ [Access 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Act of Terror: Information that leads to the significant disruption of...Trafficking in Oil and Antiquities Benefiting the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL). Available at:

https://www.rewardsforjustice.net/english/trafficking\_oil\_and\_antiquities.html [Accessed 10/10/15]

Metzker, J. 2015. *Fighting to save the region's cultural heritage*. Qantara.de Website. 04 Sep 2015. Available at: <a href="https://en.qantara.de/content/the-national-museum-in-beirut-fighting-to-save-the-regions-cultural-heritage">https://en.qantara.de/content/the-national-museum-in-beirut-fighting-to-save-the-regions-cultural-heritage</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

Anonymous Swiss Collector Opportunities - Subscribe here: http://www.anonymousswisscollector.com/opportunities

# xv) Projects: Other

#### Culture in Crisis

The V&A Museum have a Culture in Crisis programme. As part of this they have launched an online Culture in Crisis hub which discusses their programme, contains videos and details of events they have run, and links to forthcoming events. Projects 104 not listed in other sections include:

- The V&A has started work on creating a V&A Culture in Crisis Charity. It is hoped that the charity will both raise public awareness and at the same time allow the public to directly support preservation and conservation efforts.
- We are collaborating with the British Museum to create a European Museum Security Group. The group will consider strategic security issues and in particular look at innovative and safe ways for museums to assist in the protection of cultural heritage while at the same time ensuring the safety and security of visitors, staff and collections.
- The V&A is supporting colleagues from Oxford University and the Ashmolean Museum to deliver a conference to examine in more detail the reasons behind recent acts of iconoclasm and to seek new ways of preventing or reducing further destruction. This conference is called Conflict and Cultural Heritage, and is on 31 October 2015.
- With our partners at the Institute for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage at Yale University we are considering the value of a second Culture in Crisis Conference this time held closer to the region most affected at this time, to encourage the participation of a wider International group.
- The V&A has offered to establish a National Research and Coordination Team to assist the UK in analysing intelligence and coordinating support efforts. We await a funding decision on this proposal.
- In addition, the participants of their Culture in Crisis conference have agreed to a number of recommendations. They have been approved by UNESCO and were presented at the World Heritage Council Meeting in Bonn June 2015, and made available on the V&A Culture in Crisis internet hub. 105

http://www.vam.ac.uk/content/articles/v/the-v-and-as-culture-in-crisis-programme/ [Accessed 19/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> V&A Website. Available at: http://www.vam.ac.uk/page/c/culture-in-crisis/ [Accessed 15/09/15].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Culture in Crisis Programme. V&A webpage. Available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> V&A Recommendations

# b) Awareness Raising (Talks, Conferences, Discussions, Workshops, etc.)

Most of the groups listed also carry out awareness raising activities as part of their work: these take the form of talks, and conferences, amongst other initiatives. They will not be listed again here. What is known of their awareness raising activities can be viewed in the relevant sections.

# xvi) Cooperation Discussions

# Syria and German Archaeological Institute, the Free University of Berlin and the German archaeological missions (6-9 Oct 2014)

Several talks were held in Berlin by the Director-General, Prof. Maamoun Abdulkarim to discuss ways of cooperation and integration to face the risk to Syrian Cultural Heritage between the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM), the German Archaeological Institute, the Free University of Berlin and the German archaeological missions works in Syria. <sup>106</sup>

#### Syria and Italy, Berlin and Japan

June 2015: According to the DGAM presentation at the Strategies for Restoration and Reconstruction: Museums, Heritage Sites and Archaeological Parks in Post-War Countries Conference (Bern, 25 June 2015), Italy, Berlin and Japan have all hosted cooperation workshops, as capacity building is particularly important now. <sup>107</sup>

#### EU's external relations looking to protect heritage (3-4 Sep 2015)

As part of the speech of commissioner Navracsics, at the *Culture and development: towards a more strategic approach to cultural policies in the EU's external relations*, organised by Luxembourg Presidency of the Council of the European Union, Echternach, in Luxembourg, he said "together with the European External Action Service, the European Commission is exploring ways to intensify our cooperation with organisations working for the preservation of cultural heritage". <sup>108</sup>

 $<sup>^{106} \ \</sup>textit{DGAM Website}. \ Available \ at: \\ \underline{\text{http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314\&id=1449}} \ [Accessed \ 9/3/15]$ 

Notes taken by Cunliffe during the conference.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> A hidden gem: the role of culture in making Europe a stronger global actor. 03 September 2015. EC Europa Website. Available at:

# xvii) Appeals / Calls / Offers of Aid

# Norway Launches Appeal to Prevent Illicit Trade of Cultural Objects (Mar 2015)

The Norwegian Government has launched an appeal to Norwegian collectors and to exercise caution and help to prevent the illegal trade in cultural artefacts from the region. <sup>109</sup>

# European Council. Council conclusions on the EU regional strategy for Syria and Iraq as well as the ISIL/Da'esh threat (16 Mar 2015)

The EU strongly condemns Da'esh's deliberate destruction of archaeological and cultural heritage in Syria and Iraq and the extremist ideology behind it, noting that such actions may amount to a war crime according to the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court. The Council adopts the EU regional strategy for Syria and Iraq as well as the ISIL/Da'esh threat, based on the annexed Joint Communication of the European Commission and the High Representative of the EU for Foreign Affairs and Security Policy. The EU recalls that military action in this context is necessary but not sufficient to defeat ISIL/Da'esh. It will coordinate closely with international partners in the framework of the Global Coalition's working groups on stabilisation, strategic counter-messaging, foreign terrorist fighters, countering terrorist financing and military action. The EU is committed to help document and protect the heritage of Syria and Iraq while taking appropriate steps in accordance with UNSCR 2199 to prevent the illegal trade of cultural property, noting that such illicit traffic of cultural artefacts, directly contributes to the financing of Da'esh and other terrorist organizations. <sup>110</sup>

# The National Museum, Beirut offers heritage protection advice (4 Sep 2015)

Having already been through a traumatic civil war, The National Museum in Beirut is offering advice to protect heritage based on previous experience.<sup>111</sup>

In addition, there have been several calls for aid in reconstruction projects (See *Reconstruction Projects and Conservation*).

Press Release. 2015. *Appeal to halt illicit trafficking of cultural objects from Iraq and Syria*. Government.no Website. Available at: <a href="https://www.regjeringen.no/en/aktuelt/trafficking-cultural-objects/id2401029/">https://www.regjeringen.no/en/aktuelt/trafficking-cultural-objects/id2401029/</a> [Accessed 8/09/15]

Council of the European Union Website. Available at: <a href="http://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2015/03/16-council-conclusions-eu-regional-strategy-for-syria-and-iraq-as-well-as-the-isil-daesh-threat/">http://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2015/03/16-council-conclusions-eu-regional-strategy-for-syria-and-iraq-as-well-as-the-isil-daesh-threat/</a> [Accessed 9/9/15]

Metzker, J. 2015. *Fighting to save the region's cultural heritage*. Qantara.de Website. 04 Sep 2015. Available at: <a href="https://en.qantara.de/content/the-national-museum-in-beirut-fighting-to-save-the-regions-cultural-heritage">https://en.qantara.de/content/the-national-museum-in-beirut-fighting-to-save-the-regions-cultural-heritage</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

# xviii) Conferences / Workshops

*Note:* UK Blue Shield have started to collate all forthcoming events relating to heritage in conflict on their website <sup>112</sup>, and information published regarding any previous events. <sup>113</sup> This has provided a major source of information. Whilst attempts have been made to make this as comprehensive as possible, there have been a large number of events, and it is likely some were missed, for which we apologise. Furthermore, they did not start collating this information until September 2015, so earlier events are far more likely to have been missed. In addition, some outcomes may have been missed due to language barriers (e.g. Spanish, Japanese) or late publication, and conference announcements are often more widely circulated than the outcomes. <sup>114</sup> Therefore this list should in no way be taken as complete.

The authors have made the choice to only include conferences that have occurred. Those wishing to know about forthcoming events being organised should check sites like the Heritage for Peace Facebook Page, or the UK Blue Shield website page. In addition, the Anonymous Swiss Collector Webpage has created a list of opportunities and a mailing list related to opportunities and conferences in the fields of art crime, antiquities trafficking, provenance studies, art authentication, repatriation and cultural property law. 115

# Syrian Heritage Initiative Symposium - Luncheon Presentation (23 Nov 2014)

ASOR's Cultural Heritage Initiative hosted a public Symposium at the 2014 ASOR Annual Meeting on Sunday, November 23 at The Westin San Diego hotel. The Symposium included two sessions that were open to the general public, and a ticketed Luncheon, which featured a keynote presentation on looting in the region—especially the role of Da'esh in this looting. The afternoon sessions featured principal team members who introduced the major aspects of the Syrian Heritage Initiative: cultural heritage communications, satellite remote sensing and mapping, and preservation planning and training. The Panel Discussion (featuring international experts on Syrian heritage) addressed the topic of cultural heritage protection in areas of conflict.

The goals of the Symposium were to raise awareness about the challenges facing Syrian cultural heritage preservation and to provide a forum where heritage specialists and the public could engage in discussions about ASOR's Syrian Heritage Initiative.

Outcomes: The video has been made available online. 116

<sup>112</sup> UK Blue Shield Forthcoming events: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/forthcoming-events/

<sup>113</sup> UK Blue Shield Previous events: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/

Emma Cunliffe is also the UK Blue Shield webmaster, so any mistakes are hers, twice over.

Anonymous Swiss Collector Opportunities - subscribe here: http://www.anonymousswisscollector.com/opportunities

ASOR. Syrian Heritage Initiative Symposium - Luncheon Presentation. Available at: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=g0bmApgPmns&feature=youtu.be">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=g0bmApgPmns&feature=youtu.be</a> [Accessed 21/08/15]

#### Heritage and Cultural Diversity at Risk in Iraq and Syria (3 Dec 2014)

International Conference held in Paris. Five main concrete policy proposals were made by the participants to the conference: 1. An international ban on trade in cultural objects from Syria at the United Nations (UN) Security Council (SC) level, echoing a similar measure taken for Iraq through UN SC Resolution 1483 (2003). 2. The creation of "protected cultural zones" around major heritage sites as a way to reduce violence through negotiated 'freezes' of the hostilities, starting from places of shared cultural value, with the city of Aleppo as a pilot. 3. Stronger investment in access to quality education as the key to preventing further radicalization as well as to promoting respect for cultural diversity, pluralism and dialogue among different communities. 4. Wider ratification and stronger implementation of the 1954 Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict and its additional protocols, as well as putting an end to impunity for deliberate attacks against cultural heritage, which is recognized as a war crime under the Rome Statutes of the International Criminal Court. 5. An in-depth analysis of "cultural cleansing" as a process, including the relevance in its connection of the protection of human rights and the prevention of genocide.

- Outcomes: UNESCO is following up on these issues, in collaboration with relevant agencies and partners. In this regard, the Director-General of UNESCO announced at the Conference the launching of a multidirectional outreach campaign for the protection of Syrian and Iraqi cultural heritage. This campaign uses different means of communication from social media to the production of audio-visual materials in order to broadly disseminate UNESCO's message. This campaign also taps into the network of high-visibility museums (e.g. the Louvre), auction houses, as well as national and international media through the production of joint materials and social media campaigns.
- A report of the conference was made available online by UNESCO.<sup>117</sup>

#### Syrian Heritage in Crisis (16 Jan 2015)

The Council for British Research on the Levant (CBRL) sponsored a seminar on Syrian Heritage in Crisis at the British Academy. This was intended primarily as an awareness-raising event.

- Outcomes: Unknown / Unpublished.

#### The Cultural Heritage in Times of War (20 Feb 2015)

Seminar hosted by The Catalan Institute for Cultural Heritage Research (ICRPC). 119

- Outcomes: Unknown / Unpublished.

# A Crisis of Syrian cultural heritage and the efforts to safeguard it (21-22 Feb 2015)

The University of Tsukuba, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, organised this symposium sponsored by Japanese Agency for Cultural Affairs in Tokyo. Ten presentations

http://icrpc.cat/en/news/seminario-el-patrimonio-cultural-en-tiempos-de-conflictos-.html [Accessed 24/8/15]

UNESCO. 2015. *Heritage and Cultural Diversity at Risk in Iraq and Syria*. Available at: http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0023/002325/232562e.pdf [Accessed 24/08/15]

http://www.eventbrite.co.uk/e/syrian-heritage-in-crisis-tickets-14895445679 [accessed 17/10/15].

<sup>119</sup> ICRPC Website. Available at:

were given, three by the DGAM, aiming to raise awareness to the conflict and how it affects Syria and heritage in Japan. <sup>120</sup>

See also: *Meeting for Syria-Japan cooperation on safeguarding of the Syrian cultural heritage*, held in Beirut 15 March 2015, based on the previous Symposium in Tokyo (see above). <sup>121</sup>

- Outcomes: Unknown / Unpublished.

# The Past for Sale: Archaeological Looting: Realities and Possibilities for New Policy Approaches (27-28 Feb 2015)

Held at the Neubauer Collegium by the Chicago University. This conference brought together leading authorities to tackle these key questions: Who loots, and why? What is the impact of looting on objects, archaeological contexts, and nearby communities? How can we take steps to protect ancient art?<sup>122</sup>

- Outcomes: SAFE published reports on the conference, available online. 123

### Attempting to Protect Cultural Heritage in the Middle East (5-6 Mar 2015)

The King Fahd Center for Middle East Studies at the University of Arkansas held a conference on the Cultural Heritage Crisis in the Middle East. This conference brought together leading scholars with years of hands-on experience in the Middle East who discussed what has been lost, what remains under threat, and what might yet be done to track and, ultimately (if idealistically) preserve artefacts, texts and structures that speak to our past and that are part of our global cultural and civilizational heritage. 124

### U.N. Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice (Apr 2015)

The U.N. Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice addressed the topic of cultural heritage trafficking at its April meeting in Doha, Qatar. <sup>125</sup>

- Outcomes: *the Doha Declaration* on integrating crime prevention and criminal justice into the wider United Nations agenda to address social and economic challenges and to promote the rule of law at the national and international levels, and public participation

http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1603 [Accessed 21/08/15]

<sup>120</sup> DGAM Website. Available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> DGAM website. Available at: <a href="http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1621">http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1621</a> [Accessed 24/08/15]

The Past for Sale: Archaeological Looting: Realities and Possibilities for New Policy Approaches. Available at: <a href="http://neubauercollegium.uchicago.edu/events/uc/archaeological\_looting/">http://neubauercollegium.uchicago.edu/events/uc/archaeological\_looting/</a> [Accessed 24/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Huffer, D. 2015. The Heritage Landscape: Key Players and Current Issues (Notes on the Past for Sale Conference, 2015). SAFE website. 24/7/2015. Available at:

 $<sup>\</sup>underline{http://saving antiquities.org/the-heritage-landscape-key-players-and-current-issues-notes-on-the-past-for-sale-conference-2015/$ 

<sup>-</sup> The Heritage Landscape: Key Players and Current Issues (Notes on the Past for Sale Conference, 2015: Part 2). SAFE website. 08/07/2015. Available at: http://savingantiquities.org/past-for-sale-2/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

University of Arkansas Website. Available at: <a href="http://cavern.uark.edu/rd\_arsc/mest/8702.php">http://cavern.uark.edu/rd\_arsc/mest/8702.php</a> [Accessed 20/10/15]
 CulturalHeritageLawyer Website. Available at:

http://culturalheritagelawyer.blogspot.ca/2015/03/cultural-property-crime-on-un-agenda.html [Accessed 24/08/15]

(aka The Doha Declaration)<sup>126</sup>, which aimed, amongst many other things "to continue to support the implementation of capacity-building programmes and training for criminal justice officials aimed at preventing and countering terrorism in all its forms and manifestations, in line with human rights and fundamental freedoms, including with regard to [...] the destruction of cultural heritage by terrorists".

### UNESCO Meeting (1 Apr 2015)

UNESCO brought together key partners to step up safeguarding of Iraqi and Syrian Cultural Heritage. The meeting was attended by representatives from ICOM (International Council of Museums), ICOMOS (International Council on Monuments and Sites), ICCROM (International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and Restoration of Cultural Property), IFLA (International Federation of Library Associations), INTERPOL, UNODC (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime), UNIDROIT (International Institute for the Unification of Private Law) and WCO (World Customs Organization), as well as the Analytical Support and Sanctions Monitoring Team of the Security Council Al-Qaida Committee (SMT). 127

- Outcomes: Unknown / Unpublished.

### Stand for Syria, Arts Festival in Scotland (7-11 Apr 2015)

"Stand for Syria Arts Festival is a week's arts event on Syria in Scotland that envisioned creating a stronger awareness in Scotland of the peaceful and civic struggle of the Syrian civil society amongst all the violence. Spanning across movies, music, graffiti and arts exhibitions, this event also fundraised for Syrian refugees in Lebanon.<sup>128</sup>

### Culture in Crisis (14 Apr 2015)

The Victoria & Albert Museum (V&A) hosted an international conference to discuss the issue of Culture in Crisis. The V&A partnered with the Institute for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage at Yale University and operated under the patronage of UNESCO.

- Outcomes: Videos of the conference are available online. 129
- The participants of the conference have agreed to a number of recommendations. They have been approved by UNESCO and were presented at the World Heritage Council

http://www.un.org/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=A/CONF.222/L.6 [Accessed 17/10/15]

 $\frac{http://en.unesco.org/news/unesco-brings-together-key-partners-step-safeguarding-iraqi-and-syrian-cultural-heritage}{[Accessed 8/09/15]}$ 

Videos of the conference are also available:

https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLe2ihXndm5juIuR2xUhRsS7GZIVMTUtGk [Accessed 17/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> The *Doha Declaration* is available online here:

<sup>127</sup> UNESCO Website. Available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Stand for Syria: http://issuu.com/waseemalbahri/docs/stand\_for\_syria [Accessed 10/10/15]

Details of the conference are *V&A Culture in Crisis Website hub*. Available at: http://www.vam.ac.uk/content/articles/c/culture-in-crisis-conference,-april-2015/

Meeting in Bonn June 2015, and made available on the V&A Culture in Crisis internet hub. 130

# Cultural Genocide in Iraq and Syria (Apr 2015)

Public discussion about the destruction of museum artefacts, archaeological sites and historic buildings by the Islamic State.

- Outcomes: a summary of the discussion was covered by the Globe and Mail. 131

### Meeting of the United Nations Security Council (28 Apr 2015)

A meeting of the United Nations Security Council was convened by the Permanent Missions of Jordan and France to the United Nations, co-presidents of the Security Council. It was meant to identify innovative and practical ways to preserve cultural heritage following the recent adoption of UNSC Resolution 2199 - a resolution unanimously adopted by the Security Council in February to prevent terrorist groups from benefiting from trade in oil, antiquities and hostages and from receiving donations. <sup>132</sup>

- Outcomes: Unknown / Unpublished.

*Mobilization For Heritage: Iraq, Syria and other conflict-stricken countries* (6 May 2015) United Nations University and UNESCO brought together Iraqi officials, writers, poets, intellectuals and archaeologists. They discussed how to counter the forces that are destroying the world's heritage. <sup>133</sup>

- Outcomes: Unknown / Unpublished.

# The Heritage Heist Conference (18 May 2015)

The National Commission for UNESCO, the Honours Academy of Leiden University and the Centre for Global Heritage and Development host a conference on the protection of cultural heritage in war zones and during conflict in Leiden. The conference discussed two issues: stopping the destruction of cultural heritage, and the illicit trade in cultural artefacts.

The conference consisted of an afternoon workshop session for (honours) students and an evening program open to the general public. 134

http://www.vam.ac.uk/\_\_data/assets/pdf\_file/0006/256614/London-declaration-on-Culture-in-Crisis.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> V&A Recommendations

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Taylor, K. 2015. *Kate Taylor: Islamic State's assault on artifacts is more than vandalism*. The Globe and Mail. 17 April 2015. Available at:

http://www.theglobeandmail.com/arts/art-and-architecture/kate-taylor-islamic-states-assault-on-artifacts-is-more-than-vandalism/article24009806/ [Accessed 24/08/15]

FoxNews. 2015. *Interpol steps up search for ancient artefacts stolen in Syria and Iraq*. FoxNews.com Website. 28 April 2015. Available at:

http://www.foxnews.com/world/2015/04/28/interpol-steps-up-search-for-ancient-artifacts-stolen-in-syria-iraq/[Accessed 24/08/15]

<sup>133</sup> UNESCO Website. Available at:

http://en.unesco.org/events/mobilization-heritage-iraq-syria-and-other-conflict-stricken-countries [Accessed 9/09/2015]

- Outcomes: Unknown / Unpublished.

# Strategies for Restoration and Reconstruction: Museums, Heritage Sites and Archaeological Parks in Post-War Countries (25 Jun 2015)

Workshop held at the Bern University, Universität Schanze (UniS) by Shirīn and the Institute for Archaeological Sciences (IAW). The workshop took place within the framework of the 61e Rencontre Assyriologique Internationale (hosted by the International Association for Assyriology) taking place in Geneva and Bern. Groups including Shirīn, the DGAM, the Museum of Aleppo, the Syrian Heritage Archive Project and APSA presented the status of Syrian Antiquities during the conflict and some responses. <sup>135</sup>

- Outcomes: Unknown / Unpublished.

# 39th Session of the World Heritage Committee (28 Jun - 8 Jul 2015)

UNESCO meeting to discuss the status of the World Heritage sites and Syria's World Heritage sites in Danger. Recorded sessions of the World Heritage Committee, are available online. 136

# Krieg gegen die Zivilisation. Fördert der Handel mit Antiken den internationalen Terror? (War against civilization. Does the sale of antiques promote international terrorism?) (10 Jul 2015)

Discussion group organised by the Museum für Antike Schiffahrt des RGZM in Mainz. The question under discussion was whether the trade with antiquities benefits or boosts the international terror. The group was composed of an archaeologist, a detective chief superintendent, a politician, an author and former director of the History Museum in Philly/US and various media representatives. 137 138

- Outcomes: Unknown / Unpublished.

#### Berlin Meeting (31 Jul 2015)

A one-day meeting hosted by the Syrian Heritage Archive Project, held in Berlin, with the Museum für Islamische Kunst and the Deutsches Archäologisches Institut. Attendees included members of the DGAM. The workshop stressed how international efforts are complementary to the national efforts exerted by DGAM to protect the Syrian antiquities. It focused on the topics

The program is no longer available, but an advert for the conference is still available on Leiden University website: http://education.leiden.edu/illp/news/blog-the-heritage-heist-protecting-history.html [accessed 17/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> *RAI Website*. Available at: <a href="http://rai.unibe.ch/gb/strategies-for-restoration-and-reconstruction/">http://rai.unibe.ch/gb/strategies-for-restoration-and-reconstruction/</a> [Accessed 30/06/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> 39th World Heritage Committee: http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/39com/records/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>137</sup> *RGZM Website*. Available at:

http://web.rgzm.de/a/article/krieg-gegen-die-zivilisation-foerdert-der-handel-mit-antiken-den-internationalen-terror-1.html [Accessed 20/07/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Heritage *for* Peace would like to thank Aylin Polzer for the translation.

of digital archives, and damage assessment, as well as monitoring the art market and illicit trafficking. <sup>139</sup>

#### Recommendations:

- As all projects are already obliged to hand copies of any data generated during fieldwork to the DGAM, digital data of this type should be handed over as well.
- For future networking, multilingual databases are necessary. Arabic and English versions, if possible, must be developed.
- It was agreed that specific standards for recording the damage will be used, for example the guidelines similar to those of ICCROM, and standardised databases for damage assessment.
- Future work should also address the data synchronization of the individual initiatives.
- Since most initiatives focus on the tangible heritage while the situation of the intangible heritage is still neglected. Greater efforts to collect data of the intangible heritage would be important.
- Finally, it was agreed to hand over research data on the Syrian Cultural Heritage to the DGAM and to discuss the technical issues concerning data linking on various levels.
- UNESCO offered to act as a platform for further cooperation.

#### Outcomes:

- SYHER are signing MOUs for datasharing of damage documentation
- SYHER, UNESCO, ICOMOS, and Heritage *for* Peace are looking at ways to standardise documentation in line with European Standards. *See damage assessment*.
- A follow up technical meeting was held on 20-21 August for a "Digital inventory of Dayr az-Zor Museum".

### Digital inventory of Dayr az-Zor Museum (20-21 Aug 2015)

A meeting was held to discuss the digital inventory of Dayr az-Zor Museum. Attending parties were the DGAM, DAI, Islamic Museum, UNESCO, CIDOC (ICCROM).

Recommendations: data has to be prepared to be shared with Syrians (DGAM) and a priority is given to standards of data exchange, acknowledging the technical standard they have reached in database systems, and empowering the DGAM to improve their work with help from international actors. [Link not available].

Culture and development: towards a more strategic approach to cultural policies in the EU's external relations (3-4 Sep 2015)

Organised by Luxembourg Presidency of the Council of the European Union, Echternach, in Luxembourg.  $^{140}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> Minutes are available from Issam Ballouz, Syrian Heritage Project, Museum für Islamische Kunst]
<issam.ballouz@syrian-heritage.org>

- Various actions were announced: they are detailed under the relevant sections.
- Outcomes of the conference itself are unknown / unpublished.

#### Importance of Provenance Research and Cultural Heritage Protection (15-16 Sep 2015)

The Conference was organised by the European Shoah Legacy Institute, in cooperation with Mr. Pavel Svoboda MEP, the Chair of the European Parliament Committee on Legal Affairs. The conference discussed conflict looting and cultural heritage protection.

Representatives of over a dozen permanent representations, along with delegates from the European Commission and the Council of the European Union, and experts from both Europe and the United States, all attended. The concluding seminar brought together: experts and senior representatives of the world's leading museum (Smithsonian Institution); auction houses (Sotheby's and Christie's); provenance and restitution organisations (Dutch Restitution Committee, Conference on Jewish Material Claims Against Germany, Commission for Art Recovery (Europe)); and cultural heritage protection organisations (European Shoah Legacy Institute, Walk of Truth, Heritage for Peace). They discussed the issues surrounding conflict looting and restorative justice, and the role that the European Parliament can play in combatting the trafficking of plundered cultural heritage. Numerous MEPs and representatives of various parliamentary committees and delegations attended the conference. 141

- Outcomes: A press release summarised the topics covered in the conference. 142
- Outcomes: the decision of the Committee on Legal Affairs to commission a study into the
  viability and suitability of introducing legislation to the European Parliament to mandate
  provenance research as an indispensable mechanism to combat the trade in illicit
  antiquities and plundered cultural heritage.

http://www.eu2015lu.eu/en/actualites/ordres-jour/2015/09/conf-cult-dev/conf-cult-dev-odj.pdf [Accessed 10/10/15] Also see: A hidden gem: the role of culture in making Europe a stronger global actor. EC Europa Website. 03 September 2015. Available at:

http://ec.europa.eu/commission/2014-2019/navracsics/announcements/hidden-gem-role-culture-making-europe-stronger-global-actor\_en [Accessed 07/09/15]

Full details are available on the UK Blue Shield website;

http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/importance-of-provenance-research-and-cultural-heritage-protection/ [Accessed: 16/10/2015]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Culture and development: towards a more strategic approach to cultural policies in the EU's external relations. Conference program available at:

Importance of Provenance Research and Cultural Heritage Protection. The conference booklet is available here: http://shoahlegacy.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/Final-Booklet.pdf [accessed 17/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> 2015. Press Release about a conference and exhibition on conflict looting and the importance of provenance research to cultural heritage protection. European Shoah Legacy Institute. Available at: <a href="http://shoahlegacy.org/press-release-about-a-conference-and-exhibition-on-conflict-looting-and-the-importance-of-provenance-research-to-cultural-heritage-protection/">http://shoahlegacy.org/press-release-about-a-conference-and-exhibition-on-conflict-looting-and-the-importance-of-provenance-research-to-cultural-heritage-protection/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

# Fighting the Looting of Syria's Cultural Heritage (16-17 Sep 2015)

The conference aimed at exploring the joint efforts from the global community that are essential for protecting cultural heritage and curbing the looting and illicit trafficking of antiquities. The conference was organised by the Royal Norwegian Embassy in Sofia and the Norwegian Institute for Cultural Heritage Research under the patronage of UNESCO and in partnership with the Bulgarian Ministry of Culture, the Bulgarian Ministry of Interior, the Embassy of the Republic of Cyprus and the non-governmental organization "Walk of Truth" (the Netherlands). 143

- Outcomes: Unknown / Unpublished.

# Culture Under Threat: The Security, Economic and Cultural Impact of Antiquities Trafficking and Terrorist Financing (24 Sep 2015)

Conference held by The Asia Society and the Antiquities Coalition in New York, attended by Irina Bokova of UNESCO, numerous Middle Eastern Foreign Ministers, and many senior heritage figures. The first half of the conference consisted of presentations on the problem and possible solutions from Bokova and the Foreign Ministers. This was followed by a wide ranging panel discussion on a 'starting point' list of solutions provided by the Antiquities Coalition. The conference was broadcast live, and is available as a podcast. 144

#### Outcomes:

- The Antiquities Coalition and the Asia Society released summaries<sup>145</sup>, and Charles Jones wrote a summary of the conference on the CLIR Blog.<sup>146</sup>
- High level discussions took place following the meeting of potential solutions.

http://www.unesco.org/new/en/media-services/single-view/news/director\_general\_in\_sofia\_to\_participate\_in\_a\_con ference\_on\_fighting\_the\_looting\_of\_syrias\_cultural\_heritage/#.VhknPnpViko [Accessed 10/10/ 2015]

The programme is available here:

 $\underline{https://www.regjeringen.no/contentassets/d3ec84e76620418eb9d9d9921ba7a45c/programme-sofia---cultural-heritage-syria.pdf}$ 

<sup>144</sup> Culture Under Threat: The Security, Economic and Cultural Impact of Antiquities Trafficking and Terrorist Financing. Read about the conference on the Asia society webpage:

 $\underline{http://asiasociety.org/media/our-news/forum-address-destruction-and-looting-antiquities-across-middle-east}$ 

The videos of the conference are available here:

http://asiasociety.org/video/culture-under-threat-identifying-solutions-and-galvanizing-action-complete [Accessed 18/10/15]

<sup>145</sup> Press Release. 2015. *Unprecedented Forum Unites Global Government Leaders with Archaeology, Art, Museum Communities in Fight Against "Cultural Cleansing"*. The Antiquities Coalition Webpage. 25 Sep 2015. Available: <a href="http://theantiquitiescoalition.org/press-releases/unprecedented-forum-unites-global-government-leaders-with-archaeology-art-museum-communities-in-fight-against-cultural-cleansing/">http://theantiquitiescoalition.org/press-releases/unprecedented-forum-unites-global-government-leaders-with-archaeology-art-museum-communities-in-fight-against-cultural-cleansing/</a> [Accessed 18/10/15]

Fish, E. 2015. *Can the World Save Antiquities Under Terrorist Threat*? Asia Society Blog. 24 Sep 2015. Available at: <a href="http://asiasociety.org/blog/asia/can-world-save-antiquities-under-terrorist-threat#FW0J9TXqcqzBilUH.99">http://asiasociety.org/blog/asia/can-world-save-antiquities-under-terrorist-threat#FW0J9TXqcqzBilUH.99</a> [Accessed 18/10/15]

<sup>146</sup> Henry, C. 2015. *Culture Under Threat and Digital Libraries*. Council on Library and Information Resources Blog. 02/10/15. Available at:

http://connect.clir.org/blogs/charles-henry/2015/10/01/culture-under-threat-and-digital-libraries [accessed 18/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> UNESCO Website. Available at:

- The Antiquities Coalition have launched a Call to Action petition. (See Other).
- The Antiquities Coalition are creating a register for those interested in taking this further and assisting.

# Erasing the Past: Da'esh and the Crisis of Antiquities Destruction (24 Sep 2015)

The day-long conference, organised by the History and Religion departments of Wellesley College, brought interdisciplinary lecturers together in an effort to facilitate a narrative about the destruction of cultural heritage in the Middle East and how to respond.<sup>147</sup>

- Outcomes: A summary of the conference was published online. 148

# The Question of Syria (24-16 Sep 2015)

The Syrian Peace Action Centre hosted a 3-day event in Oslo with panel discussions and film screenings about resistance, art and revolution in Syria. They introduced the work of Syrian artists and intellectuals and cultural actors. 149

# Conflict Antiquities: Forging a Public/Private Response to Save Iraq and Syria's Endangered Cultural Heritage (29 Sep 2015)

Panel discussions organised by The Department of State, who continue to sponsor work to protect cultural heritage in conflict, and The Metropolitan Museum of Art highlighting the connection between Da'esh's looting and trafficking of antiquities and the financing of its terrorist operations (Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York). The first panel of the conference was broadcast live, and is available as a podcast.

There have been a number of summaries, releases and publications of this event, including slides of some presentations and significant new information about the looting conducted by Da'esh. Rather than including multiple weblinks here, UK Blue Shield has collated all of them on their conference summary website page. 150

- Outcomes: The Rewards for Justice programme announced they are offering a reward of up to \$5 million for information leading to the significant disruption of the sale and/or trade of oil and antiquities by the Islamic State. 151

Erasing the Past: Da'esh and the Crisis of Antiquities Destruction. Details are available here: <a href="http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/erasing-the-past-daesh-and-the-crisis-of-antiquities-destruction/">http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/erasing-the-past-daesh-and-the-crisis-of-antiquities-destruction/</a> [Accessed 10/10/015]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Patwa, Z. 2015. *Daesh's destruction of antiquities sparks interdisciplinary conference*. The Wellesley News. 03 October 2015. Available at: Accessed

 $<sup>10/10/15] \</sup>underline{the well es ley news. com/2015/10/03/daeshs-destruction-of-antiquities-sparks-interdisciplinary-conference/[linear conference/linear conferenc$ 

The Question of Syria: http://issuu.com/waseemalbahri/docs/the question of syria [accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> *UK Blue Shield Website: Conflict Antiquities*. Available at: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/conflict-antiquities-forging-a-publicprivate-response-to-save-iraq-and-syrias-endangered-cultural-heritage/ [Accessed 10 October 2015]

Act of Terror: Information that leads to the significant disruption of...Trafficking in Oil and Antiquities Benefiting the Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL). Available at: https://www.rewardsforjustice.net/english/trafficking oil and antiquities.html [Accessed 10/10/15]

# xix) Speeches / Talks

# 12th Conference on Conservation & Presentation of Mosaics (27-31 Oct 2014)

The DGAM team were invited to attend this conference, held in Sassari and Alghero (Sardinia). Dr Komait Abdellah gave a presentation on mosaic conservation and protection during the conflict 2012 to 2014. 152

# Protecting cultural heritage in crisis: Syria and Iraq (24 Feb 2015)

Talk given by Dr Kathryn Hanson at the American University of Rome. 153

### In the Eye of the Storm: Archaeology in the Midst of War in Syria (27 Feb 2015)

Talk given by the directors of Tell Mozan Archaeological Project, Dr Giorgio Buccellati and Dr Marilyn Kelly-Buccellati, at The School of Theology and Religious Studies of The Catholic University of America (Washington, D.C.). 154

# Cultural Heritage: Extremism's New Target (1 July 2015)

UNESCO DG Irina Bokova lectured at Chatham House on July 1 2015 on "Cultural Heritage: Extremism's New Target", followed by an expert panel discussing the issue. <sup>155</sup>

### Disappearing Cities of the Arab World (12 Jul 2015)

A conference organised at the British Museum. One of the sessions discussed Syrian cultural heritage in conflict, although this was not the focus of the day. 156

### What the World is Losing (27 Jul 2015)

Special talk with Dr Paul Collins, Curator of the Ancient Near East Collections at the Ashmolean Museum, as well as Dr Robert Bewley and Dr Emma Cunliffe from the University Of Oxford School Of Archaeology, held at the Ashmolean Museum Lecture Theatre. <sup>157</sup>

- Outcomes: although there were plans to podcast the event, none have been made available.

# The Heritage of Palmyra: in honour of Khalid al Asa'ad (19 Sept 2015)

This afternoon of short lectures was intended to honour the memory of Khaled al-As`ad, and was organised by the by the Near Eastern Archaeology Foundation, University of Sydney. 158

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: <a href="http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=314&id=1490">http://www.dgam.gov.sy/?d=314&id=1490</a> [Accessed 3/7/15]

The American University of Rome Website. Available at: http://www.aur.edu/blog/myevents/protecting-cultural-heritage-in-crisis-syria-and-iraq/ [Accessed 21/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> Crossroads Cultural Center Website. Available at: http://www.crossroadsculturalcenter.org/events/2015/2/27/in-the-eye-of-the-storm-archeology-in-the-midst-of-war-in-sy.html [Accessed 20/10/2015]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> UNESCO. 2015. *Irina Bokova at Chatham House: Culture must be at the Frontline of Peace*. UNESCO. 01 July 2015. Available at: en.unesco.org/news/irina-bokova-chatham-house-culture-must-be-frontline-peace-2 [accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> Shubbak Website. Available at: <a href="http://www.shubbak.co.uk/disappearing-cities-of-the-arab-world/">http://www.shubbak.co.uk/disappearing-cities-of-the-arab-world/</a> [Accessed 21/07/15]

<sup>157</sup> HeyEvent Website. Available at: http://heyevent.uk/event/nmycyjgae7eoka/what-the-world-is-losing-talk-with-dr-paul-collins-dr-robert-bewley-dr-e mma-cunliffe [Accessed 16/08/2015]

# A Discussion About Destruction And Looting Of Cultural Property In Syria And Iraq (22 Sep 2015)

Organisers: Art And Cultural Heritage Law Committee. Michael D. Danti, Academic Director of the ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiatives, chaired the discussion, which was also broadcast live, and could be accessed online. 159

# Protecting Cultural Heritage in Syria and Iraq (22 Sep 2015)

Dr Brian Daniels of the University of Pennsylvania delivered a lecture on the destruction of the archaeological sites in Iraq and Syria, including Palmyra at the Vanderbilt University (Nashville, TN). <sup>160</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> *The Heritage of Palmyra*. Details are still available on the UK Blue Shield website: http://ukblueshield.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/Palmyra-day-flyer-Sep-2015.pdf [Accessed 10/10/015]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> A Discussion About Destruction And Looting Of Cultural Property In Syria And Iraq. Details are still available on the UK Blue Shield website:

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/discussion-about-destruction-and-looting-of-cultural-property-in-syria-and-iraq/\ [Accessed 16/10/15]$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> Protecting Cultural Heritage in Syria and Iraq. Details are still available on the UK Blue Shield website: <a href="http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/forthcoming-conferences/protecting-cultural-heritage-in-syria-and-iraq/">http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/forthcoming-conferences/protecting-cultural-heritage-in-syria-and-iraq/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

### xx) Exhibitions

# Syrian Archaeological Treasures (Aug 2014)

An exhibition, titled "Syrian Archaeological Treasures", was organised by the Syrian Tourism Ministry in cooperation with Friends of Maaloula Association as part of the Syrian Tourism Day. It includes over 100 documented photos of Syrian landmarks before and after they were damaged by armed terrorist groups. It was held in Madrid. <sup>161</sup>

### The Battlefield Cultural Dangers (29 Sept 2014 – 10 Dec 2014)

This exhibition took place at the German-Arab Friendship Association (DAFG) in Berlin, in cooperation with Cultural Cooperation Int.e.V, Friends of the Old City of Aleppo and in coordination with the DGAM. The Exhibition focused on the damage in the Syrian archaeological sites, especially Old Aleppo and Old Homs. <sup>162</sup>

### Cultural Battlefield (29 Sep 2014)

Photo exhibition held at the Deutsch-Arabische Freundschaftsgesellschaft (Berlin) about the conflict in Syria and its impact on heritage and antiquities. <sup>163</sup>

#### Libertà o Terrorismo / Freedom or Terrorism (5-15 Feb 2015)

Photographic exhibition and discussion held at the church of St Maria in Cosmedin (Rome) about the distruction of the Syrian cultural heritage. <sup>164</sup>

### A Threatened Heritage (21 May 2015 – ongoing)

The Oriental Institute of Chicago organised a photo exhibition documenting threats to heritage and provides an outlook into possible ways to help prevent further losses and build a stronger future for the past. The exhibit consists of graphic panels interspersed throughout the permanent galleries, focussing on Mesopotamia (Iraq and Syria), the Southern Levant, Egypt, and Nubia. 165

### Syrian Archaeological Treasures: A Heritage for Humanity (Jun 2015)

A photo exhibition entitled "Syrian Archaeological Treasures: A Heritage for Humanity" was organized by the Syrian community in Italy in cooperation with the Syrian Tourism Ministry and European Front for Defending Syria. It showcased the scale of destruction inflicted by terrorists

Sabbagh, H. 2015. *UNWTO Secretary-General: Vandalism of Syrian heritage sites by terrorists unjustifiable.* SANA Website. 04 August 2014. Available at: <a href="http://www.sana.sy/en/?p=8971">http://www.sana.sy/en/?p=8971</a> [Accessed 06/08/14]

Khider, N. H.. 2015. *A Cultural Battle Field "an Exhibition in Berlin"*. The Syria Times Website. 20 October 2015. Available at: <a href="http://syriatimes.sy/index.php/culturt/14946-a-cultural-battle-field-an-exhibition-in-berlin">http://syriatimes.sy/index.php/culturt/14946-a-cultural-battle-field-an-exhibition-in-berlin</a> [Accessed 26/10/14]

and DGAM Website. Available at: <a href="http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1459">http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1459</a> [Accessed 15/06/15]

Weißenbach. M. 2014. *Ausstellung: "Schlachtfeld Kultur"*. Deutsch-Arabische Freundschaftsgesellschaft Website. 29 September 2014. Available at:

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{http://dafg.eu/de/aktuelles/news-home/?tx\_ttnews[tt\_news]=797\&cHash=52fcfbc98cdb9b95d228fd3697201e4d}{[Accessed 15/06/15]}$ 

Archaeology in Syria Facebook Page. Available at: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/Archaeology.in.Syria/photos/a.233347923430501.48648.227270824038211/735627629">https://www.facebook.com/Archaeology.in.Syria/photos/a.233347923430501.48648.227270824038211/735627629</a>

<sup>869192/?</sup>type=1&theater [Accessed 10/03/15]

165 A Threatened Heritage. Oriental Institute Website. Available at: <a href="https://oi.uchicago.edu/threatened-heritage">https://oi.uchicago.edu/threatened-heritage</a>
[Accessed 5/06/15]

on Syria's archaeological and historical sites. It concluded with a seminar on what is currently happening in Syria. The itinerant exhibition toured in several cities, including Rome, Catania, Lecce, Florence, and Caracas. 166

# Syria Widowed: Remembering Palmyra (22 Sep – 10 Dec 2015)

Organised by Professor Betsey Robinson and E.B. Armstrong, this exhibition, held at the Vanderbilt's Cohen Memorial Hall (Nashville, Tennessee), juxtaposes photographs of Palmyra in 1995 with engraved prints of temples, tombs, and cityscapes from L.-F. Cassas, "Voyage pittoresque de la Syrie, de la Phoenicie, de la Palaestine, et de la Basse Aegypte" I (1799). 167

### Importance of Provenance Research and Cultural Heritage Protection (15 Sep 2015)

The official opening of the exhibition gallery at the European Parliament occurred on the evening of 15th September. This exhibition on provenance research and cultural heritage protection aimed to address the inextricably linked themes of history, ownership, and possession that define our understanding of the nature and value of art and cultural property. The exhibition aimed to encourage audiences to explore their perceptions on the importance of inheriting, maintaining, and bestowing our shared cultural, intangible, and natural world heritage. 168

# The Missing: Reconstructing, Reshaping, and Recovering Vanished Cultural Property (9 Dec 2015 – 9 Feb 2016)

Appeal for information: One way to define cultural property is as objects with so powerful a connection to a community that they continue to influence that community's dreams, hopes, and self-definitions even after the physical objects themselves have disappeared. Our world today presents many examples of such disappearances, whether via theft, unauthorized sale, or even deliberate destruction. The show will focus on what happens after the disappearance – how artists and scholars express their love and need for the vanished objects through the creation of artworks that react to or refer to the objects, through the painstaking reconstruction of the objects, or through fights to repatriate objects taken from one culture and tantalizingly displayed, out of reach, in another country. The exhibition will run from December 9, 2015, to February 9, 2016, and will be accompanied by a symposium on a date to be determined. The exhibition will be held in the state-of-the-art Shiva Gallery at John Jay College of Criminal Justice (CUNY), a publically accessible gallery in the heart of Manhattan. If you know of artists whose work addresses missing cultural heritage or scholars or others who are attempting to reconstruct or digitally preserve cultural heritage who might be interested in participating in the exhibit or symposium, please let Dr Erin Thompson know at ethompson@jjay.cuny.edu.

Sabbagh, H. 2015. Syrian Archeological Treasures photo exhibition opens in Italian city of Asti. SANA Website.
 June 2015. Available at: <a href="http://sana.sy/en/?p=43828">http://sana.sy/en/?p=43828</a> [Accessed 10/06/15]
 Sabbagh, H. 2015. Syrian Archeological Treasures photo exhibition concluded in Rome. SANA Website.

February 2015. Available at: http://sana.sy/en/?p=28679 [Accessed 06/03/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> Syria Widowed: Remembering Palmyra. UK Blue Shield Website. [Accessed 10/10/15] Available at: <a href="http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/forthcoming-conferences/protecting-cultural-heritage-in-syria-and-iraq/">http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/forthcoming-conferences/protecting-cultural-heritage-in-syria-and-iraq/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> *Importance of Provenance Research and Cultural Heritage Protection*. See UK Blue Shield website: <a href="http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/importance-of-provenance-research-and-cultural-heritage-protection/">http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/importance-of-provenance-research-and-cultural-heritage-protection/</a> [Accessed: 16/10/ 2015]

# xxi) Awareness Raising: Other

The following groups were listed in previous reports, conducting awareness raising (and other) activities: see March 2014 report, and September 2014 report.

It is important to stress that a lack of updates below does not necessarily indicate an inactive group. Given the political sensitivities and complexities of the Syrian conflict, it is not always possible to publicise work.

- Aleppo Archaeology: Facebook group that continues to post updates. 169
- Alliance for the Restoration of Cultural Heritage (ARCH) International: The Working Group to Protect Syrian Heritage in Crisis<sup>170</sup>: Project status unknown, no updates on website since March 2014 report.
- *Arab British Centre (ABC)*: The ABC is continuing to raise awareness, for example sponsoring a conference that will discuss MENA heritage in conflict in October 2015. <sup>171</sup>
- *American Institute of Archaeology*: Continues to promote awareness of archaeology in conflict in Syria, and elsewhere, with sessions at its major annual conference. <sup>172</sup>
- *Archaeology in Syria Network*: This organisation promotes the protection of the Syrian archaeological heritage sharing updates, interviews, articles and other type of information on its website and Facebook page. <sup>173</sup>
- *Blue Shield*: UK Blue shield has launched a Facebook page which shares information on the damage to Syrian heritage via its page.<sup>174</sup>
- *BANEA*: Organisation that raises awareness of the damage to Syrian heritage via its Facebook page. <sup>175</sup>
- Cultural Heritage in Syria in the current conflict (Heritage in Syria in Danger)<sup>176</sup>: The project is still active the news section continues to be updated.
- *Division of Antiquities of the Free Council of Aleppo*<sup>177</sup>: The Facebook page has not been updated since April, but was not regularly updated, given the power / internet situation in Aleppo. Current status: unknown.
- Documenting the Injured Archaeological Sites of Homs: Page no longer active.
- Eyes to protect Syrian Heritage (a.k.a. Eyes on Heritage)<sup>178</sup>: The Facebook page has not been updated since May.

https://www.facebook.com/pages/Aleppo-Archaeology/459668177425042?sk=timeline

Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/Archaeology.in.Syria

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> Aleppo Archaeology Facebook page:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> ARCH Website: http://www.archinternational.org/index.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Arab British Centre Website: http://www.arabbritishcentre.org.uk/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> American Institute of Archaeology Website: http://www.archaeological.org/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Archaeology in Syria Network Website: http://ainsyria.net/

<sup>174</sup> UK Blue Shield Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/ukblueshield?ref=bookmarks

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> BANEA Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/BAneareastarch

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> Cultural Heritage in Syria in the current conflict Website: <a href="http://hisd.tors.ku.dk/">http://hisd.tors.ku.dk/</a>

Division of Antiquities of the Free Council of Aleppo Facebook page: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/Department.Archaeology">https://www.facebook.com/Department.Archaeology</a>

Eyes to protect Syrian Heritage Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/eyesonheritage

- Fides News Agency<sup>179</sup>: no Syrian updates.
- Friends of Maaloula: are continuing their awareness raising. 180
- Etilaf (a.k.a National Coalition for Syrian Revolutionary and Opposition Forces)<sup>181</sup>: the Facebook page has not been updated since July 2013.
- Global Heritage Fund<sup>182</sup>: the organisation remains extremely active in protecting heritage under threat, although have no specifically Syrian work that the authors are aware of.
- *Ila Souria*: Ila Souria continue to raise awareness on their Facebook Page. 183 We were unable to access the website at the time of going to press, but it is unclear whether it is no longer present, or was experiencing technical issues. We apologise that we cannot provide an update.
- *Institute du Monde Arabe*<sup>184</sup>: The IMA have run several events focussing on the conflict on Syria, but none have been specifically about the cultural heritage.
- *Oriental Heritage Without Borders*: No specifically Syrian updates, but the group continue to raise awareness of the importance of the heritage of the wider region. <sup>185</sup>
- National Research Institute for Cultural Properties, Tokyo<sup>186</sup>: The organisation continues to work with the DGAM to offer assistance where possible.
- Rescue the Old City of Aleppo: This Facebook group continues to post intermittent updates to raise awareness of Aleppo's heritage.<sup>187</sup>
- *SAADEH Cultural Foundation* <sup>188</sup>: No update available.
- *SAFE*: this group have continued to raise awareness of heritage destruction and loss across the world through a wide variety of methods. 189

Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/pages/Agenzia-Fides/166937210010364

Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/GlobalHeritageFund?fref=ts

Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/ila.souria?fref=ts

YouTube page: https://www.youtube.com/user/ilasouria [Accessed 10/10/15]

Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/institutdumondearabe

Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/ohwb.e.v?fref=ts

 $^{186}$  National Research Institute for Cultural Properties Website:

http://www.tobunken.go.jp/index\_e.html [Accessed 10/10/15]

Facebook page: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/Savingantiquities?fref=ts">https://www.facebook.com/Savingantiquities?fref=ts</a>

<sup>179</sup> Fides Website: http://www.fides.org/en

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> Friends of Maaloula Website: http://www.rahim.eu/maaloula/aboutus.html

ETILAF Facebook Page: https://www.facebook.com/SyrianInterimGovernment [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> Global Heritage Fund Website: http://globalheritagefund.org/

<sup>183</sup> Ila Souria Website: http://www.ilasouria.org/en/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> Institute du Monde Arab Website: http://www.imarabe.org/

Oriental Heritage Without Borders Website: http://ohwb.net/?page\_id=9

Rescue the Ancient City of Aleppo Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/rescue.aleppo

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> Saadeh Cultural Foundation: Website: http://saadehcf.org/Home.aspx [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> SAFE Website: http://www.savingantiquities.org/

- *Save Muslim Heritage*: this group have continued to work to raise awareness of the heritage of the region <sup>190</sup>. Specific results of some of their work will hopefully be published in the next volume.
- Schweizerische Gesellschaft für Orientalische Altertumswissenschaft Swiss Society for Ancient Near Eastern Studies (SGOA)<sup>191</sup>: No update available.
- *Syria is Here*<sup>192</sup>: No update available.
- Syrian Association for the Preservation of Archaeology and Heritage (SAPAH): the group continue to raise awareness via their Facebook page. 193
- *The Syria Campaign*: the group continue to promote the Syrian heritage on their webpage as part of wider awareness raising activities about the conflict. No information is available on the petition they circulated.
- *Syrian Club in Chile*: A "Syrian Tourism Day" was organised by the Syrian Club in Chile to draw awareness to the destruction of Syria's heritage. <sup>195</sup>
- Syrian Heritage Pages: the group continues to raise awareness via their Facebook Page. 196
- *The National Archives*: Included for completeness. No new UK legislation has been published.
- World Monuments Fund: This organisation has placed several major sites in Syria on its 'Watch List' of endangered sites and continues to monitor them and raise awareness of the damage to heritage, with regular updates.<sup>197</sup>

Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/SyriaIsHere.sy [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Save Muslim Heritage Website: <a href="http://savemuslimheritage.org.uk/">http://savemuslimheritage.org.uk/</a>
Facebook page: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/SaveMuslimHeritage">https://www.facebook.com/SaveMuslimHeritage</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> SGOA Website: http://sgoa.ch/en/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> Syria is Here Website: http://syriaishere.com/ar/index.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup> Syrian Association for the Preservation of Archaeology and Heritage Facebook Page: https://www.facebook.com/psahrteam/timeline [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> The Syria Campaign: Website: https://thesyriacampaign.org/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> 2015. *Syrian Tourism Day highlighting terror threat to cultural heritage held in Chile*. SANA. Available at: http://www.syriaonline.sy/?f=Details&pageid=18127&catid=27 [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> Syrian Heritage Pages Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/pages/Syrian-heritage-pages/373933192748748?sk=timeline [Accessed 10/10/15]

World Monuments Fund. See their webpage: <a href="https://www.wmf.org/project/cultural-heritage-sites-syria">https://www.wmf.org/project/cultural-heritage-sites-syria</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

# c) Laws, Legislation and Resolutions

# xxii) Implemented

United Nations Resolution 69/196: International Guidelines for Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice Responses with Respect to Trafficking in Cultural Property and Other Related Offences (Jan-Dec 2014)

UNESCO released guidelines for crime prevention and criminal justice responses with respect to trafficking in cultural property in January 2014<sup>198</sup>. The UN General Assembly officially adopted these guidelines on 18 December 2014 at the 69<sup>th</sup> session. <sup>199</sup>

# United Nations Security Council Resolution 2139 (22 Feb 2014)

This resolution primarily focussed on the escalating deterioration of the humanitarian situation, and called on all parties to immediately end all violence which has led to human suffering in Syria, save Syria's rich societal mosaic and cultural heritage, and take appropriate steps to ensure the protection of Syria's World Heritage Sites.<sup>200</sup> This was supported by a report of the Secretary-General on the implementation.<sup>201</sup>

# United Nations Security Council Resolution 2199 (2015) (12 Feb 2015)

Resolution adopted by the Security Council at its 7379th meeting. The resolution explicitly recognises the link between illicit traffic and security, outlaws all trade in cultural goods from Iraq and Syria, and requests that UNESCO coordinate efforts in this domain with Interpol. As part of this, UNESCO released a *Legal study on the protection of cultural heritage through the resolutions of the Security Council of the United Nations.* 203

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>198</sup> UNODC. 2014. *Draft specific guidelines for crime prevention and criminal justice responses with respect to trafficking in cultural property*. UNODC/CCPCJ/EG.1/2014/CRP.1. Available at: <a href="https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C</a> <a href="https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C</a> <a href="https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C</a> <a href="https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C</a> <a href="https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C</a> <a href="https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C</a> <a href="https://www.unodc.org/documents/organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C</a> <a href="https://www.unodc.organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C</a> <a href="https://www.unodc.organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C</a> <a href="https://www.unodc.organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.organized-crime/UNODC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C</a> <a href="https://www.unodc.organized-crime/UNDC\_CCPCJ\_EG.1\_2014\_C">https://www.unodc.organized-crime/UNDC\_CC

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> Resolution adopted by the General Assembly on 18 December 2014. 69/196. *International Guidelines for Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice Responses with Respect to Trafficking in Cultural Property and Other Related Offences*. Available at: <a href="http://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/69/196">http://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/69/196</a> [Accessed 30/01/15]

United Nations Security Council. *Resolution 2139 (2014)*. UN Website. Available at: <a href="http://www.un.org/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=S/RES/2139%282014%29">http://www.un.org/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=S/RES/2139%282014%29</a> [Accessed 6/06/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>201</sup> United Nations Security Council. 2014. *Report of the Secretary-General on the implementation of Security Council resolution 2139 (2014)*. 24 March 2014. Available at:

http://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=S/2014/208&referer=/english/&Lang=E [accessed 18/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> Resolution 2199 (2015). UN Website. Available at:

http://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=S/RES/2199%20%282015%29 [Accessed 28/02/15]

Négri, V. 2015. Legal study on the protection of cultural heritage through the resolutions of the Security Council of the United Nations. Cultural heritage through the prism of resolution 2199 (2015) of the Security Council. UNESCO. Available at:

http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/pdf/Study\_Negri\_RES2199\_01.pdf [Accessed 18/10/15]

# Thirteenth United Nations Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice (12-19 Apr 2015)

Declaration hold in Doha on integrating crime prevention and criminal justice into the wider United Nations agenda to address social and economic challenges and to promote the rule of law at the national and international levels, and public participation.<sup>204</sup>

# Law H.R.5703 - Protect and Preserve International Cultural Property Act (Passed 01 Jun 2015)

New law to protect and preserve international cultural property at risk of destruction due to political instability, armed conflict, or natural or other disasters, and for other purposes. H.R. 1493 would: direct the State Department to designate an existing employee to coordinate efforts to protect art around the world from being stolen and/or destroyed; establish a committee, which will meet once a year and be made up of representatives from various Federal agencies, who will "coordinate and inform Federal efforts to protect international cultural property"; block importation of "archaeological or ethnological material of Syria" starting 120 days after the bill's enactment. The import restrictions would expire in five years, but can be extended. 205

### Iran and Syria sign MOU to fight illicit trafficking (22 Jun 2015)

Iran and Syria signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on 22 June on cooperation in domestic security, and the fight against terrorism and its financing. The MoU also calls for cooperation against the stealing of antiquities. A future meeting is planned to include Iraq. <sup>206</sup>

# xxiii) Proposed

# EU: Regulation of the import of cultural goods (3 Sep 2015)

The EU is considering putting forward legislation that would regulate the import of cultural goods into the EU. As a first step, they will launch a study on gaps in national legislations in this area in 2016. <sup>207</sup>

# European Parliament Legislation to combat the illicit antiquities trade

At the *Importance of Provenance Research and Cultural Heritage Protection* Workshop (15-16 September), the decision of the Committee on Legal Affairs was to commission a study into the viability and suitability of introducing legislation to the European Parliament to mandate

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> In *UNODC Website*. Available at:

http://www.unodc.org/documents/congress/Documentation/ACONF222\_L6\_e\_V1502120.pdf [Accessed 1/05/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> Congress.Gov Website. Available at: <a href="https://www.congress.gov/bill/113th-congress/house-bill/5703/text">https://www.congress.gov/bill/113th-congress/house-bill/5703/text</a> [Accessed 21/08/14]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>206</sup> 2015. *Iran, Syria sign security cooperation MOU*. Kuwait News Agency. 22 June 2015. Available at: http://www.kuna.net.kw/ArticleDetails.aspx?id=2447891&language=en [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> A hidden gem: the role of culture in making Europe a stronger global actor. 03 September 2015. EC Europa Website. Available at:

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{http://ec.europa.eu/commission/2014-2019/navracsics/announcements/hidden-gem-role-culture-making-europe-stronger-global-actor\_en~[Accessed~07/09/15]$ 

provenance research as an indispensable mechanism to combat the trade in illicit antiquities and plundered cultural heritage.<sup>208</sup>

# UK ratification of the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in Armed Conflict (2015 – ongoing)

In a speech in summer 2015, UK Secretary of Culture, John Whittingdale, announced plans for the UK to (finally) ratify the convention. At present, they are the only permanent member of the UN Security Council not to do so. It should be noted that this promise has been made, and broken, several times before, and the legislation has apparently already been pushed out of this year's parliamentary sessions into next year.<sup>209</sup>

# USA S.1887 - Protect and Preserve International Cultural Property Act (Introduced 29/07/2015)

This important legislation directs the Department of State to designate a Department employee at the Assistant Secretary level or above to serve concurrently as the U.S. Coordinator for International Cultural Property Protection to: coordinate and promote federal agency efforts to address international cultural property protection activities; support activities to assist countries that are the principal sources of trafficked cultural property to protect cultural heritage sites and to prevent cultural property looting and theft; develop strategies to reduce illegal trade and trafficking in international cultural property in the United States and abroad, including by reducing consumer demand for such trade; and chair the Coordinating Committee on International Cultural Property Protection.

It establishes a Coordinating Committee on International Cultural Property Protection to facilitate the Coordinator's work. It directs the Department, through the U.S. Coordinator for International Cultural Property Protection, to report to Congress annually for seven years regarding activities of the U.S. Coordinator and the Coordinating Committee, the Department, the U.S. Agency for International Development, the Department of Defence, the Department of Homeland Security, and the Department of Justice to protect international cultural property. It authorizes any agency involved in international cultural property protection activities to enter into agreements with the Smithsonian Institution to engage Smithsonian personnel temporarily to assist in such activities.

It directs the President to apply specified import restrictions with respect to any archaeological or ethnological material of Syria as if Syria were a State Party to the Convention on prohibiting and preventing the illicit import, export, and transfer of ownership of cultural property. It sets forth the conditions for termination of such restrictions. It authorizes the President to waive such

European Parliament Legislation to combat the illicit antiquities trade. The conference booklet is available here: <a href="http://shoahlegacy.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/Final-Booklet.pdf">http://shoahlegacy.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/09/Final-Booklet.pdf</a> [accessed 17/10/15]

Full details are available on the UK Blue Shield website;

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/importance-of-provenance-research-and-cultural-heritage-protecti}{on/} \left[Accessed: 16/10/2015\right]$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> 2015. *British Government Announces Plans to Ratify the 1954 Hague Convention*. UK Blue Shield website. Available at: <a href="http://ukblueshield.org.uk/british-government-announces-plans-to-ratify-the-1954-hague-convention/">http://ukblueshield.org.uk/british-government-announces-plans-to-ratify-the-1954-hague-convention/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

import restrictions for specified cultural property if the President certifies to Congress that: the foreign owner or custodian of the specified cultural property has requested that such property be temporarily located in the United States for protection purposes; such property shall be returned upon request to the foreign owner or custodian, and the grant of a waiver will not contribute to illegal trafficking in cultural property or financing of criminal or terrorist activities.

Currently (07/29/2015) the legislation has been read twice and referred to the Committee on Foreign Relations.<sup>210</sup>

# USA H.R.2285 - Prevent Trafficking in Cultural Property Act (Introduced 05/13/2015)

This legislation refers to the enforcement and domestic implementation of the previous Act. IT declares that it is U.S. policy to: (1) ensure that U.S. Customs and Border Protection (CBP) and U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) enhance and unify their efforts to interdict, detain, seize, and investigate cultural property illegally imported into the United States, disrupt and dismantle smuggling and trafficking networks engaged in or facilitating illegal trade in cultural property, and support Offices of U.S. Attorneys in prosecuting persons engaged in such illegal trade; and (2) protect cultural property pursuant to U.S. obligations under international conventions.

It requires the CBP and ICE to each designate a principal coordinator or group of personnel to direct, manage, coordinate, and update their respective policies and procedures, and conduct interagency communications, regarding illegally imported cultural property. Directs the CBP and ICE to update and devise directives, regulations, rules, and memoranda of understanding relating to policies and procedures on the illegal importation of cultural property in order to: (1) reflect changes in cultural property law, (2) emphasize investigating, and providing support for investigations and prosecutions of, persons engaged in or facilitating the illegal importation of cultural property, and (3) provide for communication, coordination, and unity of effort between relevant CBP and ICE offices in investigating and supporting prosecutions of such individuals.

It Requires the CBP and ICE to ensure that all CBP and ICE personnel involved in interdicting and investigating the illegal importation of cultural property receive sufficient training in relevant cultural property laws, the identification of cultural property from regions that are at greatest risk of looting and trafficking, and methods of interdiction and investigative techniques specifically related to illegal trade in cultural property.

It requires the Department of Homeland Security (DHS) to ensure that the heads of all DHS components involved in cultural property protection activities are authorized to enter into agreements or memoranda of understanding to temporarily engage personnel from the Smithsonian Institution to further cultural property protection activities.

As of 16 June 2015, it has been referred to the Subcommittee on Crime, Terrorism, Homeland Security, and Investigations. <sup>211</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>210</sup> Congress.Gov Website. Available at: <a href="https://www.congress.gov/bill/114th-congress/senate-bill/1887">https://www.congress.gov/bill/114th-congress/senate-bill/1887</a> [Accessed 18/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> Congress.Gov Website. Available at: <a href="https://www.congress.gov/bill/114th-congress/house-bill/2285">https://www.congress.gov/bill/114th-congress/house-bill/2285</a> [Accessed 18/10/15]

# Proposed law in Germany to crack down on antiquity theft (12 Dec 2014)

The federal government aims to make it such that the import and trade of cultural goods to Germany will only be open to objects with an official export license from their country of origin. The new law is scheduled to come into effect in 2016.<sup>212</sup>

### Mailing list for further information

The Anonymous Swiss Collector Webpage has created a list of opportunities and a mailing list related to opportunities and conferences in the fields of art crime, antiquities trafficking, provenance studies, art authentication, repatriation and cultural property law.<sup>213</sup>

### V&A Culture in Crisis Programme

The Museum is working closely to support law-enforcement, nationally and internationally, and the British Armed forces to develop strategies to prevent the illicit trade of cultural goods.<sup>214</sup>

Jedicke, P. 2014. *Germany attracts trade in looted artifacts*. DW Website. 24 October 2014. Available at: http://www.dw.com/en/germany-attracts-trade-in-looted-artifacts/a-18019083 [Accessed 17/09/15]

Also see 2015. Looted in Mosul, sold in Munich? Germany's clampdown on illicit trade. Dalje.com. 30 July 2015. Available at:

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{\text{http://arhiva.dalje.com/en-world/looted-in-mosul-sold-in-munich-germanys-clampdown-on-illicit-trade/551803}{[Accessed 10/10/15]}$ 

Anonymous Swiss Collector - Subscribe here: http://www.anonymousswisscollector.com/opportunities

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> Culture in Crisis Programme. V&A webpage. Available at: http://www.vam.ac.uk/content/articles/v/the-v-and-as-culture-in-crisis-programme/ [Accessed 19/10/15]

# d) Training / Courses

This section covers only course courses that have taken place in the period covered by the report. Additional courses are covered in previous reports.

# Museum disaster preparedness and risk mitigation in the event of disaster or conflict (29 Sep 2014)

Regional capacity building course that took place over 2 days with participants from the DGAM. The meeting aimed to understanding the emerging needs for protecting endangered cultural heritage in the MENA region and developing a training programme for protecting cultural heritage in the mentioned region. It also considered roles and responsibilities for pre-course preparation and post-course follow up. Organised by ICCROM-ATHAR. The meeting was followed on 7-22 December 2014 by a training workshop in Cairo organised by the Egyptian Earth Construction Association (EECA) and The Egyptian Heritage Rescue Foundation (EHRF) with a cooperation of ICCROM-ATHAR Centre in Sharjah, UNESCO Cairo office, ICOM (International Council of Museums) and Ministry of Archaeology in Egypt. 215

# Illicit Trafficking in the Syrian Cultural Heritage (10-14 Nov 2014)

This training occurred in the framework of the EU funded project *The Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage*, UNESCO, and was to train of police and customs officers in Syria and adjacent countries to fight illicit trafficking of Syrian cultural properties. The training was to include normative presentations focusing on international treaties and conventions and national legislation for the protection of cultural heritage and interactive group exercises on the use of existing tools to prevent illicit trafficking.<sup>216</sup> The training document is available online.<sup>217</sup>

### First Aid for Cultural heritage (23-26 Nov 2014)

Damage Assessment Training for Staff of the Syrian Interim Ministry of Culture and Family Affairs held in Turkey by Heritage for Peace<sup>218</sup>.

# Protect Movable Heritage during and after the Conflict and Protect the Museums from Looting (26-30 Jan 2015)

In the framework of the project *Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage*, the UNESCO office in Beirut organised a 4-day training to protect movable heritage during and after the conflict and protect the museums from looting.<sup>219</sup>

In UNESCO Website. Available at:

http://www.unesco.org/new/en/culture/themes/illicit-trafficking-of-cultural-property/capacity-building/arab-states/beirut-2014/ [Accessed 8/09/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> In *DGAM Website*. Available at: <a href="http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1429">http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1429</a> [Accessed 9/03/15]

<sup>216</sup> *Illicit Trafficking in the Syrian Cultural Heritage* - In *DGAM Website*. Available at: http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1488 [Accessed 3/07/15].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> *Illicit Trafficking in the Syrian Cultural Heritage* training document: <a href="http://whc.unesco.org/document/134584">http://whc.unesco.org/document/134584</a> [Accessed 19/10/15]

Heritage for Peace Website. Available at: <a href="http://www.heritageforpeace.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/12/Damage-Assessment-Press-Release-1-December.pdf">http://www.heritageforpeace.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/12/Damage-Assessment-Press-Release-1-December.pdf</a> [Accessed 6/7/15]

# 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage (9-13 Feb 2015)

UNESCO Office in Beirut organised a training workshop to familiarise participants with the concept of intangible cultural heritage and raise their awareness regarding the key safeguard measures with emphasis on community participation, and tools integrated in the UNESCO 2003 Convention. <sup>220</sup>

### First Aid to Build Cultural Heritage in Syria (1-10 Jun 2015)

UNESCO, together with ICCROM-ATHAR, and the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage - Bahrain (ARC-WH) organised a training for Syrian professionals in Beirut, Lebanon, with the aim to establish national teams capable of undertaking emergency response interventions to secure endangered built cultural heritage, as well as training other teams within the country. <sup>221</sup>

# Short Course: Islamic Manuscript Collections in Conflict Zones: Safeguarding Written Heritage (5-7 Oct 2015)

Organised by The Islamic Manuscript Association in partnership with the Royal United Services Institute, with the support of the Thesaurus Islamicus Foundation, Harvard University, and Boston College. This intensive three-day programme will introduce the concepts and mechanisms that underpin cultural property protection (and destruction) in the present day and educate participants in best practices of managing, protecting, and preserving manuscript collections at risk.<sup>222</sup>

http://www.unesco.org/new/en/beirut/single-view/news/unesco\_trains\_syrian\_professionals\_on\_securing\_movable\_heritage#.Ve9EM5f-UhQ [Accessed 8/09/15]

http://www.unesco.org/new/en/beirut/single-view/news/unesco\_2003\_convention\_saving\_the\_syrian\_living\_heritage="." e#.VfAD9Jf-UhQ [Accessed 9/10/2015]

http://www.unesco.org/new/en/beirut/single-view/news/twenty\_three\_syrian\_experts\_trained\_on\_safeguarding\_cult ural\_built\_heritage\_in\_syria#.VfAD\_Jf-UhQ [Accessed 9/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>219</sup> DGAM Website. Available at: <a href="http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1576">http://www.dgam.gov.sy/index.php?d=314&id=1576</a> [Accessed 21/08/15] and UNESCO Website at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>220</sup> In *UNESCO Website*. Available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>221</sup> In *UNESCO Website*. Available at:

<sup>222</sup> Short Course: Islamic Manuscript Collections in Conflict Zones - details available here:
<a href="http://www.islamicmanuscript.org/courses/islamic-manuscript-collections-in-conflict-zones.aspx">http://www.islamicmanuscript.org/courses/islamic-manuscript-collections-in-conflict-zones.aspx</a> [Accessed 16/10/15]

# e) Military Operations

### V&A Culture in Crisis Programme

The Museum is working closely to support law-enforcement, nationally and internationally, and the British Armed forces to develop strategies to prevent the illicit trade of cultural goods. <sup>223</sup>

# f) Academic Publications

This section contains a list of publications about the conflict since 2014. Some of them were probably published during the period covered by previous reports, but we have only just become aware of them. It is by no means comprehensive, but we hope it may be of some assistance.

- Bauer, A. 2015. Editorial: The Destruction of Heritage in Syria and Iraq and Its Implications. *International Journal of Cultural Property* 22 (1), 1-6.
- Brodie, N. 2015. Syria and Its Regional Neighbors: A Case of Cultural Property Protection Policy Failure? *International Journal of Cultural Property* 22 (2-3), 317-335.
- Burns, R. 2014. Protecting the Cultural Heritage. Critical Muslim July-Sept 2014, 103-112.
- Danti, M. and MacGinnis, J. 2015. Prophet and Profit. World Current Archaeology 71. 224
- Casana, J. and Panahipour, M. 2014. Satellite-Based Monitoring of Looting and Damage to Archaeological Sites in Syria. *Journal of Eastern Mediterranean Archaeology & Heritage Studies* 2 (2), 128-151.
- Cunliffe, E. 2014. Archaeological Site Damage in the Cycle of War and Peace: A Syrian Case Study. *Journal of Eastern Mediterranean Archaeology & Heritage Studies* 3 (2), 229-247.
- Drazewska, B. 2015. The Human Dimension of the Protection of the Cultural Heritage from Destruction During Armed Conflicts. *International Journal of Cultural Property* 22 (2-3), 205-228.
- Guidetti, M. and Perini, S. 2015. Civil War and Cultural Heritage in Syria, 2011-2015. *Syrian Studies Association Bulletin* 20 (1). 225
- Hardy, S. A. 2015. Is Looting-to-Order "Just a Myth"? Open-Source Analysis of Theft-to-Order of Cultural Property. *Cogent Social Sciences* 1 (1). Open-access. <sup>226</sup>
- Howard, R., Prohov, J. and Elliott, M. 2015. Digging in and Trafficking Out: How the Destruction of Cultural Heritage Funds Terrorism. *CTC Sentinel, Combating Terrorism Center* February 2015, 14-18.

http://www.vam.ac.uk/content/articles/v/the-v-and-as-culture-in-crisis-programme/ [Accessed 19/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>223</sup> Culture in Crisis Programme. V&A webpage. Available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>224</sup> Available at: http://www.world-archaeology.com/world/asia/iraq/prophet-and-profit.htm [Accessed 20/10/15]

Available at: https://ojcs.siue.edu/ojs/index.php/ssa/article/view/3115/1129

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>226</sup> Available at: http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/23311886.2015.1087110 [Accessed 15/10/15]

- Lababidi, R. 2015. The International Protection of Cultural Heritage in Times of Conflict: Efficient or Deficient. *News in Conservation* 46.<sup>227</sup>
- Miznazi, D. 2015. Post-Conflict Reconstruction of Old Aleppo. *News in Conservation*. [Online]. <sup>228</sup>
- Moreland, A. 2015. *In the Absence of Sovereignty, How Will Isis Be Held Accountable for Their Crimes?* [Online]: University of Miami School of Law.<sup>229</sup>
- Morris, I. 2015. The Struggle for Soft Power in the Middle East. *Stratfor Global Intelligence* (9 September 2015). <sup>230</sup>
- Phillips, C. 2015. Sectarianism and Conflict in Syria. *Third World Quarterly* 36 (2), 357-376. Sahner, C. 2014. *Among the Ruins: Syria Past and Present*. Oxford: Oxford University Press

*Near Eastern Archaeology* published a special open-access volume: The Cultural Heritage Crisis in the Middle East (Vol. 78, No. 3), containing a number of very useful articles on that central theme. The special issue is open access free-of-charge thanks to ASOR.<sup>231</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> Available at: https://www.iiconservation.org/node/5495 [Accessed 30/03/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> Available at: https://www.iiconservation.org/node/5495 [Accessed 30/03/15]

Available at: http://nsac.law.miami.edu/absence-sovereignty-isis-held-accountable/ [Accessed 30/05/2015]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>230</sup> Available at: https://www.stratfor.com/sample/weekly/struggle-soft-power-middle-east [accessed 18/10/15]

Available at: http://www.istor.org/stable/10.5615/neareastarch.78.issue-3 [Accessed 16/10/15]

# g) Others

### ARCA Blog offers opportunity for heritage lovers to pay tribute

The ARCA blog issued a call for tributes from heritage lovers, offering them the opportunity to express their sorrow, and pay tribute to what is being lost. These are collated on their blog – *In Memoriam: The Heritage Community Speaks Out on Destruction in Syria and Iraq* (4 Sept 2015)

Due to the high response, they are displaying only some of the many statements and tributes given, and have linked to their original sources when not directly submitted.

If you would like to contribute a new quote of 250 words or less please follow them on Twitter at @ARCA\_artcrime or ARCA on Facebook and leave us your thoughts in a message and they will post it formally.<sup>232</sup>

### Call to Action Appeal (issued 24 Sep 2015)

At their Culture Under Threat forum on 24 Sep, the Antiquities Coalition launched a Call to Action petition on Change.org.<sup>233</sup> The appeal addresses the United Nations Security Council, International Criminal Court, and International Governments and calls on them to:

- The United Nations to formulate action plans to address "cultural cleansing"
- The International Criminal Court to launch a war crimes investigation against those entities that engage in "cultural cleansing"
- The international community, to support states in protecting, preserving, and documenting items of cultural heritage endangered by armed conflicts
- A global campaign to raise awareness about the purchase of conflict antiquities and terrorist financing
- All governments to take steps to prevent the trade in conflict antiquities
- All actors involved in the cultural property trade to be vigilant when obtaining antiquities from countries in conflict

#### Culture Under Threat Videos

The Antiquities Coalition is launching a video series titled, "*Culture Under Threat: Terrorism and Profiteering*," It features international experts offering solutions to and analysis of the looting crisis, illicit antiquities trade, and its connection to terrorism. Videos are available on the Antiquities Coalition website. <sup>234</sup>

http://art-crime.blogspot.co.uk/2015/09/in-memoriam-heritage-community-speaks.html [Accessed 7/09/15]

https://www.change.org/p/united-nations-security-council-international-criminal-court-international-governments-a-call-to-action-to-protect-the-world-s-cultural-heritage-d2a2d438-e6ac-4386-b090-aaf2f4f6ccd0

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> In *ARCA Website*. Available at:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>233</sup> The petition is available here:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>234</sup> Culture Under Threat: Terrorism and Profiteering - <a href="http://theantiquitiescoalition.blogspot.ca/2015/06/introducing-antiquities-coalitions-new\_23.html">http://theantiquitiescoalition.blogspot.ca/2015/06/introducing-antiquities-coalitions-new\_23.html</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

#### The Dead Sea Accord

The World Archaeological Congress has agreed and published *The Dead Sea Accord*, an ethical statement that outlines the "WAC Accord on the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict". <sup>235</sup>

### EAA Response to Devastation of Cultural Heritage in the Middle East

The Executive Board of the European Association of Archaeologists (EAA) issued a statement regarding the EAA's response to the Devastation of Cultural Heritage in the Middle East: The EAA therefore adheres

- to the complaints of archaeologists and of civil society in the Middle East, as well as of the authorities of the member-states of UNESCO;
- to the appeals of the Director-General of UNESCO, Dr. Irina Bokova,
- to the resolutions of the UN Security Council,
- to the joint statement issued by AAMD, AIA, ASOR, AAA and the Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago, in order to support the most effective measures for the protection of Cultural Heritage in the Middle East, even in these situations of instability, and the pursuit of every case of damage, looting and illicit trafficking of goods. <sup>236</sup>

# The Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage (1 Mar 2014 – 1 Mar 2017) (see also September 2014 Report)

The UNESCO and European Union funded project aims to provide an operational response to halt the on-going loss of cultural heritage and prepare post-conflict priority actions in Syria. This project is part of a three-year project.

- Monitor and assess the cultural heritage situation in Syria through updated and continued knowledge and documentation through the establishment of an International Observatory of Syrian Cultural Heritage (See Damage Assessment and Documentation, and Illicit Trafficking).
- Mitigate the destruction and loss of Syrian cultural heritage through national and international awareness-raising efforts (eg the #UNITEFORHERITAGE Campaign)
- Protect and safeguard Syrian cultural heritage through enhanced technical assistance and capacity-building for national stakeholders and beneficiaries. (See Training Courses, and Reconstruction, in addition to the many other meetings, etc UNESCO have supported and attended).

Dead Sea Accord on the ethics of acting in armed conflict. 3 March 2015. Available at: <a href="http://www.worldarchaeologicalcongress.org/about-wac/codes-of-ethics/635-the-dead-sea-accord">http://www.worldarchaeologicalcongress.org/about-wac/codes-of-ethics/635-the-dead-sea-accord</a> [Accessed 21/08/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>236</sup> The Executive Board of the European Association of Archaeologists (EAA). 2015. Statement regarding the EAA's response to the Devastation of Cultural Heritage in the Middle East March/April 2015. Available at: <a href="http://e-a-a.org/docs/EAA\_statement.pdf">http://e-a-a.org/docs/EAA\_statement.pdf</a> [Accessed 24 /08/15]

Details are available on their website.<sup>237</sup> In addition, a summary the actions taken in Year One is available online.<sup>238</sup>

# UNESCO #Unite4Heritage Campaign (8 Apr 2015)

UNESCO's #Unite4Heritage project was inaugurated during Irina Bokova's visit to the University of Baghdad in Iraq. The project aims to unite forces through the social media network Twitter to protect cultural heritage threatened by war and fight against the smuggling of cultural artefacts, she said. The UNESCO chief has recently called on more young people to join in cultural heritage protection activities and fight the destruction of world heritage and the smuggling of cultural artefacts. <sup>239</sup>

# Institute for Cultural Diplomacy (ICD):

Whilst the ICD does not appear to have carried out any specifically Syrian activities, they have carried out a number of events on the wider themes of strengthening international relations and encouraging cooperation between diverse communities based upon values of peace, democracy, human rights and the rule of law.<sup>240</sup>

### Islamic Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization (ISESCO)

ISESCO have carried out a number of projects for the wider MENA region. Although these encompass Syria, readers are recommended to check their website. <sup>241</sup>

# Syria Cultural Heritage Initiative, Cultural Heritage Centre

The Bureau of Education and Cultural Affairs, a Branch of the American Department of State, has set up a Syrian Cultural Heritage Initiative as part of the work of its Cultural Heritage Centre<sup>242</sup>. This initiative has significantly contributed to the conference Conflict Antiquities: Forging a Public/Private Response to Save Iraq and Syria's Endangered Cultural Heritage. In addition, the Department of State has donated significant funding to other projects to protect the heritage of the Middle East.

See also updates on this project at: <a href="http://www.unesco.org/new/en/safeguarding-syrian-cultural-heritage/">http://www.unesco.org/new/en/safeguarding-syrian-cultural-heritage/</a> [Accessed 9/09/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>237</sup> The Emergency Safeguarding of the Syrian Cultural Heritage Available at: <a href="https://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/emergency-safeguarding-syrian-cultural-heritage-project#sthash.DTqShwgz.dpuf">https://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/emergency-safeguarding-syrian-cultural-heritage-project#sthash.DTqShwgz.dpuf</a> and <a href="https://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/">https://en.unesco.org/syrian-observatory/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> Summary of Actions taken in Year 1 of the Project are available as pdf at: http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/pdf/UNESCO\_Safeguarding\_Syrian\_Cultural\_Heri tage.pdf [Accessed 9/09/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>239</sup> Xinhua News Agency. 2015. UNESCO chief calls on young people to join in cultural heritage protection efforts. *Global Post Website*. 08/04/2015. Available at:

 $http://www.globalpost.com/article/6509176/2015/04/08/unesco-chief-calls-young-people-join-cultural-heritage-protection-efforts \ [Accessed 24/08/15]$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>240</sup> Institute for Cultural Diplomacy website: <a href="http://www.culturaldiplomacy.org/index.php?en">http://www.diplomaziaculturale.it/priorita-cultura/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>241</sup> ISESCO Website: http://www.isesco.org.ma/index.php?lang=en

Syrian Cultural Heritage Initiative website: http://eca.state.gov/cultural-heritage-center/syria-cultural-heritage-initiative [Accessed 10/10/15]

# Manar al-Athar open-access photo-archive (ongoing)

The Manar al-Athar open-access photo-archive at the University of Oxford that provides more than 17,000 high resolution, searchable images, freely downloadable for teaching, research, heritage projects, and publication. It covers buildings and art in the areas of the former Roman empire which later came under Islamic rule (e.g. Syro-Palestine/the Levant, Arabia, Egypt, and North Africa), from ca. 300 BC to the present, but especially Roman, late antique, and early Islamic art, architecture, and sacred sites. Material is labelled in both English and Arabic. They could be of particularly use in damage assessment comparisons and reconstruction. 243

White House March to stop Da'esh from destroying what remains of Mesopotamian Civilization (10 Mar 2015)

March organised by Jabbar Jaafar and Abdul Amir Al Hamdani. 244

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>243</sup> Manar al-Athar archive: http://www.manar-al-athar.ox.ac.uk/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup> In SAFE Website. Available at: http://savingantiquities.org/whitehouse-march-stop-isis/ [Accessed 21/08/15]

#### **Conclusions**

The following table offers a summary of the number of the national and international initiatives currently undertaken as divided into type of action. Many of these initiatives are now signing agreements to merge, and we stress again that the lines between them are not as clear cut as this table could suggest. Therefore, when an activity belongs to multiple type of actions it may have been counted in both sections. In particular, the DGAM site and object inventories are also constructed to record damage, and can therefore be distinguished from the international damage recording databases, who have a different primary purpose. They are included under 'Inventories', despite the fact they also record damage. Furthermore, these are only projects with updates in the last year. Some initiatives pre-date this, for example the database to record intangible cultural heritage, but if no update is available, these projects have not been included here. As such, this work does not represent a compilation of all available projects, but should be viewed as an addendum to previous reports.

In our previous reports, it was interesting to note the number of new groups and projects that were created in response to the heritage destruction occurring in Syria, or who undertook actions to help protect it. As so many organisations are co-sponsoring talks and conferences on the topic, the authors felt that 'counting' organisations would no longer be beneficial.

Table 1. Summary of type of national and international actions undertaken towards the protection of the Syrian Cultural Heritage and their figures as discussed in this report.

TYPE OF ACTION	NATIONAL FIGURE	INTERNATIONAL FIGURE
Projects & Documentation		
Site and Object Inventories	DGAM, 2	6
Damage Assessment: Reporting and Databases	DGAM, 5	23
Information Databases (Other)		5
Reconstruction Projects and Conservation	DGAM, ongoing	9
Projects Fighting Illicit Trafficking	DGAM, ongoing Citizens, multiple	10
Site Protection Projects (on the ground)	DGAM, multiple Citizens, multiple	1
Project & Documentation (Other)	In progress	1
Awareness Raising <sup>245</sup>		

This is a very broad classification and may potentially include all collaborations among national and international organisations and institutions, as simply by carrying out many of their actions, they are raising

2

TYPE OF ACTION	NATIONAL FIGURE	INTERNATIONAL FIGURE
Cooperation Discussions	DGAM, multiple Citizens, multiple	3
Appeals / Calls / Offers of Aid	DGAM, 6	3
Conferences / Workshops	DGAM, 3 See international.	26
Speeches / Talks	DGAM, 1 See international.	9
Exhibitions / Museums / Libraries	Citizens, 2	9
Laws, Legislation and Resolution		
Implemented		6
Proposed	1 <sup>246</sup>	8
Training / Courses		
Training by and for DGAM staff	DGAM, 3	7
Others		
Other actions		12

This report has shown a remarkable growth in collaborative projects undertaken by the major national and international groups and organisations listed in the previous reports. In particular, there is a significant development in the creation of databases and inventories, especially those aiming to record damage to immovable properties and to fight illicit trafficking of movable property. Such activities require local and international partnerships, which represent the only solution to create an extensive and realistic record of damage, and potentially track the movement of objects. Collaborations and joint efforts among different groups and organisations also have the benefit of preventing duplication of similar initiatives. However, there is still a general lack of awareness on the international scene about who is doing what, and the aim of this report remains the promotion of cooperation and the increase in teamwork.

awareness. However, in this particular case, it refers only to specific projects with the goal of raising awareness, rather than a primary purpose, such as damage recording.

Amended heritage legislation was discussed in a previous 2014 report. No update is available so it has not been included in the body of this report.

It is notable that the majority of external projects at present focus on what can be achieved from outside Syria, such as documentation for reconstruction and rebuilding, rather than mitigation and support for those working in the country. Whilst documentation and inventory of sites and objects is essential for their current and future management, there are a number of other ways the international community could assist. Furthermore, very few publications on the subject are available open-access, with the ASOR-funded special edition one of a handful of notable exceptions. Such research could be very valuable in a non-university setting. Outside the work of UNESCO and its partner organisations, such as ICOM and ICOMOS, there appears to be a lack of projects supporting the DGAM or local people in protecting sites on the ground, although the SHOSHI project at Ma'arret al-Nu'man museum stands out as an example. Very few funding opportunities supply those working in Syria with materials. Heritage for Peace's current projects are looking for funding to support their colleagues on the ground, as are some others. A great many people have said that it is not possible to prevent the destruction of sites on the ground, hence the focus on the post-conflict period. However, the work carried out by the staff of the DGAM, and others in less secure regions, is testament to their desire to protect their heritage if support is made available.

Although they have not been mentioned, as few of them have formed an official group, there are frequent reports of individual Syrian citizens working to protect their heritage, posing as buyers to learn about looted items, conducting documentation, and saving what they can. Some of these have gone on to join more established groups, photographing and documenting the damage to sites. Whilst there are international projects that aim to assist them, again they are few and far between - despite the fact that in areas that government staff cannot access, these citizens are willing to risk their lives to do this work, and they are the only ones doing it. However, it should be reiterated that it is not the goal of the international community to get Syrian people to risk their lives for their heritage: their safety must be paramount whatever support is offered.

There are great many ways in which the international community can assist Syria, in terms of practical help, awareness raising, and data gathering and planning from a distance. The first is by far the most difficult, and it is to this that we should perhaps focus our efforts, looking for ways to improve international cooperation to make it easier.

Whilst ordinarily, we would not discuss actions confirmed after the cut-off date of the publication, October saw a number of important developments, some of which are extremely significant. In particular, although the UNESCO Safeguarding of Syrian Heritage project created a Roster of Experts and an Information Sharing Network for Syria, the problems in the region have now spread further, necessitating a wider approach that can connect projects and prevent duplication on a broader scale. There have been several recent calls for a Coordination Centre. September saw the discussion raised by the Antiquities Coalition at their Asia Society Conference. UK Blue Shield has been made aware of discussions about the need for one in October. October also saw an apparently different discussion group meet under the patronage of

the Greek Ministry of Foreign Affairs<sup>247</sup>. At all costs, we should avoid the necessity for a Coordination Centre to coordinate the Coordination Centres.

Levity aside, the desire of the international community to assist does great credit, but who the entire community would work with, where such a group should sit, how many countries such a body could feasibly work with (Middle East, MENA region, Eurasia, Global?), and how many language barriers could be overcome by such an organisation are all discussions which must be approached with great care, and from which no-one who wants to help should be excluded.

middle-east/ [Accessed 27/10/15])

Discussions were apparently held as part of the Religious and Cultural Pluralism and Peaceful Coexistence in the Middle East Conference, 18-20 October, Athens. Nicolaidis to Cunliffe, pers. comm. (http://ukblueshield.org.uk/events/previous-events/religious-and-cultural-pluralism-and-peaceful-coexistence-in-the-

# **Appendix 1: Group Information: Updates**

The information for most groups can be found in previous reports. This section contains updates to previous information and information on the major groups listed. However, we apologise to some projects, where language barriers prevented updates. In addition, the list of conferences was extensive, and many were supported by several different groups. As such, the authors have not included groups who have organised conferences, but attempted to provide information on most other groups.

No information is available on the local Syrian groups in order to protect their identities.

# CCNR: The Aleppo Project (2014 - ongoing)

Location: Budapest Date Founded: 2014

Team: Various, including Syrians

The Aleppo Project, joining the Center of Conflict, Negotiation and Recovery (CCNR) at Central European University and Columbia University, aims to address three issues:

- How can donors better help those trying to survive in the midst of destruction and how can that aid help rebuild communities as well as cities?
- How can refugees maintain a voice in what happens to their cities while balancing the need to redevelop healthier communities?
- What can we learn from the recent reconstruction of cities such as Beirut, Kabul and Sarajevo?

They have a website, a Facebook page, and a YouTube video about their work.<sup>248</sup>

### The Antiquities Coalition

Location: USA Date Founded:

Team: Primarily American

The Antiquities Coalition was founded to help fight cultural cleansing and illicit trafficking across the Middle East and North Africa region, supporting the countries suffering, and working to bring together those best placed to assist with developing innovative solutions<sup>249</sup>.

# ASOR Syrian Heritage Initiative (ASOR SHI)

Location: USA

Date Founded: Autumn 2014 Team: American and Syrian

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup> *CCNR Website*, available at: <a href="http://ccnr.ceu.edu/thealeppoproject">http://ccnr.ceu.edu/thealeppoproject</a> and Facebook page: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/aleppoproject">https://www.facebook.com/aleppoproject</a>, and YouTube link: <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Hktdy-Lc2Dw">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Hktdy-Lc2Dw</a> [Accessed 01/10/2015].

The Antiquities Coalition website: http://theantiquitiescoalition.org/ [Accessed 10/10.15]

The Syrian Cultural Heritage Initiative was founded in autumn 2014. The aims are: documenting damage, promoting global awareness, planning emergency and post-war responses. The directions are: collecting information from news and social media sources, communicating with Syrian heritage specialists, analysing satellite imagery to monitor, document, and verify heritage damage; promoting global awareness: weekly and periodic reports, sharing findings through symposia, social media, and news; coordinating with other organizations; planning emergence and post-war Responses: assessing the major preservation issues, designing protocols, proposals and identifying priorities.

ASOR were awarded \$57,000 to expand their Syrian Heritage Initiative into Iraq in February 2015 by the J. M. Caplan Fund. 250 It is now called the ASOR Cultural Heritage Initiative (CHI).

### Measuring Cultural Property Destruction

Location: Deakin University, Australia Date Founded: April 2015-10-28

Team: Australian / 2 advertised post-doctoral students

This is a three year project involving the creation of sophisticated databases cataloguing the destruction of heritage across Iraq and Syria. However, it builds on a previous project in Iraq, which included Australians, Americans and Iraqis.

Contact: Dr Benjamin Isakhan

### Endangered Archaeology in the Middle East and North Africa

Location: Oxford and Leicester, England

Date Founded: January 2015

Team: Various

This two-year project, supported by the Arcadia Foundation and based at the Universities of Oxford and Leicester, is using satellite imagery to record and make available information about archaeological sites and landscapes which are under threat across the Middle East and North Africa. They are recording the increasing threat to sites from massive and sustained population explosion, agricultural development, urban expansion, warfare, and looting, and are in the process of creating an ARCHES 3 database to share key information online. The project aims to assist regional governments by providing the data and supporting them in protecting their heritage. <sup>251</sup>

### Heritage of Syria

Location: UK Date Founded:

Team: British-Syrian

A Facebook group that aims "To promote Syria's spectacular historic environment and ensure that its past & culture stays alive & to show the world what Syria's past has to offer."

J.M. Kaplan Fund. In *Syrian Heritage Initiative Website*. Available at: <a href="http://www.asor-syrianheritage.org/j-m-kaplan-fund-awards-asor-57000-to-expand-its-syrian-heritage-initiative/">http://www.asor-syrianheritage.org/j-m-kaplan-fund-awards-asor-57000-to-expand-its-syrian-heritage-initiative/</a> [Accessed 21/08/15]

Endangered Archaeology of the Middle East and North Africa. Available at: http://www.arch.ox.ac.uk/ea.html

The page exists in English and Arabic.<sup>252</sup>

Contact: syriaheritage@gmail.com

Facebook page: https://www.facebook.com/Heritage-of-Syria-439242389432464/

# Institute of Digital Archaeology (Harvard University and the Classics Conclave)

Location: Oxford Date Founded: 2012 Team: Various

The Million Image Database project, started in 2015, is the first project working with Syria's

endangered heritage<sup>253</sup>.

# The Islamic Manuscript Association

Location: International Date Founded: 2008

Team: Various (International)

The Islamic Manuscript Association is an international non-profit organisation dedicated to protecting Islamic manuscript collections and supporting those who work with them. It was formed in response to the urgent need to address the poor preservation and inaccessibility of many Islamic manuscript collections around the world. The Islamic Manuscript Association is an affiliated project of the Prince Alwaleed Bin Talal Centre of Islamic Studies at the University of Cambridge. <sup>254</sup>

#### Manar al-Athar

Location: Oxford / Online

Date Founded: -

Team: British. Bi-lingual website.

Manar al-Athar is an open-access photo-archive at the University of Oxford, covering buildings and art in the areas of the former Roman empire which later came under Islamic rule (e.g. Syro-Palestine/the Levant, Arabia, Egypt, and North Africa<sup>255</sup>.

### **MEDMAK Syrian Archaeologist Studies**

Location: -

Date Founded: 2014 Team: Syrian (?)

NGO who raise awareness of the damage to Syria heritage with a variety of events. Very little information about the group is available on their website, but it contains sections on Laws, campaigns, articles, organisations, conferences, studies, reports and so on. <sup>256</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>252</sup> Heritage of Syria Facebook Page - Arabic: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/SyriaHeritage?ref=hl">https://www.facebook.com/SyriaHeritage?ref=hl</a> English: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/Heritage-of-Syria-439242389432464/">https://www.facebook.com/Heritage-of-Syria-439242389432464/</a> [Accessed 19/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> Institute of Digital Archaeology website: <a href="http://digitalarchaeology.org.uk/">http://digitalarchaeology.org.uk/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>254</sup> Islamic Manuscript Association: http://www.islamicmanuscript.org/Home.aspx [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>255</sup> Manar al-Athar archive: <a href="http://www.manar-al-athar.ox.ac.uk/">http://www.manar-al-athar.ox.ac.uk/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>256</sup> MEDMAK Website: https://medmakblog.wordpress.com/

#### $Shir\bar{\imath}n$ (2014-ongoing)

Shirīn exist to make the expertise of the foreign missions available to support the DGAM, to governments, and NGOs in Syrian heritage protection. They are currently pushing for the creation of National Shirīn Committees, which has happened in Switzerland, Belgium, Australia and France. Marc Lebeau has now stepped down as President, to be replaced by Frank Braemer. See also *September 2014 Report*. All information is available on the website.<sup>257</sup>

### Syria – A cry for heritage

Location: Syria

Date Founded: May 2015?

Team: Syrian

Facebook page documenting damage to Syria's heritage sites. <sup>258</sup>

### Syrian Heritage Archive Project (SYRHER)

Location: Berlin

Date Founded: November 2013 Team: German and Syrian

Museum für Islamische Kunst and the Deutsches Archäologisches Institut

Thanks to extensive research projects conducted over the past decades by foreign missions in conjunction with the Syrian General Directorate for Antiquities and Museums, there are numerous records available for many of the important archaeological and historical sites in Syria. Much of this research, however, is only available in analogue form as digital records only really began to be kept on a large scale in archaeology and building research towards the end of the 1990s. The complete digitisation of older archives is therefore essential to ensure that the data can be used in the future and meaningfully integrated in larger database projects to provide a basis for the subsequent evaluation of data on the current status of Syria's cultural heritage. The Museum für Islamische Kunst Berlin and the Deutsches Archäologisches Institut thus decided to launch a joint project in November 2013 with the aim of digitising their extensive data archives, compiled over many years of working in Syria. A further goal of the initiative is to create an international network with similar projects focusing on the long-term documentation of Syria's cultural assets, and to document the damage occurring to them.

 $Facebook\ page: \underline{https://www.facebook.com/MedmakSyrianArchaeologistStudiescentre/timeline}\ [Accessed\ 10/10/15]$ 

https://www.facebook.com/%D8%B3%D9%88%D8%B1%D9%8A%D8%A9-%D8%B5%D8%B1%D8%AE%D8%A9-%D8%AA%D8%B1%D8%A7%D8%AB-1595169457432294/ [Accessed 10/10/15]

http://www.smb.museum/en/museums-and-institutions/museum-fuer-islamische-kunst/research/erstellung-digitaler-kulturgueterregister-fuer-syrien.html [Accessed 19/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>257</sup> Shirīn Website. Updates are available here: <a href="http://shirin-international.org/?page\_id=795">http://shirin-international.org/?page\_id=795</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>258</sup> *Syria – a Cry for Heritage* Facebook page:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>259</sup> Syrian Heritage Archive Project Website available at:

#### **TerraWatchers**

Location: Online

Date Founded: 2015 (?)

Team: American, with international volunteers

TerraWatchers is dedicated to providing web-based, crowdsourced satellite image monitoring and overwatch tools for critical missions related to current events. They use interactive Google Maps© interfaces to display the latest freely available, high-resolution satellite imagery in our mission footprints<sup>260</sup>.

### UNOSAT (Part of UNITAR, UN)

Location: Geneva Date Founded: Team: International

UNOSAT is a technology-intensive programme delivering imagery analysis and satellite solutions to relief and development organisations within and outside the UN system to help make a difference in critical areas such as humanitarian relief, human security, strategic territorial and development planning. UNOSAT develops applied research solutions keeping in sight the needs of the beneficiaries at the end of the process. UNOSAT is a part of UNITAR, the United Nations Training and research branch. They have been releasing reports using satellite imagery to analyse Syria since 2014<sup>261</sup>.

#### Victoria and Albert Museum

Location: London UK

Date Founded: Museum – 1852. Culture In Crisis Programme - 2015

Team: Primarily British but international.

The V&A is one of Britain's oldest, largest museums, with collections covering thousands of years. It is committed to bringing together everyone with a shared interest in protecting cultural heritage. Working together by sharing information, inspiring and supporting action and raising public awareness<sup>262</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>260</sup> TerraWatchers website: <a href="http://terrawatchers.org/">http://terrawatchers.org/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>261</sup> UNOSAT website: <a href="http://www.unitar.org/unosat/">http://www.unitar.org/unosat/</a> [Accessed 10/10/15]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>262</sup> Culture in Crisis Programme. V&A webpage. Available at: